The maternity ward as mirror

*Maternal death, biobureaucracy, and institutional care in the Tanzanian health sector*

Strong, A.E.

---

Citation for published version (APA):
The Maternity Ward as Mirror

Maternal Death, Biobureaucracy, and Institutional Care in the Tanzanian Health Sector

Adrienne E Strong
WASHINGTON UNIVERSITY IN ST. LOUIS
Department of Anthropology

Dissertation Examination Committee:
John Bowen, Chair
Anita Hardon, Co-Chair
Shanti Parikh
Bradley Stoner
Priscilla Song

The Maternity Ward as Mirror: Maternal Death, Biobureaucracy, and Institutional Care in the Tanzanian Health Sector
by
Adrienne Elizabeth Strong

A dissertation presented to the Graduate School of Washington University in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

May 2017
St. Louis, Missouri
The Maternity Ward as Mirror: Maternal Death, Biobureaucracy, and Institutional Care in the Tanzanian Health Sector

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor

aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam

op gezag van de Rector Magnificus

prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex

ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,

in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel

op woensdag 12 april 2017, te 10 uur

door Adrienne Elizabeth Strong

teboren te Cleveland, Ohio, Verenigde Staten van Amerika
This thesis was prepared within the partnership between the University of Amsterdam and Washington University in St. Louis with the purpose of obtaining a joint doctorate degree. The thesis was prepared in the Faculty of Social and Behavioural Sciences at the University of Amsterdam and in the Department of Anthropology at Washington University in St. Louis.

Dit proefschrift is tot stand gekomen binnen een samenwerkingsverband tussen de Universiteit van Amsterdam en de Washington University in St. Louis met als doel het behalen van een gezamenlijk doctoraat. Het proefschrift is voorbereid in de Faculteit der Maatschappij-en Gedragswetenschappen van de Universiteit van Amsterdam en de Department of Anthropology van Washington University in St. Louis.
Table of Contents

List of Figures ................................................................. viii
List of Tables ................................................................. ix
Acronyms .............................................................................. x
Acknowledgements .............................................................. xii
ABSTRACT OF THE DISSERTATION ........................................ xvi
Preface .............................................................................. xviii

Part I: Introduction to the Study .................................................. 2

Chapter 1: Introduction .......................................................... 3
  1.1 Introduction .................................................................. 3
  1.2 The Research Problem: A Point of Departure ...................... 5
  1.3 Theoretical Framings and Analytic Lenses ......................... 7
  1.4 The Frames .................................................................. 7
  1.4.1 The Anthropology of Reproduction: Birth as a Site of Power and Inequality ......................................................... 7
  1.4.2 Authoritative Knowledge and Childbirth ....................... 10
  1.4.3 Colonialism .................................................................. 13
  1.4.4 Bureaucracy and Biobureaucracy .................................... 16
  1.4.5 Hospital Ethnography .................................................. 19
  1.5 The Analytic Lenses and Contributions to Theory ................ 21
  1.5.1 The Meanings of Maternal Death ................................... 21
  1.5.2 Metrics and Modalities of Accountability ....................... 22
  1.5.3 Risk and Uncertainty ............................................... 24
  1.5.4 Care ........................................................................ 26
  1.6 Background: Tanzania, the Rukwa Region, and the Health Sector ................................................................. 32
  1.6.1 Tanganyika and Independence ..................................... 32
  1.6.2 Post-independence Ujamaa and the Ideology of Self-Reliance .......................................................... 32
  1.6.3 Growing Dependence on Foreign Aid: The 1970s and 1980s .......................................................... 34
  1.7 The Rukwa Region ......................................................... 36
  1.8 Health Sector Formal Organization and Referral Chain ......... 39
  1.9 Organization of the Dissertation .................................... 45

Chapter 2: Methods ................................................................. 48
  2.1 Introduction .................................................................. 48
  2.2 The Regional Hospital ................................................... 48
    2.2.1 Cross-sectional Data .................................................. 50
    2.2.2 Data Analysis .......................................................... 55
  2.3 Referral Chain .............................................................. 56
    2.3.1 Sampling and Data Collection ..................................... 57
    2.3.2 Data Analysis .......................................................... 64
  2.4 Communities ............................................................... 65
    2.4.1 Sampling and Data Collection ..................................... 65
    2.4.2 Data Analysis .......................................................... 66
  2.5 History ........................................................................ 66
Introduction to Part III

Part III: Maternal Death in Present

Chapter 4: “Pregnancy is Poison:” Logics of risk and care in the community

Part II: Contextualizing Maternal Health and Death: Historical, Policy, and Community Perspectives

