



## UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

### Targeting data in armed conflict

*Interpreting international humanitarian law's fundamental notions of 'attack', 'object(ive)' & 'damage' against the effects of cyber operations*

van den Essen, R.S.

#### Publication date

2024

[Link to publication](#)

#### Citation for published version (APA):

van den Essen, R. S. (2024). *Targeting data in armed conflict: Interpreting international humanitarian law's fundamental notions of 'attack', 'object(ive)' & 'damage' against the effects of cyber operations*. [Thesis, fully internal, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

#### General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

#### Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.



## Targeting Data in Armed Conflict

Interpreting International Humanitarian Law's fundamental notions of 'attack', 'object(ive)' & 'damage' against the effects of cyber operations



Raïssa van den Essen

# **Targeting Data In Armed Conflict**

*Interpreting International Humanitarian Law's  
fundamental notions of 'attack', 'object(ive)' & 'damage'  
against the effects of cyber operations*

Raïssa S. van den Essen

Typography & Design: Multimedia NLDA  
Cover design: Fanny van Donge-Hofstra  
Printed by: Repro FBD

ISBN: 9789493124448

# **Targeting Data In Armed Conflict**

Interpreting International Humanitarian Law's fundamental notions of 'attack',  
'object(ive)' & 'damage' against the effects of cyber operations

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam  
op gezag van rector magnificus Prof. P.P.C.C. Verbeek  
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties  
te verdedigen op 30 april 2024 klokke 16.00

door

Raissa S. van den Essen

geboren te Nijmegen in 1987

*Promotores*

Prof. dr. P.A.L. Ducheine      Universiteit van Amsterdam  
Prof. dr. T.D. Gill              Universiteit van Amsterdam

*Promotiecommissie*

Prof. dr. L. Zegveld              Universiteit van Amsterdam  
Prof. dr. M.C. Zwanenburg      Universiteit van Amsterdam  
Dr. E. Pouw                      Nederlandse Defensie Academie  
Prof. H. Harrison-Dinniss      Swedish Defence University  
Prof. dr K. Mačák                University of Exeter  
Prof. mr. dr. H.G. van der Wilt   Universiteit van Amsterdam

*This dissertation was financially and factually supported by the Royal Netherlands Army and Ministry of Defence. The views and opinions in this dissertation are and remain solely the responsibility of the author and do not necessarily reflect those of the Ministry of Defence.*

*For Lennart*

# Table of contents



## Inhoudsopgave

<b>Introduction .....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>1 Introduction.....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>1.1 Background &amp; Relevance .....</b>	<b>15</b>
1.1.1 <i>Interconnectivity &amp; growing dependency.....</i>	15
1.1.2 <i>Considerations &amp; possible ramifications.....</i>	18
1.1.3 <i>Contested concepts.....</i>	19
<b>1.2 Legal Framework .....</b>	<b>21</b>
1.2.1 <i>International Humanitarian Law .....</i>	21
1.2.2 <i>Targeting &amp; Cyber Operations .....</i>	26
<b>1.3 Research Question .....</b>	<b>28</b>
1.3.1 <i>Research Objective.....</i>	28
1.3.2 <i>Outline &amp; Methodology.....</i>	29
1.3.3 <i>Scope &amp; limitations.....</i>	32
 <b>The Notion of Attack in Cyber Operations .....</b>	 <b>35</b>
<b>2 Introduction.....</b>	<b>35</b>
<b>2.1 Understanding the notion of attack in API.....</b>	<b>35</b>
2.1.1 <i>The ordinary meaning of attack.....</i>	36
2.1.2 <i>Context .....</i>	41
2.1.3 <i>Object &amp; purpose .....</i>	50
<b>2.2 The notion of attack &amp; subsequent practice .....</b>	<b>57</b>
2.2.1 <i>Executive acts.....</i>	57
2.2.2 <i>Judicial &amp; legislative acts .....</i>	58
2.2.3 <i>IHL/LOAC Manuals.....</i>	59
2.2.4 <i>Attack &amp; subsequent practice: summary.....</i>	60
<b>2.3 The notion of attack &amp; the evolutive approach .....</b>	<b>61</b>
2.3.1 <i>What is evolutive interpretation.....</i>	62
2.3.2 <i>Criticism.....</i>	64
2.3.3 <i>Evolutive interpretation &amp; the ICJ .....</i>	65
2.3.4 <i>The notion of attack &amp; evolutive interpretation.....</i>	68
<b>2.4 The notion of ‘cyber-attack’ .....</b>	<b>69</b>
2.4.1 <i>Meaning &amp; usage of the term .....</i>	70
2.4.2 <i>Cyber-attack &amp; the Tallinn Manual.....</i>	72
2.4.5 <i>Art. 49 API attack &amp; cyber-attack .....</i>	75
<b>2.5 Conclusion .....</b>	<b>88</b>

