Prisoners of the international community: the legal position of persons detained at international criminal tribunals

Abels, D.

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
# Table of Contents

| Contents | vii |
| Table of Contents | ix |
| Acknowledgements | xix |
| Abbreviations | xxiii |

## Chapter 1 Introduction .............................................................. 27
1.1 Detention at international criminal tribunals ........................................... 27
1.2 Purpose of the study ........................................................................ 28
1.3 Scope of the study and definitions ....................................................... 31
1.4 Methodology ........................................................................................ 35
1.5 Structure of the study ......................................................................... 37
1.6 Use of instruments and case-law ......................................................... 38

## Part 1 Detention law at international criminal tribunals: sources and principles

## Chapter 2 The protection of detained persons under international law ....... 43
2.1 Introduction ...................................................................................... 43
2.2 International developments ............................................................... 45
  2.2.1 General developments ................................................................. 45
  2.2.2 The prohibition of torture and other inhuman and degrading treatment or punishment ............................................................. 51
    The UDHR, the ICCPR and the 1975 Declaration .............................. 51
    The U.N. Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment and the Committee .................. 53
    The Subcommittee on the Prevention of Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment ................................. 58
    The U.N. Special Rapporteur on Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment ........................................ 61
  2.2.3 The United Nations Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice Program and its standard setting work .................................................. 63
Chapter 3 The legal regimes governing detention at the international criminal tribunals

3.1 Introduction

3.2 The institutions’ legal frameworks

3.2.1 Statutes

3.2.2 Rules of Procedure and Evidence

3.2.3 Administrative regulations regarding detention matters

3.3 Exceptions to the regular detention regimes

3.3.1 The modification of detention conditions

3.3.2 The prohibition or regulation of contact of detainees with other persons

3.4 Applying human rights law
3.4.1 The applicability of international human rights law ............................... 191
   The rationales for applying international human rights law .......................... 191
   The applicability of international human rights law .......................................... 193
3.4.2 Sources of law and the tribunals’ practice ................................................. 214
   Agreements, customary law and general principles of law .............................. 214
3.4.3 Difficulties in applying human rights law .................................................... 222
3.5 Applying soft-law penal standards and beyond ................................................. 231
3.6 Conclusion ........................................................................................................... 250

Chapter 4 Principles of law governing detention at the international criminal
tribunals ..................................................................................................................... 255
4.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................... 255
4.2 Principles defined ............................................................................................... 259
4.3 Principles of law governing detention at the international criminal tribunals .... 268
   4.3.1 The notion of ‘principles’ as employed by international tribunals ............... 268
   4.3.2 Primary principles: respect for human dignity and the rule of law ............... 271
   4.3.3 A selection of secondary principles ............................................................. 284
      The presumption of innocence ................................................................... 284
      Equal treatment and non-discrimination ....................................................... 295
      Natural justice and procedural fairness ......................................................... 302
      Respect for the right of detained persons to complain about intramural
      matters (to a higher authority) .................................................................... 310
      Respect for the fair trial rights of accused persons in detention ..................... 313
      Preserving the health of detained persons ...................................................... 323
      Social rehabilitation ..................................................................................... 332
4.4 Conclusion ........................................................................................................... 347

Part 2 Detention law at international criminal tribunals:
   procedures

Chapter 5 Making and handling complaints......................................................... 351
5.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................... 351
5.2 Complaints procedures: rationales and legal framework .............................. 354
5.2.1 Rationales ........................................................................................................ 354
5.2.2 Legal framework ............................................................................................ 362
5.3 Complaints procedures at the international criminal tribunals ...................... 369
  5.3.1 Making complaints to the person in charge of the day-to-day management of
    the facility ........................................................................................................... 369
  ICTY .................................................................................................................... 369
  ICTR ................................................................................................................... 371
  SCSL .................................................................................................................. 377
  STL ...................................................................................................................... 379
  ICC .................................................................................................................... 380
  5.3.2 Making complaints to the Registrar ............................................................ 382
  ICTY .................................................................................................................... 382
  ICTR ................................................................................................................... 389
  SCSL .................................................................................................................. 396
  STL ...................................................................................................................... 404
  ICC .................................................................................................................... 404
  5.3.3 Making complaints to the President/Presidency ......................................... 407
  ICTY .................................................................................................................... 407
  ICTR ................................................................................................................... 409
  SCSL .................................................................................................................. 414
  STL ...................................................................................................................... 417
  ICC .................................................................................................................... 417
  5.3.4 Evaluation .................................................................................................... 421
  Informal avenues for making complaints ................................................... 421
  Independence and impartiality of the adjudicator ....................................... 423
  Legal assistance ............................................................................................ 427
  Transparency .................................................................................................. 427
  Financial compensation .............................................................................. 428
  5.4 Medical complaints ............................................................................................ 433
  5.4.1 Making complaints about medical care ...................................................... 433
  ICTY .................................................................................................................... 433
  ICTR ................................................................................................................... 443
  SCSL .................................................................................................................. 447
5.4.2 Evaluation .................................................................................................... 454

Establishing a complaints procedure that deals specifically with medical complaints ................................................................. 454
Deaths in custody ............................................................................................................ 455

5.5 Making complaints to the inspectorate ................................................................. 460

5.5.1 Complaining to the inspectorate at international criminal tribunals ............... 460
ICTY ........................................................................................................... 460
ICTR ........................................................................................................... 464
SCSL ........................................................................................................... 468
STL ............................................................................................................. 469
ICC .............................................................................................................. 470

5.5.2 Evaluation .................................................................................................... 475

5.6 Making complaints to Trial and Appeals Chambers ............................................. 483

5.6.1 Detained accused persons’ complaints about intramural matters to Trial and Appeals Chambers ................................................................. 483
ICTY ........................................................................................................... 483
ICTR ........................................................................................................... 487
SCSL ........................................................................................................... 491
ICC .............................................................................................................. 496

