Prisoners of the international community: the legal position of persons detained at international criminal tribunals

Abels, D.

Citation for published version (APA):
# Table of Contents

Contents.............................................................................................................................................. vii
Table of Contents.......................................................................................................................... ix
Acknowledgements ....................................................................................................................... xix
Abbreviations .................................................................................................................................. xxiii

## Chapter 1 Introduction ............................................................................................................... 27
1.1 Detention at international criminal tribunals ........................................................................ 27
1.2 Purpose of the study ............................................................................................................. 28
1.3 Scope of the study and definitions ..................................................................................... 31
1.4 Methodology ....................................................................................................................... 35
1.5 Structure of the study ......................................................................................................... 37
1.6 Use of instruments and case-law ....................................................................................... 38

## Part 1 Detention law at international criminal tribunals: sources and principles

## Chapter 2 The protection of detained persons under international law ......................... 43
2.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................................... 43
2.2 International developments ............................................................................................. 45
  2.2.1 General developments ............................................................................................... 45
  2.2.2 The prohibition of torture and other inhuman and degrading treatment or punishment .......................................................................................................................... 51
    The UDHR, the ICCPR and the 1975 Declaration ......................................................... 51
    The U.N. Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment and the Committee ................................................. 53
    The Subcommittee on the Prevention of Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment .......................................................... 58
    The U.N. Special Rapporteur on Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment ................................................................. 61
  2.2.3 The United Nations Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice Program and its standard setting work .................................................................................. 63
2.3 Regional developments ........................................................................................................ 81
  2.3.1 General developments ................................................................................................ 81
    Europe ................................................................................................................................ 81
    The Americas ....................................................................................................................... 90
    Africa .................................................................................................................................. 95
    The Arab region ................................................................................................................... 96
  2.3.2 The prohibition of torture and other inhuman and degrading treatment or punishment .......................................................... 98
    Europe ................................................................................................................................ 98
    The Americas ....................................................................................................................... 102
    Africa .................................................................................................................................. 105
  2.4 Conclusion .......................................................................................................................... 106

Chapter 3 The legal regimes governing detention at the international criminal tribunals ................................................................. 109

  3.1 Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 109
  3.2 The institutions’ legal frameworks .................................................................................. 114
    3.2.1 Statutes ...................................................................................................................... 114
      The ICTY, ICTR, SCSL and STL ....................................................................................... 114
      ICC ................................................................................................................................. 117
    3.2.2 Rules of Procedure and Evidence .............................................................................. 120
      The ICTY, ICTR, SCSL and STL ....................................................................................... 120
      ICC ................................................................................................................................. 123
    3.2.3 Administrative regulations regarding detention matters ........................................... 126
      The ICTY, ICTR, SCSL and STL ....................................................................................... 126
      ICC ................................................................................................................................. 139
  3.3 Exceptions to the regular detention regimes ................................................................. 143
    3.3.1 The modification of detention conditions ................................................................. 143
      The modification of detention conditions at the various tribunals ................................. 144
      Evaluation ....................................................................................................................... 170
    3.3.2 The prohibition or regulation of contact of detainees with other persons .................. 173
      The prohibition or regulation of contact at the various tribunals ................................... 174
  3.4 Applying human rights law .............................................................................................. 191
3.4.1 The applicability of international human rights law

The rationales for applying international human rights law

The applicability of international human rights law

3.4.2 Sources of law and the tribunals’ practice

Agreements, customary law and general principles of law

3.4.3 Difficulties in applying human rights law

3.5 Applying soft-law penal standards and beyond

3.6 Conclusion

Chapter 4 Principles of law governing detention at the international criminal tribunals

4.1 Introduction

4.2 Principles defined

4.3 Principles of law governing detention at the international criminal tribunals

4.3.1 The notion of ‘principles’ as employed by international tribunals

4.3.2 Primary principles: respect for human dignity and the rule of law

4.3.3 A selection of secondary principles

   The presumption of innocence

   Equal treatment and non-discrimination

   Natural justice and procedural fairness

   Respect for the right of detained persons to complain about intramural matters (to a higher authority)

