



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

The power of the Supreme People's Court

Reconceptualizing judicial power in contemporary China

Qi, D.

Publication date

2018

Document Version

Other version

License

Other

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Qi, D. (2018). *The power of the Supreme People's Court: Reconceptualizing judicial power in contemporary China*.

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.



UNIVERSITY
OF AMSTERDAM

THE POWER OF THE SUPREME PEOPLE'S COURT

Reconceptualizing Judicial Power in Contemporary China



DING QI

齐 玎



**THE POWER OF THE SUPREME
PEOPLE'S COURT**

*Reconceptualizing Judicial Power
in Contemporary China*

DING QI

齐玓

Copyright © 2018 by D. Qi (齐玘). All rights reserved. No part of this thesis may be reproduced by any means, including electronic, mechanical, photocopying, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the author.

THE POWER OF THE SUPREME PEOPLE'S COURT

*Reconceptualizing Judicial Power
in Contemporary China*

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex

ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde
commissie,

in het openbaar te verdedigen in de *Agnietenkapel*
op donderdag 21 juni 2018, te 12.00 uur

door

DING QI

geboren te Fujian, China

Promotiecommissie:

Promotors:

prof. dr. L.F.M. Besselink	Universiteit van Amsterdam
prof. dr. B. van Rooij	Universiteit van Amsterdam

Overige leden:

dr. C.M. Zoethout	Universiteit van Amsterdam
prof. mr. dr. A.J.C. Moor-van Vugt	Universiteit van Amsterdam
dr. N. Doornbos	Universiteit van Amsterdam
prof. dr. A.W. Bedner	Universiteit Leiden
prof. dr. B. Ahl	Universität zu Köln

Faculteit der Rechtsgeleerdheid

CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	V
LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES	IX
LIST OF ACRONYMS	XI
CHAPTER 1	
INTRODUCTION	1
1.1. THE POWER OF THE HIGHEST COURTS BEYOND THE WEST: AN INCOMPLETE PICTURE	3
1.2. HOW IS JUDICIAL POWER EXERCISED IN AN AUTHORITARIAN LEGAL SETTING?	10
1.3. LEARNING FROM THE COURT’S EVERYDAY PRACTICE	14
1.4. STRUCTURE OF THE BOOK	17
CHAPTER 2	
THE POWER OF THE COURT FROM AN INSTITUTIONAL PERSPECTIVE	21
2.1. INTRODUCTION	21
2.2. ORGANIZATIONAL FRAMEWORK	24
2.2.1. <i>Court Structure: From Form to Composition</i>	25
2.2.2. <i>Court Personnel: From Composition to Ranks</i>	29
2.3. A PROFILE OF THE SUPREME COURT JUSTICES	34
2.3.1. <i>Recruitment</i>	35
2.3.2. <i>Decision-making</i>	40
2.3.3. <i>Career Identity</i>	43
2.4. PEOPLE’S COURTS OR PARTY’S COURTS?	50

2.4.1.	<i>The Party's Impact on Ideology and Policymaking</i>	51
2.4.2.	<i>The Party's Impact on Personnel Matters</i>	56
2.4.3.	<i>The Party's Impact on Handling Cases</i>	60
2.5.	CONCLUDING ANALYSIS	66
CHAPTER 3		
THE JUDICIAL PRACTICE OF THE COURT		69
3.1.	INTRODUCTION	69
3.2.	IS THE COURT A COURT OF LAST RESORT?	72
3.2.1.	<i>Case Types, Distribution, and Caseload</i>	75
3.2.2.	<i>The Court's Impact beyond Individual Cases</i>	87
3.3.	DOES THE COURT INTERPRET OR ESTABLISH LAW?	92
3.3.1.	<i>Distinguishing Features</i>	94
3.3.2.	<i>Do Abstract Interpretations Lead to Judicial Activism or Judicialization?</i>	105
3.4.	ARE GUIDING CASES GUIDANCE OR COMPULSORY INSTRUCTIONS?	110
3.4.1.	<i>Distinguishing Features</i>	112
3.4.2.	<i>Limited Role and Impact of Guiding Cases</i>	115
3.5.	CONCLUDING ANALYSIS	119
CHAPTER 4		
THE NONJUDICIAL PRACTICE OF THE COURT		123
4.1.	INTRODUCTION	123
4.2.	ADMINISTRATIVE FUNCTIONS OF THE COURT	125
4.2.1.	<i>Requests for Instructions</i>	127
4.2.2.	<i>Court Performance Management</i>	131
4.2.3.	<i>Adjudicative Guidance or Centralized Control?</i>	138
4.3.	POLITICAL FUNCTIONS OF THE COURT	140
4.3.1.	<i>The Need to Combat Judicial Corruption</i>	141
4.3.2.	<i>The Need to Redress Litigation-Related Petitions</i>	151

