Prisoners of the international community: the legal position of persons detained at international criminal tribunals

Abels, D.

Citation for published version (APA):
# Table of Contents

**Contents** .................................................................................................................................... vii
**Table of Contents** ....................................................................................................................... ix
**Acknowledgements** .................................................................................................................. xix
**Abbreviations** ......................................................................................................................... xxiii

## Chapter 1 Introduction .............................................................................................................. 27
1.1 Detention at international criminal tribunals ........................................................................ 27
1.2 Purpose of the study ............................................................................................................. 28
1.3 Scope of the study and definitions ....................................................................................... 31
1.4 Methodology ......................................................................................................................... 35
1.5 Structure of the study .......................................................................................................... 37
1.6 Use of instruments and case-law ....................................................................................... 38

## Part 1 Detention law at international criminal tribunals: sources and principles

## Chapter 2 The protection of detained persons under international law ......................... 43
2.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................................... 43
2.2 International developments ................................................................................................. 45
   2.2.1 General developments ............................................................................................... 45
   2.2.2 The prohibition of torture and other inhuman and degrading treatment or punishment .............................................................................................................. 51
      The UDHR, the ICCPR and the 1975 Declaration ......................................................... 51
      The U.N. Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment and the Committee ............................. 53
      The Subcommittee on the Prevention of Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment .................................................. 58
      The U.N. Special Rapporteur on Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment ................................................................. 61
   2.2.3 The United Nations Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice Program and its standard setting work ................................................................. 63
2.3 Regional developments ................................................................. 81
  2.3.1 General developments ............................................................. 81
    Europe ............................................................................................ 81
    The Americas ................................................................................... 90
    Africa ............................................................................................. 95
    The Arab region .............................................................................. 96
  2.3.2 The prohibition of torture and other inhuman and degrading treatment or punishment ............................................................................. 98
    Europe ............................................................................................ 98
    The Americas ................................................................................... 102
    Africa ............................................................................................. 105
  2.4 Conclusion .................................................................................... 106

Chapter 3 The legal regimes governing detention at the international criminal tribunals ................................................................. 109
  3.1 Introduction ................................................................................... 109
  3.2 The institutions’ legal frameworks ................................................. 114
    3.2.1 Statutes .................................................................................... 114
      The ICTY, ICTR, SCSL and STL ...................................................... 114
      ICC ............................................................................................... 117
    3.2.2 Rules of Procedure and Evidence .............................................. 120
      The ICTY, ICTR, SCSL and STL ...................................................... 120
      ICC ............................................................................................... 123
    3.2.3 Administrative regulations regarding detention matters .......... 126
      The ICTY, ICTR, SCSL and STL ...................................................... 126
      ICC ............................................................................................... 139
  3.3 Exceptions to the regular detention regimes .................................. 143
    3.3.1 The modification of detention conditions ................................. 143
      The modification of detention conditions at the various tribunals .... 144
      Evaluation ..................................................................................... 170
    3.3.2 The prohibition or regulation of contact of detainees with other persons ... 173
      The prohibition or regulation of contact at the various tribunals ....... 174
  3.4 Applying human rights law ............................................................. 191
3.4.1 The applicability of international human rights law ......................... 191
   The rationales for applying international human rights law ............... 191
   The applicability of international human rights law ....................... 193
3.4.2 Sources of law and the tribunals’ practice ................................... 214
   Agreements, customary law and general principles of law ................ 214
3.4.3 Difficulties in applying human rights law ..................................... 222
3.5 Applying soft-law penal standards and beyond ................................ 231
3.6 Conclusion ......................................................................................... 250