   Respect for the fair trial rights of accused persons in detention

   Preserving the health of detained persons

   Social rehabilitation

4.4 Conclusion

Part 2 Detention law at international criminal tribunals: procedures

Chapter 5 Making and handling complaints

5.1 Introduction

5.2 Complaints procedures: rationales and legal framework
5.2.1 Rationales ........................................................................................................ 354
5.2.2 Legal framework ........................................................................................... 362

5.3 Complaints procedures at the international criminal tribunals ...................... 369

5.3.1 Making complaints to the person in charge of the day-to-day management of the facility ........................................................................................................ 369
   ICTY ........................................................................................................... 369
   ICTR ........................................................................................................... 371
   SCSL ........................................................................................................... 377
   STL ............................................................................................................. 379
   ICC .............................................................................................................. 380

5.3.2 Making complaints to the Registrar ............................................................ 382
   ICTY ........................................................................................................... 382
   ICTR ........................................................................................................... 389
   SCSL ........................................................................................................... 396
   STL ............................................................................................................. 404
   ICC .............................................................................................................. 404

5.3.3 Making complaints to the President/Presidency ......................................... 407
   ICTY ........................................................................................................... 407
   ICTR ........................................................................................................... 409
   SCSL ........................................................................................................... 414
   STL ............................................................................................................. 417
   ICC .............................................................................................................. 417

5.3.4 Evaluation .................................................................................................... 421
   Informal avenues for making complaints ................................................... 421
   Independence and impartiality of the adjudicator ....................................... 423
   Legal assistance .......................................................................................... 427
   Transparency ............................................................................................... 427
   Financial compensation .............................................................................. 428

5.4 Medical complaints ............................................................................................ 433

5.4.1 Making complaints about medical care ....................................................... 433
   ICTY ........................................................................................................... 433
   ICTR ........................................................................................................... 443
   SCSL ........................................................................................................... 447
STL ............................................................................................................. 453
ICC .............................................................................................................. 453
5.4.2 Evaluation ............................................................................................ 454
Establishing a complaints procedure that deals specifically with medical complaints ................................................................................................... 454
Deaths in custody ........................................................................................ 455
5.5 Making complaints to the inspectorate ....................................................... 460
5.5.1 Complaining to the inspectorate at international criminal tribunals ........ 460
ICTY ........................................................................................................... 460
ICTR ........................................................................................................... 464
SCSL ........................................................................................................... 468
STL ............................................................................................................. 469
ICC .............................................................................................................. 470
5.5.2 Evaluation ............................................................................................ 475
5.6 Making complaints to Trial and Appeals Chambers ..................................... 483
5.6.1 Detained accused persons’ complaints about intramural matters to Trial and Appeals Chambers .......................................................................................... 483
ICTY ........................................................................................................... 483
ICTR ........................................................................................................... 487
SCSL ........................................................................................................... 491
ICC .............................................................................................................. 496
5.6.2 Evaluation ............................................................................................ 497
5.7 Conclusion ................................................................................................... 498
5.7.1 An independent complaints adjudicator ............................................... 498
5.7.2 Complaints about medical care .............................................................. 501
5.7.3 Legal assistance in complaints procedures .......................................... 501
5.7.4 Inspections ........................................................................................... 502

Chapter 6 Discipline ..................................................................................... 507
6.1 Introduction ................................................................................................ 507
6.2 Prison discipline: theoretical underpinnings and legal framework ............ 508
6.2.1 Theoretical underpinnings .................................................................... 508
6.2.2 Legal framework .................................................................................. 514
Human rights jurisprudence ................................................................. 514
Penal standards .................................................................................. 525