<b>The Notion of the Military Objective.....</b>	<b>91</b>
<b>3 Introduction.....</b>	<b>91</b>
<b>3.1 Understanding the notion of objects &amp; objectives.....</b>	<b>91</b>
3.1.1 <i>The ordinary meaning of objects</i> .....	92
3.1.2 <i>The ordinary meaning of objectives</i> .....	93
3.1.3 <i>The meaning of Military Objectives</i> .....	94
3.1.4 <i>Context</i> .....	104
3.1.5 <i>Object &amp; Purpose</i> .....	112
<b>3.2 Article 52(2) API &amp; subsequent practice.....</b>	<b>116</b>
3.2.1 <i>The post-1977 notion of Military Objectives &amp; civilian objects</i> .....	117
<b>3.3 Article 52(2) API &amp; the evolutive approach .....</b>	<b>122</b>
3.3.1 <i>Objects &amp; objectives; then and now</i> .....	123
3.3.2 <i>The term object &amp; the ICJ's 'General Rule'</i> .....	129
3.3.3 <i>An evolutive approach to 'objects' in cyberspace'?</i> .....	130
<b>3.4 Cyber operations, military objectives, &amp; civilian objects .....</b>	<b>132</b>
3.4.1 <i>Military objectives &amp; civilian objects in cyberspace</i> .....	133
3.4.2 <i>Military objectives &amp; the Tallinn Manual 2.0</i> .....	137
3.4.3 <i>Art 52(2) API &amp; cyber operations</i> .....	138
3.4.4 <i>Discussion</i> .....	151
<b>3.5 Conclusion .....</b>	<b>155</b>
<b>The Notion of Damage in Cyber Operations .....</b>	<b>159</b>
<b>4 Introduction .....</b>	<b>159</b>
<b>4.1 Understanding the notion of damage .....</b>	<b>159</b>
4.1.1 <i>Ordinary meaning</i> .....	160
4.1.1.1 <i>The notion of damage as a legal term</i> .....	161
4.1.1.2 <i>Military operations</i> .....	165
4.1.2 <i>Context</i> .....	174
4.1.3 <i>Object &amp; Purpose</i> .....	184
<b>4.2 The notion of damage &amp; subsequent practice .....</b>	<b>187</b>
4.2.2 <i>Damage &amp; State Practice</i> .....	187
<b>4.3 The notion of damage &amp; evolutive interpretation .....</b>	<b>193</b>
<b>4.4 Understanding the notion of 'cyber-damage' .....</b>	<b>196</b>
4.4.1 <i>General interpretation of 'cyber damage'</i> .....	196
4.4.2 <i>Cyber Security &amp; the Information Security approach</i> .....	204
4.4.3 <i>'Cyber damage' in legal procedures: an example</i> .....	209
4.4.4 <i>Damage in the context of cyber operations</i> .....	212

<b>4.5 The notion of ‘collateral damage’</b> .....	<b>221</b>
4.5.1 Art. 57 API & the notion of collateral damage .....	222
4.5.2 Cyber operations & collateral damage: Challenges.....	230
<b>4.6 Conclusion</b> .....	<b>239</b>
<b>Synthesis</b> .....	<b>243</b>
<b>5 Introduction</b> .....	<b>243</b>
<b>5.1 Outcomes &amp; implications</b> .....	<b>243</b>
<b>5.2 The notion of ‘cyber-attack’ &amp; Art. 49 API: Outcomes &amp; Implications</b> .....	<b>244</b>
5.2.1 The concept of violence & violent acts for the purpose of API .....	244
5.2.1.1 Descriptions of violence.....	245
5.2.1.2 The changing meaning of violence .....	246
5.2.1.3 The scope of violence.....	246
5.2.2 Identifying the grey area .....	248
5.2.3 An evolutive interpretation of ‘attack’ & cyber operations .....	250
5.2.3.1 Intention .....	251
5.2.3.2 The changing meaning of terms.....	252
5.2.3.3 A broader purpose .....	253
<b>5.3 Data: intangible objects &amp; military objectives?</b> .....	<b>253</b>
5.3.1 What do objects consist of, for the purposes of API? .....	253
5.3.2 The effects of armed conflict & civilian objects’ .....	255
5.3.3 An evolutive approach to objects & military objectives .....	257
5.3.3.1 Categorising data .....	257
5.3.3.2 Tangible and visible objects vs data.....	258
5.3.3.3 The purpose of API and data .....	259
<b>5.4 Non-physical damage</b> .....	<b>259</b>
5.4.1 ‘Damage’ vs damage in API.....	260
5.4.2 Damage through cyber operations.....	262
5.4.3 Damage or nuisance: a sliding scale? .....	266
5.4.4 An evolutive approach to damage and Art. 57 API .....	269
<b>5.5 Conclusion</b> .....	<b>271</b>
<b>Bibliography</b> .....	<b>275</b>
<b>Summary</b> .....	<b>329</b>
<b>Acknowledgements</b> .....	<b>331</b>