The construction and operationalisation of NGO accountability: Directing Dutch governmentally funded NGOs towards quality improvement

Boomsma, R.S.

Link to publication

Citation for published version (APA):
Boomsma, R. S. (2013). The construction and operationalisation of NGO accountability: Directing Dutch governmentally funded NGOs towards quality improvement.

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**LIST OF FIGURES** ................................................................. VI
**LIST OF TABLES** ................................................................. VII
**LIST OF ACRONYMS** ........................................................... VIII
**ABSTRACT** ............................................................................ IX

## CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION .................................................. 1
1.1 Introduction ........................................................................ 1
1.2 Research questions and objectives ..................................... 2
1.3 Theory ................................................................................ 3
1.4 Research methods .............................................................. 5
1.5 Research contributions ...................................................... 6
   1.5.1 Empirical contributions to the NGO accountability field .. 6
   1.5.2 Theoretical contributions to governmentality studies .... 7
1.6 Thesis structure ................................................................. 9

## CHAPTER 2: NGO ACCOUNTABILITY ................................... 13
2.1 Introduction ........................................................................ 13
2.2 Conceptions of accountability .......................................... 13
2.3 Forms of accountability .................................................... 15
   2.3.1 Distinctions between forms of accountability with a focus on resource use and values .. 15
   2.3.2 Hybrid forms of accountability .................................. 19
   2.3.3 Summary of accountability literature review ................ 20
2.4 The nature of NGO Accountability .................................... 20
   2.4.1 Defining and classifying NGOs .................................. 21
   2.4.2 Motives for NGO accountability ................................ 22
   2.4.3 Forms of NGO accountability – Upward, downward and internal ......................... 23
   2.4.4 Tensions between different forms of accountability .......... 25
   2.4.5 Donor dominance in NGO accountability ................. 26
   2.4.6 Operationalisation of NGO accountability – The accountability technologies (mechanisms) adopted .. 28
2.5 Chapter summary .............................................................. 37
CHAPTER 3: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK: GOVERNMENTALITY

3.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................. 39

3.2 Introducing governmentality ..................................................................................... 40
  3.2.1 Control through discipline ................................................................................. 40
  3.2.2 Analysing governmentality ................................................................................. 42

3.3 Theoretical framework ............................................................................................... 44
  3.3.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................ 44
  3.3.2 Problematisation – Constructing problematic conduct ........................................ 46
  3.3.3 Rationalities of government - Making problems thinkable ................................... 47
  3.3.4 Programmes of government – Linking rationalities with frameworks for intervention 49
  3.3.5 Technologies of government - Intervention ......................................................... 52

3.4 Chapter summary .................................................................................................... 56

CHAPTER 4: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND METHODS

4.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................ 57

4.2 Research methodology ............................................................................................ 57

4.3 Research methods and the role of theory ................................................................. 59
  4.3.1 The role of theory in qualitative research .......................................................... 60
  4.3.2 Qualitative research methods – Documentary analysis ...................................... 61
  4.3.3 Qualitative research methods – Interviews ......................................................... 62

4.4 The research process of this study ............................................................................ 63
  4.4.1 Background to the research ................................................................................. 63
  4.4.2 Research questions ............................................................................................... 64
  4.4.3 Data collection: Documents on the construction of accountability .................... 64
  4.4.4 Data collection: Interviews ................................................................................ 66
  4.4.5 Data analysis ........................................................................................................ 69

4.5 Chapter summary .................................................................................................... 73

CHAPTER 5: CASE CONTEXT AND INTRODUCTION TO FINDINGS

5.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................ 75

5.2 A brief introduction to international development cooperation ................................ 75

5.3 A brief history of Dutch development cooperation ................................................... 77

5.4 Introduction to the Dutch NGOs included in this study ........................................... 79
  5.4.1 Oxfam Novib ........................................................................................................ 79
  5.4.2 ICCO .................................................................................................................... 80
  5.4.3 Cordaid ................................................................................................................. 80
  5.4.4 Hivos ................................................................................................................... 80

5.5 Brief overview of the research findings (chapters 6 to 9) ......................................... 81

5.6 Chapter summary .................................................................................................... 84
CHAPTER 6: THE PROBLEMATISATION OF INSIGHT AND CONTROL: THE CONSTRUCTION OF QUALITY IMPROVEMENT AS A RATIONALE OF GOVERNMENT

6.1 Introduction .........................................................................................................................................................85

6.2 Emergence of the co-financing program ........................................................................................................... 85
   6.2.1 Background to the commencement of the co-financing program ................................................................. 86
   6.2.2 Transferring responsibility for the selection and approval of project proposals to NGOs ........................... 88

6.3 Problematising insight into and control of co-financing NGOs ......................................................................... 90
   6.3.1 Evaluating Dutch development cooperation ................................................................................................ 91
   6.3.2 Concerns about donor centrism .................................................................................................................... 93

