The religious polemics of the Muslims of Late Medieval Christian Iberia
Colominas Aparicio, M.

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: http://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
Manuscript Description of the Kitāb al-Mujādala (MS AF 58)

Location: MS AF 58, 126-128ff., Österreichische Nationalbibliothek of Vienna. MS AF 58 also contains the Ta‘yīd al-Milla ['Fortification of the Faith, or Community'] on ff. 1r-30r.

Title: Kitāb al-Mujādala ma‘a-l-Yahūd wa-n-Naṣārā ['The Book Called Disputation with the Jews and the Christians']

Author: Unknown

Copyist: Abū Zakariyyā‘ Yahyā ibn Ibrāhīm al-Raqīlī

Date and Place: 808 H (=1405 CE), Pedrola (Aragon), colophon of the Ta‘yīd al-Milla, f. 30v.

Genre: Polemics


Explicit: wa ‘idh qāla ‘Isā ibn Maryām. MS incomplete.

Codicological Description

Form: Codex

Support: Paper, Watermarks contemporaneous with the copy

Ink: Black

Extent: ff. 3r-62v, incomplete

Foliation: On the recto folia. Roman numerals -rūmī- on the right below, sometimes also on the left above in a different hand. Triple foliation on f. 58r. No catchwords.

Collation: Quire signatures (numeration from 1-5) on the verso of ff. 31-35; 41-45; 51-55.

Conservation: Fairly good. Holes on ff. 42r, 60v, 61v. Blurring on ff. 34r, 35r, 36r, 36v, 38r, 38v, 39r, 43r, 47r, 48r, 48v, 49v, 53r, 55r, 60r, 63v. Later restorations on ff. 39r, 42v, 53r, 54r, 55r, 60r, 61r, 62r, 62v.

Layout: One column. The block of text is well-centred and occupies almost the whole page. Constant written space. The text has no ruled-border or frame. There
Manuscript Description of the Kitāb al-Mujādala (MS AF 58)

are 23 lines per page and their length and spacing remains constant throughout the manuscript. No pricking or ruling is appreciable.

Hand: Arabic, Spanish Aljamiado. Maghribi script, probably vocalized later. Similar to Paris BNF arabe 1451 (579 H/1183 CE) and Paris BNF arabe 389 (800 H/1400 CE).\(^1\)

One hand. Clear *rasm*, partially vocalized. Rubrics and significant words emphasized in bold. Textual dividers mostly in the form of three dots or an open circle with a central dot; *tamat* to indicate the end of paragraphs or argumentations. Some text divisions seem to have been added later. Correction on f. 32r. References to the treatises (*maqālat*) of the *qādi* Abū-Ṭabbās Ahmad al-Lakhami al-Sharafi; the Kitāb al-Jumal by Abū-l-Qāsim al-Jāziyy; the Tahāfat al-Tahāfat by Ibn Rushd; the Tahāfat al-Falāsifa by al-Ghazālī; the Kitāb al-Takhīs by Galen; the al-Manṭiq and al-Ḍarūra (al-Ḍarūra fi-l-Manṭiq) by Ibn Rushd; the al-Manṭiq, al-Falsafa-l-Madaniyya, Falsafa-ṭ-Ṭabī‘a, and the Kitāb Ṭabī‘ al-Ulwiya by Aristote;\(^2\) the Epistles by Aghushtîn; various *bayt* by Ibn Abī Ṭalib. Also references to Seneca and al-Ṭalayawṣī.

Additions: Five hands. Marginal annotations in Arabic by the copyist himself, a couple of times using another *calamus* (f. 34r, 36r, 36v, 38r, 42r, 42v, 50v, 51r, 53v, 56r, 60r. Annotation in Hebrew\(^3\) and Romance -perhaps(?)- in the bottom left of f. 48v in a different hand. Marginal annotations in Arabic in one different hand - perhaps two (?), see f. 38r- on ff. 39v, 43v, 47v. Marginal annotations in Latin in one different hand, who seems to have added as well a leaving on the bottom left of the folia recto. The Latin annotations read:

f. 41v: Toleti Iudai, Christ[i]ani et Muhammedani tempore auctoris habitabant. ['At the time of the author there lived in Toledo Jews, Christians and Muslims'].

