International criminal trials: A normative theory

Vasiliev, S.

Publication date
2014

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
# SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

## VOLUME I: NATURE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table of acronyms</td>
<td>xvi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of abbreviated sources</td>
<td>xviii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of cases</td>
<td>xx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of instruments</td>
<td>xcv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## PART 1. A THEORY FOR TRIALS: METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK

- **Chapter 1. Background and Purpose of the Study:**

- **Chapter 2. Fairness and its Metric in International Criminal Procedure:**
  Drawing from Human Rights Law ................................................................. 89

- **Chapter 3. Measuring Effectiveness: Teleology and Efficiency of International Criminal Justice** ................................. 159

## PART 2. PHENOMENOLOGY OF THE TRIAL PHASE: CONCEPTUAL APPROACHES

- **Chapter 4. Trial Phase: A Theoretical and Comparative Outlook** ................. 221

- **Chapter 5. Functions of International Criminal Trials** ............................. 283

- **Chapter 6. Centrality of Trial in International Criminal Proceedings** ............ 369

## VOLUME II: ORGANIZATION

## PART 3. ANATOMY OF THE TRIAL PHASE: DESCRIPTIVE AND ANALYTICAL APPROACHES

- **Chapter 7. Defining the Trial Stage** .................................................. 451

- **Chapter 8. Trial Preparation: Setting the Scene** .................................. 488

- **Chapter 9. Opening Stage of Trial** .................................................... 613

- **Chapter 10. Presentation of Evidence** .............................................. 649
Chapter 11. Closing Stage of Trial…………………………………………………………800

PART 4. FACES OF TRIAL:
FROM PRESENT TO THE FUTURE

Chapter 12. Towards a Normative Theory of International Criminal Trial……836

Summary……………………………………………………………………………………………932
Samenvatting………………………………………………………………………………………942
Bibliography………………………………………………………………………………………cxvii
DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS*

VOLUME I: NATURE

Table of acronyms...........................................................................................................xvi
Table of abbreviated sources...........................................................................................xviii
Table of cases..................................................................................................................xx
Table of instruments.........................................................................................................xcv

PART 1. A THEORY FOR TRIALS:
METODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK

Chapter 1. Background and Purpose of the Study:

1. Introductory remarks 3
2. International Criminal Justice: The Prime of Life or a Midlife Crisis? 4
   2.1. Mapping the Context 4
   2.2. Scholarship at the Turning Point 12
3. International criminal procedure: From Convoluted Legacy to
   Considered Paradigm 18
   3.1. ‘Orphan’ without ‘identity’? 18
      3.1.1. Ontological question 18
      3.1.2. No primary obligations? 22
   3.2. Nature and genesis: From judge-made law to legislation and back again 24
      3.2.1. General features 24
      3.2.2. Activating judge-legislators: IMT and IMTFE 26
      3.2.3. ‘Judge-made law’ era: ICTY, ICTR, and SCSL 30
      3.2.4. Paradigm shift: ICC and SPSC 42
      3.2.5. Back again: Recent courts (ECCC and STL) 50
   3.3. Taking stock and charting the way ahead: From practice to theory 56
4. A Normative Theory for International Criminal Trial 62
   4.1. What theory? 62
   4.2. Objectives and questions 65
   4.3. Approach 66
      4.3.1. Focus on the trial stage 66
      4.3.2. Perspective and limitations 68
   4.3.3. Key definitions and courts covered 70
   4.3.4. Evaluative framework 75
      A. Fairness perspective 77
      B. Effectiveness perspective: Goals and functional efficiency 78
      C. Comparative law: A non-parameter 79
5. Outline and methods 84

* The detailed Table of Contents of volume II can be found at the beginning of that volume.
Chapter 2. Fairness and its Metric in International Criminal Procedure: Drawing from Human Rights Law

