UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

[Review of: R. Cortina (2014) The education of indigenous citizens in Latin America]

Admiraal, F.

DOI

[10.1080/14664208.2014.992192](https://doi.org/10.1080/14664208.2014.992192)

Publication date

2014

Document Version

Final published version

Published in

Current Issues in Language Planning

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Admiraal, F. (2014). [Review of: R. Cortina (2014) The education of indigenous citizens in Latin America]. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, 16(1-2), 169-172.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/14664208.2014.992192>

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

UvA-DARE is a service provided by the library of the University of Amsterdam (<https://dare.uva.nl>)

The education of Indigenous citizens in Latin America, edited by Regina Cortina, Bristol/Buffalo/Toronto, Multilingual Matters, 2014, xii + 215 pp., £29.95 (pbk), ISBN 978-1-78309-094-5

The volume, *The Education of Indigenous Citizens in Latin America*, provides an excellent and up-to-date insight into the development of intercultural and bilingual education and its design and implementation in Latin America, including the evaluation of recent changes

therein. Intercultural bilingual education, or *Educación Intercultural Bilingüe* (EIB) in Spanish, is a pedagogical model that promotes the inclusion of cultural, ethnic and linguistic diversity in the educational practice. As such, it operates at the state level in educational policy design, as well as at the local level in the implementation of the curricula in the classroom. The volume comprises an introduction and eight main chapters in which the various authors share their expertise on the matter, from their different but complementary perspectives. Whereas the first chapter presents a regional overview of the background and context of EIB, the other chapters focus in depth on the different praxes at the local level. Together they form a first-class insight into the progress and potential of this new educational paradigm as it is being shaped.

In the first chapter, Luis Enrique López discusses Indigenous bilingual education in Latin America and points at the widening gaps between educational policy and actual practice. After briefly introducing the Indigenous peoples of Latin America, he gives a historic overview of bilingual education in this region, highlighting the improved attention to native languages and cultures in many countries towards the end of the twentieth century. López assesses two opposite strategies of EIB implementation, contrasting the top-down EIB approach in Mexico and Guatemala with the bottom-up strategy observed in Bolivia. However, whereas in Mexico EIB policy and implementation is primarily state-driven, in Guatemala international donors are the major driving force. According to López, after the initial success of EIB implementation in Latin America in the late twentieth century, the turn of the century has brought back the one-size-fits-all educational methods. In addition, resistance to EIB continues to exist, and clear differences in opinion between indigenous leaders, politicians and grassroots community leaders and parents are considered an obstacle to successful implementation. López argues that EIB policy needs to be formulated *with* the community, taking into account the community's perspective, instead of *for* them.

In Chapter 2, the author and book editor, Regina Cortina, examines the alliances between social movements in Latin America and European development aid agencies in their support of EIB. She focuses particularly on the involvement of the German technical assistance program GIZ in two projects. In Peru, the PROEDUCA program aimed to train the faculty and directors of public teacher-training institutions in rural communities, and to invest in the professional development of teachers in intercultural education and EIB. In Bolivia, GIZ collaborated with PROEIB-Andes to offer a Master's program in EIB for professionals who identified themselves as Indigenous and spoke an Indigenous language. Now that the German aid has come to an end for these programs, both initiatives find themselves in an unstable situation. The responsibility for continuity is shifting from the independent, externally financed, units towards institutions incorporated in public universities. Cortina argues that foreign aid agency participation has resulted in the evolution of EIB as an alternative education pedagogy and practice. Within the complex framework of interaction between Indigenous peoples' initiatives, governmental education initiatives, bilateral agencies, and multilateral agencies, the transnational intellectual networks of social scientists and linguists have contributed significantly to the support of EIB.

Chapter 3, *Intercultural Bilingual Education in the Andes: Political Change, New Challenges and Future Directions*, starts with a brief introduction on the political regimes in the Andean countries, followed by a discussion of the wider context of neoliberal multiculturalism in Latin America. In the remainder of the chapter, Bret Gustafson describes the historical paths of the politics of education, as well as current advances in EIB in Bolivia, Peru and Ecuador, and characterizes their respective recent political transformations. The author argues that EIB is most successful when it is supported by constant Indigenous mobilization, and that aid from external donors has proven to be essential. Gustafson sees EIB

policy-making as a process deeply embedded in the ongoing political struggles over the decolonization of the state. As such, EIB has political implications beyond the educational domain and concerns the entire population of a nation. Gustafson therefore concludes that EIB questions demand new concepts of the state and explicit public dialogues on racism, patriarchy and inequality, including cultural or linguistic particularities.