6.4 Working towards quality improvement as a rationale of government ................................................................... 95
   6.4.1 Constructing the rationale of quality improvement ....................................................................................... 95
   6.4.2 Programme of government aimed at realising quality improvement ............................................................ 99
   6.4.3 Lack of available technologies of government ............................................................................................ 101

6.5 Making programmatic aims more explicit and developing accountability technologies ....................................... 102
   6.5.1 Introducing explicit programmatic aims ....................................................................................................... 103
   6.5.2 Introducing enhanced accountability technologies ...................................................................................... 104

6.6 Chapter summary .................................................................................................................................................. 105


7.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................................................................... 107

7.2 Moving from project to programme financing .................................................................................................. 107
   7.2.1 The distinction between project and programme financing ........................................................................ 107
   7.2.2 The desire to move to programme financing ............................................................................................... 108
   7.2.3 A new programmatic aim: retrospective oversight on a policy level .......................................................... 108
   7.2.4 Technological changes enabling retrospective oversight ..................................................................... 110
   7.2.5 Reflecting on the programmatic and technological changes in the 1980s ................................................ 113

7.3 Entering the 1990s - Increased public scrutiny of development cooperation .................................................... 114
   7.3.1 Further debates on the role of co-financing NGOs .................................................................................... 114
   7.3.2 Unpacking the rationale of quality improvement: Structural poverty reduction and sustainable longer term development ................................................................................................................... 115
   7.3.3 New programmatic aims: A revised framework of action aimed at achieving quality improvement ....... 116
   7.3.4 Addressing the revised programmatic aims – NGO reorganisations ......................................................... 119

7.4 Chapter summary ................................................................................................................................................ 121
CHAPTER 8: CO-FINANCING PROGRAMS FROM THE LATE 1990s ONWARDS: THE DEVELOPMENT OF TWO KEY PROGRAMMATIC AIDS - COMPETITION FOR FUNDING AND IMPROVED ACCOUNTABILITY

8.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 123

8.2 Moving to MFP-Breed: Addressing the ‘semi-monopoly’ position of co-financing NGOs ........ 123
8.2.1 MFP-Breed: Questioning the ‘semi-monopoly’ position of co-financing NGOs ................. 124
8.2.2 The MFP-Breed funding scheme: Assessing the functioning of technologies of government .. 125
8.2.3 The MFP-Breed funding scheme: Programmatic and technological changes between 2002 and 2006 126

8.3 The initiation of MFS1: A more systematic approach to the assessment and comparison of NGOs ....... 127
8.3.1 MFS1: Further unpacking the rationale of quality improvement - Decomposing effectiveness and efficiency ................................................................. 128
8.3.2 MFS1: Unpacking programmatic aims in order to operationalise the decomposed rationale of quality improvement .......................................................... 129
8.3.3 MFS1: Linking the programmatic aim of competition for funding with ex-ante accountability technologies ........................................................................ 130
8.3.4 MFS1: Linking the programmatic aim of improved accountability with ex-post accountability technologies .............................................................. 131

8.4 Moving to MFS2: More stringent accountability technologies .................................................. 133
8.4.1 Questioning the achievements of MFS1 ................................................................. 134
8.4.2 MFS2: Discussing suggested programmatic and technological changes ...................... 135
8.4.3 MFS2: Linking the programmatic aim of competition for funding with more stringent ex-ante accountability technologies .................................... 136
8.4.4 MFS2: Linking the programmatic aim of improved accountability with more stringent ex-post accountability technologies ...................................... 138

8.5 Chapter summary .............................................................................................................. 142

CHAPTER 9: OPERATIONALISING THE PROGRAMMATIC AIDS OF MFS2: THE IMPACT OF ACCOUNTABILITY TECHNOLOGIES ON NGOs

9.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 145

9.2 NGO support for the programmatic aims of MFS2 ............................................................. 145

9.3 The problematic nature of MFS2 accountability technologies .................................................. 148
9.3.1 Predetermined indicators: Barriers as opposed to opportunities for learning ............... 149
9.3.2 The problems of aggregation and standardisation ......................................................... 152
9.3.3 Creating ‘fake certainties’ ......................................................................................... 156
9.3.4 Speculation on the Ministry motives for aggregation and standardisation ............... 157
9.3.5 Influencing introduced accountability technologies ..................................................... 158

9.4 Acting as a buffer between MFS2 accountability technologies and counterparts: Focusing on internal accountability needs ................................................................. 159
9.4.1 The Case of Hivos – A buffer between MSF2 requirements and counterpart priorities .. 160
9.4.2 The Case of Cordaid – Linking systems in order to address the inappropriate aspects of accountability technologies ............................................................ 165
9.4.3 The Case of ICCO – The threat of mission drift .......................................................... 170
9.4.4 Brief summary of the three NGO cases ................................................................. 175

9.5 Chapter summary .............................................................................................................. 177