Evolving property rights in water and their impact on water allocation and reallocation

Bosch, H.J.

Publication date
2023

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
The growing globalization and the dominance of neo-liberal capitalism have permeated in public policies in both industrialized and developing countries. This has led to the current dominant water governance language and logic being deeply infused with neoliberalism.

This thesis aims to understand whether the changing nature and content of property rights in water as part of the ongoing water governance reforms support or undermine the efforts of states to allocate and reallocate water. It examines the organisation of water ‘property’ rights in laws, and more specifically, it studies the role of policy instruments, including water use permits and investor-state contracts between foreign investors and host states and its potential effects on water allocation and reallocation. It does so by focusing on Africa and Asia more broadly, with two case studies in South Africa and India.

The challenge for developing countries is that they are struggling with the legacy of property rights regimes created in the colonial era. As they attempt to dismantle that, they are creating a new quasi-property right regime.

Hilmer Bosch studied Environmental Entrepreneurship at the University of Strathclyde, Glasgow and Water Management and Governance at UNESCO-IHE Delft, Delft before pursuing a PhD at the Amsterdam Institute for Social Science Research (AISSR), University of Amsterdam.
Evolving Property Rights in Water and Their Impact on Water Allocation and Reallocation

Hilmer J. Bosch
Evolving Property Rights in Water and Their Impact on Water Allocation and Reallocation

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor

aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam

op gezag van de Rector Magnificus

prof. dr. ir. P.P.C.C. Verbeek

ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,

in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel

op vrijdag 30 juni 2023, te 10.00 uur

door Hilmer Jan Bosch

geboren te Dongeradeel
Promotiecommissie

Promotores: prof. dr. J. Gupta Universiteit van Amsterdam
dr. H.J.L.M. Verrest Universiteit van Amsterdam

Overige leden: dr. mr. S. Schmeier IHE Delft Institute for Water Education
prof. dr. M. Hurlbert University of Regina
mr. dr. C.M. Bröllmann Universiteit van Amsterdam
dr. M.A. Hordijk Universiteit van Amsterdam
prof. dr. I.S.A. Baud Universiteit van Amsterdam

Faculteit der Maatschappij- en Gedragswetenschappen
# Table of Contents

List of Tables  xi
List of Figures  xii
List of Boxes  xii
List of Abbreviations  xiii
Publications xv
Acknowledgement xvii

Chapter 1  Property rights in Water and Reallocation of Water  1
  1.1 Introduction  3
  1.2 Social relevance: Real-life problem  4
    1.2.1 Increasing demand and decreasing supply calls for reallocating water  4
    1.2.2 Water privatization and commodification  6
    1.2.3 Social movements on water and water litigation  8
    1.2.4 The need to understand property rights  9
  1.3 Academic relevance: Scholarly gaps in knowledge  10
    1.3.1 Legacy of historical property rights and the creation of new quasi-property rights in water in the Global South  10
    1.3.2 A lack of understanding of the relationship between ‘property’ rights and water allocation and reallocation  11
  1.4 Research question, approach, and limits  12
    1.4.1 Question and sub-questions  12
    1.4.2 Scope and limitations  13
  1.5 Property rights in water, water allocation and reallocation, and inclusive development  14
    1.5.1 Property rights in water  14
    1.5.2 Water allocation and reallocation problems as part of water governance  15
    1.5.3 Inclusive development and water allocation and reallocation of water  17
  1.6 Policy relevance: Water property rights and water allocations and reallocation  20
    1.6.1 International policy  20
    1.6.2 Property rights in water IWRM and the SDGs  22
    1.6.3 Inferences  24
  1.7 Structure of thesis  24
**Chapter 2 Methodology and research approach**

