



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Mozart's unfinished Mass in C minor, K. 427 ('Great Mass')

History, Theory, and Practice of its Completion

Kemme, C.

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Kemme, C. (2017). Mozart's unfinished Mass in C minor, K. 427 ('Great Mass'): History, Theory, and Practice of its Completion.

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

MOZART'S UNFINISHED MASS IN C MINOR, K. 427 ('GREAT MASS')
HISTORY, THEORY, AND PRACTICE OF ITS COMPLETION

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor

aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam

op gezag van de Rector Magnificus

prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex

ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde
commissie, in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Aula der Universiteit

op woensdag 18 oktober 2017, te 10.30 uur

door Clemens Kemme

geboren te Loosdrecht

Promotiecommissie:

Promotor:	prof. dr. R. de Groot	Universiteit van Amsterdam
Copromotor:	prof. dr. M.H. Schmid	Eberhard-Karls-Universität Tübingen
Overige leden:	prof. dr. J.J.E. Kursell	Universiteit van Amsterdam
	prof. dr. F. Grijzenhout	Universiteit van Amsterdam
	prof. dr. J. Butt	University of Glasgow
	prof. dr. C. Eisen	King's College London
	prof. dr. C. Kühn	Hochschule für Musik, Dresden
	dr. B. Titus	Universiteit van Amsterdam
Faculteit:	Geesteswetenschappen	

Het onderzoek voor dit proefschrift werd mede mogelijk gemaakt door steun van de Amsterdamse Hogeschool voor de Kunsten. De auteur ontving een promotievoucher voor 0,55 fte gedurende de periode 1 september 2007 t/m 31 december 2009.

Contents	iii
Abstract	v
Samenvatting (Abstract in Dutch)	vi
Acknowledgements	viii
Abbreviations	xi
Part A. Text	
I. Introduction	2
II. History	5
1. Time of composition	5
2. Mozart's masses, mass types, K. 427	5
3. Incentive?	16
4. Why unfinished?	32
5. After 1783	34
III. The musical context	
1. Contemporary Mozart works	36
2. Van Swieten	40
3. Bach	41
4. Handel	45
5. Other sacred music - Italy	46
IV. Sources and early editions	49
1. Overview	49
2. The autograph	52
3. The Salzburg parts: Estlinger's organ part and Hofstätter's trombone parts	64
4. Fischer's score copy	69
5. André's first edition and its <i>Stichvorlage</i> (1840)	82
6. Spitta's edition for Breitkopf's <i>Gesamtausgabe</i> (AMA, 1882)	93
7. Overview	95
V. The available completions	96
1. Overview	96
2. Schmitt (1901)	96
3. Landon (1956)	98
4. NMA/Eder (1983/1985)	99
5. Beyer (1989)	100
6. Maunder (1990)	101
7. Wilby (2004)	103
8. Levin (2005)	105
9. Cohrs (2010)	107
10. Koopman (unpublished)	110
11. Bernius and Wolf (2016)	111
12. Overview	113
13. A new completion: why and how?	113
VI. The new completion	115
1. Editing the Kyrie and Gloria	115
2. Completing the 'Credo in unum Deum'	117
3. Completing the 'Et incarnatus est'	131
4. Reconstructing the Sanctus	158
5. Editing the Benedictus	192
VII. Conclusions. Some reflections on the nature of research in the arts	199
Bibliography	211

Part B. Music 231

from:

Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart, Messe c-moll für Soli, Chor und Orchester, KV 427, ergänzt und herausgegeben von Clemens Kemme, © 2017 by Breitkopf & Härtel, Wiesbaden. 7. Probe.

Erratum	232
1. Kyrie (first page only)	1
9. Credo in unum Deum	107
10. Et incarnatus est	130
11. Sanctus	141
12. Benedictus	156

Abstract

Mozart's Mass in C minor, K. 427, (the 'Great Mass'), is an unfinished work like his famous Requiem. It is a long mass. Like its finished Gloria, the Credo was most likely planned in seven movements. Only two of these were composed in outlines, their instrumentation remaining unfinished. The Sanctus and Benedictus were completed, but their main scores have gone lost and have to be reconstructed from Mozart's surviving wind score and two secondary sources. There is no Agnus Dei. Performances of the Mass necessarily have to rely on completions and reconstructions by other authors.

