



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

A rights-based approach to statelessness

Swider, K.J.

Publication date

2018

Document Version

Other version

License

Other

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Swider, K. J. (2018). *A rights-based approach to statelessness*.

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

A rights-based approach to statelessness

Katja Swider

A rights-based approach to statelessness

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,
in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel
op donderdag 5 juli 2018, te 10:00 uur
door Katarzyna Joanna **Swider**
geboren te Rzeszow, Polen

Promotiecommissie

Promotor(es): Prof. dr. L.F.M. Besselink Universiteit van Amsterdam
Prof. dr. G.R. de Groot Universiteit Maastricht

Co-promotor(es):

Overige leden: prof. dr. mr. B. de Hart Universiteit van Amsterdam
prof. dr. E.M.H. Hirsch Ballin Universiteit van Amsterdam
prof. dr. P. Wautelet Université de Liège
prof. dr. M.P. Vink Universiteit Maastricht
prof. dr. T. Molnár University of Budapest
prof. dr. H.U. Jessurun d'Oliveira Universiteit van Amsterdam

Faculteit der Rechtsgeleerdheid

‘...if claiming *statelessness* could also be an empowered political step, and the imposition of *citizenship* could be disenfranchising, then the traditional discourse of citizenship needs to be reconsidered.’

Tendayi Bloom

Table of Contents

1	Introduction.....	9
1.1	Research question and structure.....	9
1.2	Methods.....	12
Part I Meaning of nationality and statelessness.....		17
2	Definitions of nationality and statelessness under international law.....	17
2.1	Constitutive definitions vs. regulative rules.....	17
2.2	Nationality and citizenship as non-statelessness.....	20
2.3	Definition of a stateless person under international law.....	24
2.3.1	The 1954 Convention definition.....	24
2.3.2	Meaning of ‘operation of law’.....	25
2.3.3	Exclusion clauses.....	27
2.4	Definition of a national under international law.....	30
2.5	Rules on acquisition and loss of nationality, and on the recognition of nationality bonds created by foreign states.....	32
2.5.1	Rules on recognition of nationality bonds created by other states.....	32
2.5.2	The ‘genuine link’ doctrine and the <i>Nottebohm</i> judgment.....	34
2.6	Concluding remarks.....	38
3	Nationality and rights.....	40
3.1	Introductory remarks.....	40
3.2	Nationality as a gateway to rights.....	41
3.2.1	Nationals’ rights and human rights.....	41
3.2.2	De facto and de jure definitions.....	44
3.2.3	Rights and UNHCR’s constitutive definition of nationality.....	48
3.2.4	Zooming in on selected rights associated with nationality.....	51
3.2.5	What about nationals’ duties?.....	56
3.3	Nationality as a (human) right.....	57
3.3.1	The human right to a nationality.....	58
3.3.2	Violating and waiving the human right to a nationality: involuntary and voluntary statelessness.....	60

3.3.3	Correlative duties, duty to be a national, and statelessness as a violation of that duty	62
3.3.4	Right not to exercise the human right to a nationality: a (human) right to statelessness?.....	65
3.4	Concluding remarks: disentangling rights, nationality and statelessness	66
4	Nationality as a contract	73
4.1	Introductory remarks	73
4.2	Role of voluntariness in theories of state membership	73
4.3	Nationality as a contract and as a right	77
4.4	Nationality as a contract in nationality laws and practices	79
4.5	Concluding remarks	82
Part II.	Policies on statelessness	84
5	International policy goals on statelessness	85
5.1	Introductory remarks	85
5.2	The goal of avoiding statelessness	86
5.2.1	Introductory remarks	86
5.2.2	Prevention.....	86
5.2.3	Remedying existing cases of statelessness.....	89
5.2.4	Ending statelessness?	90
5.2.5	Avoidance goal in national legal systems	93
5.3	The goal of protecting stateless persons.....	94
5.3.1	Introductory remarks	94
5.3.2	Protection as exercise of fundamental rights and freedoms.....	97
5.3.3	Protection and identification in national legal systems.....	101
5.4	Identification of stateless persons	103
5.4.1	Introductory remarks	103
5.4.2	Content of statelessness determination procedures	105
5.4.3	Under-inclusion and over-inclusion in identification mechanisms.....	108
5.4.4	Identification of stateless persons and ‘normalization’ of statelessness	111
5.5	Justifications for pursuing policy goals on statelessness	113
5.5.1	Introductory remarks	113
5.5.2	In policy discourse	113

5.5.3	In academic discourse	118
5.6	Concluding remarks	122
6	Tensions among policy goals on statelessness	125
6.1	Introductory remarks	125
6.2	Types of tensions.....	126
6.2.1	Introductory remarks	126
6.2.2	Avoidance leading to lower protection of affected persons.....	126
6.2.3	Protection not leading to the acquisition of nationality.....	129
6.2.4	Identification perceived to stand in the way of avoidance	132
6.2.5	Identification inhibiting protection.....	136
6.3	Prioritization of avoidance in the policy discourse	137
6.4	Concluding remarks	139
7	Prioritizing empowerment through a rights-based approach to statelessness	141
7.1	Rights-based approach as empowerment, agency, and representation through rights.	141
7.2	Statelessness policy in light of the rights-based approach	149
7.2.1	Introductory remarks	149
7.2.2	Avoidance of statelessness, the right to a nationality, and nationality rights.....	151
7.2.3	Identification of stateless persons and the right to the recognition of a legal status	154
7.2.4	Rights-based approach as a solution to tensions among current policy goals	156
7.2.5	Concluding remarks	157
7.3	Rights-based approach and voluntary statelessness	158
7.3.1	Introductory remarks	158
7.3.2	Prohibition on voluntary statelessness	160
7.3.3	Identification and protection of voluntarily stateless persons.....	163
7.3.4	Rights-based approach to voluntary statelessness.....	165
7.4	Recommendations and conclusions: towards a rights-based statelessness policy	168
8	Applying a rights-based approach to examples of policy responses to statelessness.....	173
8.1	Introductory remarks	173
8.2	Dangerous nationality: the case of army duty.....	173
8.3	Unrecognized statelessness: the case of Dutch municipal records	178

8.4	Politically sensitive nationality: the case of Latvian non-citizens	184
8.5	Traumatic nationality: the case of restoration of nationality to German Jews and Iraqi Faili Kurds.	190
8.6	Concluding remarks	200
9	Conclusion and discussion.....	203
9.1	Conclusion.....	203
9.2	Language, discourse, and the power of defining.....	204
9.3	Rights as a path from vulnerability to empowerment	207
	List of references	211
	Summary in English	228
	Samenvatting in het Nederlands	229
	Funding	231
	Acknowledgements.....	232