Climate change and topography as drivers of Latin American biome dynamics

Flantua, S.G.A.

Citation for published version (APA):
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

One of the most rewarding responsibilities in writing this thesis has been to look back and remember all those special people and moments that were in my life during the last five years. The rewarding part has to do with having the opportunity to acknowledge them and express my gratitude for helping me in ‘getting the job done’. The great responsibility is, then, to remember and to include all those who helped me accomplish what I have attained today.

In doing so, I thank the many of you who are reading these acknowledgements and have stayed along my side, for keeping up with my long hours behind the computer, and for understanding that a passion driven project is not a nine-to-five job. Special thanks are meant as well for all those people who have shared moments with me during conferences, fieldtrips, music and sports; and for those who have inspired me to be in science thus being able to make a contribution in making this world a better place for all of us.

Without a doubt, I dedicate this thesis to my supervisor, Henry Hooghiemstra. You have motivated me since I was a Master’s student. Your classes were the reason I left the University of Groningen to come and study at the University of Amsterdam. Our first collaboration during my Master already resulted in a publication thanks to your support. Even when I had long disappeared to Venezuela and Colombia after finishing my Master’s Degree, you kept our communication lines open waiting patiently for me to decide when I would be ready for a PhD. You probably knew all along that it was a matter of time for me to be convinced, but I thank you dearly for maintaining the faith that we would again engage in a long-term project. I look back with great pleasure to our year of working together on the proposal, our first ‘ping-pong’ session, after you had made it very clear that you needed my final decision before you would run out of funding possibilities. We submitted our proposal in February 2012 and hoped for the best as we knew that the chances to get funding from NWO were considered very low. Therefore, in April you proposed that even if we would not get funded, I should and could already start working by other financial means you had figured out yourself. And so I did in September 2012. In November, and by a bit unusual way, we found out that we got fully funded when a colleague asked you for advice as to how you got your NWO proposal ranked number 1 of all proposals!! At that time I was in Colombia accompanied by Elkin Posada (my paranymph) and his family, and we remember vividly the happy moment in receiving that email. Thanks to your faith in the project we had already started working for what was to become a great four years major undertaking.

I want to give you special thanks for believing that I could handle a PhD while being mostly in South America acting on my professional and academic activities; for always giving me time and space to develop myself; for supporting several of the crazy ideas to engage in
unplanned publications and trips; and also for indicating to me during our trip in Brazil in 2013 that my communication should be improved. You showed me how important it has been to maintain a high quality communication in handling any issue that arose, which we did quite smoothly during the last years. It was absolutely great to travel to Ecuador and Peru with you, and I appreciate how you accepted Elizabeth to come along, how you quietly endured sitting in the backseat of the car while curving around all those steep cliffs, and how you gave me the opportunity to plan the trip and be able to celebrate your birthday, as a surprise to you, at Chachapoyas, Leymebamba and Kuelap. Hopefully many more fieldtrips will come in the future as well as ongoing collaborations!

Elkin F. Posada, Paranymp
Our friendship at the beginning of my PhD has been life changing ever since and a gift every single day since we met. You taught me how to be the best of me and more, how to stay at the top of productivity while also recognizing my limits, and how to face challenges while always staying a healthy and happy person. Thank you for your continuous support, your everlasting advices, your patience, your dedication and help to stay in the present moment, while removing distractions from priorities. It’s an honor and a great pleasure to have you along my side.

Wendy Veerman, Paranymp
The longest lasting friendship I have also accompanied me during the entire PhD. Our weekends out to different places around the Netherlands were a welcome intermezzo to my work (sorry for cancelling some of them due to….work). Our long talks about life, people, challenges and a lot of laughter characterize our friendship and keep our contact always special and with an amazing interchange of ideas and deepening thoughts. Thank you for being here again at a very special day, for coping with my many saying-goodbye-and-back-again’s and for always checking how I am doing during long distance calls. Happy to have you here for the next exciting times to come!

