Beyond immigrant ethnic politics?

Organizational innovation, collaboration and competition in the Los Angeles immigrant rights movement (1980-2015)

Gnes, D.

Publication date
2018

Document Version
Other version

License
Other

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
BEYOND IMMIGRANT ETHNIC POLITICS?


Davide Gnes
BEYOND IMMIGRANT ETHNIC POLITICS?


Davide Gnes
BEYOND IMMIGRANT ETHNIC POLITICS?

ISBN: 978-94-6233-979-8
© Davide Gnes. All rights reserved.

Cover design and layout: Nicola Gnes
Print: Gildeprint, Enschede, NL.

This research was funded by the European Union’s Seventh Framework Program (FP7/2007-2013) under grant agreement n° 316796. The research was part of INTEGRIM: Integration and international migration: pathways and integration policies, a larger EU-funded research project involving 8 partner universities: University of Amsterdam, University of Deusto, University of Liège, University of Sussex, University of Lisbon, Koç University, Central European University (CEU), and University of Poitiers.
BEYOND IMMIGRANT ETHNIC POLITICS?


ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam op gezag van de Rector Magnificus prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie, in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel op woensdag 27 juni 2018, te 10.00 uur

door Davide Gnes
geboren te Pavia, Italië
## Promotiecommissie:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>rol</th>
<th>naam</th>
<th>universiteit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Promotor:</td>
<td>Prof. dr. J.N. Tillie</td>
<td>Universiteit van Amsterdam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Copromotor(es):</td>
<td>Dr. W. J. Nicholls</td>
<td>University of California-Irvine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dr. F.F. Vermeulen</td>
<td>Universiteit van Amsterdam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overige leden:</td>
<td>Prof. dr. W.G.J. Duyvendak</td>
<td>Universiteit van Amsterdam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prof. dr. B.M. Burgoon</td>
<td>Universiteit van Amsterdam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dr. D.V. Vigneswaran</td>
<td>Universiteit van Amsterdam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prof. dr. J.L. Uitermark</td>
<td>Universiteit van Amsterdam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prof. dr. R. Milkman</td>
<td>The City University of New York</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prof. dr. M.L.J.C. Schrover</td>
<td>Universiteit Leiden</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Faculteit der Maatschappij- en Gedragswetenschappen
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES .................................................................................. 8  
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION .................................................................................. 9  
The Rise and Fall of a Class-Based Immigrant Rights Movement in Los Angeles. How Did It Happen? ...................................................................................................................... 9  
Theoretical Framework of the Research Project ......................................................... 13  
Immigrant Incorporation and Political Participation in Receiving Societies: The Role of Contentious Politics and Social Movements ................................................................. 13  
Understanding Immigrant Organizations and their Organizing Process. A Relational Perspective ......................................................................................................................... 16  
Research Methodology .............................................................................................. 20  
Perspective on Social Reality ...................................................................................... 21  
Research Method and Case Selection ......................................................................... 21  
Data Sources, Analysis and Limitations ...................................................................... 23  
Researcher’s Positionality, Access to the Field and Ethnical Issues .......................... 25  
Notes on Dissertation Terminology .......................................................................... 26  
Outline of the dissertation .......................................................................................... 27  
CHAPTER 2. THE RESEARCH PUZZLE IN CONTEXT: THEORIZING LOS ANGELES AS A CRITICAL CASE ............................................................................................................. 31  
Introduction ................................................................................................................ 31  
The Social and Economic Context of Immigrant Los Angeles ................................ 32  
Los Angeles and the Great Demographic Transformation: From ‘Nativist City’ to ‘Capital of the Third World’ ................................................................................................. 32  
Between Economic Restructuring, Legal Precarity and Differential Racialization: Creating an Immigrant Working Class ...................................................................................... 39  
The Political Context of Immigrant Los Angeles ....................................................... 47  
Immigrant Political Activism and the Historical Salience of Racial and Ethnic Politics ............................................................................................................................... 47  
Immigrant Organizing Under Adverse Conditions .................................................... 53  
The Research Puzzle(s) Reframed ............................................................................ 58  
CHAPTER 3. IMMIGRATION, IDEOLOGY AND THE ‘THIRD WORLD’: ORGANIZATIONAL INNOVATION IN THE EARLY DAYS OF THE LA IMMIGRANT RIGHTS MOVEMENT ............................................................................................................. 61  
Introduction ................................................................................................................ 61  
Innovation, Ideology and Immigrant Organizations in a Transnational Context .... 63  
Methodology ............................................................................................................... 65  
Part One. Community Formation and Early Transmitters in Los Angeles ............... 66  
Part Two. Innovators and Knowledge Synthesizers .................................................... 70  
The Instituto de Educación Popular del Sur de California (IDEPSCA) ......................... 70  
The Korean Immigrant Workers Advocates (KIWA) ................................................ 74
The Pilipino Workers Center (PWC) ................................................................. 77
Discussion and Conclusion ............................................................................. 80

