Disputing about taste: Practices and perceptions of cultural hierarchy in the Netherlands
van den Haak, M.A.

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: http://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
# Table of contents

Acknowledgements 11

Introduction

‘Highbrow’ or ‘nobrow’? The study of cultural hierarchy 15
  Practising, perceiving and valuing hierarchy: On research questions and methods 18

The rationale behind the research questions 20
  Practising cultural hierarchy in a more egalitarian society 20
  Defining and classifying cultural hierarchy 21
  Cultural upbringing or education? Studying upwardly mobile people separately 26
  The less educated: Accepting, resisting or unaware of cultural hierarchy? 28
  High culture for older women? The importance of age and gender 29
  Between hierarchy and egalitarianism: The strategic case of the Netherlands 30

Organisation of the dissertation 32

Notes to the reader 34

Chapter 1

The rise and fall of cultural hierarchy? A historical analysis 37

The social construction of cultural hierarchies 39
  The unimportance of cultural distinction in the late Middle Ages 39
  Size, grandeur and craftsmanship: Early signs of cultural distinction 40
  Aesthetic refinement and professionalisation: The first logic of cultural hierarchy 42
  High vs. low culture: The institutionalisation of cultural hierarchy 45
  Authenticity and innovation: An alternative logic of cultural hierarchy 47
  Kitsch, middlebrow, popular and mass culture: Distinctions from lower and middle classes 50

The end of distinction? The alleged fading of cultural hierarchies 55
  An individualist and non-hierarchical era? 55
  The omnivore debate: Tolerant or distinctive? 57
  Auteur films and authentic hip hop: Continuous dynamics within cultural domains 59

A hierarchy-breaking hierarchy? Lines for inquiry 62

Chapter 2

How to research cultural hierarchies: Methodological considerations 65

Which questions to ask, and why: The interview design 66
  Taste or participation? 67
Chapter 3

The relation between hierarchy and taste: The ranking of items

Puzzles, negotiations, and refusals: The ranking in practice

Ignorance and faking: The knowledge of items

Consensus on high and low culture: Hierarchy and taste compared

Outliers and dispersion: Variations in the hierarchy

High and low reversed: Deviant cases discussed
Is André Rieu high or low? High dispersion on specific items
The consecration of Bach: The role of educational level
The canonisation of classical rock: The role of age
The irrelevance of gender

High culture as the old higher educated’s taste

Conclusion: A persisting but changing cultural hierarchy

Chapter 4

Distinction or not? Hierarchical versus egalitarian narratives

Looking down and up: Hierarchical narratives
‘I’m not culturally literate’: The case of Ria
‘Everyone watches pulp’: Exploring cultural distinction
‘I feel like an inferior person’: Looking up to others and down on oneself
Frequency, knowledge and attitude: Specific hierarchical practices

Egalitarianism, individualism and anti-elitism: Anti-hierarchical narratives
‘We’re all the same’: The case of Nel
‘There is no disputing about taste’: Individualist views
‘Hazes can be high culture too’: Opposing the high–low distinction
Resisting fakeness and snobbery: Anti-elitism as a form of egalitarianism
Authentic tastes and moral boundaries: Egalitarianism as alternative distinction

Conclusion: The coexistence of opposite narratives

Chapter 5

Combining and ignoring repertoires: Ambivalences and neutrality

The case of Cultuurshake: Ambivalence and neutrality about hierarchies in a television show
Cross-tabulating cultural repertoires: Developing a typology of respondents
Switching between repertoires: The ambivalent type
‘I don’t mean it in a derogatory way’: The case of Inge
Distinctive or not? Being inconsistent
‘That’s not a value judgement’: Downplaying statements
‘I don’t dare to say it’s kitsch’: The bad tastes of proximate others
‘It’s just not their world’: The unease of upwardly mobile people

To conclude

Not engaging in the hierarchy debate: The neutral type
‘It doesn’t appeal to me’: The case of Arie
Exploring and extending the neutral type
Taking serious non-hierarchical narratives

Conclusion: Uneasiness about cultural distinction

Chapter 6

Taste biographies and classifications: How people explain their own and others’ tastes

Porridge spoons and planting seeds: Perceptions of the origins of taste
‘Brought up with culture’: The importance of parental socialisation
Opening windows: Different sources of secondary socialisation
Turning Orfeo into a fairytale: Passing culture on to one’s children
Understanding Jimi Hendrix: Parental influences in pop music
‘They are too simple for that’: How people explain taste differences
Youth culture and conservatism: The interrelatedness of age and birth cohort
Chick flicks and macho shows: Perceptions of gendered tastes
Coalmen, PhDs, and high IQs: Finding alternatives for class differences
Chapter 5

Combining and ignoring repertoires: Ambivalences and neutrality 167

The case of Cultuurshake: Ambivalence and neutrality about hierarchies in a television show 168

Cross-tabulating cultural repertoires: Developing a typology of respondents 171

Switching between repertoires: The ambivalent type 175
‘I don’t mean it in a derogatory way’: The case of Inge 175
Distinctive or not? Being inconsistent 178
‘That’s not a value judgement’: Downplaying statements 180
‘I don’t dare to say it’s kitsch’: The bad tastes of proximate others 183
‘It’s just not their world’: The unease of upwardly mobile people 185
To conclude 189

Not engaging in the hierarchy debate: The neutral type 190
‘It doesn’t appeal to me’: The case of Arie 191
Exploring and extending the neutral type 193
Taking serious non-hierarchical narratives 194

Conclusion: Uneasiness about cultural distinction 196

Chapter 6

Taste biographies and classifications: How people explain their own and others’ tastes 199

Porridge spoons and planting seeds: Perceptions of the origins of taste 201
‘Brought up with culture’: The importance of parental socialisation 201
Opening windows: Different sources of secondary socialisation 205
Turning Orfeo into a fairytale: Passing culture on to one’s children 208
Understanding Jimi Hendrix: Parental influences in pop music 211

‘They are too simple for that’: How people explain taste differences 214
Youth culture and conservatism: The interrelatedness of age and birth cohort 216
Chick flicks and macho shows: Perceptions of gendered tastes 221
Coalmen, PhDs, and high IQs: Finding alternatives for class differences 223
Chapter 7

How to value art? On the criteria for good art and high culture

A quantitative account of criteria

Popular aesthetics
  From sentiment to enthralment: Valuations of emotions
  From substance to interpretation: Valuations of content

Classic criteria for high culture
  ‘I don’t want to be shocked’: Valuations of morality
  On nonsense and naturalness: Valuations of realism
  On skills and virtuosity: Valuations of craftsmanship

When contrasting criteria collide: An intermezzo on abstract art

An overarching criterion: Valuations of complexity

Pure aesthetics and modern criteria for high culture
  ‘There’s a tension between the pots’: Valuations of form over function
  Seniority versus experiments: Valuations of originality
  ‘It feels plastic to me’: Valuations of authenticity

Social criteria
  Mainstream versus underground: Perceived relations between popularity and quality
  High culture for elites: Valuations of social status

Conclusion
  The application of criteria in general
  The perceived characteristics of high culture
  Discussion: Possible opinions on a ‘new’ hierarchy

Conclusion

Research questions and methods

Hierarchical practices, perceptions and opinions
  Practising cultural hierarchy
  Defining cultural hierarchy
  Valuing cultural hierarchy

Analysing contradictions and tensions
  Practising and opposing cultural hierarchy