5.6.2 Evaluation .................................................................................................... 497

5.7 Conclusion ........................................................................................................... 498

5.7.1 An independent complaints adjudicator ...................................................... 498
5.7.2 Complaints about medical care ................................................................. 501
5.7.3 Legal assistance in complaints procedures .................................................. 501
5.7.4 Inspections ................................................................................................... 502

Chapter 6 Discipline .................................................................................................. 507

6.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................... 507

6.2 Prison discipline: theoretical underpinnings and legal framework ...................... 508

6.2.1 Theoretical underpinnings ........................................................................... 508
6.2.2 Legal framework .......................................................................................... 514
Human rights jurisprudence ................................................................. 514
Penal standards .................................................................................... 525

6.3 Discipline at the international criminal tribunals’ detention facilities .......... 532
  6.3.1 Discipline at the various tribunals .................................................... 532
    ICTY .................................................................................................. 532
    ICTR .................................................................................................. 539
    SCSL .................................................................................................. 545
    STL ..................................................................................................... 556
    ICC .................................................................................................... 559
  6.3.2 Evaluation ....................................................................................... 562
    Review by an external adjudicator ....................................................... 562
    Legal assistance .................................................................................. 567
    Emergency proceedings ....................................................................... 568
    Solitary confinement and reduction of diet .......................................... 569
    Final observations ............................................................................... 570

6.4 Conclusion .......................................................................................... 571

Chapter 7 The designation of States for the enforcement of sentences .......... 573
7.1 Introduction .......................................................................................... 573
7.2 The designation of States for the enforcement of sentences ................. 576
  7.2.1 International penal standards ......................................................... 576
  7.2.2 General observations .................................................................... 578
    ICTY, ICTR, SCSL and STL ............................................................... 578
    ICC .................................................................................................... 588
  7.2.3 The tribunals’ designation procedures ......................................... 596
    ICTY .................................................................................................. 596
    ICTR .................................................................................................. 611
    SCSL .................................................................................................. 624
    ICC .................................................................................................... 634
7.3 Evaluation ............................................................................................ 641
  7.3.1 The sentencing judges’ knowledge of prison conditions .................. 641
  7.3.2 The need for an independent and impartial appeals adjudicator in designation procedures ................................. 641
7.3.3 Establishing an international prison ............................................................ 645
7.3.4 Inter-State co-operation on the transfer of prisoners and the tribunals’
designation regimes compared ............................................................................. 647
7.3.5 The timing of the SCSL convicts’ transfer to Rwanda ............................... 649
7.3.6 The treatment of international prisoners as foreign prisoners............... 650
   General observations ................................................................................... 650
   The treatment of foreigners in Dutch prisons ............................................. 654
   Concluding observations............................................................................. 657
7.3.7 Transparency ............................................................................................... 658
7.3.8 A lack of willing States ............................................................................... 659
7.4 Conclusion ........................................................................................................... 661

Part 3 Detention law at international criminal tribunals:
conditions of detention

Chapter 8 Contact with the outside world............................................................. 665
8.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................... 665
8.2 Contact with family and friends........................................................................... 670
   8.2.1 Contact with family and friends: rationales and legal requirements ....... 670
      Rationales.................................................................................................... 670
      Legal framework......................................................................................... 678
8.2.2 Contact with family and friends at the various tribunals ...................... 706
      ICTY ........................................................................................................... 706
      ICTR ........................................................................................................... 736
      SCSL ........................................................................................................... 759
      ICC .............................................................................................................. 779
8.2.3 Evaluation .................................................................................................... 823
      Accessibility of regulations and detention orders .................................. 823
      Foreseeability of infringements on detainees’ rights.............................. 824
      The necessity of the infringements ........................................................... 828
      Retention of recordings ........................................................................... 829
      Financial assistance for family visits ...................................................... 830
      Communications with the inspectorate ................................................... 836

xv
9.2 Conclusions ............................................................................................................. 960
  9.2.1 The detention law of the international criminal tribunals ......................... 960
  9.2.2 Free and confidential communications with counsel: a rule of customary
      international law ..................................................................................................... 962
  9.2.3 Disciplinary punishment: solitary confinement and reduction of diet .......... 963
  9.2.4 Inter-State co-operation on the transfer of prisoners and the tribunals’
      designation regimes compared ............................................................................ 963
  9.2.5 UNDU detainees’ contact with the media ....................................................... 964
9.3 Recommendations ................................................................................................. 965
  9.3.1 The need for an independent and impartial adjudicator in complaints
      proceedings ............................................................................................................. 965
  9.3.2 The need for an independent and impartial appeals adjudicator in
      disciplinary proceedings ....................................................................................... 967
  9.3.3 The need for an independent and impartial appeals adjudicator in designation
      procedures ............................................................................................................. 970
  9.3.4 Inspections ..................................................................................................... 972
  9.3.5 The sentencing judges’ knowledge of prison conditions .............................. 973
  9.3.6 The treatment of international prisoners as foreign prisoners .................... 973
  9.3.7 Accessibility of regulations and detention orders governing detainees’
      contact with the outside world ............................................................................. 974
  9.3.8 The foreseeability and necessity of infringements on substantial rights of
      detainees ............................................................................................................... 975
  9.3.9 Detainees’ communications with the inspectorate ....................................... 976
  9.3.10 Financial assistance for family visits .......................................................... 978

Summary ................................................................................................................................. 981
Samenvatting (Summary in Dutch) ......................................................................................... 989
Bibliography ........................................................................................................................... 997
Official documents and resolutions ...................................................................................... 1029
Table of Cases ...................................................................................................................... 1043