



## UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

### Teaching historical empathy

*Perspective taking in past and present using eyewitnesses*

Bartelds, H.

#### Publication date

2024

[Link to publication](#)

#### Citation for published version (APA):

Bartelds, H. (2024). *Teaching historical empathy: Perspective taking in past and present using eyewitnesses*. [Thesis, externally prepared, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

#### General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

#### Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

# TEACHING HISTORICAL EMPATHY

PERSPECTIVE TAKING IN PAST AND PRESENT  
USING EYEWITNESSES

Hanneke Bartelds





Teaching historical empathy  
Perspective taking in past and present using  
eyewitnesses



UNIVERSITEIT VAN AMSTERDAM

University of Amsterdam  
Research Institute of Child Development and Education

## Acknowledgments

This research was funded by the Dutch Research Council (NWO) under grant number 023.011.002 as a part of the research program *Promotiebeurs voor leraren* and supported by Willem Lodewijk Gymnasium.



Printing: Ridderprint, the Netherlands | [www.ridderprint.nl](http://www.ridderprint.nl)

Copyright © 2024 Hanneke Bartelds

All rights reserved. No part of this thesis, including the illustrations, may be reproduced, stored or transmitted in any way or by any means without the prior permission of the author, or when appropriate, of the publishers of the publication.

Teaching historical empathy  
Perspective taking in past and present using eyewitnesses

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor  
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam  
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus  
prof. dr. ir. P.P.C.C. Verbeek  
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,  
in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel  
op dinsdag 5 november 2024, te 16.00 uur

door Hanneke Bartelds  
geboren te GRONINGEN

***Promotiecommissie***

*Promotor:* prof. dr. C.A.M. van Boxtel Universiteit van Amsterdam

*Co-promotores:* dr. G.M. Savenije Universiteit van Amsterdam

dr. J.P. van Drie Universiteit van Amsterdam

*Overige leden:* prof. dr. M.L.L. Volman Universiteit van Amsterdam

prof. dr. J.M. Voogt Universiteit van Amsterdam

prof. dr. P.A. Bax Tilburg University

dr. M. Hülsken Radboud Universiteit

dr. J.A. Schuitema Universiteit van Amsterdam

Faculteit der Maatschappij- en Gedragwetenschappen

## Motto

"The biggest deficit that we have in our society and in the world right now is an empathy deficit. We are in great need of people being able to stand in somebody else's shoes and see the world through their eyes." (Barack Obama, 2017)



## Table of contents

Table of contents .....	6
Chapter 1: General introduction .....	14
1.1 Aim of the thesis .....	14
1.1.2 Positionality and motivation of the researcher .....	16
1.2 Theoretical framework.....	18
1.2.1 Defining historical empathy .....	18
1.2.2 Objectives of historical empathy .....	22
1.2.3 Teaching historical empathy.....	25
1.3 Research questions and outline of the dissertation .....	27
Chapter 2: Students' and teachers' beliefs about historical empathy in secondary history education ..	34
2.1 Introduction.....	35
2.2 Theoretical framework.....	36
2.2.2 Objectives of historical empathy .....	37
2.2.3 Teaching strategies .....	38
2.2.4 Teachers' and students' beliefs about historical empathy .....	40
2.3 Method.....	41
2.3.1 Participants .....	41
2.3.2 Data collection.....	43
2.3.3 Data analysis.....	44
2.4 Findings .....	45
2.4.1 Beliefs about the concept of historical empathy.....	45
2.4.2 Objectives of historical empathy .....	47
2.4.3 Explicit teaching of historical empathy in Dutch classrooms .....	50
2.4.4 Learning resources and activities that promote historical empathy.....	52
2.5 Discussion and conclusions .....	54
2.5.1 Conclusions .....	54
2.5.2 Limitations and further research.....	59
2.5.3 Implications for practice.....	60
Chapter 3: Using eyewitnesses to promote students' understanding of empathy in the history classroom .....	64
3.1 Introduction.....	65
3.2 Theoretical framework.....	66
3.2.1 The concept of historical empathy and empathy .....	66