Eight or nine completions of both the C-minor Mass and the Requiem are available. Of the Requiem there is a version dating from Mozart's own time, the completion by his assistant Franz Xaver Süßmayr. And although heavily criticized from the first performances onwards, there are strong indications that this version is at least partially based on information from the composer. Therefore it still counts as the standard version. Of the C-minor Mass, however, such a historical completion does not exist. The only available performing editions date from the twentieth and twenty-first centuries. All of these versions, however, have met with serious criticism and none of them has succeeded in becoming a standard version.

The research question of this dissertation is whether it would be possible to arrive at a more convincing completion by combining (a) the most recent findings of historical musicology, (b) historically informed music theory (analysis, counterpoint, harmony, arranging), (c) a detailed study of Mozart's typical style of composition and instrumentation, (d) the experience of several decades of historically informed performance practice. In this dissertation, I hope to show that such a combination can indeed lead to more satisfactory results.

The thesis consists of two parts, Part A: Text, and Part B: Music. Part A, the text part, summarizes the current state of historical research about the work, discusses the musical sources in detail (autograph, secondary manuscript sources, early editions), analyses the work and its various movements in relation to Mozart's composition and instrumentation techniques in similar completed works and other composers' works that may have inspired him, explores the possibilities for completion of the incomplete movements of K. 427, discusses the versions published so far, and offers a new completion. The choices made in the new version are motivated by comparisons with many examples from Mozart's completed works, including the finished movements of the Mass itself, and works by Bach and Handel (among others) which Mozart studied with great enthusiasm in the period he worked on the C-minor Mass. A concluding chapter summarizes the

most important findings and offers some reflections on the relation between musicology, music theory, orchestration, and performance practice, and on the nature of research into the arts.

Part B is a full score of the newly completed or reconstructed movements ‘Credo in unum Deum’, ‘Et incarnatus est’, Sanctus, and Benedictus. These four movements are part of the new edition of the complete Mass to be published in 2017 by Breitkopf & Härtel, Wiesbaden, Germany. Preceding the four movements is the opening page of the Mass, the first page of the Kyrie.

~~~

*Mozarts onvoltooide Mis in c kleine terts, KV 427 ('Grote Mis'). Geschiedenis, theorie en praktijk van haar completering*

## Samenvatting

Mozarts Mis in c kl.t. (KV 427) is een onvoltooid werk, zoals het beroemde Requiem. Het is een lange mis waarvan het Credo waarschijnlijk in zeven delen was gepland, net als het wel voltooide Gloria. Slechts twee delen daarvan werden in hoofdlijnen gecomponeerd; de instrumentatie bleef onafgemaakt. Sanctus en Benedictus werden wel voltooid, maar daarvan is de hoofdpartituur verloren gegaan; zij moeten worden gereconstrueerd uit Mozarts wel bewaard gebleven blazerspartituur en twee secundaire bronnen. Er is geen Agnus Dei. Uitvoeringen van de mis zijn alleen mogelijk in completering van de hand van andere auteurs.

Voor elk van beide werken zijn acht of negen completering voorhanden. Slechts voor het Requiem bestaat er een completering uit Mozarts eigen tijd, die van zijn assistent Franz Xaver Süssmayr, en hoewel hevig bekritiseerd vanaf de vroegste uitvoeringen, zijn er sterke aanwijzingen dat deze versie op zijn minst gedeeltelijk is gebaseerd op informatie van de componist. Daarom geldt deze versie als de standaardversie. Voor de Mis in c-klein echter is zo'n historische completering er niet. De enig beschikbare uitvoeringsversies dateren uit de twintigste en eenentwintigste eeuw. Al deze versies zijn echter op serieuze kritiek gestuit en geen ervan heeft het gebracht tot de status van standaardversie.

De onderzoeksvraag van deze dissertatie is of het mogelijk zou zijn tot een meer overtuigende completering te komen door het combineren van (a) de meest recente bevindingen van de historische musicologie, (b) historisch geïnformeerde muziektheorie (analyse, contrapunt, harmonie, arrangeren), (c) gedetailleerde kennis van Mozarts typische stijl van componeren en instrumenteren (d) de ervaring van enkele decennia historisch geïnformeerde uitvoeringspraktijk. In

deze dissertatie hoop ik aan te tonen dat een dergelijke combinatie inderdaad tot een meer bevredigend resultaat kan leiden.

Het proefschrift bevat twee delen, 'Part A: Text', en 'Part B: Music'. 'Part A', het tekstdeel, vat de actuele stand van het historisch onderzoek over het werk samen, behandelt de muzikale bronnen in detail (autograaf, secundaire handgeschreven bronnen en vroege edities), analyseert het werk en de verschillende delen ervan in relatie tot Mozarts compositie- en instrumentatietechnieken in soortgelijke voltooide werken en werken waaraan hij mogelijk een voorbeeld heeft genomen, verkent de mogelijkheden tot completering van de incomplete delen, bespreekt de tot dusver gepubliceerde versies, en presenteert, tot slot, de nieuwe versie. De hierin gemaakte keuzen worden onderbouwd met vele voorbeelden uit Mozarts voltooide werken, inclusief de voltooide delen uit de Mis zelf, en werken van Bach en Händel (o.a.) die Mozart met groot enthousiasme bestudeerde in de periode waarin hij aan de c-klein-Mis werkte. Een slothoofdstuk vat de voornaamste bevindingen samen en reflecteert op de relatie tussen muziekwetenschap, muziektheorie, orkestratie en uitvoeringspraktijk, en tevens op de bijzondere aard van onderzoek in de kunsten.

Part B is een complete partituur van de nieuw voltooide dan wel gereconstrueerde delen 'Credo in unum Deum', 'Et incarnatus est', Sanctus en Benedictus. Deze vier delen zullen samen met de opnieuw geredigeerde delen Kyrie en Gloria uitkomen als de nieuwe editie van de volledige mis, te publiceren in 2017 door Breitkopf & Härtel, Wiesbaden, Duitsland. Aan de vier delen gaat de beginpagina van de mis vooraf, de eerste pagina van het Kyrie.

