Markets framed by culture
The role of local contexts in the rise of contemporary art commerce in Russia and India
Komarova, N.

Publication date
2018

Document Version
Other version

License
Other

Citation for published version (APA):
Komarova, N. (2018). Markets framed by culture: The role of local contexts in the rise of contemporary art commerce in Russia and India.
Nataliya Komarova

Markets framed by culture

The role of local contexts in the rise of contemporary art commerce in Russia and India
Markets Framed by Culture
The role of local contexts in the rise of contemporary art commerce in Russia and India

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,
in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel
op vrijdag 2 februari 2018, te 12:00 uur
door Nataliya Komarova
egeboren te Moskou, Sovjet-Unie
## Promotiecommissie

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Promotor:</th>
<th>prof. dr. G.M.M. Kuipers</th>
<th>Universiteit van Amsterdam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Copromotor:</td>
<td>dr. O.J.M. Velthuis</td>
<td>Universiteit van Amsterdam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overige leden:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>prof. dr. J.C. Rath</td>
<td></td>
<td>Universiteit van Amsterdam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>prof. dr. E. Rutten</td>
<td></td>
<td>Universiteit van Amsterdam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dr. O.K. Sooudi</td>
<td></td>
<td>Universiteit van Amsterdam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dr. O. Sezneva</td>
<td></td>
<td>Universiteit van Amsterdam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>prof. dr. F.R.R. Vermeylen</td>
<td></td>
<td>Erasmus Universiteit Rotterdam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>prof. dr. F.F. Wherry</td>
<td></td>
<td>Princeton University</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Faculteit der Maatschappij- en Gedragswetenschappen
This dissertation is based on the following articles:

Chapter 2


Data were collected, and the first draft was written by S. Kharchenkova and N. Komarova. Subsequent drafts were written by the three authors.

Chapter 3


Data were collected, and the first draft was written by N. Komarova. Subsequent drafts were jointly written.

Chapter 4

Komarova, N. “Between the market and non-commercial art institutions: Early career strategies of contemporary artists in emerging art scenes”, under review in Poetics

Chapter 5


Chapter 6

# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Section</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td><strong>Chapter 1</strong>&lt;br&gt;Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td><strong>Chapter 2</strong>&lt;br&gt;Official art organizations in the emerging markets of China and Russia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61</td>
<td><strong>Chapter 3</strong>&lt;br&gt;Local contexts as activation mechanisms of market development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>87</td>
<td><strong>Chapter 4</strong>&lt;br&gt;Between the market and non-commercial art institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>113</td>
<td><strong>Chapter 5</strong>&lt;br&gt;Ups and downs of art commerce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>149</td>
<td><strong>Chapter 6</strong>&lt;br&gt;Meanings of discounts in contemporary art markets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>167</td>
<td><strong>Chapter 7</strong>&lt;br&gt;Conclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>191</td>
<td>Appendices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>201</td>
<td>References</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>233</td>
<td>English summary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>241</td>
<td>Nederlandse samenvatting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgements

“This thesis by now may well be history,” - was the first attempt at an opening sentence for the introduction chapter of this dissertation, quickly dismissed as a not very promising start for a PhD thesis. Luckily, this gives me an opportunity to recycle it here, as now, indeed, is the moment to look at the last six years of my life as history: come to terms with what has happened to me and who helped me along the way.

First and foremost, I would like to thank Olav Velthuis, my supervisor, for believing in me and taking me on board of his project. I hope you still don’t regret it. Apart from giving me an opportunity to undertake a PhD project, you also opened a whole new world for me: academically, geographically and socially. As I told many people throughout these years, I actually did not know much about where I was going, but somehow I ended up in the great city, outstanding research institute and department, and amazing programme group, among curious, creative and inspiring people. Thank you! But that was just a start… I am endlessly grateful for your caring and generous supervision, always elaborate and sharp feedback, seeing the bigger picture, support and encouragement, especially in the moments when I doubted myself most.

I got to know my promotor, Giselinde Kuipers, when I was thrown into the pond of teaching in the first few weeks of my PhD trajectory. Ever since then, I have always been amazed by the scope and depth your knowledge, your ability to make complex ideas understandable and light, and your mastery of practical academic skills necessary for surviving and succeeding in this world. Thank you for trusting me with your students, who back then were just a few years younger than I… But more importantly, thank you for sharing your wisdom and expertise when reading and commenting on my work, talking or just doing your job. If I do become an academic when I grow up, I want to be the one like you!

Next comes our little research team. Svetlana and Amanda, the three of us have divided the four countries and contemporary art markets. It was a great experience of flying apart and coming back together, learning about each other’s diverse disciplinary backgrounds, sharing such similar anecdotes from the “fields”.

The “Culture Club”: I am indebted to all the members of it, who honestly read my drafts and gave feedback from a variety of perspectives. I always felt that presenting my work there allowed me to step out from the jungle that I created myself and see new possible routes to move forward. Apart
from that, seeing the work in progress of other much smarter scholars than I was one of the most valuable learning experiences I have had in the past years. This was the most enriching academic seminar that I have ever participated in. I miss the Culture Club and I hope I will be able to join again from time to time.

I would also like to thank the AISSR bureau for all the practical support over the years and for making bureaucracy not part of my life. Also, special thanks go to Danny van der Poel! You helped me a lot, sometimes with things I did not even know I could ask for. It is to a large extent due to you that I can still live in this country!

