Gerrits, G.J.E.

Published in:
Medische Antropologie

Citation for published version (APA):
The edited volume ‘Reproduction, Globalization and the State. New Theoretical and Ethnographic Perspectives’ brings together an interesting collection of chapters on the global anthropology of reproduction and reproductive health. In the introductory chapter the editors position their book in the history of the anthropology of reproductive health; they underline the important place of Ginsburg and Rapp’s seminal article ‘The Politics of Reproduction’ (1991) and book ‘Conceiving the New World Order: the Global Politics of Reproduction’ (1995) in this history. These publications, Browner and Sargent state, have moved anthropological research on reproduction from a descriptive to a more analytical level and have drawn attention to the effects of global processes on women’s reproductive experiences. In addition, they stimulated the production of a wave of single-country monographs in this area. However, the editors continue, most of these monographs have not problematized globalization as a concept, nor did they study the impact of global processes together with national policies for reproduction or did they explore methodological problems associated with global ethnography. This is exactly what the current volume intends to do.

In the introduction the editors also provide the reader with their thoughts on a number of key concepts used in the book, including: globalization, global ethnography, the state, the local, agency and the individual, and co-production theory. This is convenient for the reader; it serves as an introduction for the new-comer in this area, and as a wrap-up of the ‘state of the art’ for the reader who is already conversant with these concepts and insights.

The book consists of three parts. The six chapters in the first part ‘Global Technologies, State Policies, and Local Realities’ explore the intersections of and interactions among local, national and global influences on reproductive policies and practices. Addressing a variety of contemporary reproductive health issues, the ethnographic accounts presented depict both the development of policies and the way actors at the local level creatively navigate the opportunities and constraints they see themselves confronted with. Susan Erikson, in her contribution on the use of fetal ultrasound technologies in Germany (where women get an ultrasound scan at every prenatal exam), makes the reader strongly aware of the complexity of the task global anthropologists have set for themselves. The question she raises, ‘How does a discipline embrace the global/macro and the local/micro theoretically and methodologically and makes the results comprehensible in narrative form?’ (p.25) may sound pretty familiar to many anthropologists in this field who have faced similar challenges. In the next chapter Junjie Chen addresses population policies in China, which are widely critiqued for their coercive character. The author shows how over decades the Chinese state kept justifying this policy by depicting Chinese peasants and their reproductive patterns as “opposed to the state’s modernization agenda and therefore in need of’civilizing’ state interventions” (p.20). Further, Chen argues, contemporary attempts of the Chinese government to give a bit more space for individual reproductive choices are largely
cosmetic – directed at the global community – and hardly have any impact in practice. Matthew Gutman also addresses the issue of population policies, this time in Mexico where he focuses on male involvement, or rather the neglect thereof. While in the international health arena the involvement of men in reproductive health is being emphasized, Gutman shows that locally – in Mexico – men are mainly seen as barriers to responsible reproduction. Hence they are excluded from state population policies. While international policies may affect national policies to a certain extent, he argues, they do not fully determine them. In the following chapters Lisa Ann Richey and Cecelia van Hollen examine pregnancies in times of AIDS and ARVs, in South Africa and southern India (Tamil Nadu) respectively. Richey explores the intersection of different histories and policies at various levels – local, national, and global. She examines the paradoxical situation her South African female HIV+ informants are confronted with: being encouraged to get pregnant and advised to have safe sex at the same time. Van Hollen looks into the social consequences for the Indian women who were already pregnant when they detected that they were HIV+. She shows how a woman’s HIV/AIDS status is a family and social event rather than an individual one. The stigma attached to AIDS, in the context of a weak regional state where policies of informed consent for HIV testing and confidentiality are not enforced, places the pregnant HIV+ women in complex situations, which they attempt to resolve by carefully navigating the medical system, and their kind and family networks. In the last chapter of section one Ellen Gruenbaum examines how recent debates about female genital cutting (FGC) are being shaped by global influences from two contradictory directions, namely that of various Islamist groups on the one hand, and that of western feminist and human rights discourses on the other. Interestingly, Gruenbaum shows how states can interpret regional practices as backward or appropriate at different moments in time, depending on multiple global and local dynamics.

The second part ‘Biotechnology, Biocommerce, and Body Commodification’ examines how states are responding, in the form of legal and ethical guidelines, to global developments in reproductive technologies. The chapters address the way these technologies are challenging and transforming conventional local notions of kinship and of what constitutes a proper family. Finally, they show how global reproductive technologies are transformed by cultural contexts and how this may lead to unintended or unexpected consequences. Aditya Bharadwaj reveals how Indian infertile patients, infertility specialists and the government co-produce a number of practices that altogether strengthen Indian stem cell research and the biotechnology industry. While Indian governmental guidelines stipulate that embryos cannot solely be harvested for stem cell research and emphasize the practice of informed consent and rational autonomous decision making, IVF doctors encourage their patients to donate their embryos as a ‘gift’ to science and do not heavily emphasize informed consent procedures. Infertile patients, on their turn, as a reaction to “subtle moral pressure” (p. 122) are prepared to share or give their embryos altruistically, an attitude which is shaped more by notions of social suffering related to infertility than by informed consent procedures. In Marcia Inhorn’s contribution about advanced reproductive technologies (ARTs) in the Muslim Middle-East she illustrates how locally diverging inter-
pretations of the religious law (sharia) define IVF practices. By comparing the local interpretations of the sharia among the more restrictive Sunni and the more flexible Shia, she shows how religious law is being (re)interpreted and in some cases evaded. In addition, she explores the ambiguous position IVF-children may have in different societies. Claudia Fonseca takes the reader to the use of DNA-techniques in Brazil, where this technique, since the 1990s, has become available for children to discover the biological identity of their parents. The expectation was that DNA testing would mainly be used by unmarried women and their children in child support claims. To the contrary, though, Fonseca demonstrates that the technique became popular among married men, intending to prove that they were not the progenitors of their female partners’ children.