4.3.3. <i>Is the Court a Rational Actor or Tool of Social Control?</i>	163
4.4. CONCLUDING ANALYSIS	165
CHAPTER 5	
THE POWER OF THE SUPREME PEOPLE'S COURT	167
5.1. INTRODUCTION	167
5.2. HIGHEST COURTS IN A SEPARATION OF POWERS CONTEXT: COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS	169
5.2.1. <i>Separation of Powers: The Western Perspective</i>	170
5.2.2. <i>Separation of Powers: Experience beyond the West</i>	178
5.3. SEPARATION OF POWERS WITH CHINESE CHARACTERISTICS	189
5.3.1. <i>Normative versus Functional Analysis</i>	190
5.3.2. <i>Judicial Independence versus Judicial Interdependence</i>	196
5.3.3. <i>Political-Centered versus Legal-Centered Operation</i>	201
5.4. RETHINKING SEPARATION OF POWERS FROM THE EXPERIENCE OF THE SUPREME PEOPLE'S COURT	206
5.5. CONCLUSION	212
APPENDICES	217
APPENDIX I INTERVIEW DESIGN FOR THE CHINESE SUPREME COURT JUDGES	217
APPENDIX II SAMPLE OF A MODEL CASE	225
APPENDIX III SAMPLE OF A GUIDING CASE	229
APPENDIX IV SAMPLE OF REQUESTS FOR INSTRUCTIONS	241
SUMMARY	245
SAMENVATTING	255
REFERENCES	265
PUBLICATIONS	285

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

WHEN I LIVED in New York in 2015, the New York Public Library was my favorite haunt. On every visit, I passed the pair of marble lions that stand proudly before the majestic Beaux-arts building. In the 1930s, the pair were named Patience and Fortitude by the mayor at the time, Fiorello LaGuardia, in the hope that New Yorkers would draw on these two qualities to survive the economic depression. Nearly eighty years later, these names remain equally apt. In fact, I believe they also represent two of the most important qualities in academic research, especially for Ph.D. researchers, who journey and battle alone to realize the identity change from candidate to doctor.

My journey toward this destination over the last five years has been a long one, with several snags and hurdles along the way. It has been a grand adventure characterized by exploration and excitement, and by courage, challenges, and conquests. Nevertheless, “the best way out is through,” as Robert Frost notes in “A Servant of Servants.” In light of my journey, I consider the accomplishment of my Ph.D. studies a step that will provide even more possibilities and opportunities, and above all, bring stunning changes to my life.

I could not have completed this book without the help of my supervisors, colleagues, friends, and family. First, I would like to express my most sincere gratitude to my Ph.D. supervisors Professors Leonard Besselink and Benjamin van Rooij. The old Chinese saying, a day as a teacher is equivalent to a life of fatherhood (*yiri weishi, zhongshen weifu* 一日为师，终身为父), which perfectly describes the academic and personal guidance I have received from Leonard: he has not only been a demanding promotor but also a loving father, without whose patience and full support my Ph.D. studies would have been impossible. I particularly appreciated his experience, skill, and sense of responsibility as my promotor, his strict discipline at all stages of the process, and his generosity with his time when I needed it. Meanwhile, I owe a huge debt

of gratitude to Benjamin. As a supervisor, he is professional, talented, enthusiastic, and innovative, and his input and advice are always concise, sharp, and enlightening. He shaped my initial research concept, urging me to pursue excellence and to exceed my own expectations.

