UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

[Review of: I. Marazka, R. Pourjavady, S. Schmidtke (2006) Samaw'al al-Maghribī's (d. 570/1175) Ifhām al-yahūd: the early recension]

Schippers, A.

DOI

[10.2143/BIOR.67.1.2052748](https://doi.org/10.2143/BIOR.67.1.2052748)

Publication date

2010

Document Version

Final published version

Published in

Bibliotheca Orientalis

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Schippers, A. (2010). [Review of: I. Marazka, R. Pourjavady, S. Schmidtke (2006) Samaw'al al-Maghribī's (d. 570/1175) Ifhām al-yahūd: the early recension]. *Bibliotheca Orientalis*, 67(1-2), 213-214. <https://doi.org/10.2143/BIOR.67.1.2052748>

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

UvA-DARE is a service provided by the library of the University of Amsterdam (<https://dare.uva.nl>)

The importance of the *Ifhām* is to have developed a strong debate between different authors. The work generated other works such as those of Aḥmad ibn Idrīs al-Sanhājī al-Qarāfī (d. 1285) and Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya (d. 1350). Among the Jews the Baghdadi Saʿd ibn Manṣūr ibn Kammūna (d. 1284), in his *Tanqīḥ al-abḥāth lil-milal al-thalāth* ("Critical evaluation of the researches of the three religions"), rejected numerous objections against Judaism raised in the *Ifhām*, which also served as a reference text for some later authors polemizing against Judaism.²⁾

The work can be divided in three parts:

1. Part One (pp. 1-15) containing an introduction about Samaw'al al-Maghribī and his work, and about the interest for his work from the 19th century onwards. For instance the textual edition by Moshe Perlmann, in 1964, which was based on a later version of the manuscript, and the more recent one realised by Muḥammad 'Abd Allāh al-Sharqāwī (1986) on the basis of an Istanbul Ms Topkapı Saray 4832 R 506 and Damascus Zāhiriyya 5111, and he also made use of Perlmann's edition. Information about the manuscripts with earlier versions is given, namely the Ms Tehran Majlis 593, Majlis 4547 and Dānishgāh 1074 from the Central Library of the University of Tehran.

2. Part Two contains the critical edition of the *Ifhām* (pp. 19-48) from the Mss Tehran Majlis 593 and 4547, and the republishing of two documents in appendix of the treatise, namely the *Nuskhat mas'ala wuridat 'alā s-Samaw'al min ba'd al-zanādiqa al-mutafalsifa* ("Text of a question directed to Samuel by one of the godless philosophers" (pp. 44-45), and the answer to this question, namely the *Nuskhat al-jawāb* (pp. 46-48). The edition is equipped with a meticulous critical apparatus.

3. Part Three (pp. 51-71) contains facsimiles of Ms Majlis 4547 (pp. 51-69) and the Ms Dānishgāh 1074 (pp. 70-71), which only provides the introduction of the work. Interesting in the facsimiles is to see how the quotations from the Hebrew Bible are given in the text: some indecipherable signs, followed by the transcription of the Hebrew in Arabic characters with the real Hebrew text added in the margin.

This edition of the "Early Recension" gives us a good idea of the different textual traditions and variants. We may congratulate the team Marazka/Pourjavady/Schmidtke for their thorough editorial work.

University of Amsterdam, June 2009

Arie SCHIPPERS

* *
*

MARAZKA, I., R. POURJAVADY and S. SCHMIDTKE (eds.) — Samaw'al al-Maghribī's (d. 570/1175) *Ifhām al-yahūd*. The Early Recension. (Abhandlungen für die Kunde des Morgenlandes, Band LVII, 2). Verlag Otto Harrassowitz, Wiesbaden, 2006. (22 cm, 71). ISBN 3-447-05284-8, ISSN 0567-4980. € 38,-.

Samaw'al al-Maghribī, a 12th century North African mathematician and physician and a Jewish convert to Islam was motivated by his conversion to write a pamphlet against Judaism entitled "Sealing the mouth of the Jews" (*Ifhām al-yahūd*). The arguments which are used by the author are the typical arguments used by medieval Muslim polemicists against Judaism¹⁾.

¹⁾ See M. Schreiner, "Zur Geschichte der Polemik zwischen Juden und Muhammedanern", *Zeitschrift der deutschen morgenländischen Gesellschaft* 42 (1888), 591-675; Camilla Adang, *Muslim Writers on Judaism and the Hebrew Bible: from Ibn Rabban to Ibn Hazm*. Brill, Leiden, 1996.

²⁾ See Daniel J. Lasker, "The Jewish critique of Christianity under Islam in the Middle Ages", *PAAJR* 57 (1991), 121-153; id., *Jewish Philosophical Polemics against Christianity in the Middle Ages*, New York, Littman, KTAV, 1977; id. with Sarah Stroumsa, *The Polemic of Nestor the Priest*, 2 vols., Jerusalem, Ben-Zvi Institute for the Study of Jewish Communities in the East, 1996; Barbara Roggema, "Epistemology as Polemics: Ibn Kammūna's Examination of the Apologetics of the Three Faiths", in Barbara Roggema et al. (eds.), *The three rings. Textual studies in the historical triad of Judaism, Christianity, and Islam*, Leuven, Peeters, 2005, pp. 47-68.

* *
*