Win-wins in forest product value chains? How governance impacts the sustainability of livelihoods based on non-timber forest products from Cameroon

Ingram, V.J.

Citation for published version (APA):
Ingram, V. J. (2014). Win-wins in forest product value chains? How governance impacts the sustainability of livelihoods based on non-timber forest products from Cameroon.
Contents

List of tables  ix
List of figures  x
List of boxes  xi
List of photos  xi

Acknowledgements  xii
Preface  xv
List of acronyms  xvii

PART I: INTRODUCTION AND OBJECTIVES  1

1 FORESTS, PRODUCTS, PEOPLE, PLACES AND POVERTY – AN INTRODUCTION  1
   Forests, products and poverty  5
   Forest products, people and places: value chains  8
   Places, poverty and forest products  10
   Justification, research objectives and questions  15
   Thesis structure  17

2 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK  18
   Understanding sustainable livelihoods  19
   Unpacking forest product values  24
   Getting to grips with governance  27
   Examining institutions  32
   Connecting the views on value chains  37
   Linking the concepts  40

3 METHODOLOGY  42
   Research design  42
   Research and analysis methods  49
   Limitations of the study  62

PART II: CONTEXTUAL ANALYSIS  64

4 FOREST CAPITAL CONTEXTUAL ANALYSIS  66
   The origin of the value chains: forest ecoregions  66
   Non-timber forest products in Cameroon  70
   Conclusion: paradoxical products  82

5 LIVELIHOODS CONTEXTUAL ANALYSIS  84
   Socioeconomic context  84
   Entrepreneurial operating context  93
   Conclusion: Visible for livelihoods – invisible for policy  97
PART III: GOVERNANCE AND VALUE CHAIN ANALYSES

6 GOVERNANCE ANALYSIS 101
   Political and institutional context 101
   Statutory frameworks regulating NTFPs 106
   ‘Dash’ 114
   Customary forest governance 116
   Voluntary and market-based governance instruments 124
   Governance through international agreements and conventions 126
   Project governance arrangements 127
   Discussion: An incongruent bricolage 132

7 GNETUM VALUE CHAIN 136
   The Gnetum value chain 136
   Governance of the Gnetum value chain 150
   Governance and livelihoods in the Gnetum chain 157
   Governance and sustainability in the Gnetum chain 163
   Conclusions 165

8 APICULTURE VALUE CHAIN 168
   The apiculture value chain 168
   Governance of the apiculture chain 187
   Governance and livelihoods in the apiculture chain 194
   Governance and sustainability in the apiculture chain 197
   Conclusions 200

9 PRUNUS AFRICANA VALUE CHAIN 202
   The Prunus africana value chain 202
   Governance of the Prunus africana value chain 218
   Governance and livelihoods in Prunus africana chain 230
   Governance and sustainability in the Prunus africana chain 231
   Conclusions 238

10 ANALYSIS OF FIVE NTFP VALUE CHAINS 240
   Introduction 240
   Cola chain 240
   Bush mango chain 243
   Raffia chain 245
   Bamboo chain 247
   Gum arabic chain 249
   Conclusions 251
PART IV: CONCLUSIONS 253

11 HOW GOVERNANCE ARRANGEMENTS SHAPE NTFP VALUE CHAINS 254
   Introduction 255
   Shaping contexts and trends 255
   Value chain configurations 258
   Governance arrangements 263
   How governance arrangements shape sustainable livelihoods 267
   Impact of governance arrangements on product and chain sustainability 275
   Conceptual implications and contribution to knowledge 280
   Recommendations for policy and practice for forest governance and sustainable livelihoods based on NTFPs 283
   Recommendations for further research 286
   Conclusions 286

12 REFERENCES 288

13 OUTPUTS 336

14 SUMMARY 336
   SAMENVATTING
   RÉSUMÉ

15 ABOUT THE AUTHOR AND COLLABORATING ORGANISATIONS 356
   University of Amsterdam 356
   Center for International Forestry Research 357
   Netherlands Development Organisation 357
   Tropenbos International 357
   Guiding Hope 358
   Western Highlands Nature Conservation Network 358
   African Studies Centre 359
### Appendices