A special word of thanks to my family and friends in the Netherlands who are always there to support me, keeping in touch to find out how I am doing to make sure I don’t work “too hard”. I want to thank my Mom, my ‘über-paranymph’, who has given me endless support and understanding for my passion for science, taking every opportunity to let me know how proud she is of my achievements and progress. It was great to have you and Henk in Colombia with me travelling around the country you have known from years ago. I admire your sparkling energy, desire to enjoy every single day in the best possible way, and for climbing impossible mountains by bike, and I thank you for that energy that has always inspired me to be the best I can. Ook wil ik Yvonne en Roy bedanken dat jullie altijd interesse tonen, voor de gezellige lunchafspraken bij jullie thuis en voor de kadootjes die altijd voor me klaarliggen. Ik hoop dat dit proefschrift een inspiratie zal zijn voor mijn broer Marcel om een droom in vervulling te zien gaan waar je lang en hard voor moet werken,
A large part of my PhD I spent in Colombia where I enjoyed the peacefulness of working at home with a great view over Bogotá. Some amazing friends made sure I left my place regularly, taking me out for coffees, lunches and nice trips. Catalina González, not only a much appreciated co-author, but foremost a dear friend. Working together has always been a great pleasure and you are among the first to visit when I get back to Colombia. Elizabeth Aguilera, ‘hermana’, thank you for the great weekends at the finca, I can’t wait to see it ready for long sleepovers. Inviting you to come with me and Henry to Ecuador and Peru was the best decision ever. You were always the one to jump out of the car first, making sure we had a place to sleep and to eat, and a beer for Henry. I really hope that we will make another fieldtrip somewhere soon!

My work experience in South America has expanded in an exceptional way thanks to Milton Romero. Working with you in different projects has provided me important insights into many different fields of research in the Neotropics, making my overall profile very versatile while also fulfilling my eagerness to broaden my background knowledge on the tropics.
Thank you for everything you have shared with me and for motivating me in becoming an excellent ‘GIS-er’, and to share and confirm in me with your experience the important philosophy in producing the highest quality outcomes and in always giving more than one is asked for. Not only was working together very easy and always felt very natural, but you played an important role in my life in Colombia as a very dear friend. Always ready to help me out, to hear how I was doing while inviting me generously to be part of your professional and family life. Many good times we shared and beautiful memories always remain. And thanks to you, I met Olgalú Hernández and Nicolás Giménez who welcomed me to be part of the "animal family" and with whom spending New Year's eve in the mountains of Villa de Leyva was a unique experience. Working with Olgalú was always accompanied with immense hilarity and I recall numerous times we cried with laughter. Thank you for those great times, abrazo para los dos.

The group at IBED has always giving me warm surroundings for work, interested in my whereabouts, asking when I would come back, and making me part of new things to come. Will Gosling, Frank Hammacher, Bas van Geel, Joost Duivenvoorden, Thijs de Boer, Gerard Oostermeijer, Emiel van Loon, Judy Shamoun-Baranes, and Harry Seijmonsbergen just make it immensely fun and inspiring to be at IBED. John van Bozel has been involved in many undertakings since my Master’s Degree. Thank you for your critical review of my work, always filtering out the many unnoticed details. You had an important share in IBED’s advances for the LAPD and it would be great to keep that effort going. I owe quite a lot to the always very helpful ladies at the secretary, Tanya Noorlander, Maria Dolorita and Mary Parra. You helped me plan many trips and specifically, your help to have me live in a proper house to finish my PhD has been an immense gift from heaven. A special thanks goes to Divyam Steveker for helping me out with the many questions I had concerning the budget, for moving items around to cover all designated purposes, and also for supporting my effort in making sure that the final euros of the project would be spend (although I think that at the end we both were happy the project had finished!).

My special thanks to Annemarie Philip who I've known since coming in as a Master's student allowing me to have exclusive lunches and long talks at her laboratory. It's great to know that you are always awaiting to hear news about my arrivals in Amsterdam. Milan Teunissen van Manen, Mirellita la Grande, Adele Julier and Nick Loughlin: You have made the final year of my PhD a very fun one. Sharp humor, a proper level of self-mockery, and conversations with an average of 128 different topics per hour. You made my decision to come back to the Netherlands to spend more time at IBED worthwhile. Crystal McMichael: when you become a professor I will open an amazing bottle of Santa Teresa 1796 rum from Venezuela hoping you will still remember to invite me to join the celebration of the hardworking (and mad) scientist you are. Women scientists like you are very few, so Milan and Adele have a great example to follow.
Another woman in science who I admire greatly is Carina Hoorn. Your perseverance, your dedication to science, your sense of recognizing exciting topics, and your huge network of prestigious researchers are really admirable. Thank you for getting me involved in new ideas that arise and for introducing me to so many people around. I hope we will continue working together for many years to come!

