



## UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

### International cooperation in combating modern forms of maritime piracy: Legal and policy dimensions

Gottlieb, Y.

**Publication date**

2017

**Document Version**

Other version

**License**

Other

[Link to publication](#)

**Citation for published version (APA):**

Gottlieb, Y. (2017). *International cooperation in combating modern forms of maritime piracy: Legal and policy dimensions*.

**General rights**

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

**Disclaimer/Complaints regulations**

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

**INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION IN COMBATING  
MODERN FORMS OF MARITIME PIRACY:  
LEGAL AND POLICY DIMENSIONS**

**YARON GOTTLIEB**



**INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION IN COMBATING MODERN  
FORMS OF MARITIME PIRACY:  
LEGAL AND POLICY DIMENSIONS**

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT  
ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor  
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam  
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus  
prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex  
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde  
commissie, in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel  
op woensdag 24 mei 2017, te 12:00 uur

door  
Yaron Gottlieb  
geboren te Haifa, Israel

**Promotiecommissie:**

Promotor: prof. dr. G.K. Sluiter, Universiteit van Amsterdam

Overige leden: prof. dr. E. Benvenisti (Tel Aviv University)  
prof. mr. dr. W.N. Ferdinandusse (Rijksuniversiteit Groningen)  
prof. dr. A.G. Oude Elferink (Universiteit Utrecht)  
prof. dr. J. d' Aspremont (Universiteit van Amsterdam)  
prof. mr. dr. H.G. van der Wilt (Universiteit van Amsterdam)  
dr. D. Abels (Universiteit van Amsterdam)

Faculteit der Rechtsgeleerdheid

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>1 INTRODUCTION: EXPLORING INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION IN COMBATING MARITIME PIRACY</b> .....	<b>8</b>
<b>1.1. the new-old threat of maritime piracy</b> .....	<b>8</b>
<b>1.2. the overarching question and a roadmap</b> .....	<b>12</b>
<b>1.3. Methodology and Scope</b> .....	<b>14</b>
<b>2 Chapter one: Defining piracy under international law</b> .....	<b>16</b>
<b>2.1. Introduction</b> .....	<b>16</b>
<b>2.2. The elements of piracy as defined by Article 101(a) of UNCLOS</b> .....	<b>22</b>
2.2.1. “any illegal acts of violence or detention, or any act of depredation” .....	22
2.2.2. “committed for private ends” .....	27
2.2.3. “by the crew or the passengers of a private ship or a private aircraft” .....	34
2.2.4. “directed...(i) on the high seas...(ii) in a place outside the jurisdiction of any State” .....	38
2.2.4.A. <i>Questions arising from UNCLOS zoning system</i> .....	39
2.2.4.B. <i>Different scenarios related to the high seas requirement</i> .....	42
2.2.4.C. <i>The high seas requirement in the context of piracy off the coast of Somalia</i> .....	51
2.2.4.D. <i>Piratical act “in a place outside the jurisdiction of any State”</i> .....	55
2.2.5. “against another ship or aircraft” .....	56
<b>2.3. Voluntary participation, incitement and facilitation</b> .....	<b>58</b>
<b>2.4. The mental element</b> .....	<b>69</b>
<b>2.5. The piracy definition under UNCLOS: An assessment</b> .....	<b>73</b>
<b>2.6. Acts of piratical nature committed entirely in areas under state jurisdiction – the definition of “armed robbery at sea”</b> .....	<b>76</b>
<b>2.7. Addressing piratical acts through other international or regional instruments</b> .....	<b>80</b>
<b>3 Chapter two: Combating Maritime Piracy: Inter-Disciplinary Cooperation and Information Sharing</b> .....	<b>84</b>
<b>3.1. Introduction</b> .....	<b>84</b>
<b>3.2. Combating Maritime Piracy: The Duty to Cooperate</b> .....	<b>84</b>
3.2.1. The primary legal sources underlying the duty to cooperate .....	84
3.2.2. Interpretation of the duty to cooperate: the applicable legal test.....	88
3.2.3. Article 100 as the guiding principle in identifying the specific duties imposed on states.....	94
<b>3.3. The Duty to Share Information as a Specific Obligation under the General Duty to Cooperate</b> .....	<b>98</b>
<b>3.4. The Nature of Cooperation: A Call for Holistic Inter-Disciplinary Cooperation</b> .....	<b>101</b>
<b>3.5. Challenges in Sharing Information in the Fight Against Piracy</b> .....	<b>103</b>
3.5.1. Scope of the duty to share information and the “national security” exception .....	103

