The fragility of rightness. Adjudication and the primacy of practice

van Domselaar, I.

Publication date
2014

Citation for published version (APA):
## Contents

1 Introduction 1
   1 Adjudication and its troublesome phenomenology 1
   2 Methodology 6
   3 Road map 7
   4 Delimitations and caveats 8

Part I The stability of rightness. Giving primacy to theory

2 A stabilizing approach to adjudication 13
   1 Introduction 13
   2 The morality of adjudication and why philosophy needs to come in 13
   3 A stabilizing approach to adjudication. Legal commensurability and adjudication as applied moral theory 22
   4 Stability explained 33
   5 Do I overstate the stabilizing character of legal commensurability? 37
   6 Conclusion and how to proceed 41

3 On reason’s hope. Normative theories of political morality and their potential stabilizing function for adjudication 43
   1 Introduction 43
   2 On (the stabilizing effect of) normative theories of political morality 44
   3 The role of adjudication. Returning the compliment 50
   4 Conclusion 52

4 The Fragility of Justice I. Rawls’ Theory of Justice as moral background theory of law and adjudication 54
   1 Introduction 54
   2 Rawlsian justice. Kantian with an Aristotelian twist 55
     2.1 Protecting ‘noumenal selves’ 55
     2.2 Concrete needs also count: an Aristotelian twist 60
   3 Rawls’ conception of adjudication. A version of a stabilizing approach 64
   4 Conclusion 67

5 The Fragility of Justice II. Rawls’ residues of justice and their bearing on adjudication 68
   1 Introduction 68
   2 Rawls’ residues and their bearing on adjudication 68
3.1 Conflicting judicial commitments 275
  3.1.1 Conflicting commitments to fundamental rights 275
  3.1.2 Conflicting commitments to law and values of political morality 284
  3.1.3 Conflicting commitments to law and the concrete embodied Other 288
  3.1.4 Conflicting commitments due to epistemic uncertainty 291

3.2 Moral remainders and tragic responsive reactions 293

4 Tragic legal choice in practice. Arguments for and against 298
5 The Fragility of Rightness and the rule of law 302
6 Conclusion 304

13 Concluding summary and some practical implications 306
  1 Concluding summary 306
  2 Some practical implications 310

Bibliography 314

Samenvatting 330
  De Breekbaarheid van Rechtspraak. Het primaat van de praktijk 330

Acknowledgments 345