



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Legal shape-shifting

On the protection of traditional cultural expressions and crossing the boundaries between copyright, cultural heritage and human rights law

Breemen, J.M.

Publication date

2018

Document Version

Other version

License

Other

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Breemen, J. M. (2018). *Legal shape-shifting: On the protection of traditional cultural expressions and crossing the boundaries between copyright, cultural heritage and human rights law*. [Thesis, fully internal, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

Legal Shape-shifting

On the protection of traditional cultural expressions and crossing the boundaries between copyright, cultural heritage and human rights law

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,
in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel
op donderdag 7 juni 2018, te 14.00 uur

door

Josephine Marcella Breemen

geboren te Dordrecht

Promotiecommissie:

Promotor: Prof. dr. mr. M.M.M. van Eechoud, Universiteit van Amsterdam

Copromotor: Dr. T. McGonagle, Universiteit van Amsterdam

Overige leden: Prof. dr. D.J. Gervais, Universiteit van Amsterdam
Prof. dr. Y.M. Donders, Universiteit van Amsterdam
Prof. mr. P.B. Hugenholtz, Universiteit van Amsterdam
Prof. dr. E. Brems, Universiteit Gent
Prof. dr. F. Lenzerini, L'Università degli Studi di Siena
Prof. dr. S. Frankel, Victoria University of Wellington

Faculteit der Rechtsgeleerdheid

Concise Table of Contents

1 - INTRODUCTION, APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY	13
2 - BACKGROUND, HISTORY AND PROTECTION INTERESTS	33
3 - COPYRIGHT LAW AND TRADITIONAL CULTURAL EXPRESSIONS	101
4 - CULTURAL HERITAGE LAW AND TRADITIONAL CULTURAL EXPRESSIONS	155
5 - HUMAN RIGHTS LAW AND TRADITIONAL CULTURAL EXPRESSIONS	219
6 - BEYOND THE EXISTING LEGAL TRIPARTITE: LEGAL AND PRACTICAL SOLUTIONS	303
7 - SYNTHESIS: WHAT HAVE WE LEARNED?	347
8 - CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	381
SUMMARY	397
NEDERLANDSE SAMENVATTING	407
ANNEX I – LATEST DRAFT ARTICLES OF 2017	417
BIBLIOGRAPHY	433
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	463