~~~


Acknowledgements

When I started this research project in September 2007, nobody would have thought it would take me 10 years to finish it. And although in the last couple of years some people must have thought it would remain as unfinished as the work that was its subject, here is the result, finally.

The longer the process took, the larger became the group of people somehow involved. Yet there are people who witnessed the entire decade of its duration. And one of them has to be mentioned first and foremost. It is the one person about whom I can say: without him I would definitely not have managed to finish the project. It is prof. dr. Rokus de Groot, emeritus professor of musicology at the University of Amsterdam. He has been my supervisor/promoter. When I came to him with my plan in early 2007, he immediately saw its potential and supported it wholeheartedly. And only he really knows what came on my path, the obstacles I had to take, the little victories every now and then, and the crises I had. He always understood, and helped me through, with the patience of a guardian angel and as a real father to the project. I could not be more thankful to him.

In the second place my enormous gratitude goes to prof. dr. Manfred Hermann Schmid, emeritus professor of musicology at the Eberhard-Karls-Universität Tübingen, who was my co-supervisor/co-promoter (*Zweitgutachter*, as the Germans say), the renowned Mozart specialist I certainly needed to discuss all the specialized Mozart questions with. And what a specialist he appeared to be! Not only did he share numerous precious pieces of information with me, he also possessed the same immeasurable patience, waiting for new chapters year after year, never uttering even the smallest complaint. In 2010, he became President of the *Forschungsakademie* of the Mozarteum in Salzburg, and in September 2012, I had the opportunity to present my project at the Mozart-Kongress of this honoured Academy. And at the performance by the *Chor des Bayerischen Rundfunks* under Peter Dijkstra of my completion of the Great Mass in November 2012 in Munich's *Prinzregententheater*, he was willing to share his vast knowledge and expertise with the audience having turned up in great numbers an hour before the concert. Furthermore, his positive advice has been decisive for the publisher Breitkopf & Härtel to choose my completion for their new edition, forthcoming later this year.