And sometimes there are those people that were not directly involved with the PhD project but their presence and conversations nevertheless triggered new ideas and motivated to think bigger, be a better researcher, and always push my results to a next level: I want to thank Daniel Kissling for your share in my development, for giving me the opportunity to learn from your experience while working on the NG-Review paper, and also for making me part of your group where I have been able to expand my horizon. I feel fortunate to be one of your collaborators and besides inspiring, it’s also great fun. I want to thank Kenneth Rijsdijk and Sietze Norder for their contagious passion for island biogeography and for introducing me to shifting sea level changes during the Pleistocene. Having ‘newcomers’ like Renske Onstein and Chris Barratt at the institute instantly added enjoyable distractions from work. You are the perfect example that friendships can start in a split second and I will enjoy having you around for a long while more.

From another research group in Europe, I would like to give a special word to Alexandre Antonelli for the very interesting, insightful and inspiring experience while working together, and for giving me the opportunity to get to know his group in Sweden. One of the things I have to thank for is the confidence and certainty I learnt from you at aiming at the highest journals. You also gather an amazing group of people around you, each one of them great scientists and ‘one of a kind’ people. Meeting Laura Lagomarsino, Christine Bacon, Daniele Silvestro, and Alexander Zizka has been great, and working with Allison Perrigo was an immense pleasure! What a dream team! Hopefully in the future we will all meet and work again.

During the thesis I have been fortunate to be accompanied by many researchers with whom I established common grounds in shared publications. I want to thank each one of them for being my co-authors in the publications that are now bundled in this thesis. It has been a great experience to be leading papers, but it was foremost a pleasure to learn from the unique contribution that each single co-author made. Thank you for what you have shared, for being part of my thesis, and I hope that we will again meet in future papers and exciting collaborations.

During and even from before my PhD, the Neotoma community had welcomed me in a very special way to be part of a global effort to gather paleo-data. Not only have I learned a lot by working together and did I enjoy immensely the meetings, but it was also great to feel supported in my work by so many enthusiastic and leading researchers in their field:
Russell Graham, Simon Brewer, Simon Goring, Jessica Blois, Jack Williams, Thomas Giesecke, and Eric Grimm. Here an extra word of gratitude for Eric: Thank you for being on my Thesis committee, for your support for the LAPD throughout the PhD, and for having me enjoy a wonderful stay at your house in Springfield (also thanks to Jane!). It’s a great pleasure to have you enjoy several months in Amsterdam with us.

And I want to give a special thanks to those scientists, researchers and naturalists out there who unawaresly have inspired me to learn more, understand more, think out of the box, triggering my imagination about the mysteries of nature yet to be understood: Valentí Rull, Colin Hughes, Richard Field, Rob Colwell, Mark Lomolino and Rob Whittaker. It has been an honor to have worked with some of you already and I truly hope that new collaborations will follow.

I would like to thank the Thesis Committee for spending time on reading my thesis and for being with me at such a special day of the thesis defense: Prof. dr. Eric Grimm, Prof. dr. Vera Markgraf, Prof. dr. Dirk Verschuren, Dr. Carina Hoorn, Dr. Will Gosling, Prof. dr. Steph Menken and Prof. dr. Peter de Ruiter.

And here my final words of appreciation to those who triggered my interest in the Neotropics and motivated me to dedicate my life to being a biologist and scientist making me feel that I am following your footsteps: Henry Hooghiemstra, Antoine Cleef, Thomas van der Hammen, and of course my childhood hero sir David Attenborough. My biggest admiration for all of you for your scientific work, your pioneering research, years of fieldwork, visionary insights, and everlasting passion for science and nature.

