



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Secrecy and oversight in the European Union: The law and practice of classified information

Abazi, V.

Publication date

2015

Document Version

Final published version

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Abazi, V. (2015). *Secrecy and oversight in the European Union: The law and practice of classified information*. [Thesis, fully internal, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

Ms Vigilencia Abazi

Email: [REDACTED]

Ref. [REDACTED]

Request made on: 14.04.2015

Registered on: 15.04.2015

Deadline extension: 07.05.2015

Dear Ms Abazi,

Following our letter of [REDACTED], we can inform you that the General Secretariat [REDACTED] has finished the examination of your request.¹

Please find attached the following requested documents:

ST [REDACTED]	ST 7756 2013 INIT	ST 6230 2013 INIT
ST 11395 2012 INIT	ST [REDACTED]	ST 15104 2010 INIT
ST 12737 2010 INIT	ST 13885 2009 INIT	ST 13646 2009 INIT
ST 9518 2009 ADD 1		
ST 6770 2000 INIT		

You will also [REDACTED]

ST 8111 2014 INIT

ST 18734 2011 IN

I regret to inform

[REDACTED] applying

¹ On the b

31.5.20

the Co

Article

SECRECY AND OVERSIGHT IN THE EUROPEAN UNION

The Law and Practice of Classified Information

Vigjilenca Abazi

SECURITY AND OVERSIGHT IN THE EUROPEAN UNION

The Law and Practice of Classified Information

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor

aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam

op gezag van de Rector Magnificus

prof. dr. D.C. van den Boom

ten overstaan van een door het college voor promoties ingestelde

commissie,

in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel

op vrijdag 11 december 2015, te 10.00 uur

door

Vigjilencja Abazi

geboren te Zagreb, Kroatië

PROMOTIECOMMISSIE

PROMOTOR

Prof. dr. D.M. Curtin

Universiteit van Amsterdam

CO-PROMOTOR

dr. Ch. Eckes

Universiteit van Amsterdam

OVERIGE LEDEN

Prof. dr. S.F. Blockman

Universiteit van Amsterdam

Prof. dr. D. Chalmers

London School of Economics and Political Science

Prof. dr. M. Cremona

European University Institute

Prof. de. M. de Goede

Universiteit van Amsterdam

Prof. dr. S. Vanhoonacker

Maastricht University

Prof. dr. M. de Wilde

Universiteit van Amsterdam

Faculteit der Rechtsgeleerdheid

Familjes time

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS.....	11
LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES.....	12
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION.....	13
1. THE RELEVANCE OF SECRECY IN THE EUROPEAN UNION	16
2. RESEARCH RATIONALE, QUESTION AND PERSPECTIVE.....	20
3. METHODOLOGICAL CONSIDERATIONS	22
4. CONTRIBUTION TO THE LITERATURE	29
5. OUTLINE OF THE THESIS.....	34
PART I	37
CHAPTER 2 DEMOCRATIC CONSTRAINTS ON SECRECY.....	39
INTRODUCTION	41
2.1 INTRODUCING SECRECY.....	42
2.1.1 The Concept of Secrecy	42
2.1.2 Secrecy and Institutional Relations	44
<i>A. Secrecy Types and Institutional Interplays</i>	45
<i>B. Power, Protection and Confidentiality</i>	47
2.2 DEMOCRACY AND OPENNESS	52
2.2.2 Democratic Foundations and Processes	53
2.2.3 Applying Openness: Actors, Scope and Time	55
2.3 TOWARDS DEMOCRATIC CONSTRAINTS ON SECRECY	59
2.3.1 Determining Legitimate Claims to Secrecy	60
<i>A. The Necessity of Secrecy</i>	61
<i>B. Who Decides?</i>	63
2.3.2 Oversight and Public Deliberation	65
CONCLUSIONS	68
CHAPTER 3 THE EU EXECUTIVE POWERS, OVERSIGHT AND INSTITUTIONAL WORKINGS.....	71
INTRODUCTION	73
3.1 EXECUTIVE POWER IN THE EU	74

