



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

International criminal trials: A normative theory

Vasiliev, S.

Publication date
2014

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Vasiliev, S. (2014). *International criminal trials: A normative theory*.

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I: NATURE

Table of acronyms.....	xvi
Table of abbreviated sources.....	xviii
Table of cases.....	xx
Table of instruments.....	xcv

PART 1. A THEORY FOR TRIALS: METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK

Chapter 1. Background and Purpose of the Study: ‘What’, ‘Why’, and ‘How’ of the Theory.....	3
Chapter 2. Fairness and its Metric in International Criminal Procedure: Drawing from Human Rights Law.....	89
Chapter 3. Measuring Effectiveness: Teleology and Efficiency of International Criminal Justice.....	159

PART 2. PHENOMENOLOGY OF THE TRIAL PHASE: CONCEPTUAL APPROACHES

Chapter 4. Trial Phase: A Theoretical and Comparative Outlook.....	221
Chapter 5. Functions of International Criminal Trials.....	283
Chapter 6. Centrality of Trial in International Criminal Proceedings.....	360

VOLUME II: ORGANIZATION

PART 3. ANATOMY OF THE TRIAL PHASE: DESCRIPTIVE AND ANALYTICAL APPROACHES

Chapter 7. Defining the Trial Stage.....	451
Chapter 8. Trial Preparation: Setting the Scene.....	488
Chapter 9. Opening Stage of Trial.....	613
Chapter 10. Presentation of Evidence.....	649
Chapter 11. Closing Stage of Trial.....	800

**PART 4. FACES OF TRIAL:
FROM PRESENT TO THE FUTURE**

Chapter 12. Towards a Normative Theory of International Criminal Trial.....836

Summary.....932

Samenvatting.....942

Bibliography.....cxvii

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS*

VOLUME II: ORGANIZATION

PART 3. ANATOMY OF THE TRIAL PHASE: DESCRIPTIVE AND ANALYTICAL APPROACHES

Chapter 7. Defining the Trial Stage.....	451
1. Introduction	451
2. Scope and structure of the trial phase	453
2.1 IMT and IMTFE	453
2.2 ICTY, ICTR, and SCSL	456
2.3 ICC	458
2.4 SPSC	464
2.5 ECCC	466
2.6 STL	473
3. Practical significance of delimitation: Two examples from ICC practice	478
3.1 Challenges to the admissibility of the case: <i>Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i>	479
3.2 Post-confirmation withdrawal of charges: <i>Muthaura</i>	482
4. Conclusion	485
Chapter 8. Trial Preparation: Setting the Scene.....	488
1. Introduction	488
2. Preliminary Phase of Trial Proceedings in a Comparative Perspective	491
3. Preparation for Trial before International Criminal Tribunals	495
3.1 IMT and IMTFE	495
3.2 ICTY, ICTR, and SCSL	496
3.2.1 Introductory remark	496
3.2.2 Initial appearance	498
3.2.3 Conferences	500
A. Status conferences	500
B. Rule 65ter meetings (ICTY)	504
C. Pre-Trial Conference	508
a. Rationale	508
b. Pre-trial filings	511
c. Judicial powers	519
D. Pre-Defence Conference	532

* The detailed Table of Contents of volume I can be found at the beginning of that volume.

