



## UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

### International criminal trials: A normative theory

Vasiliev, S.

**Publication date**  
2014

[Link to publication](#)

#### **Citation for published version (APA):**

Vasiliev, S. (2014). *International criminal trials: A normative theory*. [Thesis, fully internal, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

#### **General rights**

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

#### **Disclaimer/Complaints regulations**

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

# SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

## VOLUME I: NATURE

Table of acronyms.....	xvi
Table of abbreviated sources.....	xviii
Table of cases.....	xx
Table of instruments.....	xcv

### **PART 1. A THEORY FOR TRIALS: METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK**

<b>Chapter 1. Background and Purpose of the Study: 'What', 'Why', and 'How' of the Theory.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Chapter 2. Fairness and its Metric in International Criminal Procedure: Drawing from Human Rights Law.....</b>	<b>89</b>
<b>Chapter 3. Measuring Effectiveness: Teleology and Efficiency of International Criminal Justice.....</b>	<b>159</b>

### **PART 2. PHENOMENOLOGY OF THE TRIAL PHASE: CONCEPTUAL APPROACHES**

<b>Chapter 4. Trial Phase: A Theoretical and Comparative Outlook.....</b>	<b>221</b>
<b>Chapter 5. Functions of International Criminal Trials.....</b>	<b>283</b>
<b>Chapter 6. Centrality of Trial in International Criminal Proceedings.....</b>	<b>369</b>

## VOLUME II: ORGANIZATION

### **PART 3. ANATOMY OF THE TRIAL PHASE: DESCRIPTIVE AND ANALYTICAL APPROACHES**

<b>Chapter 7. Defining the Trial Stage.....</b>	<b>451</b>
<b>Chapter 8. Trial Preparation: Setting the Scene.....</b>	<b>488</b>
<b>Chapter 9. Opening Stage of Trial.....</b>	<b>613</b>
<b>Chapter 10. Presentation of Evidence.....</b>	<b>649</b>

<b>Chapter 11. Closing Stage of Trial.....</b>	<b>800</b>
--	------------

**PART 4. FACES OF TRIAL:  
FROM PRESENT TO THE FUTURE**

<b>Chapter 12. Towards a Normative Theory of International Criminal Trial.....</b>	<b>836</b>
--	------------

<b>Summary.....</b>	<b>932</b>
---------------------	------------

<b>Samenvatting.....</b>	<b>942</b>
--------------------------	------------

<b>Bibliography.....</b>	<b>.cxvii</b>
--------------------------	---------------

# DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS\*

## VOLUME I: NATURE

Table of acronyms.....	xvi
Table of abbreviated sources.....	xviii
Table of cases.....	xx
Table of instruments.....	xcv

### **PART 1. A THEORY FOR TRIALS: METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK**

#### **Chapter 1. Background and Purpose of the Study: ‘What’, ‘Why’, and ‘How’ of the Theory.....3**

<b>1. Introductory remarks</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>2. International Criminal Justice: The Prime of Life or a Midlife Crisis?</b>	<b>4</b>
2.1. Mapping the Context	4
2.2. Scholarship at the Turning Point	12
<b>3. International criminal procedure: From Convoluted Legacy to Considered Paradigm</b>	<b>18</b>
3.1. ‘Orphan’ without ‘identity’?	18
3.1.1. Ontological question	18
3.1.2. No primary obligations?	22
3.2. Nature and genesis: From judge-made law to legislation and back again	24
3.2.1. General features	24
3.2.2. Activating judge-legislators: IMT and IMTFE	26
3.2.3. ‘Judge-made law’ era: ICTY, ICTR, and SCSL	30
3.2.4. Paradigm shift: ICC and SPSC	42
3.2.5. Back again: Recent courts (ECCC and STL)	50
3.3. Taking stock and charting the way ahead: From practice to theory	56
<b>4. A Normative Theory for International Criminal Trial</b>	<b>62</b>
4.1. What theory?	62
4.2. Objectives and questions	65
4.3. Approach	66
4.3.1. Focus on the trial stage	66
4.3.2. Perspective and limitations	68
4.3.3. Key definitions and courts covered	70
4.3.4. Evaluative framework	75
A. Fairness perspective	77
B. Effectiveness perspective: Goals and functional efficiency	78
C. Comparative law: A non-parameter	79
<b>5. Outline and methods</b>	<b>84</b>

---

\* The detailed Table of Contents of volume II can be found at the beginning of that volume.

5.1. Structure	84
5.2. Sources and methodology	86

**Chapter 2. Fairness and its Metric in International Criminal Procedure: Drawing from Human Rights Law.....89**

<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>89</b>
<b>2. ‘Fairness’ as external framework: Drawing from human rights law</b>	<b>90</b>
2.1. Duality of human rights law and its questions	90
2.2. Human rights law as binding law	96
2.2.1. From the nature of obligation...	96
2.2.2. ... to sources of law	99
2.2.3. Human rights law as applicable law	104
2.2.3.1. Treaty law	104
2.2.3.2. General international law	105
A. Question of applicability, again	105
B. Custom	108
C. General principles of law	114
D. Moving beyond sources	116
2.2.3.3. Precedents of other courts and monitoring bodies	116
2.2.4. Law or policy, and does it matter?	124
2.3. Human rights as a methodological framework: Place in the normative hierarchy	129
2.3.1. <i>Ad hoc</i> tribunals	129
2.3.2. ICC	132
2.3.3. Other courts	136
<b>3. Metric of ‘Fairness’: Contextualization and its Limitations</b>	<b>138</b>
3.1. The need and duty to contextualize	138
3.2. ‘Fairest’ or ‘fair enough’?	145
3.3. What is ‘enough’? Setting the limits	150
<b>4. Conclusion</b>	<b>155</b>