3.2.2 Teaching historical empathy: six principles .....	68
3.2.3 Eyewitnesses embedded in documentaries and guest speakers .....	69
3.2.4 Aims and research questions .....	71
3.3 Method .....	72
3.3.1 Research design .....	72
3.3.2 Participants .....	72
3.3.3 The lesson unit.....	73
3.3.4 Measures and instruments .....	75
3.3.5 Data analysis.....	77
3.4 Results.....	78
3.4.1 Comparability of the two conditions .....	78
3.4.2 Effects of the lesson unit .....	79
3.5 Discussion and conclusions .....	84
3.5.1 Conclusion.....	85
3.5.2 Limitations and suggestions for further research .....	86
3.5.3 Implications for practice.....	87
Chapter 4: Promoting empathy with the help of eyewitnesses in history class. Teachers’ implementation of six design principles for teaching historical empathy. ....	92
4.1 Introduction.....	92
4.2 Theoretical framework.....	94
4.2.1 The concept of historical empathy.....	94
4.2.2 Goals of historical empathy.....	95
4.2.3 Teaching historical empathy with eyewitnesses: design principles and challenges .....	96
4.2.4 Research question .....	100
4.3 Method.....	100
4.3.1 Research design .....	100
4.3.2 Participants of the study .....	100
4.3.3 Lesson unit .....	101
4.3.4 Data collection and instruments .....	103
4.3.5 Data Analysis.....	104
4.4 Findings .....	108
4.4.1 Contextualization.....	108
4.4.2 Awareness of positionality.....	109
4.4.3 Multiperspectivity .....	110
4.4.4 Personal connection.....	112
4.4.5 Address both the cognitive and affective aspects of historical empathy .....	113

4.4.6 Explicit instruction .....	115
4.5 Conclusions and discussion .....	117
4.5.1 Conclusions .....	117
4.5.2 Limitations and suggestions for further research .....	119
4.5.3 Implications for practice.....	120
Chapter 5: Professionalizing teachers in teaching historical empathy. How can history teachers foster empathy in history lessons using eyewitnesses? .....	124
5.1 Introduction.....	125
5.2 Theoretical framework.....	126
5.2.1 The concepts and goals of empathy in history class.....	126
5.2.2 Teaching historical empathy.....	127
5.2.3 Teacher professionalization in historical empathy .....	128
5.2.4 Research Questions .....	129
5.3 Method.....	130
5.3.1 Design of the PLC .....	130
5.3.2 Participants of the PLC.....	131
5.3.3 Instruments and analysis.....	133
5.4 Findings .....	140
5.4.1 Teachers' professional growth.....	140
5.4.2 Resources for teachers' professional growth .....	143
5.5 Conclusion and discussion.....	149
5.5.1 Conclusions .....	149
5.5.2 Limitations and suggestions for further research .....	151
5.5.3 Implications for practice.....	152
Chapter 6: General conclusions and discussion .....	156
6.1 Introduction.....	156
6.2 Main findings.....	157
6.3 General discussion .....	164
6.4 Reflections on my role as teacher researcher.....	175
6.5 Limitations and suggestions for future research .....	178
6.6 Implications for practice .....	181
Summary in English .....	185
Samenvatting.....	195
References .....	206

Appendices .....	227
Appendix A Interview protocol teachers and students, study 1 .....	228
Appendix B Design principles for the intervention study, study 2 .....	231
Appendix C Codes for students' explanation of the importance of empathy, including ICC scores, study 2.....	234
Appendix D Coding scheme for the understanding of empathy, including ICC scores, study 2.....	235
Appendix E Interview protocol 2 teachers, study 3.....	237
Appendix F Example of a summary of what is happening and how it happens per design principle, study 3.....	238
Appendix G Interview protocol post- interviews 8 teachers PLC, study 4.....	239
Appendix H Assignments for eyewitnesses lessons [in Dutch].....	241
Appendix I Assignment Mentimeter Documentary Promises and guest speakers, in lesson 4, study 3 [in Dutch].....	246
Appendix J Placemat method, lesson 4, study 3 [in Dutch] .....	247
Contributions of authors.....	248
Curriculum Vitae .....	250
Publications and presentations related to this thesis .....	251
Dankwoord (Dutch) .....	253

## **List of tables**

Table 1.1 Overview of this dissertation

Table 2.1 Characteristics of participating teachers

Table 2.2 Characteristics of participating students

Table 2.3 Teachers' and students' beliefs about historical empathy

Table 2.4 Learning activities and resources in percentages that are considered most suitable (ranked at the top) to promote historical empathy and the learning activities and resources that are most applied in practice, according to students (n=17) and teachers (n=10)

Table 3.1 Overview of the lesson unit

Table 3.2 Means, standard deviations for Confidence in the ability to empathize, Importance, Understanding and Explaining importance for pre-, post- and follow-up tests

Table 3.3 Percentages for categories in students' answers to the question why it is important to empathize for the Documentary and Guest speaker condition

Table 3.4 Percentages for categories in students' answers to the questions about what helps and what doesn't help if you want to understand why someone did something, for the condition Documentary and Guest speaker

Table 4.1 Participating teachers

Table 4.2 Overview of the lesson unit

Table 4.3 Coding scheme for interviews with teachers, with examples

Table 5.1 Overview of the PLC meetings and activities

Table 5.2 Characteristics of the participating teachers in the PLC

Table 5.3 Coding scheme including domains and resources of professional growth for the video recording of the three PLC meetings and post-interviews