My warmest thanks go to the Chinese judges, judicial clerks, lawyers, and scholars I met and worked with during my fieldwork study at the Supreme People's Court of China in 2012 and 2014. I would like to express my gratitude to my respondents at the Supreme People's Court and the people who helped me out of unexpected difficulties and created opportunities for my interviews. For ethical reasons, I cannot refer to them by names, and all quotations in this book have been anonymized. Nevertheless, their wisdom and insights enlightened my research and eventually made this book meaningful and invaluable.

Special thanks are due to my colleagues at the University of Amsterdam Law Faculty. These outstanding scholars not only helped to sharpen my thinking and research skills but also generously shared their experience in their areas of expertise. Dr. Ronald Janse, Professor Carla Zoethout, Dr. Klaske de Jong, Professor Adrienne de Moor-van Vugt, Dr. Jan-Herman Reestman, Dr. Aernout Nieuwenhuis, Dr. Roland Pierik, Dr. Rob Schwitters, Dr. Nienke Doornbos, Dr. Joris Kocken, Professor Ernst Hirsch Ballin, Professor Jonathan Soeharno, Bastian Michel, Marleen Wessel, Samantha Daniels, Dr. Martine Beijerman, Tabitha Oost, Katja Swider, Dr. Sanne Akerboom, Dr. Nik de Boer, Dr. Zuozhen Liu, Dr. Nina Holvast, Chris Koedooder, Dr. Natasa Nedeski, Dr. Machiko Kanetake, Tidaporn Sirithaporn, Jenneke Evers, Jessica Schechinger, and Dr. Shu Chien Chen—thank you. I am further grateful for having had the opportunity to work with my former colleagues at the Netherlands China Law Center: Dr. Yedan Li, Annemieke van den Dool, Eline Scheper, Dr. William Jin Guo, Dr. Huiqi Yan, Dr. Na Li, Dr. Yunmei Wu, and Xiang Cheng. I also wish to thank Dr. Kim Bierhoff, Inge de Bruyne, Louise Beuling, Lilian Ramdien, Marlies Woltjer, Carla Weijers, and Grace Sieberichs for their support. A special thanks to Eline and Annemieke for their kind help in arranging the defense and translating the Dutch summary of my dissertation.

I feel fortunate to have met and shared thoughts with numerous talented scholars across the world, and it has been fascinating to learn from and a pleasure to

benefit from these brilliant minds: Professor Benjamin Liebman of Columbia University; Professor Tom Ginsburg of the University of Chicago; Professor Jerome Cohen of New York University; Professor Carl Minzner of Fordham University; Professor Brian Tamanaha of St. John's University; Professor Sida Liu of the University of Wisconsin; Professor Marie Seong-Hak Kim of St. Cloud State University; Professor Björn Ahl of the University of Cologne; Professor Adriaan Bedner, Professor Sebastiaan Pompe, and Dr. Geerten Groet of Leiden University; Professor Eline Mak, Professor Ton Hol, Dr. Damiam Zaitch, and Dr. Brenda Oude Breuil of Utrecht University; Professor Leny E. de Groot-van Leeuwen of Radboud University Nijmegen; Professor Norikazu Kawagishi of Waseda University; Professors Albert Chen, Yun Zhao, and Hualing Fu of Hong Kong University; Professors Suli Zhu, Meng Hou, and Susan FINDER of Peking University; Professors Yu Fan, Weijian Tang, Jianguo Xiao of Renmin University of China; Professors Wusheng Zhang, Guangjie Zhang and Yanyan Yang of Fudan University.

