



## UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

### A rights-based approach to statelessness

Swider, K.J.

**Publication date**

2018

**Document Version**

Other version

**License**

Other

[Link to publication](#)

**Citation for published version (APA):**

Swider, K. J. (2018). *A rights-based approach to statelessness*. [Thesis, fully internal, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

**General rights**

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

**Disclaimer/Complaints regulations**

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

# **A rights-based approach to statelessness**

**Katja Swider**

A rights-based approach to statelessness

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor  
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam  
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus  
prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex  
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,  
in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel  
op donderdag 5 juli 2018, te 10:00 uur  
door Katarzyna Joanna **Swider**  
geboren te Rzeszow, Polen

***Promotiecommissie***

*Promotor(es):* Prof. dr. L.F.M. Besselink                      Universiteit van Amsterdam  
Prof. dr. G.R. de Groot    Universiteit Maastricht

*Co-promotor(es):*

*Overige leden:* prof. dr. mr. B. de Hart                                      Universiteit van Amsterdam  
prof. dr. E.M.H. Hirsch Ballin                                      Universiteit van Amsterdam  
prof. dr. P. Wautelet    Université de Liège  
prof. dr. M.P. Vink    Universiteit Maastricht  
prof. dr. T. Molnár    University of Budapest  
prof. dr. H.U. Jessurun d'Oliveira                                      Universiteit van Amsterdam

Faculteit der Rechtsgeleerdheid

‘...if claiming *statelessness* could also be an empowered political step, and the imposition of *citizenship* could be disenfranchising, then the traditional discourse of citizenship needs to be reconsidered.’

Tendayi Bloom

## Table of Contents

1	Introduction.....	9
1.1	Research question and structure.....	9
1.2	Methods.....	12
Part I Meaning of nationality and statelessness.....		17
2	Definitions of nationality and statelessness under international law.....	17
2.1	Constitutive definitions vs. regulative rules.....	17
2.2	Nationality and citizenship as non-statelessness.....	20
2.3	Definition of a stateless person under international law.....	24
2.3.1	The 1954 Convention definition.....	24
2.3.2	Meaning of ‘operation of law’.....	25
2.3.3	Exclusion clauses.....	27
2.4	Definition of a national under international law.....	30
2.5	Rules on acquisition and loss of nationality, and on the recognition of nationality bonds created by foreign states.....	32
2.5.1	Rules on recognition of nationality bonds created by other states.....	32
2.5.2	The ‘genuine link’ doctrine and the <i>Nottebohm</i> judgment.....	34
2.6	Concluding remarks.....	38
3	Nationality and rights.....	40
3.1	Introductory remarks.....	40
3.2	Nationality as a gateway to rights.....	41
3.2.1	Nationals’ rights and human rights.....	41
3.2.2	De facto and de jure definitions.....	44
3.2.3	Rights and UNHCR’s constitutive definition of nationality.....	48
3.2.4	Zooming in on selected rights associated with nationality.....	51
3.2.5	What about nationals’ duties?.....	56
3.3	Nationality as a (human) right.....	57
3.3.1	The human right to a nationality.....	58
3.3.2	Violating and waiving the human right to a nationality: involuntary and voluntary statelessness.....	60

3.3.3	Correlative duties, duty to be a national, and statelessness as a violation of that duty .....	62
3.3.4	Right not to exercise the human right to a nationality: a (human) right to statelessness?.....	65
3.4	Concluding remarks: disentangling rights, nationality and statelessness .....	66
4	Nationality as a contract .....	73
4.1	Introductory remarks .....	73
4.2	Role of voluntariness in theories of state membership .....	73
4.3	Nationality as a contract and as a right .....	77
4.4	Nationality as a contract in nationality laws and practices .....	79
4.5	Concluding remarks .....	82
Part II.	Policies on statelessness .....	84
5	International policy goals on statelessness .....	85
5.1	Introductory remarks .....	85
5.2	The goal of avoiding statelessness .....	86
5.2.1	Introductory remarks .....	86
5.2.2	Prevention.....	86
5.2.3	Remedying existing cases of statelessness.....	89
5.2.4	Ending statelessness? .....	90
5.2.5	Avoidance goal in national legal systems .....	93
5.3	The goal of protecting stateless persons.....	94
5.3.1	Introductory remarks .....	94
5.3.2	Protection as exercise of fundamental rights and freedoms.....	97
5.3.3	Protection and identification in national legal systems.....	101
5.4	Identification of stateless persons .....	103
5.4.1	Introductory remarks .....	103
5.4.2	Content of statelessness determination procedures .....	105
5.4.3	Under-inclusion and over-inclusion in identification mechanisms.....	108
5.4.4	Identification of stateless persons and ‘normalization’ of statelessness .....	111
5.5	Justifications for pursuing policy goals on statelessness .....	113
5.5.1	Introductory remarks .....	113
5.5.2	In policy discourse .....	113

5.5.3	In academic discourse .....	118
5.6	Concluding remarks .....	122
6	Tensions among policy goals on statelessness .....	125
6.1	Introductory remarks .....	125
6.2	Types of tensions.....	126
6.2.1	Introductory remarks .....	126
6.2.2	Avoidance leading to lower protection of affected persons.....	126
6.2.3	Protection not leading to the acquisition of nationality.....	129
6.2.4	Identification perceived to stand in the way of avoidance .....	132
6.2.5	Identification inhibiting protection.....	136
6.3	Prioritization of avoidance in the policy discourse .....	137
6.4	Concluding remarks .....	139
7	Prioritizing empowerment through a rights-based approach to statelessness .....	141
7.1	Rights-based approach as empowerment, agency, and representation through rights. ....	141
7.2	Statelessness policy in light of the rights-based approach .....	149
7.2.1	Introductory remarks .....	149
7.2.2	Avoidance of statelessness, the right to a nationality, and nationality rights.....	151
7.2.3	Identification of stateless persons and the right to the recognition of a legal status .....	154
7.2.4	Rights-based approach as a solution to tensions among current policy goals ....	156
7.2.5	Concluding remarks .....	157
7.3	Rights-based approach and voluntary statelessness .....	158
7.3.1	Introductory remarks .....	158
7.3.2	Prohibition on voluntary statelessness .....	160
7.3.3	Identification and protection of voluntarily stateless persons.....	163
7.3.4	Rights-based approach to voluntary statelessness.....	165
7.4	Recommendations and conclusions: towards a rights-based statelessness policy .....	168
8	Applying a rights-based approach to examples of policy responses to statelessness.....	173
8.1	Introductory remarks .....	173
8.2	Dangerous nationality: the case of army duty.....	173
8.3	Unrecognized statelessness: the case of Dutch municipal records .....	178



8.4	Politically sensitive nationality: the case of Latvian non-citizens .....	184
8.5	Traumatic nationality: the case of restoration of nationality to German Jews and Iraqi Faili Kurds. ....	190
8.6	Concluding remarks .....	200
9	Conclusion and discussion.....	203
9.1	Conclusion.....	203
9.2	Language, discourse, and the power of defining.....	204
9.3	Rights as a path from vulnerability to empowerment .....	207
	List of references .....	211
	Summary in English .....	228
	Samenvatting in het Nederlands .....	229
	Funding .....	231
	Acknowledgements.....	232