f. 42r: Muḥammad est Paracleto in Evangel[iorum]. ['Muḥammad is the Paraclete in the Gospels'].

f. 42v Non recedet sceptrum Iuda Gen 49 ['The sceptre shall not depart from Judah'].

f. 53v Averroes Abu Velid Ruschad ... et Abu Hamid Gazal. Al Gazel vulgo. ['Averroes Abū al-Wālid ibn Rushd... and Abū Ḥāmid al-Ghazālī. Commonly known as Al Gazel'].

F. 54v S. Augustin. Aristos. ['St Augustine. Aristotles'].

f. 58v Ebu Velid Ruschad [?] Averroes. ['Abū al-Wālid ibn Rushd [?] Averroes'].

f. 60r Averroes. ['Averroes'].

Illuminations: Hands on ff. 44r, 54v.

---

\(^1\) See Déroche, 2000, 130 and 132.

\(^2\) See on al-Manṭiq and al-Ḍarūra by these authors my discussion above.

\(^3\) It could probably have been written in the Italian style. I thank the Hebraist Irene Zwiep for giving me this information.
Binding: On ff. 43v and 47r it is obvious that the binding was done at a later stage, probably by the same person who wrote some annotations in Latin. On f. 58r, there is a triple foliation, perhaps because a previous foliation was no longer visible after the binding as it is extant today and it was therefore redone.

Bibliography:


Source overview

Aghushtin

source not mentioned 32r 53r 54v
Aghushtin (Epistle) 50v 54r

Ibn Rushd

al-Manṭiq 39v 42r 44r 45r 46r 53v
56v 59r
Kitāb al-Manṭiq 45v
Kitāb ad-Ḍarūra 47r
Kitāb Tahāfut al-Tahāfut2 53v

Aristotle

Falsafa-ṭ-Ṭabi‘a 31v 34r 38r 46v 56r 57r
59r 59v
al-Falsafa 42r 43r
Kitāb Āthār al-ʿUlwiya 43r
al-Manṭiq 40v3 45r 56r
Kitāb al-Manṭiq 45r
Falsafa-l-Madaniyya 59v
al-Madaniyya 46r

Galen

Kitāb at-Talkhis 48r

1 Here, I have omitted the references in which the identity of the person can be only inferred, such as those to
sultān Awshāb (Eusebius of Cesarea) on f. 44r or to al-manṭiqī Bīr (perhaps Petrus Hispanus d. c. 1254 CE) on f.
54v.
2 In the manuscript rendered as: Tahāfut al-Tahāfut.
3 The author does not mention Aristotle here.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Manuscript Description of the Kitāb al-Mujādala (MS AF 58)</th>
<th>243</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>al-Ghazālī</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>source not mentioned</td>
<td>48r 50v 57v 61r</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kitāb Tahāfut al-Falāsifa&lt;sup&gt;4&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>53v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Saḥīh al-Bukhārī (?)</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>source not mentioned</td>
<td>34r</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ibn Abī Ṭālib</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bayt</td>
<td>45v 46v 61r</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>al-Zajjājī</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kitāb al-Jumal&lt;sup&gt;5&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>60v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>al-Baṭalyawsi&lt;sup&gt;6&lt;/sup&gt;</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source not mentioned</td>
<td>60v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Seneca</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source not mentioned</td>
<td>57v</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>1</sup> In the manuscript rendered as: Tahāfut al-Falāsifa.
<sup>2</sup> Referring to "maqāla-th-thāniyya min Kitāb al-Jumal" by al-Zajjājī. A translation by Kees Versteegh of Kitāb al-Jumal fi an-Nahw ['Explanation of Linguistic Causes'] by al-Zajjājī is found in al-Zajjājī, 1995.
<sup>3</sup> Andalusian grammarian and philosopher born in Badajoz (Baṭalyawsi, 1052-1127 CE). Ela s.v. "al-Baṭalyawsi" (Lévi-Provençal).