In closing, I want to share my gratefulness to the Universe for putting in my path the great people who made me who I am today…:

‘…quasi nanos, gigantium humeris insidentes, ut possimus plura eis et remotiora videre, non utique proprii visus acumine, aut eminentia corporis, sed quia in altum subvenimur et extollimur magnitudine gigantean.’
John of Salisbury, Metalogicon (1159)

...we are as dwarfs sitting on the shoulders of giants, so that we can see more things than they, and things at a greater distance, not at any rate by virtue of sharpness of sight on our part, or any physical excellence, but because we are assisted and lifted up by their giant size’

So… always make sure you choose your giants wisely!

Suzette G.A. Flantua
April 28th, 2017
CO-AUTHORSHIP STATEMENT
The following people contributed to the publication of work undertaken as part of this thesis (their current institution and the number of publications they contributed to):

Name candidate and institution = Suzette Flantua, University of Amsterdam.
Name and institution = Henry Hooghiemstra, University of Amsterdam. (8)
Name and institution = John Van Boxel, University of Amsterdam. (3)
Name and institution = Catalina González-Arango, Universidad Los Andes. (3)
Name and institution = Valentí Rull, Institute of Earth Sciences Jaume Almera. (2)
Name and institution = Marie-Pierre Ledru, Inst. des Sciences de l’Evolution de Montpellier. (2)
Name and institution = William Gosling, University of Amsterdam. (2)
Name and institution = Hermann Behling, Georg August University of Göttingen (2)
Name and institution = Antonio Maldonado, Centro de Estudios Avanzados en Zonas Áridas (2)
Name and institution = Alexandre Antonelli, University of Gothenburg. (1)
Name and institution = Catherine Badgley, University of Michigan (1)
Name and institution = Mauricio Bermúdez, Universidad Central de Venezuela (1)
Name and institution = Maarten Blaauw, Queen’s University Belfast (1)
Name and institution = Mark Bush, Florida Institute of Technology (1)
Name and institution = Marian Cabrera, University of Amsterdam (1)
Name and institution = John Carson, University of Reading (1)
Name and institution = Jon Fjeldså, University of Copenhagen (1)
Name and institution = Susanne Fritz, Biodiversität und Klima Forschungszentrum (1)
Name and institution = Eric Grimm, University of Minnesota (1)
Name and institution = Zaire González-Carranza, University of Amsterdam (1)
Name and institution = Frédéric Herman, University of Lausanne (1)
Name and institution = Carina Hoorn, University of Amsterdam (1)
Name and institution = Isabel Hoyos, Universidad de Antioquia (1)
Name and institution = Daniel Kissling, University of Amsterdam (1)
Name and institution = Holger Kreft, University of Göttingen (1)
Name and institution = Peter Linder, University of Zurich (1)
Name and institution = Socorro Lozano-García, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México (1)
Name and institution = Frank Mayle, University of Reading (1)
Name and institution = Encarni Montoya, Institute of Earth Sciences Jaume Almera (1)
Name and institution = Carsten Rahbek, University of Copenhagen (1)
Name and institution = Andreas Mulch, Biodiversität und Klima Forschungszentrum (1)
Name and institution = Aldo Prieto, Universidad Nacional de Mar del Plata (1)
Name and institution = Marcela Tonello, Universidad Nacional de Mar del Plata (1)
Name and institution = John Van Smaalen, ESRI Netherlands (1)
Name and institution = Mathias Vuille, State University of New York (1)
Name and institution = Bronwen Whitney, Northumbria University (1)
Author details and their roles in each chapter/paper:

Chapter 2: Flantua, S.G.A.\textsuperscript{1}, Hooghiemstra\textsuperscript{2}, H., Grimm\textsuperscript{3}, E.C., Behling\textsuperscript{4}, H., Bush\textsuperscript{5}, M.B., González-Arango\textsuperscript{6}, C., Gosling\textsuperscript{7}, W.D., Ledru\textsuperscript{8}, M.-P., Lozano-García, S.\textsuperscript{9}, Maldonado, A.\textsuperscript{10}, Prieto, A.R.\textsuperscript{11}, Rull, V.\textsuperscript{12}, Van Boxel, J.H.\textsuperscript{13}, 2015. Updated site compilation of the Latin American Pollen Database. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 223, 104–115.

The candidate, author 2 and author 13 were the primary authors. The candidate undertook the data collection and assessments, and the writing of the initial drafts of the manuscript to which author 2 and 13 provided comments. Author 4-12 provided feedback on the advanced versions of the manuscript. Author 3 revised and improved the English before publication.