1. Exchange rates
2. Database of NTFPs in Cameroon
3. Species specific NTFP study references
4. Subject specific NTFP study references
5. Location specific NTFP study references
6. Value chain analysis activities
7. Survey questionnaires
8. Market surveys
9. Equations used for analysis
11. NTFPs exported from Cameroon
12. Participatory Action Research activities
13. Governance scores
14. Reports
15. Technical data sheets on honey, wax and propolis and ecoregion honey profiles
16. Priority NTFPs in Cameroon
17. Indicators for VCA
18. Melliferous plant species

Appendices provided on the CD or downloadable from https://www.dropbox.com/sh/c2v65etv9sa3thi/h4PuEjV2sy

### List of photos

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>A walk in the forest, Loboke, 2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Bricolage in action!</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td><em>Gnetum africanum</em> leaves, Takamanda, 2011</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Freshly harvested honeycomb, Oku, 2007</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td><em>Prunus africana</em>, Fundong, 2009</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td><em>Cola acuminata</em> tree and owner, Bamenda, 2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2</td>
<td><em>Irvingia gabonensis</em> flowers, fruits and dried kernels, Yaoundé, 2009</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>Wine tapping (<em>Raphia farinifera</em>), Bafut, 2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4</td>
<td><em>Yushania alpina</em> bamboo beaker, Oku, 2009</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>Gum arabic (<em>Acacia senegal</em> and <em>Acacia seyal</em>), Maroua, 2006</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>Harnessing marketing and product knowledge, Yaoundé, 2008</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of figures

2.1 Sustainable livelihoods approach 20
2.2 Conceptual scheme 41
3.1 Map of research sites 48
4.1 Forest ecoregions in Cameroon 67
5.1 Number of people active in eight NTFP chains 94
6.1 Direct and indirect actors in forest governance in Cameroon 104
6.2 Official exports of Special Forestry Products 2004 to 2009 110
6.3 Tenure, access and rights changes over time in Kilum-Ijim Forest 119
7.1 Map of Gnetum spp. value chain study area in Cameroon and Nigeria 140
7.2 Gnetum value chain from the Southwest and Littoral regions 141
7.3 Length of time harvesting Gnetum by region 142
7.4 Average harvest production in kg per region from 2007 to 2009 146
7.5 Gnetum spp. prices and chains from Southwest and Littoral regions 148
7.6 Gnetum price fluctuations across markets, 2008 148
7.7 Governance arrangements in the Gnetum spp. chain in Cameroon 156
7.8 Average Gnetum trader profit margin per market 159
7.9 Nigerian Gnetum importers’ average annual profit 2007 to 2009 160
8.1 Map of apiculture value chain study area in Cameroon 172
8.2 Apiculture value chain and product channels 173
8.3 Beekeepers and organisations per region, Cameroon 2008 175
8.4 Annual revenue of apiculture processing organisations 2003 to 2007 177
8.5 Apiculture calendar 180
8.6 Average honey selling prices in Cameroonian markets 2006 to 2009 183
8.7 Apiculture value chain and prices 186
8.8 Governance arrangements in the apiculture chain in Cameroon 193
9.1 Map of Prunus africana value chain study area in Cameroon 205
9.2 Prunus africana chain from Northwest, Southwest and Adamawa regions 206
9.3 Annual Prunus africana production (tons and percentage) 2003 to 2011 214
9.4 Prunus africana exports from Cameroon 1976 to 2011 215
9.5 Prunus africana value chains and prices 217
9.6 Prunus africana quotas and exports from Cameroon 1995 to 2011 225
9.7 Governance arrangements in the Prunus africana chain in Cameroon 229
9.8 Relation between tree mortality and harvest technique 233
9.9 Prunus africana seedlings and trees planted 1988 to 2008 235
9.10 Number of new Prunus africana plantations 1988 to 2008 236
10.1 Intensity of governance arrangements in the Cola spp. chain 242
10.2 Intensity of governance arrangements in Irvingia spp. chain 245
10.3 Intensity of governance arrangements in the Raphia spp. chain 247
10.4 Intensity of governance arrangements in the bamboo chain 249
10.5 Intensity of governance arrangements in the Acacia spp. chain 250
11.1 Relationships between forest quality, NTFP supply and demand 256
11.2 Plural governance arrangements in NTFP chains in Cameroon 264
11.3 Intensity of governance arrangements in eight NTFP chains 265
11.4 Overview of intensity of NTFP chain governance arrangements 267
11.5 Legitimacy of governance arrangements 268
11.6 Plural governance arrangements covering chain activities 271
11.7 Actor power and control in NTFP value chains 275
11.8 Average annual market value and cultivation levels in NTFP chains 279
11.9 Conceptual implications 281
## List of tables