3.1.1 Growing Powers in Security	74
3.1.2 Plurality of Executive Actors	79
A. Core Actors: European Council, Council and Commission	79
B. Multitude of Agencies, Bodies and Other Actors	82
3.2 EU OVERSIGHT	84
3.2.1 The European Parliament	85
3.2.2 The Court of Justice of the European Union.....	88
3.2.3 The European Ombudsman	89
3.2.4 Interplays in Information: Oversight and Executive Actors.....	90
3.3 INSTITUTIONAL WORKINGS	91
CONCLUSIONS	94
CHAPTER 4 THE EU REGULATION OF SECRECY	97
INTRODUCTION	99
4.1 THE LEGAL REGIME OF EUROPEAN UNION CLASSIFIED INFORMATION	100
4.1.1 Secrecy and EU Primary Law	101
4.1.2 Institutional Turf Battles for Legislation on Secrecy	104
4.1.3 Executive Engineering of the EUCI Rules	108
4.1.4 EUCI Rules and Oversight Institutions	112
4.2 REVISIONS AND RIGIDITY OF OFFICIAL SECRETS	116
4.2.1 From NATO ‘Cosmic Top Secret’ to ‘EU Top Secret’?.....	118
4.2.2 Originator Control: From ‘Soft’ to ‘Hard’ Gatekeeping of Secrecy	122
4.3 EUCI RULES: IMPLICATIONS FOR OPENNESS AND SECURITY	125
4.3.1 Openness and EU Secrecy Regulation	125
4.3.2 EUCI Rules and Security Cooperation	128
CONCLUSIONS	130
CHAPTER 5 BEHIND THE SCENES OF THE EU PRACTICES ON SECRECY	133
INTRODUCTION	135
5.1 THE DISCRETION TO CREATE SECRETS	136
5.1.1 EU Officials with Power to Classify Documents	139
5.1.2 Justifying Secrecy: Reasons for Classifying Documents	142
5.1.3 Is Openness Missing in the EUCI Practices?	145
5.2 RESTRICTIONS ON INTERNAL ACCESS TO EUCI	149
5.2.1 Institutional Structure and Organisation	149
5.2.2 National Rules and the EUCI system	151
5.2.3 Security Clearance	153
5.2.4 The Need-To-Know Principle	155
5.3 ADMINISTRATIVE CULTURE OF SECRECY?	158
5.3.1 Lack of Internal Oversight Perspective.....	159
5.3.2 Differences and Similarities in the EUCI Practices	160
CONCLUSIONS	161

PART III	165
CHAPTER 6 EU OVERSIGHT OF SECRECY	167
INTRODUCTION.....	169
6.1 REVIEWING EXECUTIVE SECRECY	170
6.1.1 The Courts and Fundamental Rights	170
A. <i>Scope of Review: Wide Margin of Executive Discretion?</i>	172
B. <i>Extent of Nondisclosure: Justified ‘Deep Secrecy’?</i>	175
C. Duty to State Reasons: A Sufficient Safeguard?	177
6.1.2 Parliamentary Review and Disclosure of Secrets	179
6.1.3 EU Secrecy under Administrative Review	182
6.2 ACCESS TO OFFICIAL SECRETS	184
6.2.1 Privileged Access to EU CI.....	185
A. <i>Scope and Time of Privileged Access</i>	186
B. <i>Insiders of Oversight Institutions</i>	190
6.2.2 Limited Access: The Biggest Challenge.....	193
6.2.3 Creating an ‘Executive Privilege’ in the EU?.....	195
CONCLUSIONS	198
CHAPTER 7 THE PRACTICE OF EU OVERSIGHT: SECRECY IMPLICATIONS	201
INTRODUCTION	203
7.1 OVERSIGHT BEYOND SECRECY LIMITATIONS	204
7.1.1 European Parliament and Unveiled Secrecy in Practice	206
A. <i>The Press and Unauthorised Disclosure of Secrecy</i>	207
B. <i>Parliamentary Inquiries Shedding Light on Secrets</i>	212
7.1.2 Ensuring Fundamental Rights Despite Secrecy	214
7.2 OVERSIGHT BEHIND CLOSED DOORS.....	217
7.2.1 Missing Public Deliberation	218
7.2.2 Secret Evidence	221
CONCLUSIONS	223
CHAPTER 8 CONCLUSION	225
8.1 ASSESSING SECRECY IN THE EU	227
8.2 FINDINGS.....	229
8.2.1 Legitimate and Necessary Secrecy.....	229
8.2.2 Oversight and Access to Official Secrets.....	233
8.2.3 Public Deliberation Boundaries To Secrecy	234
8.3 IMPLICATIONS	236
8.3.1 Constitutional Shifts: Peer-to-Peer Accountability.....	236
8.3.3 Security and Relations with Member States	238

8.4 THEORETICAL INSIGHTS	239
8.5 EU PRACTICES OF OFFICIAL SECRETS: TOWARDS OPENNESS	240
BIBLIOGRAPHY	243
LIST OF CASES AND ADVOCATE GENERAL OPINIONS	261
LIST OF OFFICIAL DOCUMENTS AND REPORTS	263
LIST OF RESPONDENTS	271
SAMENVATTING.....	273
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	281

ABBREVIATIONS

AFSJ	Area of Freedom, Security and Justice
CFA	Committee on Foreign Affairs
CFSP	Common Foreign and Security Policy
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
EEAS	European External Action Service
EP	European Parliament
EU	European Union
EUCI	European Union Classified Information
EULEX	EU Rule of Law Mission
Europol	European Police Office
INTCEN	EU Intelligence Analysis Centre
LIBE	Committee on Civil Liberties, Justice and Home Affairs
MEP	Member of the European Parliament
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organisation
OCTA	Organised Crime Threat Assessment
SG	Secretary General
SWIFT	Society for Worldwide Interbank Financial Telecommunication
TEU	Treaty on European Union
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
TFTP	Terrorist Finance Tracking Programme

LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

Tables

- | | |
|-----|--|
| 46 | 2.1 The Position of the Outside Institution (OI) due to Types of Secrets |
| 51 | 2.1 Secrecy Functions and Institutional Relations |
| 58 | 2.3 Openness with Accountability and Deliberation |
| 115 | 4.1 Comparative overview of the European Ombudsman's provisions on EUCI |

Figure

- | | |
|-----|--|
| 139 | 5.1 The Council's Number of Classified Documents |
|-----|--|