Chapter 4 Principles of law governing detention at the international criminal
tribunals ................................................................................................. 255
   4.1 Introduction .................................................................................... 255
   4.2 Principles defined ........................................................................... 259
   4.3 Principles of law governing detention at the international criminal tribunals ..... 268
       4.3.1 The notion of ‘principles’ as employed by international tribunals .... 268
       4.3.2 Primary principles: respect for human dignity and the rule of law .... 271
       4.3.3 A selection of secondary principles ......................................... 284
           The presumption of innocence ................................................... 284
           Equal treatment and non-discrimination .................................... 295
           Natural justice and procedural fairness ..................................... 302
           Respect for the right of detained persons to complain about intramural
           matters (to a higher authority) .................................................... 310
           Respect for the fair trial rights of accused persons in detention ....... 313
           Preserving the health of detained persons .................................. 323
           Social rehabilitation .................................................................. 332
   4.4 Conclusion ....................................................................................... 347

Part 2 Detention law at international criminal tribunals:
   procedures

Chapter 5 Making and handling complaints ........................................... 351
   5.1 Introduction .................................................................................... 351
   5.2 Complaints procedures: rationales and legal framework ............... 354
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1 Rationales</td>
<td>354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2 Legal framework</td>
<td>362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Complaints procedures at the international criminal tribunals</td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.1 Making complaints to the person in charge of the day-to-day management of the facility</td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICTY</td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICTR</td>
<td>371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCSL</td>
<td>377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STL</td>
<td>379</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICC</td>
<td>380</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.2 Making complaints to the Registrar</td>
<td>382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICTY</td>
<td>382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICTR</td>
<td>389</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCSL</td>
<td>396</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STL</td>
<td>404</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICC</td>
<td>404</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.3 Making complaints to the President/Presidency</td>
<td>407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICTY</td>
<td>407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICTR</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCSL</td>
<td>414</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STL</td>
<td>417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICC</td>
<td>417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.4 Evaluation</td>
<td>421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informal avenues for making complaints</td>
<td>421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independence and impartiality of the adjudicator</td>
<td>423</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal assistance</td>
<td>427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transparency</td>
<td>427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial compensation</td>
<td>428</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 Medical complaints</td>
<td>433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.1 Making complaints about medical care</td>
<td>433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICTY</td>
<td>433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICTR</td>
<td>443</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCSL</td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.4.2 Evaluation.................................................................................................... 454

Establishing a complaints procedure that deals specifically with medical complaints ................................................................................................... 454

Deaths in custody ........................................................................................ 455

5.5 Making complaints to the inspectorate ...................................................... 460

5.5.1 Complaining to the inspectorate at international criminal tribunals ........ 460

ICTY ........................................................................................................... 460
ICTR ........................................................................................................... 464
SCSL ........................................................................................................... 468
STL ............................................................................................................. 469
ICC .............................................................................................................. 470

5.5.2 Evaluation.................................................................................................... 475

5.6 Making complaints to Trial and Appeals Chambers .................................... 483

5.6.1 Detained accused persons’ complaints about intramural matters to Trial and Appeals Chambers ................................................................. 483

ICTY ........................................................................................................... 483
ICTR ........................................................................................................... 487
SCSL ........................................................................................................... 491
ICC .............................................................................................................. 496

5.6.2 Evaluation.................................................................................................... 497

5.7 Conclusion ...................................................................................................... 498

5.7.1 An independent complaints adjudicator .................................................. 498

5.7.2 Complaints about medical care ................................................................. 501

5.7.3 Legal assistance in complaints procedures ............................................. 501

5.7.4 Inspections ............................................................................................ 502

Chapter 6 Discipline .............................................................................................. 507

6.1 Introduction .................................................................................................... 507

6.2 Prison discipline: theoretical underpinnings and legal framework .............. 508

6.2.1 Theoretical underpinnings ....................................................................... 508

6.2.2 Legal framework ..................................................................................... 514
6.3 Discipline at the international criminal tribunals’ detention facilities
6.3.1 Discipline at the various tribunals

ICTY
ICTR
SCSL
STL
ICC

6.3.2 Evaluation

Review by an external adjudicator
Legal assistance
Emergency proceedings
Solitary confinement and reduction of diet
Final observations