Then I wish to thank the then directors of the Conservatorium van Amsterdam (CvA) and the then executive board of the Amsterdamse Hogeschool voor de Kunsten (AHK) for awarding me a promotion voucher to the value of about a halftime job for the period of September 2007 to December 2009. I used it for getting my way in the vast literature on Mozart and his sacred works and presenting my project at the Eberhard-Karls-Universität in Tübingen in March 2009, at the invitation of Prof. Schmid. I am very grateful, also, to Henk Borgdorff, then Professor of Art Theory and Research at the CvA, and for years the energetic and infectious leader of the art research group ARTI of the AHK of which I had been a member at his invitation. I am certain

Henk's influence was important in the decision to award me the voucher. And I thank Michiel Schuijjer, then Lecturer and Co-ordinator of the Master Research Program at the CvA, who, having written a brilliant and widely acclaimed dissertation himself (on *Analyzing Atonal Music*, as the later book title read), was appointed to keep an eye on me on behalf of the CvA-board of directors, which turned out to be a pretty hopeless task. Comfort at last, Michiel!

Then I must thank a number of wonderful colleagues among the performance teachers at the CvA: first of all violinist-conductor Johannes Leertouwer, who was the one to set the process of finalizing my completion of the C-minor Mass in motion in the autumn of 2004 by saying yes to my proposal to programme it for the Mozart year 2006, and the one who spoke to Frans Brüggen, who planned a performance of the Mass as well, and pointed him at my new completion in the making. I thank Johannes also for the wonderful collaboration we had in numerous Analysis & Performance projects and for his energetic attempts, with great support of his father, the wonderful Lammert Leertouwer, former Rector Magnificus of the University of Leiden, to get me to finish my dissertation years ago already, a task equally hopeless for him as for Michiel to supervise me. To you and Lammert as well: finally it's done, thanks to you too! I must also thank violinist and member of the Orchestra of the Eighteenth Century Kees Koelmans for his enthusiasm in warming up Frans Brüggen and the Orchestra for my new version. Then, great thanks go to Sieuwert Verster, the indefatigable and incredibly amiable general director and one-man organizing virtuoso of the Orchestra of the Eighteenth Century. Without him, the whole project of getting my completions performed, several times, would have been unthinkable. And, posthumously, I want to warmly thank Frans Brüggen. His hospitality in the preparing conversations at his home, the many things I learned during the rehearsals and concerts, all these experiences belong to my dearest memories. Special thanks also go to soprano Claron McFadden whose first performance of the 'Et incarnatus est' in my version in 2006 was a gem and is still exemplary to me.

After the positive reception of the Mass, it was again Johannes Leertouwer who stimulated me to continue and make a new completion of the Mozart Requiem, which he was to lead as a guest director with the Netherlands Bach Society, on a tour throughout the Netherlands in October 2006. His request was soon doubled by Sieuwert Verster, since the O18C had the Requiem on their program for concerts taking place simultaneously in Warsaw. That week in October 2006, with concerts in the Netherlands and Warsaw (to which I was generously invited) was unforgettable for me, and I am enormously grateful to Johannes, Sieuwert and Frans for their initiatives and their great efforts, and all the members of both orchestras and choirs and all the soloists for their enthusiasm, their support, their instructive criticism, and their marvelous music making.

I also thank Hein Meens (posthumously), Jos van Veldhoven, Jos Vermunt, and Richard Egarr for their conducting performances of my completion of either the Mass or the Requiem in 2007, 2008, 2009, 2011 and 2013.

In December 2009, Michiel Schuijer organised a Symposium entitled ‘Unfinished Fascination: Mozart’s Requiem’. The energetic and very pleasant way he organized and lead this wonderful event was praised by all the speakers, among whom Manfred Hermann Schmid, Thomas Bauman, and David Black. And I thank Johannes Leertouwer again for leading the choir and orchestra of the CvA in a performance of the Requiem in a packed Bernard Haitinkzaal.