Introduction to Part II


Chapter 5: The Mawingu Regional Hospital Maternity Ward: Site of Care, Site of Violence
### Chapter 6: Working in Scarcity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Introduction</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 The Material Needs and Inevitable Inertia of the System</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 The Origins of Material Scarcity: Decentralization, Budgets, and the Medical Stores Department</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4 The Hospital Budget</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5 Budgets and Hiring New Personnel</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6 Increasing burden on regional-level healthcare services</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7 Working in Scarcity</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8 Uchache as Excuse and Idiom</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.9 Collecting Cash and the Expansion of Biobureaucracy</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.10 Delays in Care and Social Tension</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.11 Supplies as the Foundation of Community Trust</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.12 Motivation and The Impossible Demands of Work</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.13 Seminars to “Refresh Your Mind”</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.14 Driven to Outside Income Generation</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.15 Different Subjectivities, Different Motivations</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.16 Conclusion</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter 7: “No Zebras on Your Fingernails!”: Uniforms, looking “smart,” and the professional comportment of “good” nurses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Introduction</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Nursing Origin Stories</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 Uniforms and the Nursing Profession</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4 Development of Nursing Uniforms in Tanzania</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5 Uniform Requirements</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6 Maintaining a Professional Image for the Community</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.7 Uniforms and Village Healthcare Providers</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.8 Maternity Care Necessitating Variations</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.9 Improvising the Standards</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.10 Continued Evolution of the Conflict</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.11 Gender, Bodily Embellishment, and Nursing Identity</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.12 Uniforms and Institutional Care</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.13 Conclusion</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter 8: “Bad Luck,” Lost Babies, and the Structuring of Realities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.1 Introduction</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2 The Case of Pendo’s Baby</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3 To Know His Face: Stillbirth and Coping</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4 Informal Systems of Accountability</td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5 The Partograph and Good Care as Documented Care</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.6 The Partograph as Uncertain Technology and its Role in Constructing Realities and Responsibilities</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.7 Modalities of Accountability</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.8 Accountability as Viewed from the Outside</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## 8.9 Accountability, Language Use, and the Making of Morality and Ethical Responsibility .......................... 337

## 8.10 Conclusion ........................................................................................................................................... 346

### Chapter 9: The Stories We Tell About the Deaths We See

#### 9.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................................................ 352

#### 9.2 Reporting and Data Collection ........................................................................................................ 352

#### 9.3 Rukwa region maternal death audit meetings .................................................................................... 358

#### 9.4 Case Files ............................................................................................................................................ 363

#### 9.5 The Futility of Action (Plans) ............................................................................................................ 366

#### 9.6 Audit Meeting Outcomes and Ward Nurses ..................................................................................... 374

#### 9.7 Coping with Maternal Deaths Through Narrative ........................................................................... 376

#### 9.8 Self-Reflection and Remembering ..................................................................................................... 379

#### 9.9 Caring for the Carers .......................................................................................................................... 382

#### 9.10 Conclusion ........................................................................................................................................ 390

#### 9.11 Conclusion ........................................................................................................................................ 391

### Chapter 10: Conclusion and Recommendations

#### 10.1 Introduction ...................................................................................................................................... 396

#### 10.2 Putting the Care Providers Back into Healthcare ............................................................................. 397

#### 10.3 The Complex Reach of Scarcity and Imperfect Care ....................................................................... 399

#### 10.4 Unintended Consequences and Perversion of the System ............................................................. 402

#### 10.5 Limitations of the Study and Implications for Further Research .................................................... 405

#### 10.6 Recommendations ............................................................................................................................ 405

##### 10.6.1 Communities ................................................................................................................................. 406

##### 10.6.2 District Health Administration .................................................................................................... 407

##### 10.6.3 Regional Hospital ......................................................................................................................... 409

##### 10.6.4 Regional Health Administration .................................................................................................. 413

##### 10.6.5 National Level and Implications for Global Policy ....................................................................... 415

## References ..................................................................................................................................................... 418

## Appendix A: Interview Schedules ............................................................................................................. 439

## Appendix B: Focus Group Discussion Questions ....................................................................................... 465

## Appendix C: Conditions for Work Effectiveness Questionnaire (CWEQ) .................................................. 479

## Appendix D: Maps ....................................................................................................................................... 484

## Appendix E: Research and Ethical Clearance Documents ........................................................................... 490

## Appendix F: Full Text of Historical Documents from Chapter 3 ............................................................... 507

## Appendix G: Medical Terms ........................................................................................................................ 521

## Summary ....................................................................................................................................................... 524

## Samenvatting ............................................................................................................................................... 530

## Curriculum Vitae ........................................................................................................................................... 537
### List of Figures

