Increasing the requirements to show antitrust harm in modernised effects-based analysis: an assessment of the impact on the efficiency of enforcement of Art 81 EC

Lankhorst, M.

Citation for published version (APA): Lankhorst, M. (2010). Increasing the requirements to show antitrust harm in modernised effects-based analysis: an assessment of the impact on the efficiency of enforcement of Art 81 EC. Amsterdam: Amsterdam Center for Law & Economics.

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART 1
SETTING THE STAGE

CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

1.1 Subject matter ................................................................. 13
1.2 Structure of the argumentation ........................................... 15
   Part 2 .................................................................................. 16
   Part 3 .................................................................................. 17

CHAPTER 2
BACKGROUND, METHOD, AND SCOPE

2.1 Introduction ........................................................................ 18
2.2 A first introduction to Community competition policy .............. 19
2.2.1 Competition policy and general Community objectives ....... 20
   The European Coal and Steel Community ............................ 21
   The EC Treaty and Community competition policy .............. 22
2.2.2 Art 81 EC, its components, and the scope of this work ....... 23
   The elements of the assessment under Art 81(1) EC that
   are not addressed ................................................................. 25
   The object or effect to restrict competition ........................... 27
   The investigation of restrictions, countervailing benefits
   and ancillary restraints ......................................................... 30
2.2.3 Art 81 EC and non-competition-related objectives ............ 31
2.3 The dividing line between Art 81(1) and (3) EC ..................... 35
2.3.1 Regulation 17/62 and freedom of trade ............................ 35
2.3.2 The rule of reason debate in EC antitrust ......................... 39
   The impact of the notification regime ................................... 39
   The call for a rule of reason in Art 81(1) EC ......................... 42
   The rule of reason in practice ................................................ 46
2.4 Modernisation and the generic objectives of EC antitrust ....... 51
2.4.1 An overview of recent developments ............................... 51
2.4.2 Generic antitrust objectives ............................................ 55
   Ultimate objectives ............................................................. 55
   Intermediate objectives ..................................................... 56
   Market power ................................................................. 59
   Ways to identify market power: structure or conduct ............. 61
2.4.3 An overview of substantive modernisation ...................... 64
2.5 Approach and scope ......................................................... 68
   Legal certainty: modernisation as applied in practice ............ 68
   Making the effects of uncertainty visible ............................. 70
   An alternative approach .................................................... 73
   A final note on the scope of this work .................................. 74
# Chapter 3: Economic Analysis of the Effects-Based Standard

## 3.1 Introduction

Efficient enforcement, the legal standard and decision theory

### 3.2 Efficient enforcement, the legal standard and decision theory

- The system as a whole
- The legal standard
- Decision theory

### 3.3 Calibration of the legal standard

#### 3.3.1 Rulemaking: accuracy and timing

- Components of the rule making calculus
- Timing: rules and standards
- Errors in the application of standards

#### 3.3.2 Dividing the burden of proof

### 3.4 Firm behaviour under uncertainty about the legal standard

#### 3.4.1 Analysing the effects of uncertainty

- Binary settings
- Continuous range of options

#### 3.4.2 Contracting in the effects-based field

### 3.5 Conclusions and implications

# Chapter 4: Comparing EU and US Rule of Reason Analysis

## 4.1 Introduction

## 4.2 A brief note on the of comparison

Comparing EC law with US law

### 4.3 EU and US law on restrictive agreements compared

#### 4.3.1 The enforcing party's burden of proof

#### 4.3.1.1 US Antitrust

- The use of direct evidence
- *Eastman Kodak* and *California Dental Association*
- The required level of substantiation: a sliding scale

#### 4.3.1.2 EC Antitrust

- The *de minimis* doctrine
- The case law
- The Commission

#### 4.3.2 The affirmative defence and the weighing of effects on competition

- Basic framework
- Crucial differences
- *Bass*
- *Van den Bergh Foods*
**Master Card (and the Commission’s interpretation of Métropole)**

Comparison and implications for indispensability

4.4 Characterisation in terms of uncertainty

---

### CHAPTER 5

**THE IMPACT OF MODERNISATION ON LEGAL CERTAINTY**

5.1 Introduction

5.2 The impact of substantive modernisation

5.2.1 The shift from a rule-based to a standard-based system

5.2.2 The guidelines and developments in Industrial Organization

Early thought, Ordo-liberalism, and the Harvard School

Chicago and game theory

Implications for the usefulness of the Guidelines

5.2.3 Substantive modernisation in practice

5.3 The impact of procedural modernisation

5.4 The case for increased requirements to show harm

Modernisation as practiced

Some anecdotic evidence

Raising the level of certainty

---

### PART 3

**IMPROVING THE PERFORMANCE OF THE EFFECTS-BASED STANDARD**

### CHAPTER 6

**COSTS AND BENEFITS OF IMPROVING ACCURACY**

6.1 Introduction

6.2 Improving accuracy: incentives under current conditions

Incentives in the field of negligence

Craswell and Calfee’s theory applied to antitrust

Kahan’s theory applied to antitrust

6.3 Impact on different actors and complementary measures

Countering a drop in deterrence

6.4 Conclusion

---

### CHAPTER 7

**A NEW AGENDA FOR EUROPEAN RULE OF REASON ANALYSIS**

7.1 Introduction

7.2 Empiricism in the analysis of restraints

Implications for the way restraints are analysed

Implications for the guidance available to firms

7.3 Effects on enforcement costs

7.3.1 Transforming the Commission’s burden of proof

7.3.2 Effects on private enforcers’ costs

7.4 Compatibility with European antitrust