The chapters in the third part “Consequences of Population Movements for Agency, Structure, and Reproductive Processes” examine the effects of policies and politics on the reproductive lives of migrants and other (internally) displaced populations and the way they negotiate institutional structures, laws, and regulations. Mark Padilla first analyses the impact of structural and economic changes in Dominica, from an economy based on agriculture into one based on tourism, on sexual practices of male working class migrants. Using the concept of ‘regional masculinity’ he shows how risks of HIV and STDs are produced and affect the men as well as their wives and children. In contrast to the other chapters Padilla’s contribution pays more attention to his theoretical framework and to a lesser extent provides the reader with ethnographic insights. Carolyn Bledsoe and Papa Sow, based on multisided research in Spain and Germany, examine how the power of states affects the reproductive patterns of non-citizen resident groups. They show how the European Union’s policy of family reunification, as “one of the few remaining windows of transnational mobility for people from poor regions” (p. 187), encourages them to exploit the part of themselves that potentially has the highest human rights value in a particular foreign country at a certain moment (e.g. being a minor, parenting a child, or having married a local). Carolyn Sargent also examines how the (reproductive) lives of West-African migrant women and their families in France are being shaped by immigration policies, institutionalized biomedical practices, and religious tensions. She takes a historical approach, showing the reader how France initially (in the 1970s) allowed and stimulated family reunification and polygamous unions, while currently both are complicated, forbidden, and discouraged. These changes in policy discourses and the herewith connected discriminatory practices, Sargent argues, tremendously affect the reproductive lives and choices of the migrants. Carole Browner examines the ways Mexican immigrant women in California decide on the use of amniocentesis (which is mandatorily offered to all pregnant women in this state). In particular she considers the role of untrained medical interpreters in the decision-making process and reflects on the meaning of agency, choice, and constraints in such a context. Finally, Linda Whiteford and Amee Eden examine – using a critical medical anthropological approach – why female refugees and otherwise displaced women are often excluded from reproductive health care by the humanitarian agencies, despite the various human rights treaties and international laws that stipulate that such care should be provided.
The themes presented in this volume are highly topical; the complexities of studying the local and the global, the micro and the macro, are well illustrated; and the theoretical notions the chapters build on are clearly explained. These three qualities, together with a thought-provoking foreword by Rayna Rapp and epilogue by Didier Fassin, make this volume highly recommendable for academics and others interested in the field of reproduction and globalization.

Trudie Gerrits
Medical Anthropology, University of Amsterdam


In her well-crafted ethnography, *Scripting addiction: The politics of therapeutic talk and American sobriety*, E. Summerson Carr provides fascinating insights into the ways that institutionalized talk therapy is used as a means of shaping the subjectivities of recovering alcoholic and drug addicted women in an American mid-western city. Focusing on the therapeutic and institutional spaces of the out-patient drug treatment program, ‘New Beginnings’, she artfully works to untwine the “semiotic entanglements” of her research subjects, “an interconnected group of professional practitioners and drug using clients,” as they navigate the network of social services meant to meet the therapeutic, housing, legal, and medical needs of the recovering women. Carr shows us how the languages of “sobriety and self-sufficiency” are closely intertwined, and why learning and mastering this particular script of addition is vitally important. Not only for the professional caregivers who must learn to frame their program goals and objectives using the script if they want to qualify for state funding in an environment of shrinking resources, but also for the female client-consumers, who constantly work to shape the ways their words will be interpreted by caregivers who have the capacity to give or take away income, jobs and housing opportunities, to say nothing of influencing parole processes and decisions about child custody issues.

Beyond the basic brilliance of her ethnographic description, Carr is interested in demonstrating the cultural and political dimensions of the way people speak in clinical settings. She argues that addiction counselors effectively silence clients from making institutional critiques and social commentaries when they stop their clients from engaging in talk that does not focus on their own inner states. The public talk of clients is then used as a basis of evaluation, impacting access to basic goods and services. Finally, clients who are adept in therapeutic language are occasionally able to “flip the script” to work the system to their advantage.

Carr’s arguments are based on three and a half years of fieldwork. During her early engagements with Fresh Beginnings – a result of an internship connected to her master’s study in social work – she realized the importance of language in the therapeutic milieu, which prompted her to situate her graduate work within the field of linguistic anthropology. Her combined experiences as an intern involved in the running of the