6.3 Discipline at the international criminal tribunals’ detention facilities ........... 532
6.3.1 Discipline at the various tribunals .................................................... 532
ICTY ...................................................................................................... 532
ICTR ...................................................................................................... 539
SCSL ...................................................................................................... 545
STL ....................................................................................................... 556
ICC ...................................................................................................... 559

6.3.2 Evaluation ..................................................................................... 563
Review by an external adjudicator ...................................................... 563
Legal assistance .................................................................................. 568
Emergency proceedings ...................................................................... 569
Solitary confinement and reduction of diet ......................................... 569
Final observations ............................................................................... 570

6.4 Conclusion ....................................................................................... 571

Chapter 7 The designation of States for the enforcement of sentences .......... 573
7.1 Introduction ...................................................................................... 573
7.2 The designation of States for the enforcement of sentences ................. 576
7.2.1 International penal standards .............................................................. 576
7.2.2 General observations ....................................................................... 578
ICTY, ICTR, SCSL and STL ................................................................. 578
ICC ...................................................................................................... 588
7.2.3 The tribunals’ designation procedures ............................................. 596
ICTY ...................................................................................................... 596
ICTR ...................................................................................................... 611
SCSL ...................................................................................................... 624
ICC ...................................................................................................... 634
7.3 Evaluation ....................................................................................... 641
7.3.1 The sentencing judges’ knowledge of prison conditions .................... 641
7.3.2 The need for an independent and impartial appeals adjudicator in designation procedures ................................. 641
Part 3 Detention law at international criminal tribunals:
conditions of detention

Chapter 8 Contact with the outside world.................................665

8.1 Introduction..............................................................................665

8.2 Contact with family and friends...........................................670

8.2.1 Contact with family and friends: rationales and legal requirements ....670

Rationales..................................................................................670

Legal framework......................................................................678

8.2.2 Contact with family and friends at the various tribunals ..........706

ICTY ..................................................................................706

ICTR ..................................................................................736

SCSL ..................................................................................759

ICC ..................................................................................779

8.2.3 Evaluation...........................................................................823

Accessibility of regulations and detention orders ...............823

Foreseeability of infringements on detainees’ rights........824

The necessity of the infringements ........................................828

Retention of recordings..........................................................829

Financial assistance for family visits.................................830

Communications with the inspectorate..............................836
9.2 Conclusions.....................................................................................................................960
  9.2.1 The detention law of the international criminal tribunals .........................960
  9.2.2 Free and confidential communications with counsel: a rule of customary
      international law........................................................................................................962
  9.2.3 Disciplinary punishment: solitary confinement and reduction of diet ........963
  9.2.4 Inter-State co-operation on the transfer of prisoners and the tribunals’
      designation regimes compared.............................................................................963
  9.2.5 UNDU detainees’ contact with the media......................................................964
9.3 Recommendations........................................................................................................965
  9.3.1 The need for an independent and impartial adjudicator in complaints
      proceedings..............................................................................................................965
  9.3.2 The need for an independent and impartial appeals adjudicator in
      disciplinary proceedings.......................................................................................967
  9.3.3 The need for an independent and impartial appeals adjudicator in designation
      procedures..............................................................................................................970
  9.3.4 Inspections......................................................................................................972
  9.3.5 The sentencing judges’ knowledge of prison conditions .........................973
  9.3.6 The treatment of international prisoners as foreign prisoners.................973
  9.3.7 Accessibility of regulations and detention orders governing detainees’
      contact with the outside world ............................................................................974
  9.3.8 The foreseeability and necessity of infringements on substantial rights of
      detainees................................................................................................................975
  9.3.9 Detainees’ communications with the inspectorate.....................................976
  9.3.10 Financial assistance for family visits .........................................................978

Summary..........................................................................................................................981
Samenvatting (Summary in Dutch)...................................................................................989
Bibliography....................................................................................................................997
Official documents and resolutions.............................................................................1029
Table of Cases ..............................................................................................................1043