



**UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)**

**Shared questions, diverging answers: Muḥammad ‘Abduh and his interlocutors on ‘religion’ in a globalizing world**

Kateman, A.

[Link to publication](#)

*Citation for published version (APA):*

Kateman, A. (2016). Shared questions, diverging answers: Muḥammad ‘Abduh and his interlocutors on ‘religion’ in a globalizing world.

**General rights**

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

**Disclaimer/Complaints regulations**

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

## Table of Contents

<b>Acknowledgements</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Note on translation and transliteration</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>Part I. Questions and concepts</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>Chapter 1. Introduction. Shared questions, diverging answers in Muḥammad ‘Abduh’s world</b>	<b>19</b>
1.1 Muḥammad ‘Abduh’s world	21
1.2 Global intellectual convergence	24
1.3 An historiographical problem with plurality	28
1.3.1 Caught between modernity and tradition	30
1.3.2 A battle over Islamic orthodoxy	34
1.4 Studying ‘Abduh in context in a time of globalization	42
1.4.1 The kaleidoscopic plurality of ‘Abduh’s context in a time of globalization	43
1.4.2 Studying ‘Abduh in context	44
1.4.3 Shared questions, diverging answers	46
1.5 Studying two texts in context on the concept of ‘religion’	49
1.6 A note on sources	51
<b>Chapter 2. Discussing religion globally. Muḥammad ‘Abduh on Islam as a religion</b>	<b>53</b>
2.1 A global convergence in concepts of ‘religion’	53
2.1.1 Deconstructing the universality of concepts of religion used in academia	55
2.1.2 The globalization of the semantic field of ‘religion’	57
2.2 Comparisons	61
2.3 Comparing comparisons	62
2.3.1 ‘Religion’ and ‘the religions’	64
2.3.2 Reinterpreting Islam as a religion	67
2.4 Outline of this study	70
<b>Part II. Muḥammad ‘Abduh’s <i>Risālat al-Tawḥīd</i> in context</b>	<b>73</b>
<b>Chapter 3. <i>Risālat al-Tawḥīd</i> in its context of conception: Beirut in the 1880s</b>	<b>75</b>
3.1 <i>Risālat al-Tawḥīd</i> as it came to be published	76
3.2 The context of conception: ‘Abduh in Beirut in the 1880s	79
3.2.1 Teaching Islam at a secondary school in Beirut	84
3.2.2 Interreligious dialogue	91
<b>Chapter 4. Comparing religions in <i>Risālat al-Tawḥīd</i> in the context of its conception</b>	<b>99</b>
4.1 How to uphold morality?	99
4.1.1 ‘Religion,’ Islam and <i>tahdhīb</i>	102
4.1.2 (Religio-)Moral formation for collective benefit	105

4.1.3	Teaching <i>‘amal</i> in <i>Risālat al-Tawḥīd</i>	112
4.2	How do religions relate to ‘reason’ (al-‘aql)?	115
4.2.1	Converging conceptualizations of Islam and Protestantism: <i>taqlīd</i> and <i>iṣlāḥ</i>	117
	<b>Chapter 5. Comparisons compared. Reflecting and producing a concept of ‘religion’</b>	<b>125</b>
5.1	‘Religion’ (al-dīn) and ‘the religions’ (al-adyān)	126
5.1.1	<i>Al-Dīn</i> and truth	127
5.1.2	<i>Al-Adyān</i> and truth	130
5.1.3	The special case of Islam and Protestantism	135
5.2	Reinterpreting Islam as a religion	138
5.2.1	‘Religion’ ( <i>al-dīn</i> ) and ‘reason’ ( <i>al-‘aql</i> )	138
5.2.2	<i>Tahdhīb</i> and <i>Maṣlaḥa</i> . Negotiating a role for Islam in communal matters	144
	<b>Part III. Muḥammad ‘Abduh’s reply to Hanotaux in context</b>	<b>153</b>
	<b>Chapter 6. Hanotaux and ‘Abduh. A layered context of discussion</b>	<b>155</b>
6.1	Editions and sources	156
6.2	Hanotaux and ‘Abduh: a global discussion branching out locally	158
6.3	An interplay of global and local contexts	163
6.3.1	The question of Islam and global rivalries localized	163
6.3.2	Defending Islam for the sake of the fatherland?	169
6.3.3	Professional rivalries over the art ( <i>fann</i> ) of journalism and translation	171
	<b>Chapter 7. Comparing Islam and Christianity in reply to Hanotaux</b>	<b>175</b>
7.1	God, man, and action	175
7.1.1	The distance between man and God	177
7.1.2	God’s omnipotence and omniscience	180
7.1.3	Proof in history	187
7.2	“Leur patrie, à eux, c’est l’islam.”	189
7.2.1	‘Religion’ ( <i>dīn</i> ) or the interest of the fatherland ( <i>maṣlaḥat al-waṭan</i> )	190
7.2.2	‘Religion’ ( <i>dīn</i> ) in the interest of the fatherland ( <i>maṣlaḥat al-waṭan</i> )	194
	<b>Chapter 8. Comparisons compared. A play of similarity and difference</b>	<b>201</b>
8.1	‘Religion’ (al-dīn) and ‘the religions’ (al-adyān)	201
8.1.1	Anthropological grammars of similarity and difference between the <i>adyān</i>	201
8.1.2	A theological grammar of similarity and difference between the <i>adyān</i>	205
8.2	Reconfiguring Islam as a religion	209
8.2.1	Sacralization of history, or the naturalization of ‘religion’	210
8.2.2	Islam as a religion and the making of History	213
8.2.3	Islam as a religion and politics	215
	<b>In conclusion</b>	<b>221</b>
	Conclusions	223
	Evaluation	227
	Additional insights	229

Potential	230
<b>Sources and literature</b>	<b>231</b>
<b>Primary sources</b>	<b>233</b>
Archives and special collections	233
List of consulted newspapers and journals	233
Published sources	234
<b>Secondary sources</b>	<b>240</b>
<b>Index of names and places</b>	<b>257</b>
<b>English summary</b>	<b>261</b>
<b>Nederlandse samenvatting</b>	<b>265</b>