Questioning the past: student questioning and historical reasoning
Logtenberg, A.

Citation for published version (APA):
Logtenberg, A. (2012). Questioning the past: student questioning and historical reasoning Enschede: Ipskamp
APPENDIX A

Introductory text (760 words, translated from Dutch)

The Industrial Revolution
The platform of the brand new train station in Manchester is packed with people; wealthy ladies with their children, gentlemen in high hats. In the background a steam locomotive is still puffing. At a distance poorly-dressed men are watching, waiting for a chance to give directions to rich train passengers in the big city. Friedrich breathes in the smell of the steam engine. He observes the modern station in admiration, waiting for a chance to collect his luggage. ‘Impressive’, Friedrich thinks, ‘A lot more modern than our Essen station in Germany.’

‘Jungherr Engels?’ A large man is walking towards him. ‘My name is Peter; I’m the supervisor in your father’s factory. A carriage is waiting for you.’ A little later Friedrich is travelling through the streets of the big, grey city. Everywhere he looks he sees chimneys fuming endless trails of smoke. From the buildings lining the streets, constant rattle and trampling sounds emerge from small windows. Narrow streets all around are filled with dirt. Even the water in the wide channel is black and smelly. Friedrich’s thoughts wander back to home, where, fortunately, it is not as dirty and crowded. But here in Manchester, factories are bigger and the machines are more modern. That is the reason his father, a successful textile baron, had sent him here. Here, in his father’s factory, he has to finish his education.

The carriage stops in front of a large, stone brick building. Friedrich follows Peter through the factory gate into a large hall. His father has spent a fortune on steam engines that drive the weaving looms. Friedrich and Peter walk upstairs to the first floor, where the weaving looms are. In a large, dark area many people are working – remarkably many women and children. It is dusty and stuffy over there. The noise is deafening. ‘How many hours a day do they work?’ Friedrich asks. ‘10 to 12 hours!’ Peter screams.

Suddenly, Peter jumps between the machines. At one of the weaving looms a women is comforting a crying child. Peter pulls her roughly back on her feet. ‘A fine for you! Talk in your own time!’ The woman quickly gets back to work. The child has already disappeared. ‘If the spools are not changed in time, we have to restart the machine. That takes a great deal of time, and time is money,’ Peter explains. ‘You have to keep them working’. Friedrich looks around at the toiling people. It feels strange becoming the boss of this.

At night, after a long and tiring day, Friedrich writes in his diary: ‘The English entrepreneurs only think of making money. Workers are not people in their eyes but economic entities. Never have I seen such egoism. Factory owners do not realize that relationships other than buying and selling exist.’

This was the situation in textile factories in Manchester during the period of the Industrial Revolution that started in England. Is the situation really something from the past? Read the text below.
‘To deliver orders in time, workers are working seven days a week, sometimes even 20 hours a day, for 5 cents an hour. Overtime is not paid. The girls are so tired that they fall asleep during their breaks. But they do not have a choice, unions are prohibited and those who protest or work too slowly can expect a fine or the sack. The labourers live on the factory premises and sleep 12 to a room.’

This is about a jeans factory in China, 2008! Jasmine, a 16-year-old girl, works there. A documentary has been made about her and the work in the factory.

Just as happened in Europe in the past, the rise of industry in China caused a drift from the countryside into the cities. Because of mass-production the price of products lowered, so that workers were able to buy products too. The process of industrialization probably shares similar traits with conditions such as those in modern China and earlier Europe. In England it took some time before the working and living conditions of the workers were improved. However, industrialization also brought technical progress, faster production and useful inventions, such as the railway.

Historians think that the Industrial Revolution is one of the most important events in history because that period was a fundamental transition to modern times. However, they disagree about the effects of this development on common people. Some think that the welfare of people decreased because of the Industrial Revolution, while others think that the lives of ordinary people improved because of it.
# APPENDIX B

## Text themes and descriptions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Example from text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Narrative</strong></td>
<td>Friedrich’s thoughts wander back to home, (...) Here in Manchester, factories are bigger and the machines are more modern. That is the reason why his father, a successful textile baron, has sent him here.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Working conditions</strong></td>
<td>Suddenly, Peter jumps between the machines. At one of the weaving looms a woman is comforting a crying child. Peter pulls her roughly back on her feet. ‘A fine for you! Talk in your own time!’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Diary</strong></td>
<td>The English entrepreneurs only think of making money. Workers are not people in their eyes but economic entities. Never have I seen such egoism. ‘</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comparison</strong></td>
<td>‘In order for orders to be delivered in time, workers are working seven days a week, sometimes even 20 hours a day, for 5 cents hourly wage. This is about a jeans factory in China, 2008! Jasmine, a 16-year old girl, works there.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Process of industrialization</strong></td>
<td>The process of industrialization probably shares similar traits with conditions such as those in modern China and earlier Europe. In England it took some time before the working and living conditions of the workers were improved. However, industrialization also brought technical progress, faster production and useful inventions, such as the railway. However, they disagree about the effects of this development on common people. Some think that the welfare of people was decreased by the Industrial Revolution, while others think that the lives of common people improved because of the Industrial Revolution.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Interpretation</strong></td>
<td>A statement about different interpretations about the causes of industrialization.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>