The candidate was the primary author. Author 2 and author 3 contributed to the idea. The candidate created the geochronological database and did all age model processing, and made adjustments to the R scripts for the purpose of this paper. Author 2 contributed with the R scripts developed from a previous paper and adjusted formats. The candidate did the main writing while Author 2 and 3 contributed with comments to the manuscript.

Chapter 4: Flantua, S.G.A.\textsuperscript{1}, Hooghiemstra, H.\textsuperscript{3}, Vuille, M.\textsuperscript{3}, Behling, H.\textsuperscript{4}, Carson, J.F.\textsuperscript{5}, Gosling, W.D.\textsuperscript{6}, Hoyos, I.\textsuperscript{7}, Ledru, M.P.\textsuperscript{8}, Montoya, E.\textsuperscript{9}, Mayle, F.\textsuperscript{10}, Maldonado, A.\textsuperscript{11}, Rull, V.\textsuperscript{12}, Tonello, M.S.\textsuperscript{13}, Whitney, B.S.\textsuperscript{14}, González-Arango, C.\textsuperscript{15}, 2016. Climate variability and human impact in South America during the last 2000 years: synthesis and perspectives from pollen records. Climate of the Past 12, 483–523.

The candidate, authors 2 and 14 were the primary authors and conceived the idea of the paper. Author 3 prepared the section on climate, performed the data analysis and produced Figures 1-5. Authors 4-15 each provided a section on their region of specialization. The candidate coordinated all contributions performing quality control and consistency checks. Figures 6-13 were prepared between the candidate and Author 15. Authors 3, 6 and 14 improved the English before submission. Authors 3 and 14 made important contributions to the comments to reviewers.


This paper was part of the Candidate’s master project called: “Modeling the spatial distribution of the Colombian savannas: Los llanos Orientales”. The initial idea for this project was proposed by Author 3. The candidate undertook the processing and analysis of the data, and author 4 provided GIS assistance. Authors 3 and 2 contributed meaningful comments to the master report and proposed the re-writing of the report to a manuscript. Draft writing was undertaken by the candidate after all authors revised before submission. Author 2 contributed editorial assistance during the process of the manuscript submission to the journal.

The candidate, author 2 and author 3 were the primary authors. The candidate performed the data recollection and analysis, and presented the initial drafts of the manuscript. Author 4 dedicated her master thesis to an initial try-out of the idea. Author 5 provided pollen data. Authors 2, 3 and 6 provided feedback to the manuscript.


The candidate and author 2 jointly conceived the idea. The candidate prepared drafts of the manuscript and figures, and author 2 provided feedback for improvements.


Authors 1, 2, 4, 15 and the candidate share first authorship by leading the initiative and preparing the main body of the manuscripts. Additionally, the candidate performed the database compilation and analysis, authors 1 and 15 did the coordinating and networking, and author 2 performed the statistical analysis. Authors 4 and 13 provided the geological database. Author 10 provided the species richness database. Authors 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 12, 13 provided additional feedback to the manuscript.

Chapter 9: Flantua, S.G.A. 1, Hooghiemstra, H. 2 Unravelling the mountain fingerprint: topography, paleoclimate and connectivity as drivers of contemporary biodiversity patterns in the Northern Andes

The candidate and author 2 both conceived the idea. The candidate did the manuscript writing and figure design, and author 2 provided feedback for improvements.
BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCH
The author was born in San José, Costa Rica. She also lived in Nicaragua and Haiti, returning to the Netherlands at the age of 5. She attended high school in Utrecht after which she left for Colombia at the age of 18 to engage in voluntary work and learn Spanish. She graduated with a Bachelor in Biology at the University of Groningen in 2004, with a specialization in Marine Biology. She decided to expand her Bachelor with some extra courses at the University of Amsterdam. After following Paleo-ecology and Tropical ecology, she switched to Amsterdam to initiate her degree in Masters there. She started to work with Henry Hooghiemstra and John Van Boxel in a Master project on analyzing fossil pollen records in GIS which resulted in her first scientific publication. During the second half of her Master she went to Venezuela to engage in a fieldwork project in the National Park of Canaima working with indigenous people. She finished her Master degree in Biological Sciences in 2008 and decided to stay in Venezuela to get more work experience and engaging in numerous fieldwork trips more. After several years in Venezuela she moved to Colombia. Much of her work experience in GIS and remote sensing she obtained during the years that followed working for different companies and governmental institutes, publishing in a range of different topics. She expanded her interests to sustainable development, focusing on current climate change, spatial planning, risk assessments, and land use cover changes. While being in Colombia she started to work with the Latin American Pollen Database supported several times by funding from the Hugo de Vries Fonds. This formed the base to start the doctoral studies in 2012 at the University of Amsterdam.