1.1 Poverty, forest and governance indicators for Cameroon 2
1.2 Disciplinary embedding 18
3.1 Overview of selection criteria and research subjects 44
3.2 Value scoring system 45
3.3 Overview of NTFP value chains studied 47
3.4 Overview of NTFP value chain actors interviewed 48
3.5 Overview of research methods used per research question 49
3.6 Overview of methods used per NTFP value chain 50
3.7 Intensity scoring of governance arrangements 59
4.1 Summary of prioritised NTFPs in Cameroon 72
4.2 Overview of NTFP species and products in Cameroon 73
4.3 NTFP species with multiple parts used in Cameroon 75
4.4 Parts of animal and plants harvested for NTFP use in Cameroon 76
4.5 Major uses of NTFPs in Cameroon 77
4.6 Number of uses of animal and plant species as NTFPs 77
4.7 Vulnerability classification of NTFPs in Cameroon 78
4.8 Abundance and vulnerability status of selected NTFP species 79
4.9 Relationship between plant life cycle, form and vulnerability of NTFPs 80
4.10 Level of cultivation and domestication of NTFPs in Cameroon 80
4.11 Overview of value scores of the NTFP value chains studied 81
5.1 Ethnic origins of harvesters in value chains 87
5.2 Population statistics of study areas 88
5.3 Average value chain actor’s household size 89
5.4 Average education level of actors in value chains 90
5.5 Contribution of NTFPs to household income per actor and chain 90
5.6 Importance ranking of NTFPs in harvesters’ household incomes 91
5.7 Male-female ratio of actors in value chains 93
6.1 Status of the NTFP species with respect to standards and conventions 127
7.1 Population statistics of Gnetum chain study area 142
7.2 Annual Gnetum harvest per village 2007 to 2009 145
7.3 Values and volumes of Gnetum in Southwest markets 2007-2009 147
7.4 Gnetum exports 1992 to 2009 147
7.5 SFP quotas, production and trade in Gnetum spp. in tons 1992 to 2010 151
7.6 Gnetum harvesters’ annual average profit and profit per kg per village 158
7.7 Relationship between profit and group membership 158
7.8 Gnetum retailer’s average profit per kg and profit per annum, Cameroon 160
7.9 Gnetum exporter’s total profits per annum 160
7.10 Gnetum harvest technique and sustainability 164
8.1 Population statistics of study area and apiculture chain actors 174
8.2 Beekeepers’ characteristics in Adamawa and Northwest regions 175
8.3 Overview of major apiculture processing organisations 176
8.4 Annual average apiculture production and value per region 2003-2009 185
8.5 Average income range of beekeepers from apiculture 194
9.1 Population statistics of Prunus africana study area 207
9.2 Prunus africana harvests in the Northwest and Adamawa 2001 to 2007 213
9.3 Prunus africana harvests in Northwest community forests 2003 to 2007 213
9.4 Harvester and export value of Prunus africana 1995 to 2010 214
9.5 Average daily Prunus africana harvest revenues, Southwest 231
9.6 NTFPs per ecoregion 259
11.1 Uses and values of NTFPs studied 260
11.2 Percentage of actors per chain and stage engaging in collective action 260
11.3 Average number of sources of income per chain and actor type 261
11.5 NTFP annual average household income (US$) per chain and actor 263
11.6 Governance of access to NTFP resources 269
11.7 Governance of access to NTFP markets 270
11.8 NTFP resource access rights and responsibilities 272
11.9 NTFP cultivation strategies 278

List of boxes

1.1 Non-timber forest products (NTFPs) 3
1.2 Forests 4
1.3 Governance 5
1.4 Poverty 9
1.5 Forest product value chains 6
1.6 Common goods 14
2.1 Sustainable forests, products and chains 22
2.2 Markets 25
2.3 NTFP markets 26
2.4 Governance indicators 29
2.5 Institutional design principles 34
3.1 A definition of priority NTFPs 45
3.2 Participatory action research 57
4.1 From species to product: bamboo and Raphia spp. 70
4.2 NTFP data deficiencies 71
6.1 Forestry laws in Cameroon 107
6.2 Special Forestry Products in Cameroon 109
8.1 Import requirements for honey and wax 184
9.1 Two quarters bark harvesting technique 212