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1 - INTRODUCTION, APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY	13
1.1 AN ISSUE OF (THE) MARGINS.....	13
1.1.1 <i>TCEs, threats and trends.....</i>	<i>15</i>
1.1.2 <i>Transboundary legal protection questions on authorisation, preservation and human rights.....</i>	<i>16</i>
1.1.3 <i>Answering the research question with a three-way legal and foundational analysis</i>	<i>17</i>
1.2 CHALLENGES AND PROTECTION INTERESTS	18
1.2.1 <i>Indigenous peoples</i>	<i>18</i>
1.2.2 <i>Traditional cultural expressions</i>	<i>19</i>
1.2.3 <i>Protection interests</i>	<i>20</i>
1.3 A SYSTEMS PERSPECTIVE.....	21
1.3.1 <i>Unauthorised use and exclusive rights</i>	<i>22</i>
1.3.2 <i>Preservation, maintenance and transmission.....</i>	<i>22</i>
1.3.3 <i>Heritage and human rights struggles</i>	<i>23</i>
1.3.4 <i>Beyond existing approaches</i>	<i>24</i>
1.3.5 <i>Mapping the legal diversity</i>	<i>25</i>
1.4 STRUCTURE AND METHODOLOGY	26
1.4.1 <i>An information law perspective</i>	<i>27</i>
1.4.2 <i>Issues of context and content</i>	<i>28</i>
1.4.3 <i>Three legal perspectives.....</i>	<i>29</i>
1.5 OUTCOME AND OPERATIONALISATION	31
CHAPTER 2 - BACKGROUND, HISTORY AND PROTECTION INTERESTS	33
2.1 THE CONTEXT OF THE PROTECTION OF TRADITIONAL CULTURAL EXPRESSIONS	33
2.1.1 <i>History.....</i>	<i>33</i>
<i>Histories of dispossession and indigenous peoples.....</i>	<i>33</i>
<i>Developments in international law and indigenous peoples</i>	<i>35</i>
<i>The influence of history vis-à-vis TCE protection.....</i>	<i>39</i>
2.1.2 <i>Power and politics.....</i>	<i>40</i>
2.1.3 <i>Land claims and cultural expressions</i>	<i>43</i>
2.1.4 <i>Globalisation and technological developments</i>	<i>44</i>
<i>Globalisation</i>	<i>45</i>
<i>Technological developments.....</i>	<i>48</i>
2.2 TCES AND INDIGENOUS PEOPLES: A NEW CHAPTER IN THE INDIGENOUS RIGHTS MOVEMENT?.....	51
2.2.1 <i>Copyright context.....</i>	<i>51</i>
2.2.2 <i>Cultural heritage context</i>	<i>55</i>
2.2.3 <i>Human rights context.....</i>	<i>59</i>
2.3 TRADITIONAL CULTURAL EXPRESSIONS EXPLAINED	61
2.3.1 <i>A closer look at traditional cultural expressions</i>	<i>61</i>
<i>Holistic</i>	<i>61</i>
<i>Impersonal, traditional and oral.....</i>	<i>62</i>
<i>Secrecy and sacredness</i>	<i>64</i>
2.3.2 <i>Appropriation issues</i>	<i>65</i>
<i>Cultural appropriation</i>	<i>65</i>
<i>Cultural misappropriation and misrepresentation.....</i>	<i>66</i>
<i>Commercialisation.....</i>	<i>70</i>
2.4 CRITICISMS OF TCE PROTECTION AND COUNTERVAILING INTERESTS	71
2.4.1 <i>The public domain, commons and remix.....</i>	<i>71</i>
2.4.2 <i>Freedom of (artistic) expression</i>	<i>74</i>
2.4.3 <i>General: protection of TCEs and countervailing interests</i>	<i>76</i>
<i>Copyright law</i>	<i>77</i>
<i>TCE protection and other interests at stake.....</i>	<i>78</i>
<i>Cultural heritage law.....</i>	<i>78</i>
<i>TCE protection and other interests at stake.....</i>	<i>79</i>
<i>Human rights law</i>	<i>80</i>
<i>TCE protection and other interests at stake.....</i>	<i>81</i>
<i>Customary laws</i>	<i>82</i>

