Against all odds: aiding political parties in Georgia and Ukraine

Bader, M.

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
NOTES

1 Three of which are not parties but electoral blocs, consisting of between two and ten parties each.
2 Author’s translation of: ‘Politieke partijen bestaan eigenlijk nauwelijks in Georgië. Politieke bewegingen zijn feitelijk min of meer loyale clans rondom individuen.’
3 Author’s translation of: ‘Die Parteien der Ukraine tragen noch immer starken Projektcharakter. Sie sind in erster Linie personenzentrierte Netzwerke, die stark mit ökonomischen Interessen ihrer Betreiber verflochten sind.’
4 Examples include KAS (2007), NDI (2001: 26), and USAID (1999: 31)
5 According to one estimate, political party assistance costs no less than 139 million euros per year (Catón 2007: 12).
6 Author’s interviews with political party representatives in Georgia and Ukraine, 2007-2009
7 Notable exceptions are Elgstrom (2000) and Grigorescu (2002)
8 In fact, most stable party systems are probably found on the two extremes of regime typologies - in liberal democracies and in political closed authoritarian states.
9 The countries where party assistance is carried out are listed on the web sites of the main providers. See http://www.fes.de/sets/s_fes_i.htm, http://www.kas.de/wf/en/71.4782/, http://www.iri.org/, http://ndi.org/wherewework, http://nimd.org/page/nimd_programmes. Most of these countries are associated with weak party system institutionalization (Basedau and Stroh 2008; Kuenzi and Lambright 2005; Meleshevich 2007; Stockton 2001; Ufen 2007) and are characterized by a less-than-democratic political context (see http://www.freedomhouse.org/template.cfm?page=363&year=2009).
10 Hall employs the term ‘systematic process analysis’ instead of ‘process-tracing’.
11 This strategy is explicitly recommended by Rivera et al. (2003), who have interviewed elites in Russia.
12 http://dec.usaid.gov
13 Author’s calculation based on figures from Catón (2007: 12).
14 The NIMD project in Georgia, however, is funded by OSCE/ODIHR.
15 Relative expenditures have likely increased after 1999 due to a growth in interest in party assistance.
16 Interview with IRI/Georgia representative, September 24, 2007
17 Interviews with FES and KAS representatives. Berlin, May 10, 2007
18 Interview with NIMD representative, The Hague, April 5, 2007
19 Interview with NDI, IRI, KAS, FES, and FNS representatives in Georgia and Ukraine
20 Interview with FES representative. Berlin, May 10, 2007
21 Such, for example, was the selection criterion in the NIMD/ODIHR project in Georgia
22 Interview with IRI official, April 12, 2007, Washington D.C. Also see: USAID 2003b: 10
23 Publications and documents that have been consulted for this content analysis include: Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) 2005; Doherty 2002; Konrad Adenauer Stiftung (KAS) 2007a; National Democratic Institute for International Affairs (NDI) 2003; NDI 2008a; Netherlands Institute for Multiparty Democracy (NIMD) 2004; Saxer 2006a; Saxer 2006b; United States Agency for International Development (USAID) 1999b; USAID 2003b; USAID 2006d.
24 For a similar approach to the extraction of norms from a corpus of sources, see Kratochvil (2008).
158

25 E.g. interviews with Batkivshchyna representative, March 21, 2008; and with KAS/Georgia staff member, May 22, 2008
26 Available from http://freedomhouse.org/template.cfm?page=15
27 For an explanation of the Freedom in the World Index, see http://www.freedomhouse.org/template.cfm?page=277 (accessed January 20, 2008)
29 For definitions of democracy promotion and democracy assistance, see previous chapter.
31 See, for instance, USAID/Ukraine Annual Report FY 2003 and USAID/Caucasus - Georgia 2002
33 Interview with SPU representative, March 26, 2008
34 Interviews with Batkivshchyna representative, March 21, 2008 and KAS/Georgia staff member, May 22, 2008
35 Interviews with SPU representative, March 26, 2008, and political scientist, Tbilisi, October 5, 2007
36 Interviews with SPU representative, March 26, 2008
37 Interview with Batkivshchyna representative, March 21, 2008
38 Interview with NRU representative, November 5, 2007
39 Interview with Our Ukraine representative, October 31, 2007
40 Interview with PORA representative, November 9, 2007
41 Interview with SPU representative, March 26, 2008
42 Interview with PRU youth wing representative, March 18, 2008
43 Interview with New Rights party youth wing, Tbilisi, October 2, 2007
44 Interview with NDI/Ukraine representative, March 17, 2008
46 Author’s translation of: Політичні партії, як виявилося, позбавлені широкої соціальної бази, їх ідеологія та програми неадекватно відбивають поточну ситуацію і не відповідають завданням розвитку суспільства, партії не мають у своєму розпорядженні механізмів реалізації притарманних їм функцій та завдань (Romaniuk i Shveda 2005: 239).
47 Studies that engage in cross-national comparison include Kulik and Pshizova (2005), Meleshevich (2007), and Miller et al. (2000).
48 Although they are formally former Soviet republics, the three Baltic republics are left out of scope here, because their post-communist political trajectory has in virtually all respects been more similar to that of Central and Eastern Europe than of the FSU.
49 Against this, Markowski (2000) and Tóka (1997) argue that party system institutionalization is not crucial for democratic consolidation.
Sartori argued back in 1976 that studying unstructured party systems is of little value. For an argument on why and how parties can be studied even in a highly volatile environment, see Wolinetz (2006: 15).

