Non-lethality in reality: a defence technology assessment of its political and military potential
Orbons, J.B.J.

Citation for published version (APA):
Orbons, J. B. J. (2013). Non-lethality in reality: a defence technology assessment of its political and military potential

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: http://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
# Contents

Acknowledgements vii

Samenvatting (summary in Dutch) ix

## Chapter 1 Introduction

1

Introduction 3
Developments leading to the increasing emphasis on non-lethal weapons 4
- Trends and developments before 1990 4
- The 1990s: pragmatic examples and continuing debate 7
NLWs between doctrinal inclusion and critical debate 10
- Technological optimism 10
- Careful supporters 12
- Sceptics 13
Deriving the research questions from the NLW debate 15
- Claims related to Non-Lethal Weapons & Technology 16
- Claims related to NLW target groups 16
- Claims related to military users of NLWs 16
- Claims related to the strategic effect of NLW application 16
The research approach 17
- Sources and data collection 19
References 20

## Chapter 2 Do Non-Lethal Weapons License to ‘Silence’?

25

Introduction 27
The Military Rationale of Non-Lethality 29
Between Expectation, Intent (‘The Ideal’) and Operational Reality (‘Friction’) 31
Realities on the Ground: Assessing NLWs 32
Three NLW Devices 34
The Weapon & Technology Complex 36
The User Complex 38
The Target Complex 41
Assessment Synthesis 42
NLW and Just War Tradition 44
Conclusions 45
Acknowledgements 46
Notes 46
References 47
Chapter 3  Non-Lethal Weapons: Peace Enablers or Troublesome Force?
Assessing the Role of CS and Baton Rounds in the Northern Ireland Conflict

Introduction 51
A DTA approach to NLWs 53
CS 55
   CS weapon/technology 55
   CS user 56
   CS targets 57
   CS use-in-operational-context 57
   The aftermath of CS deployment 61
Baton Rounds (BRs) 62
   BR weapon/technology 62
   BR user 62
   BR targets 64
   BR use-in-operational-context 65
Conclusions 69
   CS 69
   BRs 70
   Synopsis and outlook for NLW assessment 71
Acknowledgements 72
Notes 72
Bibliography 75

Chapter 4  Assessing Non-Lethal Weapons Use in Detainee Operations in Iraq:
Benign Force or Necessary Evil?

Introduction 81
Rationale and expectations of NLW deployment in support of detainee operations 82
Analytical approach for NLW assessment in Iraq detainee operations 83
Kinetic NLW characteristics 87
Kinetic NLW user force 88
Kinetic NLW target population 89
Kinetic NLW use-in-operational-context 91
Deploying the Active Denial System 98
Assessment synthesis and conclusion 100
Acknowledgements 103
Notes 103
# Chapter 5  Are Non-Lethal Weapons a Viable Military Option to Strengthen the Hearts and Minds Approach in Afghanistan?  

Introduction 109  
Non-lethal weapons and the impact of tactical prudence 110  
Analytical approach for NLW assessment in Afghanistan 111  
Defining the Afghanistan research case 111  
Laser Optical Warner technology and working principles 113  
Laser Optical Warner use-in-operational-context at checkpoints 114  
Laser Optical Warner use-in-operational-context by convoys 117  
Assessment synthesis 120  
Conclusions 121  
Acknowledgements 122  
Notes 122  

# Chapter 6  Conclusions  

Introduction 129  
Purpose, expectations and doctrinal underpinnings of NLW deployment 129  
The Troubles in Northern Ireland 129  
Detention facilities in Iraq 130  
Checkpoints and convoys in Afghanistan 131  
NLW military deployment: review of findings 132  
The impact of environment and weather on NLW performance 132  
Counteracting NLW physiological effects 134  
User proficiency, performance and posture 138  
Target group perception and attitude towards the user 140  
Overall effects of NLW use 142  
NLW performance is being degraded 143  
NLWs perform counterproductive 144  
NLW performance is intentionally degenerated 145  
Conceiving an NLW counterfactual 145  
The politico-strategic level 148  
The political level / tactical level dialectic 149  
Validating the claims in the NLW debate against the DTA results 151  
Claims related to Non-Lethal Weapons & Technology 151  
Claims related to NLW target groups 152  
Claims related to military users of NLWs 153  
Claims related to the strategic effect of NLW application 154  
Revisiting expectations from an operational outcome perspective 155  
Recommendations and outlook 156  
Recommendations 156  
Outlook 156  
References 158

## Appendix

Interviews, conversations and correspondence with subject matter experts 160