



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

The male domination of transnational migrant politics

Mügge, L.

Published in:
GEXcel Work in Progress Report

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):
Mügge, L. (2011). The male domination of transnational migrant politics. GEXcel Work in Progress Report, 15, 41-49.

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

Chapter 3

The Male Domination of Transnational Migrant Politics

Liza Mügge

University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Introduction¹

Over the past decade the attention for gender in migration studies has been rising slowly (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 1999; Yuval-Davis, Anthias and Kofman, 2005; Donato, Gabaccia, Holdaway, Manalansan and Pessar, 2006; Schrover, Van der Leun, Lucassen, and Quispel 2008). Female migrants are no longer solely studied as passive followers of husbands and fathers, but as actors with agency of their own (Brettell, 2003: 153-196). Increasingly, the entire migration process is perceived as a gendered phenomenon (Donato et al., 2006: 6 citing several studies). Also in the subfield of studies on transnationalism, and more specifically its social dimension – think of transnational families, households and marriages – gender gradually becomes more integrated (Levitt, 2001; Levitt and Jaworsky, 2007: 137-139).

Gender, however, is also significant outside these typically ‘female’ spaces (Mahler, 1998: 82-87; Al-Ali, 2002; Vertovec, 2009: 64-66). Nevertheless, in most recent ‘state of the art’ and ‘taking stock’ special journal issues and edited volumes on migrant transnationalism and diaspora, full contributions or chapters on gender are absent (e.g. Fibbi and D’Amato, 2008; Khagram and Levitt, 2008; Martiniello and Lafleur, 2008; Pries, 2008; Ben-Rafael, Sternberg, Bokser Liwerant and Gorny, 2009; Vertovec, 2009; Bauböck and Faist, 2010). Equally, gender goes unnoticed in empirical studies on diaspora- and transnational migrant politics (Shain, 1999; Ögelman, 2003; Østergaard-Nielsen, 2003; Sheffer, 2003; for an exception see Aliefendioğlu, 2004; Brand, 2006; Esman, 2009). Confirming this pattern, gender is not considered in general studies on migrants’ political participation and their organizational networks in the receiving country (Van Heelsum, 2002; Schrover and Vermeulen, 2005; Vermeulen, 2006; Yurdakul, 2009). This paper argues

1 I thank Anja van Heelsum for making the database of Turkish organizations in the Netherlands available.

that there are good reasons to bring gender into the study of transnational migrant and diaspora politics. After a short literature review, I analyse how transnational and diaspora politics of Turks and Kurds in the Netherlands is gendered on an institutional level. I will conclude with suggestions for future research.

Bringing gender into the study of transnational migrant politics

The fact that gender is systematically ignored in both the field of transnational migrant politics as well as studies on migrants' political participation is arguably because, in the words of Mahler and Pessar, 'gender operates so "naturally" that it may easily escape our awareness. To measure its effects we must first see gender operating.' (Mahler and Pessar, 2006: 29). This may be particularly true for transnational politics, given that we are used to formal politics which traditionally has been male-dominated (Reynolds, 1999).

There are good reasons to bring gender into the study of transnationalism, and in particular its political dimension, because gender par excellence constructs power relations (see Mahler, 2001: 609; Mahler and Pessar, 2001; Pessar and Mahler, 2003; Brettell, 2006; Donato, Gabaccia et al., 2006). Existing scholarship suggests that migrant men and women's involvement in social networks and transnationalism takes very different forms. Taking stock of the literature, Itzigsohn and Giorguli-Saucedo (2005: 896) find that '[m]en appear to be more committed to the maintenance of public and institutionalized transnational ties than women, while women appear more committed to participating in the life of the receiving country'. Related to the receiving country Menjívar (2000: 157-193) shows that Salvadoran women play an important role in *informal* networks consisting of friends and family (also see Hagan 1998). In the case of Congolese women Nell (2003) shows that such informal networks operate almost invisibly. Those informal women networks, however, are crucial for the community since they facilitate the formation of *formal* networks of migrant organizations which are predominately directed by men. In a similar vein Fouron and Glick Schiller found that '[r]ather than being part of an explicitly political activity, women may often engage in impassioned politics within the domain of domestic activities and family rites de passage, such as weddings, funerals, births, and graduations' (2001: 571).

Yet, it is the institutionalized and public nature of migrants' organizational and transnational ties exceeding the level of the private sphere and the individual that structures transnational politics (Mügge, 2010).

The degree of institutionalization thus is expected to determine the way gender structures transnational politics. The next section shows how this plays out for Turks and Kurds in the Netherlands.