2.1 Introduction 29

2.2 Case study approach 29

2.2.1 Focus on Africa and Asia 30

2.2.2 Case selection content analysis 30

2.2.3 Case study selection 33

2.3 Methods 34

2.3.1 Literature review 34

2.3.2 Content analysis 37

2.4 Positionality and research approach 51

2.5 Ethics 52

2.6 Inferences 53

**Chapter 3 State-of-the Art: The changing nature of property rights in water**

3.1 Introduction 57

3.2 Water property rights in different systems of law 57

3.2.1 Customary Law, and the law of Indigenous peoples and local communities 58

3.2.2 Common law 59

3.2.3 Civil law 62

3.2.4 Religious law 63

3.2.5 Inferences 64

3.3 Water ‘property’ rights in statutory instruments 64

3.3.1 Water property rights through water use permits 65

3.3.2 Water property rights through purchase in water markets 67

3.3.3 Water property rights through contract, lease, concession 68

3.3.4 Inferences 70

3.4 Inferences for water property rights 71

**Chapter 4 A water ownership and allocation inventory in Africa and Asia**

4.1 Introduction 75

4.2 Water Ownership in Africa and Asia 75

4.2.1 De jure water ownership vested in the state 76

4.2.2 Exceptions to state water ownership 76

4.2.3 Customary law and water ownership 77
4.3 Inventory of water allocation instruments
- 4.3.1 Existing water use
- 4.3.2 Domestic water use
- 4.3.3 Exempt water use
- 4.3.4 Water use permits
- 4.3.5 Contracts, leases and concessions

4.4 Inferences on the state of water ownership and water allocation instruments

Chapter 5 Water property rights through water use permits, affects water allocation and reallocation: An empirical assessment of 60 countries in Africa and Asia
5.1 Introduction
5.2 Dimensions and elements of Permits
- 5.2.1 Temporal dimension
- 5.2.2 Dispute resolution
- 5.2.3 Compensation
- 5.2.4 Protection of interests
- 5.2.5 Alienation
5.3 Conditions for reallocating permits
- 5.3.1 Cancelling permits
- 5.3.2 Modifying permit conditions
- 5.3.3 Limiting permits
- 5.3.4 Suspending permits
- 5.3.5 (Periodical) review of permits
- 5.3.6 Permit re-application
- 5.3.7 Declare areas: Spatial protections
5.4 Inferences for water reallocation

Chapter 6 Water property rights in investor-state contracts on extractive activities, affects water allocation and reallocation: An empirical assessment of 80 contracts in Africa and Asia
6.1 Introduction
6.2 Right to use and operate
- 6.2.1 Right to operate
- 6.2.2 Land use rights
- 6.2.3 Water use rights
6.3 Temporal dimension
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.4 Dispute resolution mechanism</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.1 Mineral contracts</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.2 Petroleum contracts</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.3 Agriculture contracts</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5 Compensation</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.1 Mineral contracts</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.2 Petroleum contracts</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.3 Agriculture contracts</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6 Stability</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1 Change of legislation</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.2 State support to investors</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7 Alienation</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8 Inferences for water reallocation</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 7 Case Study India: An analysis on the status of water ‘property rights’ in India’s 28 States</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Introduction</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Context of India</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.1 Context and drivers in relation to water availability</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.2 Evolution of water property rights in India</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.3 The institutional set up for water governance in India</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.4 Water access and allocation instrument design</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 Water ‘property’ rights: Surface- and groundwater</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.1 Surface water</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.2 Groundwater</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.3 Water (surface- and groundwater)</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4 Inferences for water allocation and reallocation</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 8 Case study South Africa: An analysis on the status of water ‘property rights’</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1 Introduction</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2 Context of South Africa</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.1 Context and drivers in relation to water availability</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.2 Evolution of water property rights in South Africa: 1910 – 1998</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.3 The institutional set up for water governance in South Africa</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.4 Water access and allocation instrument design</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

Table 1.1 Questions answered in the chapters, and the gaps they address .................................................. 13
Table 1.2 Goal 6: Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all .................. 22
Table 2.1 Summary criteria for selecting documents and case studies ......................................................... 31
Table 2.2 Results search Scopus and HeinOnline ............................................................................................ 36
Table 5.1 Allocation of quasi-property rights through permits. ................................................................. 91
Table 5.2 Grounds for the cancellation of permits ......................................................................................... 102
Table 5.3 Grounds for the amendment of permit conditions ....................................................................... 106
Table 5.4 Grounds for the limiting permits ................................................................................................. 111
Table 5.5 Grounds for the suspension of permit ......................................................................................... 112
Table 5.6 Grounds and conditions for the periodical review of permits ................................................... 113
Table 5.7 Grounds and conditions for the permit application and reapplication ......................................... 115
Table 5.8 Quasi-property rights in water through permits, affecting water reallocation ......................... 118
Table 6.1 Quasi-property rights in water through investor-state contracts, affecting water reallocation .... 145
Table 7.1 Multi-level drivers of water-related challenges affecting India ................................................... 153
Table 7.2 GDP–growth (annual %) – India ........................................................................................................ 154
Table 8.1 Multi-level drivers of water-related challenges affecting South Africa ....................................... 184
Table 8.2 GDP–growth (annual %) – South Africa ............................................................................................ 187
Table 8.3 Transboundary major rivers systems: River Basin Organisations, committees, and agreements ..... 190
Table 8.4 Water allocation priorities ............................................................................................................. 191
Table 8.5 Allocation of quasi-property rights through the granting of water entitlements in South Africa .. 202
Table 8.6 Volume of water registered by number of registered users in South Africa .................................. 217
Table 9.1 Recommendations for minimising the quasi-property rights nature of water use permits ......... 238
List of Figures