1. Introduction

2. ‘Fairness’ as external framework: Drawing from human rights law
   2.1. Duality of human rights law and its questions
   2.2. Human rights law as binding law
      2.2.1. From the nature of obligation…
      2.2.2. … to sources of law
      2.2.3. Human rights law as applicable law
         2.2.3.1. Treaty law
         2.2.3.2. General international law
            A. Question of applicability, again
            B. Custom
            C. General principles of law
            D. Moving beyond sources
      2.2.4. Law or policy, and does it matter?
   2.3. Human rights as a methodological framework: Place in the normative hierarchy
      2.3.1. Ad hoc tribunals
      2.3.2. ICC
      2.3.3. Other courts

3. Metric of ‘Fairness’: Contextualization and its Limitations
   3.1. The need and duty to contextualize
   3.2. ‘Fairest’ or ‘fair enough’?
   3.3. What is ‘enough’? Setting the limits

4. Conclusion

Chapter 3. Measuring Effectiveness: Teleology and efficiency of international criminal justice

1. Introduction

2. Teleology of justice: Confronting the ongoing mix-up

3. Inventory of special goals
   3.1 Sources, typology, and formal recognition of goals
   3.2 Reconciliation and restoration of peace and security
   3.3 Establishment of a historical record
3.4 Promoting international rule of law (expressive or didactic goal) 179
3.5 Justice for victims 181

4. Special goals and procedure 183
4.1 Uncertain relationship: Two schools of thought 183
4.2 Voices from practice: A third view 190
4.3 Plea for a moderate approach 194
4.4 Ambiguity of goal priorities: Reductionism as ostensible solution to an imaginary problem? 201

5. Operational efficiency: A counter-parameter 207
6. Conclusion 215

PART 2. PHENOMENOLOGY OF THE TRIAL PHASE: CONCEPTUAL APPROACHES

Chapter 4. Trial Phase: A Theoretical and Comparative Outlook...... 221

1. Introduction 221
2. ‘Adversarial’ v. ‘inquisitorial’ distinction: Value and limitations 224
3. Trial as the Phase 231
3.1 Evidentiary continuity and finality of decisions 231
3.2 Character and layout of trial 237
4.1 Objectives of justice and functions of trial, and truth 243
4.2 Concepts of truth and criminal procedure 245
4.3 Truth in a comparative perspective 247
4.4 A superior model for truth-finding:? 254
5. Communicative role and effects of trials: A socio-legal view 262
6. Role of the trial phase: Impact of pre-trial process and bargaining 269
7. Conclusion 278

Chapter 5. Functions of International Criminal Trials.........................283

1. Introduction 283
3. Procedural function of international trials: Truth-finding revisited 288
3.1 Formal commitment to truth 288
Chapter 6. Centrality of Trial in International Criminal Proceedings

1. Introduction

2. Trial as the prime stage: Select factors affecting the role of trial

3. Pre-trial process and expanding judicial functions

3.1 IMT and IMTFE

3.2 ICTY, ICTR, and SCSL: Managerial judging reforms

3.2.1 Nature and evolution of judicial pre-trial involvement: An overview

3.2.2 Pre-trial judge (ICTY)

3.2.3 Case-management conferences

3.2.4 Preliminary motions

3.3 ICC: Pre-Trial Chamber and confirmation of charges

3.3.1 Pre-Trial Chamber

3.3.2 Confirmation of charges

3.3.3 Mini-trial before trial?

3.3.4 Continuity of evidence
3.4 SPSC 406
3.5 ECCC 408
3.6 STL 411

4. Use of negotiated justice 414
4.1 IMT and IMTFE 416
4.2 ICTY, ICTR, and SCSL 418
  4.2.1 Guilty pleas: Nature and potential effects on trials 418
  4.2.2 Plea-bargaining and actual impact 424
4.3 ICC 433
4.4 SPSC 437
4.5 ECCC 442
4.6 STL 444

5. Conclusion: International trial under attack? 445