<i>Geographically determined competing interests</i>	83
2.4.4 Conclusion	84
2.5 PROTECTION ARGUMENTS AND INTERESTS	84
2.5.1 Categorisation of indigenous peoples’ protection interests	85
2.5.2 Categorisation discourse: approaches in academic literature	87
2.5.3 Economic and development argument	88
<i>History and developments of the argument</i>	88
<i>Examples of protection interests informed by the argument</i>	89
2.5.4 Heritage argument	90
<i>History and developments of the argument</i>	90
<i>Examples of protection interests informed by the argument</i>	91
2.5.5 Human rights argument	93
<i>History and development of the argument</i>	93
<i>Examples of protection interests informed by the argument</i>	94
2.5.6 The hybrid argument	96
2.5.7 Concluding thoughts on categorisation and protection interests	97
2.6 CONCLUSION	98
CHAPTER 3 - COPYRIGHT LAW AND TRADITIONAL CULTURAL EXPRESSIONS	101
3.1 COPYRIGHT LAW AND TCEs	101
3.1.1 Intellectual property law and TCEs	102
3.1.2 Categorisation of IP subject matter vis-à-vis indigenous heritage	104
3.1.3 A focus on copyright law	105
3.1.4 Indigenous rights and development as a contextual backdrop	107
3.1.5 Nature and subject of protection: diverging perceptions of ownership, property and ‘works’	109
3.2 INSTRUMENTS AND REQUIREMENTS OF INTERNATIONAL COPYRIGHT LAW	112
3.2.1 The BC and UCC: history and development	112
3.2.2 Coloured by complexity: copyright characteristics and requirements and TCEs	114
<i>Originality</i>	115
<i>Fixation</i>	117
<i>Authorship</i>	118
<i>Individual and joint authorship</i>	118
<i>Authorship and communal TCEs</i>	119
<i>Transferability and ownership</i>	121
<i>Duration</i>	122
<i>In sum</i>	123
3.2.3 The importance of protection, preservation and promotion	124
<i>Various understandings of protection</i>	125
<i>Defensive protection and TCEs</i>	125
<i>Risk of loss of TCEs: preservation</i>	126
<i>Promotion of TCEs</i>	127
3.3 TRADITIONS, THEORIES AND RATIONALES OF COPYRIGHT LAW	128
3.3.1 Utilitarian tradition and incentive theories	129
<i>Utilitarianism</i>	129
<i>Incentives</i>	130
3.3.2 Natural law tradition, labour, personality and droit d’auteur theories	132
<i>Natural rights and labour</i>	132
<i>Personality and droit d’auteur</i>	133
<i>Moral rights</i>	134
3.3.3 Notions of fairness	135
<i>Distributive justice</i>	136
<i>Misappropriation, misrepresentation and unjust enrichment</i>	138
3.4 PROTECTION INTERESTS AND THEORIES: A MIXED BAG	139
3.4.1 Utilitarianism and incentive theories	140
<i>Utilitarianism</i>	140
<i>Incentives</i>	141
3.4.2 Natural rights tradition and labour, personality and droit d’auteur theories	143
<i>Labour</i>	143
<i>Personality and identity</i>	144
<i>Moral rights</i>	145
3.4.3 Notions of fairness	147

<i>Distributive justice</i>	147
<i>Misappropriation and misrepresentation</i>	148
<i>Unjust enrichment</i>	149
3.4.4 Defensive protection	150
<i>TCEs and ‘cultural privacy’</i>	151
3.5 CONCLUSION: FROM MATERIAL DIFFICULTIES TO FOUNDATIONAL OPPORTUNITIES	152

CHAPTER 4 - CULTURAL HERITAGE LAW AND TRADITIONAL CULTURAL EXPRESSIONS. 155

4.1 CULTURAL HERITAGE LAW AND TCEs	155
4.1.1 A focus on history, concepts and principles	155
4.1.2 Central aspects of cultural heritage and TCEs	156
<i>Heritage as a qualifier</i>	157
<i>Preservation</i>	157
<i>Relationship between communities and cultural heritage</i>	158
<i>Power</i>	159
<i>Land</i>	160
<i>All mankind as beneficiary</i>	161
4.1.3 Cultural heritage law: focus on preservation	163
4.1.4 Cultural heritage and human rights law	164
4.1.5 Cultural heritage law on a deeper level: objectives and rationales	165
4.2 SHORT INTRODUCTION TO INSTRUMENTS, THEORIES AND PRINCIPLES	166
4.2.1 Tangible cultural heritage in armed conflict	167
4.2.2 Movement of tangible cultural heritage	168
4.2.3 Intangible cultural heritage	169
4.2.4 Cultural heritage and cultural diversity	170
4.3 CULTURAL HERITAGE PROTECTION: DEVELOPMENTS AND INSTRUMENTS	171
4.3.1 Cultural heritage in armed conflict	172
<i>Early regulations</i>	173
<i>Context and objectives of the 1954 The Hague Convention</i>	174
<i>Cultural heritage: a general standard of understanding</i>	175
<i>Measures: safeguarding and respect</i>	176
<i>Other measures: use of an emblem and sanctions</i>	176
<i>Main principles of the 1954 The Hague Convention and TCEs</i>	176
4.3.2 Cultural heritage and illicit trade	177
<i>Preliminary developments: 1956 and 1964 Recommendations</i>	177
<i>Context and objectives of the 1970 Convention</i>	178
<i>Cultural heritage: categories of tangible cultural property</i>	180
<i>Measures against illicit trade</i>	181
<i>Main principles of the 1970 Convention and TCEs</i>	181
4.3.3 Cultural heritage, restitution and return	182
<i>Context of the 1995 UNIDROIT Convention</i>	182
<i>Objectives, scope and definitions</i>	184
<i>Measures: restitution and return</i>	185
<i>Main principles of the 1995 UNIDROIT Convention and TCEs</i>	186
4.3.4 Cultural heritage as world heritage	186
<i>Context and objectives of the 1972 World Heritage Convention</i>	186
<i>Definitions and scope</i>	188
<i>Measures: national and international protection</i>	189
<i>Other measures: the World Heritage List, awareness raising and education</i>	189
<i>Main principles of the 1972 World Heritage Convention and TCEs</i>	190
4.3.5 Towards protection of intangible cultural heritage	191
<i>Copyright and folklore: preliminary developments to the 2003 Convention</i>	191
<i>A Recommendation on folklore as a first step</i>	192
<i>Context, objectives and definitions of the 2003 ICH Convention</i>	194
<i>Measures: national inventories, education and awareness raising</i>	196
<i>Measures: safeguarding at the international level</i>	197
<i>Main principles of the 2003 Intangible Cultural Heritage Convention and TCEs</i>	198
4.3.6 Cultural heritage and cultural diversity	198
<i>Context and preliminary developments</i>	199
<i>Objectives and definitions of the 2005 Cultural Diversity Convention</i>	201
<i>Measures to protect and promote the diversity of cultural expressions</i>	203