a. Rationale	532
b. Pre-defence filings	534
c. Judicial powers	540
3.3 ICC	550
3.3.1 Introductory remark	550
3.3.2 Proceedings leading up to trial	555
A. Status conferences	555
B. Record of the proceedings	561
C. Devising the proceedings and consultation with the parties	564
3.3.3 Commencement of trial	572
3.4. SPSC	573
3.4.1 Introductory remark	573
3.4.2 Preliminary hearing	574
3.4.3 Opening of trial	574
3.5 ECCC	575
3.5.1 Introductory remark	575
3.5.2 Trial management meeting	576
3.5.3 Preparation of the trial and pre-trial filings	577
3.5.4 Initial hearing	578
3.6 STL	581
3.6.1 Introductory remark	581
3.6.2 Initial appearance	581
3.6.3 Pre-trial and pre-defence filings and PTJ's file	582
3.6.4 Conferences	584
A. Status Conferences	584
B. Meetings convened by the Pre-Trial Judge	585
C. Pre-Trial and Pre-Defence Conferences	585
3.7 Summary	587
3.7.1 Forms of trial preparation	587
3.7.2 Pre-trial (and pre-defence) filing duties	591
3.7.3 Judicial managerial powers	593
4. Assessment	594
4.1 Fairness perspective	594
4.1.1 Forms of trial preparation	594
4.1.2 Filing duties	599
4.1.3 Judicial managerial powers	601
4.2 Teleological perspective: Institutional goals	601
4.3 Efficiency perspective: Streamlining and expediting practice	603
4.3.1 Forms of trial preparation	604
A. Status conferences	604
B. Rule 65ter meetings	604
4.3.2 Pre-trial (and pre-defence) filings	607
4.3.3 Managerial powers of judges	607
5. Conclusions and Recommendations	609
Chapter 9. Opening Stage of Trial.....	613

1. Introduction	613
2. Opening statements in a comparative perspective	614
3. Status in International Criminal Procedure	617
3.1 IMT and IMTFE	617
3.2 ICTY, ICTR, and SCSL	618
3.2.1 Regulation	618
3.2.2 Timing for the defence opening statement	619
3.2.3 Statement by the accused	623
3.2.4 Length, content, and judicial control	628
3.3 ICC	630
3.3.1 Regulation	630
3.3.2 Order of opening statements	631
3.3.3 Statement by the accused	631
3.3.4 Statements by victims	632
3.3.5 Content and length of opening statements; judicial control	633
3.4 SPSC	635
3.5 ECCC	635
3.6 STL	637
3.7 Summary	638
4. Assessment	639
4.1 Fairness perspective: Drawing from human rights	639
4.2 Teleological perspective: Institutional goals	640
4.3 Efficiency perspective: Streamlining and expediting practice	643
5. Conclusions and recommendations	645
Chapter 10. Presentation and Examination of Evidence.....	649
1. Introduction	649
2. Proof-Taking Phase of Trial: A Comparative Perspective	651
3. Presentation and Examination of Evidence in International Criminal Proceedings	656
3.1 IMT and IMTFE	656
3.1.1 Order of presentation of evidence	656
3.1.2 Order and modes of questioning witnesses	657
3.1.3 Presentation of documents and exhibits	658
3.2 ICTY, ICTR, and SCSL	659
3.2.1 Order of presentation of evidence	659
A. General features	659
B. Evidence for the prosecution and evidence for the defence (cases in chief)	662
C. Prosecution evidence in rebuttal	665
D. Defence evidence in rejoinder	669
E. Evidence ordered by the Chamber	670
F. Information relevant to sentencing	672
G. Reopening of the case	674
3.2.2 Order and modes of examination of witnesses	678
A. General remarks	678

B. Examination-in-chief	680
C. Cross-examination	681
D. Re-examination	688
E. Further examination	689
F. Extra-sequential questions by the Judges	690
G. Specifics of examination in multiple-defendant cases	693
3.2.3 Presentation of documents and exhibits	696
3.2.4 Procedure for the judgment of acquittal at the close of prosecution case	698
A. Origin and rationale	698
B. Evolution of the law	702
C. Standard of review	705
D. Applicability and scope	714
3.3 ICC	716
3.3.1 General features	716
A. Order of presentation at trial: A comparative outlook	716
B. Quandary of victim evidence	719
C. Examination of witnesses	724
3.3.2 Order of presentation of evidence in practice	728
3.3.3 Order of examining witnesses in practice	737
3.3.4 Modes of examining witnesses in practice	739
A. Questioning by the party calling the witness / Examination-in- chief	740
B. Questioning by the party not calling the witness / Cross- examination	742
C. Additional questioning by the party calling the witness / Re- examination	745
D. Final questioning by the defence	746
E. Questioning by the legal representatives of victims	747
F. Judicial questioning	752
3.3.5 The order and manner of submission (and other use) of documents at trial	755
A. Introducing documents through a witness and their use in questioning	756
B. Admission into evidence from the bar table	757
C. Use of documents to refresh memory	758
3.3.6 Possibility of mid-trial acquittals	760
3.4 SPSC	761
3.4.1 General features	761
3.4.2 Order of presentation of evidence	762
3.4.3 Order of examination of witnesses	764
3.2.4 Submission and use of documents at trial	765
3.5 ECCC	766
3.5.1 Order of presentation of evidence	766
3.5.2 Order and manner of examination of witnesses	769
3.5.3 Submission of documents at trial	772
3.6 STL	773
3.6.1 Order of presentation of evidence	773
3.6.2 Order and manner of examination of witnesses	774
3.6.3 Procedure for the judgment of acquittal at the close of prosecution case	775