6.4 Conclusion

Chapter 7 The designation of States for the enforcement of sentences

7.1 Introduction

7.2 The designation of States for the enforcement of sentences

7.2.1 International penal standards

7.2.2 General observations

ICTY, ICTR, SCSL and STL
ICC

7.2.3 The tribunals’ designation procedures

ICTY
ICTR
SCSL
ICC

7.3 Evaluation

7.3.1 The sentencing judges’ knowledge of prison conditions

7.3.2 The need for an independent and impartial appeals adjudicator in designation procedures
7.3.3 Establishing an international prison ............................................................ 645
7.3.4 Inter-State co-operation on the transfer of prisoners and the tribunals’ designation regimes compared ................................................................. 647
7.3.5 The timing of the SCSL convicts’ transfer to Rwanda ............................... 649
7.3.6 The treatment of international prisoners as foreign prisoners ............. 650
   General observations .................................................................................. 650
   The treatment of foreigners in Dutch prisons .......................................... 654
   Concluding observations .......................................................................... 657
7.3.7 Transparency ....................................................................................... 658
7.3.8 A lack of willing States ......................................................................... 659
7.4 Conclusion ............................................................................................... 661

Part 3 Detention law at international criminal tribunals:
conditions of detention

Chapter 8 Contact with the outside world ...................................................... 665
  8.1 Introduction ............................................................................................. 665
  8.2 Contact with family and friends ............................................................. 670
     8.2.1 Contact with family and friends: rationales and legal requirements .. 670
         Rationales ............................................................................................ 670
         Legal framework .................................................................................. 678
     8.2.2 Contact with family and friends at the various tribunals ............... 706
         ICTY ................................................................................................. 706
         ICTR ............................................................................................... 736
         SCSL .............................................................................................. 759
         ICC ................................................................................................. 779
  8.2.3 Evaluation .......................................................................................... 823
     Accessibility of regulations and detention orders ................................. 823
     Foreseeability of infringements on detainees’ rights ............................ 824
     The necessity of the infringements ....................................................... 828
     Retention of recordings ........................................................................ 829
     Financial assistance for family visits ................................................... 830
     Communications with the inspectorate ............................................... 836
9.2 Conclusions .................................................................................................................. 960
  9.2.1 The detention law of the international criminal tribunals ................................. 960
  9.2.2 Free and confidential communications with counsel: a rule of customary international law ................................................................. 962
  9.2.3 Disciplinary punishment: solitary confinement and reduction of diet ............ 963
  9.2.4 Inter-State co-operation on the transfer of prisoners and the tribunals’ designation regimes compared ......................................................... 963
  9.2.5 UNDU detainees’ contact with the media ......................................................... 964
9.3 Recommendations .................................................................................................... 965
  9.3.1 The need for an independent and impartial adjudicator in complaints proceedings ................................................................. 965
  9.3.2 The need for an independent and impartial appeals adjudicator in disciplinary proceedings ......................................................... 967
  9.3.3 The need for an independent and impartial appeals adjudicator in designation procedures ................................................................. 970
  9.3.4 Inspections ........................................................................................................ 972
  9.3.5 The sentencing judges’ knowledge of prison conditions ................................ 973
  9.3.6 The treatment of international prisoners as foreign prisoners .................. 973
  9.3.7 Accessibility of regulations and detention orders governing detainees’ contact with the outside world ......................................................... 974
  9.3.8 The foreseeability and necessity of infringements on substantial rights of detainees ................................................................. 975
  9.3.9 Detainees’ communications with the inspectorate ....................................... 976
  9.3.10 Financial assistance for family visits ............................................................ 978

Summary .......................................................................................................................... 981
Samenvatting (Summary in Dutch) .............................................................................. 989
Bibliography .................................................................................................................... 997
Official documents and resolutions ........................................................................... 1029
Table of Cases ............................................................................................................. 1043