<i>Main principles of the 2005 Cultural Diversity Convention and TCEs</i>	205
4.4 THE SHIFTS IN CULTURAL HERITAGE LAW: PROTECTION THEORIES AND PRINCIPLES	205
4.4.1 Cultural heritage measures and TCEs	207
<i>Safeguarding and respect – Positive and negative measures</i>	207
<i>Raising awareness I – Emblems, lists and designations</i>	208
<i>Raising awareness II – Education, information and knowledge</i>	209
4.4.2 Protection for the benefit of all mankind vis-à-vis source communities	209
<i>Benefit of all mankind</i>	209
4.4.3 Roles in identity construction, cultural contexts and living cultures	211
<i>Identity construction</i>	211
<i>Cultural context and living culture</i>	212
4.4.4 Preserving cultural diversity, inheritances, cultural contexts and living cultures	213
<i>Cultural diversity</i>	214
<i>Transmission to future generations</i>	214
<i>Cultural context and living culture</i>	215
4.4.5 A cultural heritage law analysis of TCE protection	216
4.5 CONCLUSION: FROM STATIC CULTURAL HERITAGE LAW TO INCLUSIVENESS	217
CHAPTER 5 - HUMAN RIGHTS LAW AND TRADITIONAL CULTURAL EXPRESSIONS	219
5.1 HUMAN RIGHTS LAW AND TCEs	219
5.1.1 The context of human rights and TCEs	219
5.1.2 Focus on cultural and indigenous rights	223
5.1.3 Human rights obligations and TCEs: respect, protect, fulfil	224
5.2 INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW, CULTURAL RIGHTS AND INDIGENOUS RIGHTS	226
5.2.1 International human rights law	227
5.2.2 Cultural rights	229
<i>What is culture?</i>	229
<i>Culture as a qualifier of rights and narrow versus broad views</i>	231
<i>Is there a right to culture and other criticisms of cultural rights</i>	233
5.2.3 Indigenous rights	236
<i>Indigenous rights developments</i>	236
<i>Definitions of ‘indigenous peoples’</i>	239
<i>Indigenous rights and narrow versus broad views</i>	241
<i>Criticisms of indigenous rights</i>	242
5.2.4 The tension between group rights and individual rights	244
5.3 CULTURAL RIGHTS, INDIGENOUS RIGHTS AND GUIDING PRINCIPLES	246
5.3.1 Short introduction to the international human rights system	247
5.3.2 Self-determination	249
<i>Self-determination as a framework right</i>	250
<i>Self-determination, natural resources and cultural rights</i>	251
<i>The collective dimension of the right to self-determination</i>	252
<i>Self-determination and TCEs</i>	253
5.3.3 Equality and non-discrimination	253
<i>The accessory character of non-discrimination</i>	254
<i>Non-discrimination and indigenous peoples: land rights and cultural characteristics</i>	255
<i>Equality and non-discrimination and TCEs</i>	256
5.3.4 Freedom of expression	257
<i>Freedom of expression theories</i>	258
<i>The enabling nature of the right to freedom of expression</i>	260
<i>Indigenous peoples and freedom of expression, participation and minority rights</i>	262
<i>Cultural diversity, the media and freedom of expression</i>	263
<i>Community (social) media and indigenous participation</i>	263
<i>Electronic media and indigenous peoples</i>	265
<i>Indigenous representation, children and the media</i>	266
<i>Freedom of expression and TCEs</i>	267
5.3.5 Property and land	268
<i>The right to property, its framework character and reversed enabling nature</i>	268
<i>Property, land and cultural rights</i>	270
<i>Indigenous peoples and intellectual property</i>	271
<i>Property and TCEs</i>	272
5.3.6 Participation	273