1.1 Map of Tanzania……………………………………………………………………..38
1.2 Map of Rukwa region showing Sumbawanga urban district…………………39
1.3 Health sector organization, Rukwa, Tanzania…………………………………41
1.4 Formal structure of the Tanzanian health sector………………………………42
3.1 Map of Sumbawanga Hospital plans, 14 May 1959, TNA Acc. No. 450, Medical Department File 55 inserts………………………………………………..103
4.1 Women carrying firewood…………………………………………………………157
5.1 View of the Mawingu Hospital……………………………………………….183
5.2 View from the inside Mawingu Hospital……………………………………….186
5.3a View of the Mawingu Hospital maternity ward…………………………….189
5.3b View of the Mawingu Hospital maternity ward…………………………….189
5.3c View of the Mawingu Hospital maternity ward…………………………….190
5.4 Images of the labor and delivery room………………………………………205
5.5 Maternity ward operating theater, which opened in December 2014……….207
5.6 View of the post-Caesar room on the ward……………………………………208
5.7 Mawingu Hospital organogram……………………………………………….211
6.1 Supply trolleys after a busy shift………………………………………………221
6.2 CWEQ results for Section 4: Access to Resources…………………………….232
6.3 Sign reading “Blood isn’t sold, it’s always free”………………………………245
6.4 CWEQ results for Section 3: Access to Support………………………………254
7.1 Caps nursing students wore………………………………………………………275
7.2 Uniform illustrations……………………………………………………………278
7.3 Three village dispensary healthcare workers…………………………………284
7.4 Boxes of clothing and shoes……………………………………………………293
7.5 More nurses’ shoes, aprons, and boots…………………………………………293
8.1 Partograph………………………………………………………………………..351
8.2 Five bodies of deceased babies lying on a table in the maternity ward of Mawingu Regional Hospital……………………………………………………………..348
9.1 CWEQ results for Section 2: Access to Information……………………………389
List of Tables

2.1 Villages..................................................................................................................61
2.2 Summary of methods.............................................................................................70
9.1 Deaths that occurred during the field period.........................................................395
Acronyms

AMO- Assistant Medical Officer  
AMSTL/AMTSL- Active Management of the Third Stage of Labor  
APGAR- Appearance, Pulse, Grimace, Activity, Respiration (also named after Virginia Apgar)  
APH- Antepartum hemorrhage  
BEmONC- Basic Emergency Obstetric and Neonatal Care  
CEmONC- Comprehensive Emergency Obstetric and Neonatal Care  
BTL- Bilateral tubal ligation  
CCF- Congestive cardiac failure  
CHOP- Comprehensive Hospital Operating Plan  
CPD- Cephalopelvic disproportion  
DC- District Commissioner  
DIC- Disseminated Intravascular Coagulopathy  
DMO- District Medical Officer  
DRCHCO- District Reproductive and Child Health Coordinator  
EN- Enrolled Nurse  
EPMM- Ending Preventable Maternal Mortality  
FGD- Focus group discussion  
FSB- Fresh stillbirth  
Hb- Hemoglobin  
HBB- Helping Babies Breathe  
HIV- Human Immunodeficiency Virus  
HMT- Hospital Management Team  
ICU- Intensive Care Unit  
IMF- International Monetary Fund  
IUD- Intrauterine Device  
IUFD- Intrauterine fetal death  
IV- Intravenous, short for intravenous fluids in most instances  
MDG- Millennium Development Goal  
MMR- Maternal mortality ratio  
MO- Medical Officer  
MoH/MoHSW- Ministry of Health/Ministry of Health and Social Welfare  
MOI/C- Medical Officer In Charge (of the hospital)  
MSB- Macerated stillbirth  
MSD- Medical Stores Department  
MTUHA- Mfumo wa Taarifa za Utoaji Huduma za Afya, System of Reporting of Provision of Healthcare Services  
NASG- Non-pneumatic Anti-Shock Garment  
NG- Naso-gastric  
NGO- Non-governmental organization  
NO- Nursing Officer  
OPD- Out Patient Department  
OT- Operating theatre  
PPE- Personal protective equipment  
PPH- Postpartum hemorrhage
PV- Per vagina
QIT- Quality Improvement Team
RAS- Regional Administrative Secretary
RHMT- Regional Health Management Team
RMO- Regional Medical Officer
RN- Registered Nurse
RRCHCO- Regional Reproduction and Child Health Coordinator
SAS- Sub-Assistant Surgeon
SDG- Sustainable Development Goal
TB- Tuberculosis
TBA- Traditional birth attendant
TNMC- Tanzania Nurses and Midwives Council
UNFPA- United Nations Population Fund, formally United Nations Fund for Population Activities
UNICEF- United Nations International Children’s Emergency Relief Fund
USAID- United States Agency for International Development
WHO- World Health Organization