Turkish and Kurdish immigration and organisation in the Netherlands

Migrants from Turkey are the largest non-Western migrant group in the Netherlands (388.967 in 2011).² Significant migration from Turkey was concentrated between 1964 and 1974 when the Dutch and Turkish governments had a labour agreement (Akgündüz, 2008). Labour migration predominantly included Turkish men. Many labour migrants opted for a permanent stay in the Netherlands and their wives and children followed. As a consequence already in 1972 half of the Turkish migrants were women (Schapendonk-Maas, 2000: 26). A similar pattern is observed in Germany (Aliefendioğlu, 2004), and it still holds today. Kurds were underrepresented in the first wave of labour migration in the 1960s as recruitment mainly took place in western and central Turkey where few Kurds lived. This changed in the early 1970s when labour was increasingly recruited from eastern Turkey (Van Bruinessen, 1999). Many Kurds arrived in the Netherlands after the 1980 coup in Turkey (Baker, Vervloet and Gailly, 2002: 162-167). As Kurds are not registered on the basis of ethnicity, official numbers for the Netherlands do not exist. Their estimated number is between 50,000 and 100,000 (ROB, 2001; Moors, Van den Reek Vermeulen and Siesling, 2009).

Compared to other migrant groups in the Netherlands, migrants from Turkey are very well organized: they have at their disposal a high number of organizations which are connected in dense networks with a low number of isolated organisations (Fennema and Tillie 1999; Van Heelsum, Tillie et al. 1999). Also, their organizational structures are more stable than other groups (cf. Mügge, 2011). Many organisations established in the 1970s and 1980s still exist (Mügge, 2010).

Between 1998 and 1999 the Institute for Migration and Ethnic Studies (IMES) of the University of Amsterdam found 1,125 organisations among Turks (including Kurds) of which only five per cent (61) focus on women. The names of the organisations, their addresses, and the names of their board members were acquired from the Dutch Chamber of Commerce. This information was available for 69 per cent (773) of Turkish organisations. Five per cent of those organisations (40 out of

2 Statline, Central Bureau for Statistics, <http://statline.cbs.nl/statweb/>, accessed 11 May 2011.

773) are directed by women. The grand majority of those organisations specifically target women (see table 1).

Table 1 Female director and type of organisation

Type of organisation	Number
Women	35
Religious	2
Cultural	2
Unknown	1
Total	40

The IMES analysed Turkish organisational networks on the basis of the interlocking directorates of organisations, meaning organisations were connected when one person was on the administrative board of two or more organisations. None of the organisations directed by a woman have a central position in the overall of Turkish organisations (see figure 2 in Van Heelsum and Tillie: 20). The Turkish organisational network is thus almost completely male-dominated. That said, some organisations, such as the conservative Islamic Milli Görüş, organise activities specifically by and for women (for examples in Germany see Sökefeld, 2008). Mirroring the position of women in Islamist political movements, this work has largely remained informal (White, 2002).

Using the IMES network as a starting point I identified the key persons in migrant organizational networks who maintained institutionalized ties with political actors in Turkey or diaspora. Since administrative boards are seldom transnational in the sense that people from both the Netherlands and Turkey additional research to expand and update the IMES network was needed. New data was collected in the Netherlands and Turkey through interviews with organisational leaders and elites, through my own observations during activities, by reading newspaper articles, websites, organisations' brochures and reports, and secondary literature where available. The new national and transnational ties I found were based on structural or sporadic cooperation, advice, memberships (among organisations and individuals), and kinship. During the interviews I asked interviewees to provide me with the contact details of homeland organisations with which they maintain ties. This more qualitative approach only led to a very small increase of organisations in the national network directed by women. Similarly, the transnational ties maintained between migrant organisations in the Netherlands and collective actors in Turkey are also for the grand majority run by men.

Only two organisations directed by women in the overall network have been transnationally active in the past or in the period under study: the Turkish Women's Federation in the Netherlands (HTKB) and the International Free Women's Foundation (IFWF). The federation HTKB was founded in 1977 and united eight women organisations. Although the federation still exists, its transnational activities and ties have diminished over time. IFWF was founded in 2001 and in the period under study was well embedded in a sub-cluster of European Kurdish diaspora organizations and the pro-Kurdish based in Turkey. The transnational involvement of both organisations was responsive to the violence of the Turkish state against the left, Kurds, women or both and mirrored the struggle of the leftist feminist and Kurdish feminist movements in Turkey (for a full analysis see Mügge forthcoming).