<i>Procedural participation</i>	273
Self-determination, participation and minority rights	275
Indigenous standards of participation, consultation and FPIC	276
<i>Participation in cultural life</i>	279
The right to take part in cultural life	279
The right to benefit from the protection of the interests from one’s productions	281
Participation and TCEs	282
5.3.7 Minority rights	283
Article 27 ICCPR as a framework right and recognition of indigenous peoples	285
Minority rights and TCEs	285
5.3.8 Cultural integrity, dignity and identity	286
Non-discrimination, existence and cultural integrity, dignity and identity	288
Cultural integrity and dignity and TCEs.....	289
5.4 TCES AND CULTURAL AND INDIGENOUS RIGHTS: OBJECTIVES, PRINCIPLES AND UNDERLYING VALUES	289
Recap: the normative framework of cultural and indigenous rights	290
5.4.1 Self-determination	291
5.4.2 Non-discrimination	293
5.4.3 Participation: practice, continuation and existence	295
5.4.4 Dignity	298
5.5 CONCLUSION: FROM ASSIMILATIONIST EXCLUSION TO INCLUSIVE PRINCIPLE-BASED PROTECTION ARGUMENTS	300

CHAPTER 6 - BEYOND THE EXISTING LEGAL TRIPARTITE: LEGAL AND PRACTICAL SOLUTIONS..... 303

6.1 INTRODUCTION	303
6.2 WIPO’S SUI GENERIS EFFORTS	304
6.2.1 The development of sui generis rules	304
<i>Fact-Finding and gaps</i>	306
Definitions and collectiveness.....	307
Customary laws, documentation and participation	308
Defence, cooperation, empowerment and unauthorised use	312
Locality-specific issues	314
<i>Claims, rights and regulatory difficulties: towards a sui generis regime</i>	315
6.2.2 Objectives and principles: multidimensional and cross-cutting	316
Revised Objectives	316
General Guiding Principles.....	317
Preambular principles and objectives of the current Draft Articles	318
6.2.3 Content of the specialised rules: an analysis	319
Subject matter: TCEs and protection criteria	320
Beneficiaries and administration of rights: communities, states, agencies	322
Scope of protection: a distinction between ‘types’ of TCEs	324
Exceptions and limitations: checks and balances	328
Duration: an indigenous dimension.....	330
6.2.4 Focus of protection: outcome rather than process	331
6.2.5 An international approach?	332
Process	334
6.3 GRASS-ROOTS, LOCAL AND PRACTICAL INITIATIVES	334
6.3.1 Purposes and place in the system	335
6.3.2 Labels	336
Geographical indications	338
Practical example: the Local Contexts project	338
6.3.3 Licences as illustrated by the Mukurtu and Local Contexts initiatives	340
A closer look at the licences for documentation and recording	341
Licences and TCE protection concerns.....	341
6.3.4 Protocols and codes of ethics	342
6.4 CONCLUDING THOUGHTS ON TCE PROTECTION AND LEGAL AND PRACTICAL SOLUTIONS	346

