Challenges and opportunities for judicial protection of human rights against decisions of the United Nations Security Council

Hollenberg, S.J.

Citation for published version (APA):
**Table of Contents**

1. Introduction ........................................................................................................... 1  
   1.1. Sketching the Scene ...................................................................................... 1  
   1.2. Research Questions ..................................................................................... 4  
   1.3. Methodology .................................................................................................. 6  
      1.3.1. Research Methods .................................................................................. 6  
      1.3.2. Conflict between International Norms .................................................... 9  
      1.3.3. Judicial Protection ................................................................................ 11  
      1.3.4. Domestic and Regional Courts ............................................................... 14  
   1.4. Outline ............................................................................................................. 18  
      1.4.1. Institutional Framework ....................................................................... 19  
      1.4.2. Case Law Analysis ............................................................................... 20  
      1.4.3. Closing Chapters .................................................................................. 22  

2. UNSC Resolutions Potentially Affecting Individuals’ Human Rights .......... 24  
   2.1. Introduction ..................................................................................................... 24  
   2.2. The Legal Nature of UNSC Resolutions ....................................................... 24  
      2.2.1. The Binding Force of Obligations Created by the UNSC .................... 25  
      2.2.2. The Scope of Discretion Left for Implementation ................................. 29  
   2.3. Types of UNSC Resolutions Selected for the Research ............................ 33  
      2.3.1. Targeted Sanctions ............................................................................... 33  
      2.3.2. Selective Sanctions ............................................................................... 35  
      2.3.3. UNSC Sanctions Committees .................................................................. 36  
      2.3.4. Other Resolutions Potentially Affecting Individuals ......................... 39  
          2.3.4.1. Authorizations .............................................................................. 39  
          2.3.4.2. Cooperation with the International Tribunals ........................... 40  
          2.3.4.3. International Administration ....................................................... 44  
   2.4. The Implementation of UNSC Resolutions .................................................. 46  
      2.4.1. The Divide between National and International Law ....................... 47  
      2.4.2. The Role of State Organs ................................................................... 50  
      2.4.3. Implementation by the EU ................................................................... 53  
   2.5. Conclusion ....................................................................................................... 55  

3. The International Human Rights Involved ......................................................... 57  
   3.1. Introduction ..................................................................................................... 57  
   3.2. Sources of the International Human Rights Obligations ......................... 58  
   3.3. Distinction from Fundamental Rights .......................................................... 59  
   3.4. Human Rights of Private Entities ................................................................. 60  
   3.5. The Human Rights Norms Concerned ........................................................ 62  
      3.5.1. Respect for Property .......................................................................... 63  
      3.5.2. Freedom of Movement ....................................................................... 65
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3.</td>
<td>Liberty and Security</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.4.</td>
<td>Private and Family Life</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.5.</td>
<td>Effective Remedy</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.6.</td>
<td>Fair Trial and Access to Court</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.</td>
<td>Derogation and Limitation</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.1.</td>
<td>Derogation</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.2.</td>
<td>The System of Limitations</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.3.</td>
<td>Proportionality Analysis</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.4.</td>
<td>The Margin of Appreciation</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.</td>
<td>Remedy before the UNSC Sanctions Committee</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.1.</td>
<td>From Diplomatic Protection to the Ombudsperson</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.2.</td>
<td>The Latest Reforms</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8.</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>The Precedence of UNSC Resolutions over International Human Rights Law</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.</td>
<td>The Balancing of International Obligations</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.</td>
<td>No, or Limited, Judicial Protection</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1.</td>
<td>Contestable Attribution of Conduct Resulting in Inadmissibility</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2.</td>
<td>The ECtHR’s Refusal to Engage in a Marginal Review of State Conduct under UNSC Auspices</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2.1.</td>
<td>Rejection of the Equivalent Protection Test in the Behrami Case</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2.2.</td>
<td>Further Restriction of the Equivalent Protection Test’s Application</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2.3.</td>
<td>The Equivalent Protection Test with regard to Other IOs</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2.4.</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.</td>
<td>UNSC Resolutions Limiting Domestic Courts’ Jurisdiction</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.1.</td>
<td>Limited Review of Acts of Cooperation with International Tribunals</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.2.</td>
<td>Limited Review of Implementation of Sanction Measures Against Individuals</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3.3.</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.4.</td>
<td>Judicial Protection Only in Regard to Ius Cogens</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.</td>
<td>Courts Addressing the Conflict between International Norms</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1.</td>
<td>Indications on Hierarchy from International Human Rights Case Law</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2.</td>
<td>Domestic Courts on the International Norm Conflict</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.4.2.1. Reconciling International Obligations in *Al-Jedda* (House of Lords) ................................................................. 150
4.4.2.2. Subsequent Interpretations of *Al-Jedda* (House of Lords) ................................................................................. 153
4.4.2.3. Other Domestic Courts’ Perspectives on the International Norm Conflict ......................................................... 158
4.5. Conclusion ................................................................................. 160

5. Broad and Narrow Interpretations ........................................ 165
5.1. Introduction ........................................................................... 165
5.2. Interpretation of UNSC Resolutions by Domestic and Regional Courts ................................................................. 166
  5.2.1. Courts’ Latitude Following from the Need for Interpretation ................................................................................. 168
  5.2.2. Methods of Interpretation of UNSC Resolutions .......... 171
  5.2.3. The Role of the Interpretations by the UNSC Sanctions Committees ................................................................. 178
5.3. Emphasis on the Interest of Maintaining International Peace and Security ............................................................. 183
5.4. Creating an Opportunity for Judicial Protection through Interpretation ................................................................. 194
  5.4.1. Narrow Interpretation of UNSC Resolutions .......... 196
  5.4.2. Presumption of Compliance ................................................ 206
  5.4.3. Beyond Interpretation? ....................................................... 211
5.5. Conclusion ................................................................................. 215

6. The Dualist Approach and Indirect Review ........................... 220
6.1. Introduction ........................................................................... 220
6.2. The Dualist Approach as an Avoidance Technique .......... 221
6.3. Indirect Review of a UNSC Resolution’s Lawfulness ....... 225
  6.3.1. Direct Application of International Human Rights Law .... 227
  6.3.2. A Clear Reference to International Human Rights Law .... 233
  6.3.3. A Connection with International Human Rights Law Cannot be Ascertained ................................................ 237
  6.3.4. Appraisal ........................................................................ 242
6.4. Review Against Entirely Separate Domestic Prescriptions .... 243
  6.4.1. Domestic Division of Competences ................................. 244
  6.4.2. Requirements for Extradition ............................................ 248
  6.4.3. Appraisal ........................................................................ 254
6.5. A Need for Judicial Dialogue ................................................ 255
6.6. Conclusion ................................................................................. 257
9.3.1. Application and Influence of Article 103 of the UN Charter 340
9.3.2. Possibilities Emanating from the Need for Interpretation .... 342
9.3.3. Opportunities Following from a Dualist Approach and Indirect Review ................................................................. 345
9.4. Assessment of the Challenges and Opportunities ................. 350
9.5. The Approach to be Followed ......................................... 353

Case Law .................................................................................. 360

Bibliography ............................................................................. 367

Summary ................................................................................... 383

Samenvatting ........................................................................... 386