



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

The interplay between copyright law and libraries

In pursuit of principles for a library privilege in the digital networked environment

Breemen, V.E.

Publication date

2018

Document Version

Other version

License

Other

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Breemen, V. E. (2018). *The interplay between copyright law and libraries: In pursuit of principles for a library privilege in the digital networked environment*. [Thesis, fully internal, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

The interplay between copyright law and libraries

In pursuit of principles for a library privilege
in the digital networked environment

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex

ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,
in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel
op vrijdag 16 november 2018, te 14.00 uur

door

Victoria Elisabeth Breemen

geboren te Dordrecht

Promotiecommissie:

Promotor: Prof. mr. P.B. Hugenholtz, Universiteit van Amsterdam

Copromotor: Dr. L.M.C.R. Guibault, Dalhousie University

Overige leden: Prof. dr. mr. M.M.M. van Eechoud, Universiteit van Amsterdam
Prof. dr. F.J.M. Huysmans, Universiteit van Amsterdam
Dr. J.V.J. van Hoboken, Universiteit van Amsterdam
Prof. dr. T. Hoeren, Universität Münster
Prof. dr. S. Dusollier, Institut d'Etudes Politiques de Paris

Faculteit der Rechtsgeleerdheid

CONCISE TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1 – Introduction	15
CHAPTER 2 – Libraries: origins, development, mission and functions	33
CHAPTER 3 – Copyright: libraries’ institutional organization, purpose and functions through a copyright lens	115
CHAPTER 4 – Normative assessment: comparing and criticizing the status quo of the library privilege in copyright law on the traditional-evolving spectrum	367
CHAPTER 5 – Summary, conclusions and recommendations: the principles for a library privilege in copyright law in the digital networked environment	439
SUMMARY	477
NEDERLANDSE SAMENVATTING	489
BIBLIOGRAPHY	501
ANNEX I – Selection of national copyright provisions	547
ANNEX II – Charts of the library’s position under the copyright laws of the US, the EU, Germany and The Netherlands	563
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	599

Note: the research for this thesis was concluded in February 2018. Subsequent developments have therefore only sporadically been taken into account.

CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1	15
Introduction	15
1. Problem definition: copyright law and libraries in the digital networked environment	15
2. Research question, scope and terminology	20
3. Methodology and structure of the book	23
3.1 Passive interdisciplinarity	25
3.2 Doctrinal research	26
3.3 Comparative legal research, charts and patterns	27
3.4 Normative analysis	31
 CHAPTER 2	 33
Libraries: origins, development, mission and functions	33
1. Introduction	33
2. The library concept: origins and historical development of societal position	35
2.1 Origins: ancient libraries	36
2.2 Monastery and university libraries in the Middle Ages (fifth – fifteenth century)	38
2.3 Renaissance libraries and the printing press (fifteenth - seventeenth century)	42
2.4 The Enlightenment and the rise of modern libraries (seventeenth - eighteenth century and further)	46
<i>Libraries during the Enlightenment</i>	46
<i>Traces of the Enlightenment in the establishment of modern libraries</i>	49
2.5 Automated libraries and digital libraries in the Information Age (twentieth – twenty-first century)	50
<i>Library automation and early signs of online libraries</i>	51
<i>Digital libraries: from theoretical concept to reality</i>	52
3. The position of libraries in the current digital networked environment	56
3.1 The evolving concept of ‘libraries’ in library and information sciences	57
3.2 Main types of libraries and their missions: united in diversity	62
3.2.1 <i>University libraries</i>	63
3.2.2 <i>National libraries</i>	64
3.2.3 <i>Public libraries</i>	66
3.2.4 <i>Conclusion</i>	69
3.3 Public task and functions operationalizing the institutional mission and task	69
3.3.1 <i>Public task</i>	69
a. The US	71
b. The EU	72
c. Germany	74
d. The Netherlands	76
e. Conclusion	80
3.3.2 <i>Organizing functions</i>	80
3.3.3 <i>Operationalizing functions</i>	84
a. Preservation	85
b. Access.....	89
3.4 Overview: normative values of library functioning	94
4. The library’s future role in the digital era	98
4.1 Ongoing developments in the digital networked environment	99
4.2 Challenges and needs with regard to accessibility in (the information) society	102