In Chapter 4, Carmen Martínez Novo explores the tension between Western knowledge and Indigenous knowledge, focusing particularly on intercultural bilingual education in Ecuador. After providing an overview of the history of Indigenous education in this country, Martínez Novo describes the current situation, highlighting the role of Indigenous organizations in the formulation and management of EIB implementation. Despite the prominent influence of Indigenous organizations in the design of Ecuadorian EIB, intercultural education continues to be perceived as second class, even by Indigenous leaders and bilingual teachers themselves. In addition, Martínez Novo shows that communities often consider formal education to be a means to empowerment and social mobility, a goal best achieved by teaching Western knowledge in Spanish. The role and goals of the EIB system from the perspective of Indigenous leaders and their non-Indigenous allies differ considerably from those of Indigenous parents and students. Thus, in line with the conclusions drawn by López in Chapter 1, Martínez Novo concludes that policy-makers need to take into account the goals and demands of grassroots Indigenous peoples. The educational system needs to integrate Indigenous knowledge free from discrimination and base this knowledge on the changing living conditions of Indigenous populations, rather than focusing on traditional cultural practices.

Chapter 5, *Indigenous Students as Graduates of Higher Education Institutions in Mexico*, presents the findings of a study carried out by the author, Sylvia Schmelkes. She evaluates three different programs which promote the enrollment of Indigenous students: (1) an academic support project that operates in 24 Mexican public universities, (2) the special programs for Indigenous students in 2 Jesuit universities, and (3) the 10 public intercultural universities with a mainly Indigenous student body. The study found that, whereas in the public higher education institutions there seemed to be little or no discrimination against Indigenous students, in the two private Jesuit universities discrimination was reported as silent, excluding and subtle. The transition of the Indigenous students into the workforce after graduation proved more difficult in rural areas. In larger cities, however, the opportunities for obtaining employment were more or less equal among Indigenous graduates and non-Indigenous graduates. In all three programs, having a university education strengthened the Indigenous identity of students and graduates. Therefore, Schmelkes concludes that university education provides unexpected opportunities for social mobility for Indigenous students and equalizes the opportunities for Indigenous and non-Indigenous graduates on the labor market and society in general.

Drawing on his experience in the Academic Program for Professional Teacher Development (PADEP/D) at the *Universidad de San Carlos de Guatemala*, María José Aragón addresses the potential challenges associated with training teachers for EIB in Guatemala in Chapter 6. Since teachers' understanding of concepts and ideas related to EIB is essential for its successful implementation, Aragón argues that one of the main obstacles in successfully implementing EIB in Guatemala seems to be the fact that teachers are trained at the secondary level, and they therefore often lack a strong foundation in pedagogy and educational theory. Furthermore, Aragón claims that even students who do attend an academic teacher-training program such as PADEP/D struggle with the lack of consistency in the definition of key concepts in national curriculum guidelines, program materials and course content. He points out that in Guatemala, one of the major challenges for the

design of effective teacher-training programs is how teachers should translate the vision of EIB into concrete teaching practices and educational experiences. Aragón concludes that teachers of EIB should master a comprehensive set of knowledge and skills that combines pedagogy, theory and local knowledge. Only then they will be able to adequately meet the needs of the communities they serve, and open up new spaces for reflection and dialogue.

Chapter 7 considers the theoretical, political and pedagogical dimensions of decolonization in Bolivia and highlights the role of Indigenous leaders in this process. After introducing the notions of *coloniality of power* and *coloniality of knowledge*, Luz Jiménez Quispe describes the history of Bolivia's education policy, and the current situation after an educational reform was established in 2010 by the government of the Indigenous president Evo Morales. She shows how the teachers, organized in the Educational Councils of Indigenous Peoples (CEPO), have played a central role in designing the educational reform and how they managed to influence education policy at the governmental level. Jiménez Quispe concludes that decolonization inverts the power relations between Western and Indigenous knowledge, which is the very purpose of the present education reform in Bolivia. However, decolonization is a long process, and Bolivian educational practice – which is deeply rooted in the colonial vision – cannot be changed from one day to the next.

Finally, in Chapter 8, Laura Valdiviezo presents an analysis of the political discourse and school practice in multilingual Peru. She contrasts the legally established intercultural policy within a society long characterized by Indigenous exclusion, with the practice of intercultural teaching. After reporting on the clearly articulated exclusion of Indigenous peoples in the political discourse at the state level, Valdiviezo presents the experience of a Quechua teacher's educational practice as a case study. She describes his attempt to incorporate intercultural practice into the local school curriculum and discusses the teachers' understanding of interculturality in the context of an Indigenous Quechua-speaking school in the southern Peruvian Andes. Based on her research in rural Indigenous schools, Valdiviezo claims that teachers are central actors in EIB implementation, and their voice should be acknowledged when designing educational policy. As was argued in Chapter 6 of the volume, teachers can only instigate a fundamental shift in the process of intercultural policy design and implementation when they are supported in their efforts.

With this volume, the editor Regina Cortina has brought together an inspiring collection that displays in detail the fragile interplay between the different stakeholders involved in EIB. It shows how the design and implementation of intercultural education is part of a broader political struggle. As several authors point out, support from local Indigenous organizations is crucial, and the perspectives and wishes of the communities need to be taken into account for EIB to become successful. This volume is well suited for researchers as well as policy-makers and teachers, and especially for those who wish to contribute in praxis to providing equal learning opportunities for Indigenous as well as non-Indigenous students.

Femmy Admiraal
University of Amsterdam
f.admiraal@uva.nl

© 2014, Femmy Admiraal

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14664208.2014.992192>