Nationalism and private law in Europe
Comparato, G.

Citation for published version (APA):
Comparato, G. (2012). Nationalism and private law in Europe

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: http://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
Table of contents

INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................................................. 1

1. NATIONALISM .................................................................................................................................................... 3
   1.1. From nationalism to supranationalism ...................................................................................................... 4
   1.2. The persistence of nationalism ................................................................................................................ 5
2. PRIVATE LAW IN EUROPE ............................................................................................................................... 7
   2.1. The acquis communautaire ..................................................................................................................... 8
   2.2. Plans for further Europeanisation .......................................................................................................... 8
3. METHODOLOGY .................................................................................................................................................. 11
   3.1. Descriptive character .............................................................................................................................. 11
   3.2. European Union as multinational and multi-level system ..................................................................... 13
   3.3. Considered countries ............................................................................................................................ 14
4. STRUCTURE AND TOPICS ............................................................................................................................ 15

CHAPTER I

NATIONALISM .................................................................................................................................................... 17

1.1. APPROACHING NATIONALISM .................................................................................................................. 18
   1.1.1. How many nationalisms are there? ........................................................................................................ 18
   1.1.2. Interpreting nationalism: primordialism and modernism .................................................................. 20
      1.1.2.1. The awakening of the nation: primordialism .............................................................................. 22
      1.1.2.2. The invention of the nation: modernism ...................................................................................... 23
      1.1.2.3. Primordialism vs modernism? .......................................................................................................... 28
   1.2. THE NATIONALIST POLITICAL PRINCIPLE ............................................................................................... 29
   1.2.1. The political unit: the state .................................................................................................................. 30
   1.2.2. The national unit: what is a nation? ...................................................................................................... 31
      1.2.2.1. Ethnic nationalism and the objective interpretation of the nation ................................................. 31
      1.2.2.2. Civic nationalism and the subjective interpretation of the nation ................................................. 33
      1.2.2.3. From civic nationalism to constitutional patriotism .................................................................. 34
      1.2.2.4. Defining the nation as ‘culture’ ..................................................................................................... 36
      1.2.2.5. Is there a ‘good’ and a ‘bad’ nationalism? ...................................................................................... 38
   1.3. THE ARGUMENTS OF NATIONALISM ......................................................................................................... 40
   1.3.1. Preliminary remark: nationalism and liberalism .................................................................................. 40
   1.3.2. The fundamental assumption: nation and culture coincide .................................................................. 42
   1.3.3. A state should be national because ..................................................................................................... 43
      1.3.3.1. Co-nationals know better the needs of each other ...................................................................... 44
      1.3.3.2. Only within the nation state there can be democracy ................................................................. 46
      1.3.3.3. Only within the nation state there can be solidarity ..................................................................... 47
      1.3.3.4. Justice is a national concept ......................................................................................................... 50
   1.3.4. The fundamental criticism: do nation and culture really coincide? .................................................. 53
   1.3.5. National vs. social identities: some notes on the case of socialism .................................................... 55
4. CONCLUSION ..................................................................................................................................................... 57
   1.4.1. The convenience of nationalism .......................................................................................................... 57
   1.4.2. Summing up ........................................................................................................................................... 58
CHAPTER II
NATIONALISATION AND DENATIONALISATION

II.1. INFLUENCE OF NATIONALISM ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF PRIVATE LAW

II.1.1. The affirmation of the nation in international law

II.1.2. From a common to a national private law

II.1.3. Nationalism and the nationalisation of law

II.1.4. Between civic, cultural and ethnic nationalism: the German experience

II.1.4.1. The civic

II.1.4.2. The cultural

II.1.4.3. From cultural to ethnic

II.1.4.4. The racist: German and Italian fascist experiences

II.1.4.5. Back to culture

II.1.5. Impact on today’s legal systems

II.2. PRIVATE LAW AS A NATION-BUILDING TOOL

II.2.1. Homogenisation by inclusion

II.2.2. Homogenisation by exclusion

II.2.2.1. Constitutional aspects

II.2.2.2. A brief digression: Non-discrimination law in Europe

II.3. DENATIONALISATION OF PRIVATE LAW

II.3.1. Internationalisation before the world wars: faith in nations

II.3.2. Internationalisation after the world wars: distrust in nations

II.3.3. Europeanisation and Re-nationalisation

CHAPTER III
ARGUMENTS AGAINST DENATIONALISATION

III.1. THE ECONOMIC ARGUMENT

III.1.1. The ideal locus of private law in the European context

III.1.1.1. Normative implications of the argument

III.1.1.2. The challenging nature of distance relationships

III.1.1.3. Democracy issues

III.1.1.4. Heterogeneity of preferences

III.1.1.5. The decentralisation theorem in economics and politics

III.1.1.6. Problematic aspects of decentralisation for European private law

III.1.1.7. Geographical proximity

III.1.1.8. Slippery slope to Balkanisation

III.1.2. THE ARGUMENT IN LIGHT OF DIFFERENT POLITICAL THEORIES

III.1.2.1. Communitarian and cosmopolitan perspectives

III.1.2.2. Nationalist perspective

III.1.2.3. ‘Cultural similarity’ underlying the economic argument

III.1.3. THE SOCIAL JUSTICE ARGUMENT

III.1.3.1. Social Justice in the European context

III.1.3.1.1. Normative implications of the argument

III.1.3.1.2. Absence of a European model of social justice

III.1.3.1.3. Fundamental rights and harmonisation

III.1.3.1.4. The stance of European law

III.1.3.2. The argument in light of different political theories

III.1.3.2.1. Communitarian perspective

III.1.3.2.2. Nationalist perspective

III.1.3.2.3. Fortune of communitarian and nationalist conceptions

III.1.3.2.4. Cosmopolitan perspective

III.1.4. THE CULTURAL ARGUMENT

III.1.4.1. Culture as a value

III.1.4.2. Interactions of law and culture

III.1.4.2.1. Transferability thesis

III.1.4.2.2. Non-transferability thesis

III.1.4.3. Law and culture in the European context

III.1.4.3.1. Normative implications

III.1.4.3.2. Distinguishing cultural and technical aspects

III.1.4.4. Inescapability of national categories?

III.1.4.5. Future convergence or eternal divergence?