Over the years I shared offices, lunches and random coffee machine conversations with multitudes of people, who made first the Bushuis and then the Roeterseiland the place to work and the place to be, with a great atmosphere and bright spirits (despite burning deadlines, rejected papers and loads of teaching). Silvia, Elise, Thomas, Mandy, Marcel, Thijs, Aysen, Bert, Sander, Doske, Jitse, Rens, Myra, Kobe, Adeola, Davide, Dragana, Mutsumi, Katarina, Francisco, Juanfra, thank you for sharing our sociology floor and smiling to each other no matter what! Anthropologists, you are so great and so many that I cannot list you all, but you should know that the coolest PhD times I had were with you! I wish we were all still around, as careless and free as some years ago (when we believed ourselves to be super busy all the time) and could hang out together more!

Myra, jij geloofde in mijn Nederlandse taalvaardigheid toen ik daar zelf niet in geloofde. Je was vaak gemotiveerder om met mij te oefenen, dan ikzelf. Ik ben erg dankbaar voor je warme steun. Bedankt dat je om me geeft!

Rowan and Carolina, my cheerful and brave paranymphs! What can I say, you are always my two rays of sunshine, the source of endless laughs about my troubles and anxieties, but also my solid support and emotional shelter. I am (still surprised and) ever grateful that you allowed me to be your friend! Thank you for standing up for me on this important day, I am sure together we will survive and conquer and eventually have a great party with a bonfire and a smoking machine! Rowan, so great you got a job back in Amsterdam! Now our trio can hang out aaaall the time!

Mateja, Blaz & Felix, thank you for becoming my family here in Amsterdam! Thank you for accepting and embracing me grumpy, sleepy, drunk, mad, distant, irritated, anxious... at times also joyful and enthusiastic, right? Thank you for all our sleepless nights turning into spontaneous movie screenings, private dancing parties, nail polishing sessions, swimming endeavours, as well as daylight trips and brave adventures. Thank you for sharing all our floating moments on Lucy & Hank and beyond! I am still secretly hoping for the “twins experiment”. Special thanks go to Felix: thank
Acknowledgements

you for all your support and pushing me through the darkest moments of this trip, bearing all my complaints, and listening to my incomprehensible mumbling about where I am stuck this time. Okay, through some of the brightest as well, the ones caused by one so timely broken leg. You were also my last benchmark: no way I wanted to take longer with my PhD than it took you. And now it seems that I managed, to the day (because who remembers now that I actually started in August?).

Expanding the horizon beyond Amsterdam, I would like to thank Filip Vermeylen and the Department Arts and Culture Studies at the Erasmus University for taking me on board after my funded PhD years were over. This allowed me to slowly but nevertheless inevitably finish this project. Although I keep complaining about early wake ups and endless train hours, my Netherlands expanded beyond Amsterdam and my Dutch academia - beyond UvA. I met new inspiring scholars, gained new experiences and learned to teach a bit better! Filip, what a lucky coincidence it was to meet you at the India Art Fair! I hope you like this thesis and won’t ask a very tough question. Naomi, although the Dutch and the British PhD trajectories are very different, ours synchronized quite well. Always great to share our frustrations and anxieties and ultimately successes! You are next!

Further away, in Moscow, Nail is a person to a large extent responsible for the fact I am here now and can write this little “history” of my PhD. You were the one who planted a seed of doing a PhD abroad in my head, in the first place. You read and meticulously edited endless drafts, emails, cv’s (and probably even text messages): first to get into a PhD programme and then to help me keep up the appearance of being a smart person with decent English. You were the example and the best support I could have had in so many respects.

I think I should also thank my alma mater, or two: NRU-HSE and MSSES (sorry for all the complicated abbreviations, if you look them up you will understand that I save on ink here), for providing me with an academic training at a level that I actually felt comfortable at the sociology department in AISSR, UvA. Thank you Natalia Samutina and Dmitry Kurakin for supervising my first attempts at somewhat independent research, for teaching me empirical curiosity and theoretical rigorou-

ness. Thank you everyone at the Center for Fundamental Sociology for taking us kids on board and showing how real-serious social science is done, how to engage in a scientific discussion and how to do collaborative research.

Мама и папа, спасибо за вашу поддержку все эти годы! Не только последние шесть лет, но и предыдущие двадцать четыре. Без всего внимания и заботы, что вы мне дали, поддержки моих различных начинаний, развития моих способностей и свободы выбора, я бы вряд ли оказалась здесь. Спасибо за ваше терпение и веру в то, что я смогу завершить начатое! Мама, мои успехи – твои заслуги! Спасибо за то, что вы здесь со мной сегодня! Я знаю, что
To conclude, back to Amsterdam: Thank you Kriterion (the staff, the couch by the window and the endless supply of large club-mates) for your late opening hours and willingness to accommodate the bright periods of my brain activity despite the dark skies outside. While the university actively refuses to acknowledge diversity in working habits, you were there for me.

Finally, I would like to express my gratitude to Patrick Jered, who did not only make this dissertation more readable, but also taught me some wisdom about Shakespeare sonnets, correlative conjunctions and Sod’s law along the way. Also, thank you Marcel (again), now for being brave, efficient and (I hope) precise in translating my summary into Dutch. And thank you Jerom for finding a way to make this book look so beautiful, despite my cluelessness about what I want.
Temporary exhibition in the grand hall of the former Soviet movie theatre and soon-to-be private contemporary art museum (the plan was abandoned in 2014).

Moscow, December 2012