Conclusion

This paper has shown that Turkish and Kurdish women have been underrepresented in formal and institutionalized forms of migrant- and transnational politics between the late 1970s and 2005. The only two organisations involved in transnationalism directed by women were women organisations. Their transnational ties mirrored the ideologies and activities of the leftist women's movement in the 1980s and the Kurdish women's movement in the 1990s and 2000s. Women have certainly been present in mainstream migrant organisations and gradually enter boards of administration. Systematic research on migrant and transnational politics in both women and mainstream organisations of second generation women is needed. To what extent do they reproduce homeland gender hierarchies? Are their strategies similar to feminist movements in the receiving societies, the countries or origin of their or parents, or different altogether? And finally, what are the consequences for gender equality when institutionalised migrant politics and transnational politics are male dominated?

References

- Akgündüz, Ahmet (2008) *Labour Migration from Turkey to Western Europe 1960–1974: A Multidisciplinary Analysis*, Aldershot: Ashgate.
- Al-Ali, Nadjé (2002) "Gender relations, transnational ties and rituals among Bosnian refugees", *Global Networks* 2(3): 249–262.
- Aliefendioğlu, Hanife (2004) "Transnational space between women's NGOs in Germany and Turkey: Current situation and future expectations", in Thomas Faist and Eyüp Özveren (eds.) *Transnational Social*

- Spaces: Agents, Networks and Institutions*, Aldershot: Ashgate, pp. 59–90.
- Bakker, René, Vervloet, Luc and Gailly, Anton (2002) *Geschiedenis van Turkije*, Amsterdam: Bulaaq.
- Bauböck, Rainer and Faist, Thomas (eds.) (2010) *Diaspora and Transnationalism: Concepts, Theories and Methods*, Amsterdam: IMISCOE Research Series Amsterdam University Press
- Ben-Rafael, Eliezer and Sternberg, Yitzak (eds.) (2009) *Transnationalism Diasporas and the Advent of a New (dis)order*, Leiden: Brill.
- Brand, Laurie (2006) *Citizens Abroad: Emigration and the State in the Middle East and North Africa*, Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Brettell, Caroline (2003) *Anthropology and Migration: Essays on Transnationalism, Ethnicity, and Identity*, Walnut Creek: Altimira Press.
- Brettell, Caroline (2006) “Introduction: Global spaces/local places: transnationalism, diaspora, and the meaning of home”, *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 13(3): 327–334.
- Donato, Katharine M., Gabaccia, Donna, Holdway, Jeniffer, Manalansan IV, Martin and Pessar, Patricia R. (2006) “A glass half full? Gender in migration studies”, *International Migration Review* 40(1): 3–26.
- Esman, Milton J. (2009) *Diasporas in the Contemporary World*, Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Fennema, Meindert and Tillie, Jean (1999) “Political participation and trust in Amsterdam: Civic communities and ethnic networks”, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 25(4): 703–726.
- Fibbi, Rosita and D’amato, Gianni (2008) “Transnationalisme des migrants en Europe: Une preuve par les fait”, *Revue européenne des migrations internationales* 24(2): 7–22.
- Fouron, Georges and Glick Schiller, Nina (2001) “All in the family: Gender, transnational migration, and the nation-state”, *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 7(4): 539 – 582.
- Hagan, Jacqueline Maria (1998) “Social networks, gender and immigrant incorporation: Resources and constraints”, *American Sociological Review* 63(1): 55–67.
- Hondagneu-Sotelo, Pierrette. (1999) “Introduction: Gender and contemporary U.S. immigration”, *American Behavioral Scientist* 42(4): 565–576.