I have amazing friends who have made my journey colorful and cheerful: Dr. Haomiao Du, Yu Chen, Annemieke van den Dool, Eline Scheper, Dr. Yedan Li, Dr. Huiqi Yan, I Na Lam, Fengxia Yan, Dr. Qiming Ding, Dr. Yiyan Zhou, Haiyan Hong, Feiqiong Luo, Jingyun Huang, Hongzheng Liu, Xiaojun Peng, Dr. Que Chen, Dr. Yang Liu, Dr. Yang Song, Dr. Guowen Dai, Dr. Yifan Shi, Dr. Yanbang Li, Dr. Hao Shen, Dr. Liuyi Shao, Niklaus Mueller, Dr. Lukas Aberle, Dr. Fei Qi, Dr. Yun Zheng, Reina Kurobori, Dr. Kuongh Hon Che, Jay Monteverde, Kathinka van de Ven, Jing Hiah, Francisca de Groot, Jalken Antonia, Qiuhong Piao, Mengqi Cai, Xiaoxia Lin, Huaru Kang, Yuxin Le, Ruijuan Zhou, Ting Cao, Ting Zheng, Gary Lee, Dr. Po Yang, Dr. Liang Yu, Guangxing Zhu, Jin Yang, Rong Hu, Joanna Janczak, Jens Hokamp, Jeroen Damen, Shuiqin Liu, Yongqiao Jiang, and Lingjuan Zhang. Thank you all for bringing me so much joy, happiness, and fun all these years and for leaving me with tons of wonderful memories to cherish.

Words cannot express how thankful I am to my family. My dear parents, Shujie Qi and Shanling Yang, and my parents-in-law, Shikai Li and Yumei Yang, love and support me unconditionally. They have instilled the belief in me that I could overcome any difficulties I encounter, and that I have the power to do so. My

most heartfelt gratitude goes to my husband, Chao Li, who is not only a fantastic partner and father but also a wonderful friend and companion whose support I can always rely on. Words cannot express how grateful I am that we met five years ago, decided to start a family together, and were blessed with our daughter's arrival two years ago, all in the city of Amsterdam. My daughter, Amelia, who is my most cherished source of pride and joy, has brought me immense happiness and a mountain of new experiences since the day she was born. Becoming a mother has been the most amazing adventure of my life full of wonder, magic and colorful dreams.

Finally, I would like to take this opportunity to express my sincere appreciation to the China Scholarship Council for sponsoring my Ph.D. research.

LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES

FIGURE 1: Distribution of the Supreme People’s Court Judges in Substantive Divisions	29
FIGURE 2: Caseload of the Supreme People’s Court (1998–2016)	74
FIGURE 3: Cases Heard by the Chinese Courts at Various Levels (2016)	75
FIGURE 4: Case Distribution of The Supreme People’s Court (2003– 2007)	76
FIGURE 5: Performance Indicators of the Case Quality Assessment System	133
FIGURE 6: Number of Litigation-Related Petitions of Courts at All Levels (2004–2013)	152
TABLE 1: Judicial Hierarchy in China (until 2013)	27
TABLE 2: Different Forms of Judicial Interpretations	97
TABLE 3: Comparison on Number of Litigation-Related Petitions Accepted by the Courts at Various Levels and the Supreme People’s Court (2003–2011)	153

LIST OF ACRONYMS

CCP	Chinese Communist Party
CGJ	Council of Grand Justices
CIETAC	China International Economic and Trade Arbitration Commission
CPLC	Central Political-Legal Committee
DPP	Democratic Progressive Party
EU	European Union
KMT	Kuomintang, the Chinese Nationalist Party
LDP	Liberal Democratic Party
MPR	People's Consultative Assembly (Majelis Permusjawaratan Rakjat)
NPC	National People's Congress
OBOR	One Belt One Road
PKU	Peking University
PRC	People's Republic of China
QPC	Preliminary Question of Constitutionality
RMB	Renminbi, the official currency of the People's Republic of China
ROC	Constitution of the Republic of China
SPC	Supreme People's Court
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Union
U. S.	United States
USD	United States Dollar
WTO	World Trade Organization