UNIVERSITY OF AMSTERDAM

UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Women's quest for justice beyond the law

Marriage, divorce and commitment to God in Istanbul

Kalpaklıoglu, B.

Publication date
2024

Link to publication

Citation for published version (APA):
Kalpaklıoglu, B. (2024). *Women's quest for justice beyond the law: Marriage, divorce and commitment to God in Istanbul*. [Thesis, externally prepared, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, P.O. Box 19185, 1000 GD Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

UvA-DARE is a service provided by the library of the University of Amsterdam (https://dare.uva.nl)

Download date:06 Oct 2026

WOMEN'S QUEST FOR JUSTICE BEYOND THE LAW:

Marriage, Divorce and Commitment to God in Istanbul

Burcu Kalpaklıoğlu

Amsterdam, Netherlands
2024

Women's Quest for Justice Beyond the Law: Marriage, Divorce and Commitment to God in Istanbul

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
prof. dr. ir. P.P.C.C. Verbeek
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,
in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Aula der Universiteit
op vrijdag 22 november 2024, te 11.00 uur

door Burcu Kalpaklioğlu
geboren te Kadiköy

Promotiecommissie

Promotor:	**prof. dr. A.C.A.E. Moors**	**Universiteit van Amsterdam**
Copromotores:	**prof. dr. N. Sirman**	**Boğaziçi Üniversitesi**
	dr. J.A. McBrien	**Universiteit van Amsterdam**
Overige leden:	**prof. dr. J.T. Sunier**	**Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam**
	prof. dr. S.A.E. Bracke	**Universiteit van Amsterdam**
	mr. dr. M. Voorhoeve	**Universiteit van Amsterdam**
	prof. dr. M.M.A. Kaag	**Universiteit van Amsterdam**
	dr. J.S. Schielke	**Leibniz-Zentrum Moderner Orient**

Faculteit der Maatschappij- en Gedragswetenschappen

Edited by: Merl Fluin, Karina Hof, Patrick Jered
Cover Design: Kardelen Akçam
Layout Design: Fatih Mutlu
Printed by: Gildeprint

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments 9
Publication history 11
Introduction 13
Familialism, divorce and women's economic rights in Turkey 18
Religion, the everyday and commitment to god in women's life stories 21
Notes on methodology 26
Women's fatwa room 26
Marriage and divorce stories 28
Outline of the dissertation 31
Chapter 1 33
Hak (rights), relationships, and
female preachers' sense of responsibility on the Alo Fetva hotline 33
Operations of fatwa 36
Guiding relationships with God and family 38
A careful balance between *hak* and familial relationships 40
Between the law and women's lived experiences 42
Beyond *hak* 44
Vebal: Female preachers' overwhelming sense of responsibility 47
Conclusion 51
Chapter 2 53
Mehir (dower), gifts of gold, and intimate economies of marriage in Istanbul 53
The historical trajectory of *mehir* in Turkey 57
Beyond the law 59
Aspirations to lifelong marriage and conjugal trust 62
Gifts of gold: an economic resource and a performance of honour 64
Conclusion 67
Chapter 3 71
Women's sense of their *hak* (rights), divine justice, and economies of divorce in Istanbul 71
Divorce stories and the dispossession of women 74
Multiple meanings of *hak* 76
"I don't make my *hak* halal for anyone": A call for divine justice 79
Destiny beyond the vision of *hak* 82
"Would his poisonous money pass down my throat?' The contagion of injustice 86
Conclusion 90
Chapter 4 91
Life As *imtihan* (test from God): Workings of destiny in divorce narratives in Istanbul 91

Paths towards divorce 94
Imtihan as a marker in the construction of life narratives 95
Destiny as a mode of adjustment 98
Imtihan As Responsivity To God..... 101
Conclusion 104
Conclusion 107
Justice beyond the law 107
Women's entanglement in a web of relations..... 108
The anthropologist's affective burden..... 111
Moving beyond this study 114
References 117
Summary 125
Samenvatting.....129

to all the women who seek justice in their own ways...