Particularly so since the path-breaking volume of Scott Mainwaring and Timothy Scully (1995) about party system institutionalization in Latin America.

Andrew Wilson and Sarah Birch (2007: 61) make the point about the difficulty of calculating electoral volatility when party turnover is excessively high with reference to Ukraine.

Two exceptions are found in Schedler (2004: 8) and Zimmer (2003: 10-1).

Party age as an indicator of party system institutionalization is operationalized, among others, by Dix (1992) and Kuenzi and Lambright (2005). The indicator of stable roots in society is applied by Mainwaring and Scully (1995) in their study about party system institutionalization in Latin America, and in their footsteps, among many others, by Basedau and Stroh (2008).

A survey by IFES (Carson 2000: 38) found that two per cent of the adult population in Ukraine are members of a political party.

A notable exception is Van de Walle (2003).

For a more precise definition of presidentialism, see Shugart (2006).

The presence of a dual executive (Blondel 1984; Duverger 1980; Shugart 2005) is often considered the core feature of semipresidentialism.

The term ‘big men’ is frequently applied in relation to party politics in Africa. E.g. Van de Walle (2003).

Kitschelt (2000: 872) observes that ‘clientelist democracy has proved durable and has commanded sufficient support to institutionalize and entrench itself for long periods in a variety of polities’. Enyedi (2006: 230) suggests that charismatic leadership in parties (at the expense of the visibility of a party program), common to party politics in Central and Eastern Europe, can strengthen party systems.

E.g. Herron and Mirzashvili (2005) have documented the frequent amending of electoral legislation in Georgia.

Bartolini and Mair (2001: 332) divide political party functions into representative functions and procedural functions.

All election results are from the website of the Central Election Commission of Ukraine, http://www.cvk.gov.ua/

Office-seeking and vote-seeking incentives in party operation, however, are not necessarily inimical to democratic party development.

Interviews with political scientist, Tbilisi, September 27, 2007; and with IRI/Ukraine representative, Kyiv, May 29, 2007

Examples include the Progressive Socialist Party, the Ukrainian Communist Party (o), and Yabluko (Wilson and Bitch 2007: 72-3).

Interview with former NDI/Georgia representative (2000-2004), Tbilisi, October 2, 2007

See NDI (2000c); NDI (2001c); and NDI (2002c).


Interview with IRI/Georgia representative, Tbilisi, October 1, 2007

Interview with NDI/Georgia representative, Tbilisi, October 10, 2007

E.g. McGlinchey (2007), p.20
Interview with IRI/Georgia representative (2003-2007), Tbilisi, September 24, 2007

idem

Interview with IRI/Georgia representative, Tbilisi, October 1, 2007


E.g. IRI (2005b); and IRI (2005c).

Interview with IRI/Washington D.C. representative, Washington, D.C., April 12, 2007

E.g. IRI (2005b); and IRI (2005c).

Interview with NIMD representative, Tbilisi, May 14, 2008


Interview with NIMD representative, The Hague, April 5, 2007

Interview with NIMD representative, The Hague, April 5, 2007; also see ODIHR-IMD-CIPDD (2006).

Telephone Interview with NIMD representative, January 14, 2009

Interview with FNS/Georgia representative, Tbilisi, March 20, 2007

Interview with FES representative, Berlin, May 8, 2007

Interview with KAS/Georgia representative, Tbilisi, March 23, 2007

Interview with KAS/Georgia representative, Tbilisi, May 22, 2008

Interview with NDI/Ukraine representative, March 17, 2008

Interview with former NDI/Ukraine representative (1999-2001)

Interview with NDI/Ukraine representative, March 17, 2008

ibid.

ibid.

ibid.

Interview with former NDI/Ukraine representative (1999-2001)

Interview with IRI/Ukraine representative, Kyiv, March 19, 2008

Interview with IRI/Ukraine representative, Kyiv, May 29, 2007

Interview with IRI representative, Washington, D.C., April 12, 2007

Interview with IRI/Ukraine representative, Kyiv, May 29, 2007

ibid.

ibid.