3.7 Summary	776
3.7.1 Order of presentation of evidence	776
3.7.2 Order and modes of questioning witnesses	778
3.7.3 Order of presentation of documents	780
4. Evaluation	780
4.1 Fairness perspective	780
4.1.1 Order of presentation	780
4.1.2 Order and modes of questioning	784
4.1.3 Presentation of documentary and physical evidence	786
4.2 Teleological perspective: Institutional goals	787
4.3 Efficiency perspective: Streamlining and expediting practice	792
4.4. Postscript on comparative law: ‘Non-parameter’ with a quasi-normative role?	796
5. Conclusions and recommendations	798

Chapter 11. Closing Stage of Trial.....800

1. Introduction	800
2. Closing Stage of Trial: A Comparative Perspective	801
3. Status in International Criminal Procedure	806
3.1 IMT and IMTFE	806
3.2 ICTY, ICTR, and SCSL	810
3.3 ICC	815
3.4 SPSC	819
3.5 ECCC	820
3.6 STL	822
3.7 Summary	822
4. Assessment	825
4.1 Fairness perspective	825
4.2 Effectiveness perspective: Institutional goals	827
4.3 Efficiency perspective: Streamlining and expediting practice	830
5. Conclusions and Recommendations	832

PART 4. FACES OF TRIAL – FROM PRESENT TO THE FUTURE

Chapter 12. Towards a normative theory of international criminal trial.....836

1. Introduction	836
2. Reappraising normative parameters	840
2.1 Usages and limitations of comparative method: Beyond ‘adversarial’ and ‘inquisitorial’ models	840
2.2 Human rights and goals: Impactful but not decisive determinants	851
2.3 Efficiency as a normative <i>éminence grise</i>	858

2.3.1 Impact on procedural development	858
2.3.2 Emancipation from domestic traditions: From familiar to pragmatic	861
2.3.3 Result: Pragmatism and flexibility in procedure	871
3. Nature of international criminal trials	874
3.1 Objectives, functions and effects of trials: Liberal legalist and socio-legal views	874
3.2 Truth-finding: Primary function	875
3.3 Trial stage as a truth-finding locus	880
4. Organization of international criminal trials: Translating flexibility and pragmatism	886
4.1 Nature of the court: No jury and its implications	886
4.2 Structure of trial proceedings	889
4.2.1 Initial question: Structure of case at trial	889
4.2.2 Trial preparation: Importance of robust case-management	893
4.2.3 Opening statements and closing arguments: From advocacy to informative function	899
4.2.4 Presentation of evidence: Variable model	901
4.2.5 Sentencing: Need for separate hearing and deliberation	908
4.3. Participants	910
4.3.1 Role of judges: Active case-managers and truth-seekers	910
4.3.2 Defendants' role: Towards participatory model	914
4.4 'Postmodern suspense' in procedure: Reconciling variability with certainty	919
5. Concluding remarks: International trial adrift and prospects of coherent trial culture	926
Summary.....	932
Samenvatting.....	942
Bibliography.....	cxvii