3.5.2. Challenges deriving from the nature of the crime and the entities involved in counter-piracy operations	106
3.5.2.A. Navies carrying out law enforcement activities .....	106
3.5.2.B. Interaction with the shipping industry .....	111
3.5.3. The proliferation of information networks and its discontents .....	113
<b>3.6. Conclusion.....</b>	<b>118</b>
<b>4 chapter three: The Security Council’s Maritime Piracy Resolutions: A critical assessment.....</b>	<b>120</b>
<b>4.1. Introduction .....</b>	<b>120</b>
<b>4.2. The Nature of Maritime Piracy: An International Crime With Ordinary Law Crime Characteristics .....</b>	<b>122</b>
<b>4.3. The security council’s Powers in Treating Criminal Phenomena as a Threat to Peace and Security ..</b>	<b>127</b>
<b>4.4. The Security Council’s practice in addressing criminal acts.....</b>	<b>131</b>
<b>4.5. The Somali piracy Resolutions .....</b>	<b>135</b>
<b>4.6. Piracy as a threat to international peace and security? .....</b>	<b>139</b>
<b>4.7. The piracy Resolutions as a tool to address legal shortcomings of UNCLOS .....</b>	<b>154</b>
<b>4.8 Towards a holistic approach .....</b>	<b>163</b>
4.8.1. The question of ransom payments.....	167
4.8.2. Private Security Guards On-Board Commercial Ships .....	172
<b>4.9. Engaging the Private Sector .....</b>	<b>175</b>
<b>4.10. The authorization to enter Somalia’s territorial waters and territory .....</b>	<b>179</b>
<b>4.11. The applicable legal paradigm in combating piracy – international humanitarian law or law enforcement? .....</b>	<b>185</b>
<b>4.12. the piracy resolutions: chapter vii resolutions that do not convey binding decisions.....</b>	<b>191</b>
<b>4.13. Conclusion.....</b>	<b>193</b>
<b>5 chapter four: RESPONDING TO MARITIME PIRACY: THE REGIONAL APPROACH .....</b>	<b>195</b>
<b>5.1. INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>195</b>
<b>5.2. RATIONALIZING A REGIONAL APPROACH TO ADDRESS MARITIME PIRACY .....</b>	<b>197</b>
<b>5.3. THE SOUTH-EAST ASIA AND THE CARIBBEAN CASE-STUDIES.....</b>	<b>201</b>
5.3.1. Counter-piracy initiatives in South-East Asia .....	201
5.3.2. Counter-piracy initiatives in the Caribbean region .....	205
5.3.3. Characterizing the response: from a local to regional approach.....	208
<b>5.4. SOMALIA: FROM THE LOCAL TO THE INTERNATIONAL SPHERE – AND TO THE REGIONAL LEVEL.....</b>	<b>209</b>
5.4.1. Somali piracy: a transnational piracy model? .....	209
5.4.2. Characterizing the response to Somali piracy: a gradual regional approach.....	212
<b>5.5. REGIONAL COUNTER-PIRACY INITIATIVES IN THE GULF OF GUINEA: THE HYBRID APPROACH .....</b>	<b>220</b>
<b>5.6. THE ROLE OF THE INTERNATIONAL COMMUNITY IN COMBATING PIRACY: THE COMPLEMENTARITY PARADIGM .....</b>	<b>229</b>

5.7. CONCLUSION.....	233
<b>6 chapter five: The pragmatic approach characterizing the counter-piracy initiatives.....</b>	<b>235</b>
6.1. INTRODUCTION.....	235
6.2. The legal framework.....	236
6.3. The institutional landscape.....	241
6.3.1. The Contact Group on Piracy off the Coast of Somalia (CGPCS).....	243
6.3.2. The Regional Anti-Piracy Prosecution and Intelligence Coordination Centre (RAPPICC).....	249
6.4. conclusion.....	255
<b>7 concluding remarks.....</b>	<b>257</b>
<b>Bibliography.....</b>	<b>269</b>
<b>BOOKS.....</b>	<b>269</b>
<b>BOOK CHAPTERS.....</b>	<b>270</b>
<b>JOURNAL ARTICLES.....</b>	<b>272</b>
<b>REPORTS AND POLICY PAPERS.....</b>	<b>279</b>
<b>PRESS RELEASES, STATEMENTS, AND NEWS ITEMS.....</b>	<b>287</b>
<b>INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION IN COMBATING MODERN FORMS OF MARITIME PIRACY: LEGAL AND POLICY DIMENSIONS Abstract.....</b>	<b>299</b>
<b>INTERNATIONALE SAMENWERKING BIJ DE BESTRIJDING VAN MODERNE VORMEN VAN ZEEPIRATERIJ: JURIDISCHE EN BELEIDSDIMENSIES Samenvatting.....</b>	<b>300</b>