Figure 1.1 Percentage Freshwater abstraction, GDP per capita, Population growth globally – 1950 compared to 2010 5
Figure 1.2 Private Participation in Infrastructure in water and sewerage in low- and middle-income countries – 1990 – 2021 7
Figure 2.1 Evolution of Concepts Between 1970 – 2021 36
Figure 2.2 Map of countries that are included in the content-analysis 42
Figure 6.1 Global network of BITs in force. 124
Figure 8.1 Surface Water Reserve determinations for South Africa ranging from 2010 up to 2016 210

List of Boxes

Box 7.1 Water: a State matter under the Indian Constitution 162
Box 8.1 Principal functions of the Water Users Association 194
Box 8.2 Schedule 1 197
Box 8.3 Specifying Existing Lawful Use 199
Box 8.4 Brief overview of the development of water trading in South Africa, 1998 – 2021 207
Box 8.5 Article 33. Declaration of water use as existing lawful water use 213
Box 8.6 Considerations for issue of General Authorisations and licences 216
Box 8.7 Water allocation priorities 219
List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BITs</td>
<td>Bilateral Investment Treaties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRICS</td>
<td>Brazil, Russia, India, China, and South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAR</td>
<td>Central African Republic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRC</td>
<td>Democratic Republic of the Congo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DWS</td>
<td>Department of Water and Sanitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELU</td>
<td>Existing Lawful Use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GA</td>
<td>General Authorisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HAI</td>
<td>Historically Advantaged Individuals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HDI</td>
<td>Historically Disadvantaged Individuals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IB</td>
<td>Irrigation Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IWRM</td>
<td>Integrated Water Resources Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoU</td>
<td>Memorandum of Understanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPRDA</td>
<td>Mineral and Petroleum Resources Development Act 28 of 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDGs</td>
<td>Sustainable Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WUL</td>
<td>Water Use Licence</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Publications

This thesis builds on 5 scholarly papers and 3 chapters in books on water governance.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant thesis chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Authors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Papers</td>
<td>The tension between state ownership and private quasi-property rights in water.</td>
<td>Wiley Interdisciplinary Reviews Water (WIREs)</td>
<td>Published, October 2022</td>
<td>Bosch, H.J., Gupta, J.*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 &amp; 5.</td>
<td>A water property right inventory of 60 countries.</td>
<td>Review of European, Comparative &amp; International Environmental Law (RECIEL)</td>
<td>Published, May 2021</td>
<td>Bosch, H.J., Gupta, J., &amp; Verrest, H.J.L.M.**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 &amp; 5.</td>
<td>Water Permits: Do they enhance or hinder water governance?</td>
<td>IUCN AEL Journal of Environmental Law</td>
<td>Published, April 2021</td>
<td>Bosch, H.J., Gupta, J.*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Water property rights in investor-state contracts on extractive activities, affects water governance: An empirical assessment of 80 contracts in Africa and Asia.</td>
<td>Review of European, Comparative &amp; International Environmental Law (RECIEL)</td>
<td>Published, April 2022</td>
<td>Bosch, H.J., Gupta, J.*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Access to and ownership of water in Anglophone Africa and a case study in South Africa.</td>
<td>Water Alternatives (WA)</td>
<td>Published, June 2020</td>
<td>Bosch, H.J., Gupta, J.*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant thesis chapter</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Journal</td>
<td>Status</td>
<td>Authors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Book chapters</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>SDG 6: Ensure Availability and Sustainable Management of Water and Sanitation for All</td>
<td>Cambridge University Press.</td>
<td>Published, September 2022</td>
<td>Gupta, J., &amp; Bosch, H.J.***</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Bosch conceptualised and developed the research, analysed the data, and wrote the first draft of the manuscript which was revised with inputs and constructive comments provided by Gupta.

** Bosch conceptualised and developed the research, analysed the data, and wrote the first draft of the manuscript which was revised with inputs and constructive comments provided by Gupta and Verrest.

*** Gupta conceptualised and developed the research. Gupta with input from Bosch wrote the manuscript.