CHAPTER 7 - SYNTHESIS: WHAT HAVE WE LEARNED?	347
7.1 INTRODUCTION: FROM FRAGMENTATION TO VALUE-BASED CONVERGENCE	347
7.1.1 The multidimensionality of indigenous protection interests	348
7.1.2 The legal framework: TCE relevance and underlying principles	349
Copyright law and TCEs	350
Copyright principles	350
Cultural heritage law and TCEs	351
Cultural heritage principles	352
Human rights law and TCEs	353
Human rights principles	354
7.1.3 From disparate rules to principles and shared central values: a systems perspective	355
7.2 SHARED CENTRAL VALUES OF THE EXISTING LEGAL FRAMEWORK AND TCEs	356
7.2.1 Dignity and identity	358
7.2.2 Respect	360
7.2.3 Participation and democratisation of the discourse	362
Criticisms of state-centredness	364
7.3 SHARED CENTRAL VALUES, LEGAL AND PRACTICAL SOLUTIONS AND TCEs	365
7.3.1 Connecting the shared central values and a sui generis approach	365
Dignity and identity	365
Respect	366
Participation and democratisation of the discourse	367
To sum up	369
7.3.2 Connecting the shared central values and (practical) solutions	371
Dignity and identity	371
Respect	371
Participation and democratisation of the discourse	372
To sum up	372
7.4 STATE OBLIGATIONS AND LEGAL INTERCONNECTIONS	373
7.4.1 Obligations in an intellectual property and trade context	373
7.4.2 Obligations with regard to cultural heritage	375
7.4.3 Obligations and an indigenous dimension of human rights	377
7.5 CONCLUDING THOUGHTS ON TCE PROTECTION AND SHARED CENTRAL VALUES	378
Operative values	378
'Fragmentation' and inclusion	379
CHAPTER 8 - CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	381
8.1 INTRODUCTION: CLOSING THE CIRCLE	381
8.2 PROTECTION INTERESTS AND APPROACH: LESS IS NOT MORE	382
8.3 TCE PROTECTION: A LEGAL TRIPARTITE AND ONE SET OF SHARED CENTRAL VALUES	383
8.4 STATE OBLIGATIONS AND A HUMAN RIGHTS LAW BASIS: CONNECTING THE THREE LEGAL DOMAINS	384
8.5 ANSWER TO THE RESEARCH QUESTION	386
8.6 RECOMMENDATIONS: CLOSING THE CIRCLE	387
SUMMARY	397
BACKGROUND AND DEVELOPMENTS OF THE DISCUSSION	397
APPROACH	398
PROTECTION INTERESTS, A SYSTEM PERSPECTIVE AND SHARED CENTRAL VALUES	398
STATE OBLIGATIONS AND CROSS CONNECTIONS	400
ANSWER TO THE RESEARCH QUESTION	402
RECOMMENDATIONS	403
NEDERLANDSE SAMENVATTING	407
AANLEIDING EN ONTWIKKELINGEN IN DE DISCUSSIE	407
AANPAK	408
BESCHERMINGSBELANGEN, EEN SYSTEEMPERSPECTIEF EN GEDEELDE CENTRALE WAARDEN	409
STAATSVERPLICHTINGEN EN DWARSVERBANDEN	410
ANTWOORD OP DE HOOFDVRAAG	412

• Table of Contents •

AANBEVELINGEN	413
ANNEX I – LATEST DRAFT ARTICLES OF 2017	417
BIBLIOGRAPHY	433
BOOKS	433
CONTRIBUTIONS IN BOOKS	436
ARTICLES	443
CASES	449
INTERNATIONAL DOCUMENTS	450
OTHER DOCUMENTS, STATEMENTS, REPORTS AND STUDIES ETC.	452
NEWS ARTICLES AND PRESS RELEASES (LINKS)	460
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	463