Photo taken in the Sierra Nevada de Cocuy, Colombia - August 2014
LIST OF PUBLICATIONS

Published/accepted publications


TRAINING AND EDUCATION

International symposia and conferences

- 4th meeting of the Network for Neotropical Biogeography. Panama City, Panama. Poster. (2015)

Competence strengthening / skills courses

- Complex dynamics in human-environment systems; SENSE (2013)
- English academic writing; University of Amsterdam (2013)
- Time and Project management; Wageningen University (2013)
- Tools for analyzing landscape connectivity: methods and applications; Universidad Politécnica de Madrid (2013)
- Modelling and mapping species distribution; University of Amsterdam (2013)
- The Data Scientist’s Toolbox. Coursera (2014)
- Advanced Grant Writing and Proposal Development, University of Amsterdam (2016)

Workgroup meetings and workshops

- International PAGES workgroup. LaAcer I Millennial scale climate variability over the last glacial period in tropical and subtropical America (2012)
- Harmonization of Database Chronologies; ACER-INTIMATE joint workshop (2012)
- Age Models, Chronologies, and Databases Workshop (2014)
- The Antonelli Lab meeting – Evolution and biogeography with focus on the Neotropics (2014)
- Cross-disciplinary Palaeo-Environmental Research Training (XPRT) network - Summer school and fieldwork (2015)
- Palaeoecological and remote sensing discipline-bridging workshop (2015)
- PAGES Landcover mapping 6k workshop on pollen-vegetation mapping techniques, REVEALS, LOVE and modelling anthropogenic land-cover changes (2015)
- Neotoma Paleocommunity Database workshop (2010, 2011, 2016)
- European Pollen Database meeting and workshops (2016)
- LandCover6k Workshop (2016)

**Lecturing / supervision of practical / fieldwork in courses**

- Bachelor course Biodiversity & Global Change (2014, 2015, 2016)
- Paleoecology (2014, 2015, 2016)
- Pre-congress training course for young scientists LOTRED – South American (2014)

**Supervision of students**

- Connectivity and isolation in the Puna of Peru and Bolivia and its effect on species distribution; Anna Schwarz (2014)
- Population dynamics and choice of settlement in Peru from carbon-14 dated archaeological sites; Jesse Zondervan (2016)
- Summer internship on literature compilation and review of the Latin American Pollen Database; Seringe Huisman, Mayke Nieuwkerk, Nina Witteveen, Johnny Vogel (2016)
FINANCIAL SUPPORT
FINANCIAL SUPPORT

This research was financially supported by the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research (NWO, grant 2012/13248/ALW). The Hugo-de-Vries Fonds in Amsterdam supported the update of the LAPD with three grants between 2009 and 2011. NWO provided additional grants to publish Chapter 3 and Chapter 4 in the open access journal 'Climate of the Past' (grant 2015/06270/BOO and grant 2015/06271/BOO). PAGES co-supported the article processing charges of chapter 4. PAGES co-supported both La-ACER workshops in Colombia (November 2012) and in Brazil (August 2013). Travel expenses to the Age Models, Chronologies and Database Workshop was fully covered by funding from the NSF-funded NEOTOMA Paleocology Database working group and additional funding from PAGES and the US National Science Foundation. Travel expenses to the Neotoma workshops in Madison (2010) and San Francisco (2015) were fully covered by the NSF-funded NEOTOMA Paleocology Database. Local expenses in Sweden to attend the yearly Antonelli Lab meeting (2014) were covered by the University of Gothenburg.

Financial support from the University of Amsterdam for printing this thesis is gratefully acknowledged.