CHAPTER 4. LEGITIMACY AS THE BASIS FOR ORGANIZATIONAL
DEVELOPMENT OF VOLUNTARY ORGANIZATIONS ........................................ 83
Voluntary Organizations and Legitimacy .......................................................... 83
Defining Legitimacy .......................................................................................... 87
The Context of Legitimacy: Institutionalization of Normative Expectations and
Grounds for Legitimacy ..................................................................................... 89
The Context of Legitimacy: Audiences and Power Inequality ............................. 93
Organizational Agency in Legitimation Strategies: An Institutional Perspective .... 97
Organizational Agency in Legitimation Strategies: A Strategic Perspective .......... 101
Conclusion ......................................................................................................... 103

CHAPTER 5. ORGANIZATIONAL LEGITIMACY BEYOND ETHNICITY? SHIFTING
ORGANIZATIONAL LOGICS IN THE STRUGGLE FOR IMMIGRANT RIGHTS IN
LOS ANGELES ..................................................................................................... 107
Introduction ....................................................................................................... 107
Literature review ............................................................................................... 109
Methodology ...................................................................................................... 111
The Politics of the Korean Immigrant Community in Los Angeles .................... 113
The Korean Resource Center: Building Immigrant Ethnic Politics ................. 114
From Ethnic International Solidarity to Ethnic Engagement in the US ............... 114
Placing Korean Americans at the Center of the Mainstream Immigrant Rights
Debate ............................................................................................................... 117
The Korean Immigrant Workers Advocates: Building Immigrant Class Politics .... 119
Building an Immigrant Working Class Organization in a Hostile Environment ..... 119
Articulating Legitimating Strategies Outside of the Korean Immigrant Community ................................................................. 121
From Korean Immigrant Workers to a Multi-Ethnic Immigrant Workers
Constituency ....................................................................................................... 123
Conclusion ......................................................................................................... 126

CHAPTER 6. BEYOND THE LOS ANGELES MODEL? UNDERSTANDING THE
EVOLUTION OF IMMIGRANT WORKER ORGANIZATIONS THROUGH A HYBRID
RESOURCE-BASED MODEL ............................................................................... 129
From Ethnic to Immigrant Working-Class Mobilization? An Assessment of Los
Angeles ‘Exceptionalism’ .................................................................................... 129
Collaboration between Ideologically Similar Organizations: A Hybrid Organizational
Approach ........................................................................................................... 132
Methodology ..................................................................................................... 135
Phase 1 (1990s – late 1990s): The Dawn of an Innovative Immigrant Worker Movement ................................................................. 138
Organizations and Ideologies ............................................................................ 138
Growing Collaboration .............................................................................................................. 142
Phase 2 (early 2000s to mid-2000s): The Heyday of MIWON ......................................................... 146
Collaboration and Organizational Convergence ............................................................................. 146
Sticking Together despite Diverging Goals and Resource Overlap ................................................ 149
Phase 3 (Mid-2000s to Early 2010s): Organizational Drift ............................................................... 155
Changing Political Context, Changing Organizational Priorities .................................................... 155
Growing Competition and Organizational Differentiation ............................................................... 158
Conclusion and Discussion: A Way Forward to Understand Dynamics of Collaboration and Competition ................................................................................................................................. 162
Annex A ............................................................................................................................................. 167
CHAPTER 7. CONCLUSION .................................................................................................................. 169
An Overview of the Research Project ............................................................................................... 169
Connecting the Threads: Understanding the Emergence, Success and Fragmentation of the LA Immigrant Worker Rights Movement in a Relational Perspective ........................................... 170
The Birth of a Leftist Immigrant Worker Rights Movement. Cold War, International Migration and Organizational Innovation ............................................................................................................................ 170
Mobilizing under Hostile Political Conditions and with Low External Support. The Key Role of Fringe Actors and Inter-Organizational Collaboration ................................................................. 171
Organizational Change and Movement Fragmentation. A Resource-Dependency Perspective on Organizations ........................................................................................................................................... 173
Research Implications, Generalizability and Limitations ................................................................. 175
Organizational Success, the Meaning of Immigrant Political Incorporation and the Return of Ethnic Politics .............................................................................................................................................. 175
Research Limitations, Generalizability, and Avenues for Further Research: Beyond the LA Model? ................................................................................................................................. 178
APPENDIX A. ARCHIVES AND OTHER DATA SOURCES ................................................................ 181
List of archives ................................................................................................................................. 181
Other data sources ........................................................................................................................... 181
APPENDIX B. LIST OF INFORMANTS (FORMAL INTERVIEWS) ....................................................... 182
APPENDIX C. SELECTED ARCHIVE MATERIAL ................................................................................. 184
REFERENCES ........................................................................................................................................ 197
LIST OF IMAGES .............................................................................................................................. 227
SUMMARY ............................................................................................................................................ 229
SAMENVATTING ............................................................................................................................... 233
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .................................................................................................................... 237
**LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES**


