Disputing about taste: Practices and perceptions of cultural hierarchy in the Netherlands

van den Haak, M.A.

Citation for published version (APA):
# Table of contents

## Acknowledgements

11

## Introduction

### ‘Highbrow’ or ‘nobrow’? The study of cultural hierarchy

15

*Practising, perceiving and valuing hierarchy: On research questions and methods*

18

### The rationale behind the research questions

20

*Practising cultural hierarchy in a more egalitarian society*

20

*Defining and classifying cultural hierarchy*

21

*Cultural upbringing or education? Studying upwardly mobile people separately*

26

*The less educated: Accepting, resisting or unaware of cultural hierarchy?*

28

*High culture for older women? The importance of age and gender*

29

*Between hierarchy and egalitarianism: The strategic case of the Netherlands*

30

## Organisation of the dissertation

32

## Notes to the reader

34

## Chapter 1

### The rise and fall of cultural hierarchy? A historical analysis

37

#### The social construction of cultural hierarchies

39

*The unimportance of cultural distinction in the late Middle Ages*

39

*Size, grandeur and craftsmanship: Early signs of cultural distinction*

40

*Aesthetic refinement and professionalisation: The first logic of cultural hierarchy*

42

*High vs. low culture: The institutionalisation of cultural hierarchy*

45

*Authenticity and innovation: An alternative logic of cultural hierarchy*

47

*Kitsch, middlebrow, popular and mass culture: Distinctions from lower and middle classes*

50

#### The end of distinction? The alleged fading of cultural hierarchies

55

*An individualist and non-hierarchical era?*

55

*The omnivore debate: Tolerant or distinctive?*

57

*Auteur films and authentic hip hop: Continuous dynamics within cultural domains*

59

### A hierarchy-breaking hierarchy? Lines for inquiry

62

## Chapter 2

### How to research cultural hierarchies: Methodological considerations

65

#### Which questions to ask, and why: The interview design

66

*Taste or participation?*

67
The scope of research: Five cultural disciplines 68
The dynamic aspects of taste: Taste biographies 71
The social aspects of taste: Comparisons with others 71
Specific questions on hierarchies and policies 72

**Ranking the cards: Unravelling tastes and hierarchies** 73
The selection of items 74

**Which respondents to search, and how: Questions of sampling** 78
Comparing status and age groups: Defining the quotas 78
The sampling procedure: Randomly filling the quotas 80
The increased role of education: Some consequences for the research 84

**On the practice of interviewing** 88
The presentation of self 89
Perceptions of the interviewer 90
Constructing an answer 92
Diverging interpretations of used concepts 94

---

**Chapter 3**

The relation between hierarchy and taste: The ranking of items 99

Puzzles, negotiations, and refusals: The ranking in practice 100
Ignorance and faking: The knowledge of items 104
Consensus on high and low culture: Hierarchy and taste compared 107

Outliers and dispersion: Variations in the hierarchy 112
High and low reversed: Deviant cases discussed 112
Is André Rieu high or low? High dispersion on specific items 113
The consecration of Bach: The role of educational level 115
The canonisation of classical rock: The role of age 118
The irrelevance of gender 123

High culture as the old higher educated’s taste 123

Conclusion: A persisting but changing cultural hierarchy 125

---

**Chapter 4**

Distinction or not? Hierarchical versus egalitarian narratives 127

Looking down and up: Hierarchical narratives 129
‘I’m not culturally literate’: The case of Ria 129
‘Everyone watches pulp’: Exploring cultural distinction 131
‘I feel like an inferior person’: Looking up to others and down on oneself 136
Frequency, knowledge and attitude: Specific hierarchical practices 140

---

**Chapter 5**

Combining and ignoring repertoires: Ambivalences and neutrality 16
The case of Cultuurshake: Ambivalence and neutrality about hierarchies in a television show 16
Cross-tabulating cultural repertoires: Developing a typology of respondents 171
Switching between repertoires: The ambivalent type 17
‘I don’t mean it in a derogatory way’: The case of Inge 17
Distinctive or not? Being inconsistent 17
‘That’s not a value judgement’: Downplaying statements 18
‘I don’t dare to say it’s kitsch’: The bad tastes of proximate others 18
‘It’s just not their world’: The unease of upwardly mobile people 18

To conclude 18
Not engaging in the hierarchy debate: The neutral type 19
The case of Arie 19
Exploring and extending the neutral type 19
Taking serious non-hierarchical narratives 19

Conclusion: Uneasiness about cultural distinction 19

---

**Chapter 6**

Taste biographies and classifications: How people explain their own and others’ tastes 19
Porridge spoons and planting seeds: Perceptions of the origins of taste 20
‘Brought up with culture’: The importance of parental socialisation 20
Opening windows: Different sources of secondary socialisation 20
Turning Orfeo into a fairytale: Passing culture on to one’s children 20
Understanding Jimi Hendrix: Parental influences in pop music 21
‘They are too simple for that’: How people explain taste differences 21
Youth culture and conservatism: The interrelatedness of age and birth cohort 21
Chick flicks and macho shows: Perceptions of gendered tastes 21
Coalmen, PhDs, and high IQs: Finding alternatives for class differences 23
Chapter 7

How to value art? On the criteria for good art and high culture

A quantitative account of criteria

Popular aesthetics
  From sentiment to enthralment: Valuations of emotions
  From substance to interpretation: Valuations of content

Classic criteria for high culture
  ‘I don’t want to be shocked’: Valuations of morality
  On nonsense and naturalness: Valuations of realism
  On skills and virtuosity: Valuations of craftsmanship

When contrasting criteria collide: An intermezzo on abstract art

An overarching criterion: Valuations of complexity

Pure aesthetics and modern criteria for high culture
  ‘There’s a tension between the pots’: Valuations of form over function
  Seniority versus experiments: Valuations of originality
  ‘It feels plastic to me’: Valuations of authenticity

Social criteria
  Mainstream versus underground: Perceived relations between popularity and quality
  High culture for elites: Valuations of social status

Conclusion
  The application of criteria in general
  The perceived characteristics of high culture
  Discussion: Possible opinions on a ‘new’ hierarchy

Conclusion

Research questions and methods

Hierarchical practices, perceptions and opinions
  Practising cultural hierarchy
  Defining cultural hierarchy
  Valuing cultural hierarchy

Analysing contradictions and tensions
  Practising and opposing cultural hierarchy