Then I want to thank Peter Dijkstra for his choosing my version of the C-minor Mass for his performance with the Chor des Bayerischen Rundfunks and the Münchener Kammerorchester at a concert on 24 November 2012 in Munich’s Prinzregentensaal, to which also a CD-recording appeared to be attached. And I want to thank Susanne Vongries, manager of the BR-Chor, for recommending my version to publisher Breitkopf & Härtel. It led to a contract in the summer of 2013 of which we are going to see the fruit soon: the new Breitkopf edition of the C-minor Mass.

My thanks go also to Eva-Maria Hodel, the then leader of the Lektorat at Breitkopf & Härtel, who prepared me a warm welcome in Wiesbaden. Then comes a person who is still an enormous support for me: Christian Rudolf Riedel, my supervisor at Breitkopf since 2013. His exemplary craftmanship, his patience and encouragement are invaluable for an editor who has to learn while doing.

Then I want to thank my great circle of best friends, who are in fact like my family: Cornel Bierens, Anna Tilroe, Helena van Heel, Fokke van Heel, and Signe van Heel: where would I be without you?

Finally I want to thank my family. First of all, posthumously, my father Ton Kemme, who saw at the right moment that I had to choose music as my profession and convinced me to do a professional study. He was completely right. It made my career! Then I have to thank my mother, Antonetta Kemme-Broekman and my brothers Thomas, and his partner Rik Wassenaar, and Vincent, and his wife Ine, for their endless patience, sympathy and support. Moreover, Rik functioned as an excellent ad hoc, last-minute editor for this dissertation. All the mistakes still there are entirely mine.

Many thanks again to all of you!

Clemens

Abbreviations

A.	Alto
<i>AMA</i>	<i>Alte Mozart-Ausgabe</i> , the first Mozart Gesamtausgabe, published by Breitkopf & Härtel from January 1877 to December 1883
André	First printed edition of K. 427, edited and published in 1840 by Johann Anton André, Offenburg
B.	Basso (vocal Bass)
Bassi	Violoncelli, Contrabassi, Organ (Orchestral basses)
C. (I, II)	Canto (Soprano)
Cln. (I, II)	Clarini (Trumpets)
Cor. (I, II)	Corni (Horns)
E	Manuscript organ and orchestral bass part to K. 427 by Joseph Richard Estlinger, copyist in Salzburg, mid-1784 to mid-1785?, Staats- und Stadtbibliothek, Augsburg.
F	Manuscript score copy written by Pater Matthäus Fischer, Augsburg organist and choir leader, ca. 1788-1800?, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek Wien.
Fg. (I, II)	Fagotto/-i (Bassoon(s))
Fl.	Flauto
H	Manuscript trombone parts to K. 427 by Felix Hofstätter, copyist in Salzburg, mid-1784 to mid-1785?, Staats- und Stadtbibliothek, Augsburg.
M	Mozart's autograph score, Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin–Preußischer Kulturbesitz. Also available at http://imslp.org/wiki/Mass_in_C_minor,_K.427/417a_(Mozart,_Wolfgang_Amadeus)
<i>MBA</i>	Bauer, W.A., O.E. Deutsch, J.H. Eibl, U. Konrad (eds.), <i>Mozart. Briefe und Aufzeichnungen</i> . Gesamtausgabe. 8 vols. Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2005.
<i>NMA</i>	<i>Neue Mozart Ausgabe</i> , published by Bärenreiter, Kassel, starting in 1954. Also available at http://dme.mozarteum.at/DME/nma/start.php?l=
Ob. (I, II)	Oboe(s)
Org. e B.	Organo e Bassi
S. (I, II)	Soprano (Canto)
Solo	Bassi part: Organo solo (only the solo organ/light registration or texture)
Spitta	Second printed edition of K. 427, edited by Philipp Spitta, published as part of the Mozart Gesamtausgabe/ <i>AMA</i> by Breitkopf & Härtel in 1882 (Revisionsbericht 1886).
T. (I, II)	Tenore
Tasto (solo)	Organo tasto solo (only the written notes)
Tbn. (a., t., b.)	Trombone (alto, tenore, basso)
Timp.	Timpani
Tutti	Bassi part: Tutti Organi (both organs/heavier registration or texture)
Va.	Viola(s) (/Viole)
Vi. (I, II)	Violin(s)