Interview with Party of Regions representatives, Kyiv, March 18, 2008

Interview with former international secretary of SPU, Kyiv, March 26, 2008

Telephone Interview with NIMD representative, January 14, 2009

Interview with former NDI/Georgia representative, Berlin, May 9, 2007; Interview with NDI/Ukraine representative, Kyiv, March 17, 2008; and Interview with former NDI/Georgia representative, October 2, 2007
Interview with IRI/Georgia representative, Tbilisi, September 24, 2007

Interview with former NDI/Ukraine representative, Amsterdam, March 9, 2007, McGlinchey (2007: 19) notes that this has been the case in Bulgaria, Poland, and Romania.

Interview with former NDI/Georgia representative, Tbilisi, October 2, 2007

Interview with political scientist, Tbilisi, October 11, 2007

Regarding the alleged bias in favor of UNM, see, e.g. Interview with international secretary of the youth wing of the New Rights Party, Tbilisi, October 2, 2007; regarding the fact that IRI allegedly plays into the hands of the ruling forces, see USAID (2007: A2/A3).

Interview with IRI/Georgia representative, Tbilisi, October 1, 2007

Interview with IFES representative, Washington, D.C., April 8

Interview with Conservative Party of Georgia representative, Tbilisi, April 27, 2007

Interview with Party of Regions representative, Kyiv, March 18, 2008

Interview with NIMD representative, The Hague, April 5, 2007

Interview with Batkivshchyna representative, Kyiv, March 21, 2008

Interview with Republican Party of Georgia representative, Tbilisi, October 5, 2007; Interview with Party of Regions representative, Kyiv, March 18, 2008; and Interview with Socialist party of Ukraine representative, Kyiv, March 26, 2008

Interview with former NDI/Georgia representative (2000-2004), Tbilisi, October 2, 2007; and Interview with former KAS/Ukraine representative, Berlin, May 8, 2007

Interview with CIPDD representative, Tbilisi, September 27, 2007

Interview with former KAS/Ukraine representative, Berlin, May 8, 2007

Interview with Conservative Party of Georgia representative, Tbilisi, April 27, 2007; Interview with Conservative Party of Georgia representative, Batumi, October 3, 2007; and Interview with CIPDD representative, Tbilisi, September 27, 2007

Interview with two Conservative Party of Georgia representatives, Tbilisi, October 10, 2007

Interview with IRI/Georgia representative, Tbilisi, October 1, 2007

Telephone Interview with NIMD representative, January 14, 2009

Interview with CIPDD representative, Tbilisi, September 27, 2007

Interview with FES/Ukraine representative, Kyiv, June 4, 2007

Interview with Party of Regions representative, Kyiv, March 18, 2008

Interview with IRI representative, Washington, D.C., April 12, 2007

Interview with IRI/Ukraine representative, Kyiv, May 29, 2007

Interview with NDI/Ukraine representative, Kyiv, March 17, 2008

Interview with IRI/Georgia representative, Tbilisi, September 24, 2007

Interview with NDI/Ukraine representative, Kyiv, March 17, 2008

Interview with IRI/Georgia representative, Tbilisi, September 24, 2007

Interview with People’s Union Our Ukraine youth wing representative, Kyiv, October 30, 2007; and interview with New Rights party youth wing, Tbilisi, October 2, 2007

Interview with IRI/Ukraine representative, Kyiv, May 29, 2007

E.g. Interview with Georgian political scientist, Tbilisi, October 11, 2007


Interview with Labor Party representative, Tbilisi, March 24, 2007; and interview with Conservative Party of Georgia representative, Tbilisi, September 27, 2007

Interview with former NDI/Ukraine representative, Amsterdam, March 9, 2007
Telephone Interview with NIMD representative, January 14, 2009

E.g. Interview with SPU representative, Kyiv, March 26, 2008

Translation by the author of: ‘Rückblickend ist festzustellen, dass in Bezug sowohl auf die rudimentären programmatischen Konturen der Partnerparteien als auch auf die Annäherung an europäische Partner und Konzepte in dieser Phase einige Erfolge erzielt werden konnten’ (KAS 2008a: 31)

Interview with NDI/Ukraine representative, Kyiv, April 17, 2008

Interview with ODIHR representative, Warsaw, September 6, 2007

For example, a representative from NDI working on, among other countries, Georgia, in 2007 was unaware of the existence of the NIMD-ODIHR project. Interview with NDI representative, Washington, April 18, 2007

The assessment concerned is USAID (2007).

Interview with SPU representative, Kyiv, November 7, 2007. On the use of foreign trainers specifically, see Interview with CIPDD representative, Tbilisi, May 19, 2008

E.g. Interview with CIPDD representative, Tbilisi, May 19, 2008

See note 9