Acknowledgments

This dissertation is a collective work shaped by the labor, love, motivation, and courage that many people in my life have shared with me. I could not have completed it without their invaluable support, beginning with my supervisor, Prof. Annelies Moors, who created a space for me to find my voice in writing and guided me with kindness and wisdom. My co-supervisor, Prof. Nükhet Sirman, has been a constant source of inspiration. From the first day of her class in 2010, I fell in love with anthropology and pursued this passion under her mentorship. She opened the doors to anthropology and feminism for me with her unwavering dedication to both, supporting me generously and acting as a true friend throughout my journey. Dr. Julie McBrien joined my supervision team in the final months but taught me a great deal in such a short time through her detailed, demanding, and kind feedback. I am deeply grateful to my supervisory team for everything they have shared with me and to the committee members for investing their time to read my thesis. I also extend my heartfelt thanks to Dr. Sertaç Sehlikoğlu, Dr. Hilal Alkan, Dr. Aysenur Korkmaz, Dr. Merve Kayikci, and Dr. Samuli Schielke for their care and valuable comments.

My mother, Demet Kalpaklıoğlu, has been central to my education, offering constant encouragement and support since the day I started school. She has been my hero throughout my PhD years as well. As a mother of two, I wrote these pages while struggling with time limitations, and my family's endless care and love helped me carve out the time I needed. I thank my mother, my mother-in-law, Necla Yalçın, my father, Kemal Kalpaklıoğlu, and my brother, Burak Kalpaklıoğlu, who often took care of my children while I worked on my thesis. I could not have done it without their continued efforts.

My closest friend, Hümeyra Dinçer, who has been a witness to and supporter of my academic journey since the day we met, has been my greatest source of help. Whenever I felt stuck, I could always turn to her for advice. I thank Kübra Şamiloğlu for reading and editing my papers and for being a constant source of motivation when I felt inadequate. She helped me believe in myself. Hümeyra Dinçer, Esmanur Şamiloğlu, and Kübra Şamiloğlu, as a group of friends, are central to my life; their generosity, help, and understanding extend far beyond this thesis. I also thank my friends Zehra Keleş, Şeyma

Gümüş, Hasibe Tunçay, Nihan Doğusan and Ayşe Büşra Turgut for their endless support. My thanks also go to Christina Kefala, Emily Ragus, and Kyana Dipananda for making my office at Amsterdam University a warm and welcoming environment, and to Ayşenur Korkmaz and Merve Kayıkçı for helping me feel at home in Amsterdam. Their friendship kept me going and motivated me to finish my thesis.

My husband, Samet Yalçın, has been my rock through the turbulence and challenges of my academic life. He supported me emotionally, physically, intellectually, and financially in ways I could never have imagined. He endured the separation from his family for a year while I was in Amsterdam with our daughters. I thank him for his unwavering love and support.

While my project was not funded, I received a completion grant for its final stage from the Exploring Diversities group at the Amsterdam Institute for Social Science Research. I thank AISSR for making it possible for me to move to Amsterdam last year and helping me survive there.

This thesis would not have been possible without the stories my interlocutors shared with me. I am deeply grateful for their openness, help, and the time they devoted to this research.

Publication History

This Ph.D. research project follows the structured format of article-based dissertation, comprising of three journal articles and an edited volume chapter. This approach allows for the thorough exploration of the research topic and facilitates dissemination through scholarly publications.

Chapter 1:

H*ak* (rights), relationships, and female preachers' sense of responsibility on the *Alo Fetva* hotline

Status: Under Review

Journal: *Journal of Middle Eastern Women's Studies*, special issue, "Emerging Trends in the Middle East and the Mediterranean", (ed. Sadiqi, F.)

Chapter 2:

***Mehir* (dower), gifts of gold, and intimate economies of marriage in Istanbul**

Status: Published, 2024

Journal: *Anthropology of the Middle East, 19(1) Summer 2024*, part of "Performance and Identity: Reshaping Traditions in Contemporary Muslim Contexts", Special Issue, (eds. Pinto, P., Dumovich, L.)

Chapter 3:

Women's sense of their *hak* (rights), divine justice and economies of divorce in Istanbul

Status: Under Review

Journal: *Journal of Royal Anthropological Institute*.

Chapter 4:

Life as *imtihan* (test from God): Workings of destiny in divorce narratives in Istanbul

Status: Accepted

Edited volume: *Poetics and Politics of Islamic Imaginaries, (eds.* Sehlikoglu, S., Sadeghi, F. and Kalia, S.), UCL Press.