International criminal trials: A normative theory

Vasiliev, S.

Publication date
2014

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

UvA-DARE is a service provided by the library of the University of Amsterdam (https://dare.uva.nl)
**SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS**

**VOLUME I: NATURE**

Table of acronyms............................................................................................xvi
Table of abbreviated sources...........................................................................xviii
Table of cases....................................................................................................xx
Table of instruments........................................................................................xcv

**PART 1. A THEORY FOR TRIALS: METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK**

Chapter 1. Background and Purpose of the Study:

Chapter 2. Fairness and its Metric in International Criminal Procedure:
Drawing from Human Rights Law.........................................................................89

Chapter 3. Measuring Effectiveness: Teleology and Efficiency of
International Criminal Justice............................................................................159

**PART 2. PHENOMENOLOGY OF THE TRIAL PHASE: CONCEPTUAL APPROACHES**

Chapter 4. Trial Phase: A Theoretical and Comparative Outlook.......................221

Chapter 5. Functions of International Criminal Trials........................................283

Chapter 6. Centrality of Trial in International Criminal Proceedings...............369

**VOLUME II: ORGANIZATION**

**PART 3. ANATOMY OF THE TRIAL PHASE: DESCRIPTIVE AND ANALYTICAL APPROACHES**

Chapter 7. Defining the Trial Stage.................................................................451

Chapter 8. Trial Preparation: Setting the Scene.................................................488

Chapter 9. Opening Stage of Trial.................................................................613

Chapter 10. Presentation of Evidence............................................................649
PART 4. FACES OF TRIAL:
FROM PRESENT TO THE FUTURE

Chapter 12. Towards a Normative Theory of International Criminal Trial……836

Summary……………………………………………………………………………………………………932
Samenvatting……………………………………………………………………………………………942
Bibliography……………………………………………………………………………………………cxvii
# Detailed Table of Contents

## Volume I: Nature

Table of acronyms ........................................................................................................... xvi  
Table of abbreviated sources ......................................................................................... xviii  
Table of cases ................................................................................................................. xx  
Table of instruments ........................................................................................................ xcv  


#### 1. Introductory remarks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Introductory remarks</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 2. International Criminal Justice: The Prime of Life or a Midlife Crisis?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1. Mapping the Context</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. Scholarship at the Turning Point</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 3. International Criminal Procedure: From Convoluted Legacy to Considered Paradigm

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1. ‘Orphan’ without ‘identity’?</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1. Ontological question</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2. No primary obligations?</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. Nature and genesis: From judge-made law to legislation and back again</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1. General features</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2. Activating judge-legislators: IMT and IMTFE</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3. ‘Judge-made law’ era: ICTY, ICTR, and SCSL</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4. Paradigm shift: ICC and SPSC</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5. Back again: Recent courts (ECCC and STL)</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Taking stock and charting the way ahead: From practice to theory</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 4. A Normative Theory for International Criminal Trial

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1. What theory?</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2. Objectives and questions</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3. Approach</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1. Focus on the trial stage</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2. Perspective and limitations</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3. Key definitions and courts covered</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.4. Evaluative framework</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Fairness perspective</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Effectiveness perspective: Goals and functional efficiency</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Comparative law: A non-parameter</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 5. Outline and methods

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5. Outline and methods</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

The detailed Table of Contents of Volume II can be found at the beginning of that volume.
Chapter 2. Fairness and its Metric in International Criminal Procedure: Drawing from Human Rights Law

1. Introduction
2. ‘Fairness’ as external framework: Drawing from human rights law
   2.1. Duality of human rights law and its questions
   2.2. Human rights law as binding law
      2.2.1. From the nature of obligation…
      2.2.2. ... to sources of law
      2.2.3. Human rights law as applicable law
         2.2.3.1. Treaty law
         2.2.3.2. General international law
            A. Question of applicability, again
            B. Custom
            C. General principles of law
            D. Moving beyond sources
      2.2.3.3. Precedents of other courts and monitoring bodies
   2.2.4. Law or policy, and does it matter?
   2.3. Human rights as a methodological framework: Place in the normative hierarchy
      2.3.1. Ad hoc tribunals
      2.3.2. ICC
      2.3.3. Other courts

3. Metric of ‘Fairness’: Contextualization and its Limitations
   3.1. The need and duty to contextualize
   3.2. ‘Fairest’ or ‘fair enough’?
   3.3. What is ‘enough’? Setting the limits

4. Conclusion

Chapter 3. Measuring Effectiveness: Teleology and efficiency of international criminal justice

1. Introduction
2. Teleology of justice: Confronting the ongoing mix-up
3. Inventory of special goals
   3.1 Sources, typology, and formal recognition of goals
   3.2 Reconciliation and restoration of peace and security
   3.3 Establishment of a historical record
PART 2. PHENOMENOLOGY OF THE TRIAL PHASE: CONCEPTUAL APPROACHES

Chapter 4. Trial Phase: A Theoretical and Comparative Outlook...... 221

1. Introduction 221
2. ‘Adversarial’ v. ‘inquisitorial’ distinction: Value and limitations 224
3. Trial as the Phase 231
   3.1 Evidentiary continuity and finality of decisions 231
   3.2 Character and layout of trial 237
   4.1 Objectives of justice and functions of trial, and truth 243
   4.2 Concepts of truth and criminal procedure 245
   4.3 Truth in a comparative perspective 247
   4.4 A superior model for truth-finding: 254
5. Communicative role and effects of trials: A socio-legal view 262
6. Role of the trial phase: Impact of pre-trial process and bargaining 269
7. Conclusion 278

Chapter 5. Functions of International Criminal Trials…………………..283

1. Introduction 283
2. Procedural functions v. communicative aspects: The Legalist and Law-
   and-Society perspectives 284
3. Procedural function of international trials: Truth-finding revisited 288
   3.1 Formal commitment to truth 288
3.4 SPSC  
3.5 ECCC  
3.6 STL  

4. Use of negotiated justice  
4.1 IMT and IMTFE  
4.2 ICTY, ICTR, and SCSL  
  4.2.1 Guilty pleas: Nature and potential effects on trials  
  4.2.2 Plea-bargaining and actual impact  
4.3 ICC  
4.4 SPSC  
4.5 ECCC  
4.6 STL  

5. Conclusion: International trial under attack?