- Itzigsohn, Jose and Giorguli-Saucedo, Silvia (2005) "Incorporation, transnationalism, and gender: Immigrant incorporation and transnational participation as gendered process", *International Migration Review* 39(4): 895–920.
- Khagram, Sanjeev and Levitt, Peggy (eds.) (2008) *The Transnational Studies Reader: Intersections & Innovations*, New York: Routledge.
- Levitt, Peggy (2001) *The Transnational Villagers*, Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Levitt, Peggy and Jaworsky, B. Nadya (2007) "Transnational migration studies: Past developments and future trends", *Annual Review of Sociology* 33: 129–156.
- Mahler, Sarah (1998) "Theoretical and empirical contributions: Toward a research agenda for transnationalism", in Michael Peter Smith and Luis Eduardo Guarnizo (eds.) *Transnationalism from Below*, New Brunswick: Transaction Publishers, pp. 64–102.
- Mahler, Sarah J. (2001) "Transnational relationships: The struggle to communicate across borders", *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 7(4): 583–619.
- Mahler, Sarah J. and Pessar, Patricia R. (2001) "Gendered geographies of power: Analyzing gender across transnational spaces", *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 7 (4): 441–459.
- Mahler, Sarah J. and Pessar, Patricia R. (2006) "Gender matters: Ethnographers bring gender from the periphery toward the core of migration studies", *International Migration Review* 40(1): 27–63.
- Martiniello, Marco and Lafleur, Jean-Michel (2008) "Towards a transatlantic dialogue in the study of immigrant political transnationalism", *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 31(4): 645 – 663.
- Menjívar, Cecilia (2000) *Fragmented Ties: Salvadoran Immigrant Networks in America*, Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Moors, J.A., E. Van den Reek Vermeulen and M. Siesling (2009) *Voedingsbodem voor radicalisering bij kleine etnische groepen in Nederland. Een verkennend onderzoek in de Somalische, Pakistaanse, Koerdische en Molukse gemeenschappen*, Tilburg: IVA beleidsonderzoek en advies.
- Mügge, Liza (2010) *Beyond Dutch Borders: Transnational Politics among Postcolonial Migrants, Guest Workers and the Second Generation*, Amsterdam: IMISCOE Research Series Amsterdam University Press.
- Mügge, Liza (2011) "Diversity in transnationalism: Surinamese organisational Networks", *International Migration* 49(3): 52–75.

- Mügge, Liza (forthcoming) “Women in transnational migrant activism: Supporting social justice claims of homeland political organisations”, *Studies in Social Justice*.
- Nell, Liza (2003) “Solidariteitsnetwerken van Kongolese vrouwen in Luik”, *LOVA Tijdschrift voor Feministische Antropologie* 24(1): 31–46.
- Ögelman, Nedim (2003) “Documenting and explaining the persistence of homeland politics among Germany’s Turks”, *International Migration Review* 37(1): 163–193.
- Østergaard-Nielsen, Eva (2003) *Transnational Politics: Turks and Kurds in Germany*, London and New York: Routledge.
- Pessar, Patricia R. and Mahler, Sarah J. (2003) “Transnational migration: Bringing gender in”, *International Migration Review* 37(3): 812–846.
- Pries, Ludger (ed.) (2008) *Rethinking Transnationalism: The Meso-link of Organisations*, London: Routledge.
- Reynolds, Andrew (1999) “Women in the legislatures and executives of the world: Knocking at the highest glass ceiling”, *World Politics* 51: 547–72.
- ROB (2001) *Etniciteit, binding en burgerschap*, Den Haag: Raad voor openbaar bestuur.
- Schapendonk-Maas, Helma (2000) “Jonge tweede generatie allochtonen”, *Index* 9(October): 26–27.
- Schrover, Marlou, et al. (eds.) (2008) *Illegal Migration and Gender in a Global and Historical Perspective*, Amsterdam: IMISCOE Research Series Amsterdam University Press.
- Schrover, Marlou and Vermeulen, Floris (2005) “Immigrant organizations: Introduction”, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 31(5): 823–832.
- Shain, Yossi (1999) *Marketing the American Greed: Diasporas in the U.S. and Their Homelands*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sheffer, Gabriel (2003) *Diaspora Politics: At Home Abroad*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sökefeld, Martin (2008) *Struggling for Recognition: The Alevi Movement in Germany in Transnational Space*, New York: Berghahn Books.
- Van Bruinessen, Martin (1999) “Eerder verdeeld dan verenigd”, NRC webpaginas <http://www.nrc.nl/W2/Lab/Profiel/Koerden/identiteit.html>, 17 juni 1999.

- Van Heelsum, Anja (2002) "The relationship between political participation and civic community of migrants in the Netherlands", *JIMI/RIMI* 3(2): 179–200.
- Van Heelsum, Anja et al. (1999) *Turkse Organisaties in Nederland: Een Netwerkanalyse*, Amsterdam: Spinhuis.
- Vermeulen, Floris (2006) *The Immigrant Organising Process: The Emergence and Persistence of Turkish Immigrant Organisations in Amsterdam and Berlin and Surinamese Organisations in Amsterdam, 1960–2000*, Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.
- Vertovec, Steven (2009) *Transnationalism*, New York: Routledge.
- White, Jenny B. (2002) *Islamist Mobilization in Turkey: A Study in Vernacular Politics*, Washington: University of Washington Press.
- Yurdakul, Gökçe (2009) *From Guest Workers into Muslims: The Transformation of Turkish Immigrant Associations in Germany*, Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Yuval-Davis, Nira, Anthias, Floya and Eleonore Kofman (2005) "Secure borders and safe haven and the gendered politics of belonging: Beyond social cohesion", *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 28(3): 513–535.