**Chapter 3. Measuring Effectiveness: Teleology and efficiency of international criminal justice.....159**

<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>159</b>
<b>2. Teleology of justice: Confronting the ongoing mix-up</b>	<b>164</b>
<b>3. Inventory of special goals</b>	<b>171</b>
3.1 Sources, typology, and formal recognition of goals	171
3.2 Reconciliation and restoration of peace and security	174
3.3 Establishment of a historical record	177

3.4 Promoting international rule of law (expressive or didactic goal)	179
3.5 Justice for victims	181
<b>4. Special goals and procedure</b>	<b>183</b>
4.1 Uncertain relationship: Two schools of thought	183
4.2 Voices from practice: A third view	190
4.3 Plea for a moderate approach	194
4.4 Ambiguity of goal priorities: Reductionism as ostensible solution to an imaginary problem?	201
<b>5. Operational efficiency: A counter-parameter</b>	<b>207</b>
<b>6. Conclusion</b>	<b>215</b>

## **PART 2. PHENOMENOLOGY OF THE TRIAL PHASE: CONCEPTUAL APPROACHES**

### **Chapter 4. Trial Phase: A Theoretical and Comparative Outlook..... 221**

<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>221</b>
<b>2. ‘Adversarial’ v. ‘inquisitorial’ distinction: Value and limitations</b>	<b>224</b>
<b>3. Trial as the Phase</b>	<b>231</b>
3.1 Evidentiary continuity and finality of decisions	231
3.2 Character and layout of trial	237
<b>4. Function of trials: Truth-finding</b>	<b>243</b>
4.1 Objectives of justice and functions of trial, and truth	243
4.2 Concepts of truth and criminal procedure	245
4.3 Truth in a comparative perspective	247
4.4 A superior model for truth-finding:?	254
<b>5. Communicative role and effects of trials: A socio-legal view</b>	<b>262</b>
<b>6. Role of the trial phase: Impact of pre-trial process and bargaining</b>	<b>269</b>
<b>7. Conclusion</b>	<b>278</b>

### **Chapter 5. Functions of International Criminal Trials.....283**

<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>283</b>
<b>2. Procedural functions v. communicative aspects: The Legalist and Law-and-Society perspectives</b>	<b>284</b>
<b>3. Procedural function of international trials: Truth-finding revisited</b>	<b>288</b>
3.1 Formal commitment to truth	288

3.1.1 ICTY, ICTR, and SCSL	289
3.1.2 ICC	293
3.1.3 Hybrid and other courts	296
3.2 Scope of truth in trials	298
3.2.1 Dimensions of truth	298
3.2.2 Competing truths and the role of trials	300
3.2.3 Historical truth v. trial truth	304
<i>A. Are trials fit for ‘historical function’? Purposes, objects and methods of inquiry</i>	305
<i>B. Are trials appropriate conduits of historical truth? Legal v. historical facts</i>	311
3.3 What kind of truth?	316
3.3.1 Comparative outlook: ‘Contest’ v. ‘material’ truth	318
3.3.2 Truth and institutional goals: The case of plea bargaining	323
<b>4. Communicative aspect of trial process</b>	<b>330</b>
4.1 Trial as didacticism	330
4.2 Between show and political trials	334
4.2.1 Disentangling notions and quasi-notions	334
4.2.2. International trials as ‘show trials’	340
4.2.3 Making and curbing a political show: Ideological defence and its limits	348
<i>A. Political dissent in and beyond courtroom</i>	348
<i>B. Political defence and self-representation</i>	351
<i>C. Political prosecution</i>	354
4.3 Liberalism as unostentatious didacticism	357
4.3.1 Fetters on didacticism: ‘Due process’ message	357
4.3.2 Enhancing didacticism by other means: Outreach, venue, space	361
4.3.3 Calling to account?	364
<b>5. Conclusion</b>	<b>365</b>

## **Chapter 6. Centrality of Trial in International Criminal Proceedings.....369**

<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>369</b>
<b>2. Trial as the prime stage: Select factors affecting the role of trial</b>	<b>371</b>
<b>3. Pre-trial process and expanding judicial functions</b>	<b>373</b>
3.1 IMT and IMTFE	374
3.2 ICTY, ICTR, and SCSL: Managerial judging reforms	374
3.2.1 Nature and evolution of judicial pre-trial involvement: An overview	374
3.2.2 Pre-trial judge (ICTY)	386
3.2.3 Case-management conferences	390
3.2.4 Preliminary motions	393
3.3 ICC: Pre-Trial Chamber and confirmation of charges	394
3.3.1 Pre-Trial Chamber	394
3.3.2 Confirmation of charges	395
3.3.3 Mini-trial before trial?	398
3.3.4 Continuity of evidence	405

3.4 SPSC	406
3.5 ECCC	408
3.6 STL	411
<b>4. Use of negotiated justice</b>	<b>414</b>
4.1 IMT and IMTFE	416
4.2 ICTY, ICTR, and SCSL	418
4.2.1 Guilty pleas: Nature and potential effects on trials	418
4.2.2 Plea-bargaining and actual impact	424
4.3 ICC	433
4.4 SPSC	437
4.5 ECCC	442
4.6 STL	444
<b>5. Conclusion: International trial under attack?</b>	<b>445</b>