Contents

4.2.1 Practical and physical pressures	102
4.2.2 Digital constraints.....	104
4.3 Outlook: why libraries will remain important in the future	108
5. Conclusion and assessment framework.....	110
CHAPTER 3	115
Copyright: libraries' institutional organization, purpose and functions through a copyright lens.....	115
1. Introduction	115
2. The intersection between copyright law and libraries	117
Theories on copyright's rationales: social, cultural and freedom of expression arguments	118
Meeting copyright's objectives by granting exclusive rights.....	119
Copyright is not unlimited I: inherent limits	121
Copyright is not unlimited II: statutory exceptions.....	122
Exceptions are not unconditional either	124
Library exceptions: mandatory and contractually overridable?	125
3. The US	126
3.1 Introduction	126
3.2 Historical rationales behind the library privilege's development in the US	127
a. <i>The proper treatment of lending</i>	127
b. <i>Progressing reprography practices</i>	129
c. <i>From photocopying to computer uses</i>	134
3.3 Current relevant provisions in the US Copyright Act	135
3.4 Assessment: libraries' institutional organization, purpose and functions from a US copyright perspective	137
3.4.1 <i>The characterization of 'libraries' under US copyright law: institutional organization</i>	137
3.4.1.1 Physical location versus access beyond fixed location	138
"Place".....	138
"Premises"	140
3.4.1.2 Local versus remote collection.....	142
"Collection".....	143
"Open to the public".....	144
3.4.1.3 Library staff and local users versus interactivity and remote users	146
'Institutional eligibility'	146
3.4.1.4 Conclusion.....	147
3.4.2 <i>US copyright law and the purpose of 'libraries'</i>	147
"Ground rules"	148
3.4.2.1 Service in support of users	148
Supporting "private study, scholarship, or research" of users	148
Ensuring "preservation and security" and long-term access by "replacement".	150
3.4.2.2 Public service mission and values	152
No "commercial" purpose?	152
3.4.2.3 Conclusion.....	154
3.4.3 <i>How US copyright law facilitates the 'library's' operationalizing functions..</i>	155
"Ground rules"	155
Prelude: relationship between Section 107 and Section 108.....	156
3.4.3.1 Preservation	158
Digital format: use on premises	159

Contents

Preservation of unpublished works of the collection	160
Replacement of published “damaged, deteriorating, lost, or stolen” works or obsolete formats	161
Fair use?	163
Conclusion.....	164
3.4.3.2 Access.....	164
a. Consultation.....	164
First sale?.....	165
Public display	166
Fair use?	167
Conclusion.....	172
b. Lending.....	172
First sale: traditional interpretation	172
First sale: evolving reading	175
Fair use?	177
Conclusion.....	178
c. Copying	179
Copying by users: limited library liability	179
Copying by libraries on user request: entire works or parts, digital not precluded	180
Conclusion.....	184
3.4.3.3 Conclusion.....	184
3.5 Conclusion.....	184
4. The EU.....	186
4.1 Introduction	186
4.2 Historical rationales behind the library privilege’s development in the EU	187
a. <i>Reprography and lending: the need for Community action</i>	188
b. <i>Concrete action to regulate lending</i>	189
c. <i>Towards a digital networked environment</i>	190
4.3 Current relevant provisions in the EU copyright acquis	192
4.4 Assessment: libraries’ institutional organization, purpose and functions from an EU copyright perspective	193
4.4.1 <i>The characterization of ‘libraries’ under EU copyright law: institutional organization</i>	194
4.4.1.1 Physical location versus access beyond fixed location	194
“ <i>Institution</i> ”	194
“ <i>Publicly accessible</i> ” establishment.....	197
“ <i>Premises</i> ”, “ <i>terminals</i> ”	199
4.4.1.2 Local versus remote collection.....	201
“ <i>Collection</i> ”.....	201
4.4.1.3 Library staff and local users versus interactivity and remote users	203
4.4.1.4 Conclusion.....	204
4.4.2 <i>EU copyright law and the purpose of ‘libraries’</i>	204
4.4.2.1 Service in support of users	204
“ <i>Disseminative purposes</i> ”	205
Cultural and educational goals	206
4.4.2.2 Public service mission and values	208
“ <i>Public interest mission</i> ”	208
No commercial purpose	210
4.4.2.3 Conclusion.....	212

Contents

4.4.3 How EU copyright law facilitates the ‘library’s’ operationalizing functions .	212
Rules of interpretation and effectiveness of exceptions	213
Prelude: the aftermath of the Copyright Directive	214
4.4.3.1 Preservation	215
Implications of “specific” acts of reproduction in physical and digital domain	216
No “online delivery” of preservation copies	219
Conclusion.....	220
4.4.3.2 Access.....	220
a. Consultation.....	221
Digitization to make available on “dedicated terminals on the premises”	222
“Not subject to purchase or licensing terms”	225
Conclusion.....	226
b. Lending.....	227
“Originals and copies”	228
“Derogation from the exclusive lending right”	230
“Electronic lending”, “functional equivalent” and “similar characteristics” ...	232
Conclusion.....	239
c. Copying	239
“Reproductions on paper or any similar medium”, “any kind of photographic technique”.....	240
“Reproductions on any medium”	242
Conclusion.....	244
4.4.3.3. Conclusion.....	245
4.5 Conclusion.....	245
5. Germany.....	247
5.1 Introduction	247
5.2 Historical rationales behind the library privilege’s development in Germany	248
a. Increasing lending numbers	248
b. Advances in reprography and continued attention for lending.....	250
c. Copyright amendments in the information society.....	251
5.3 Current relevant provisions in the German Copyright Act	253
5.4 Assessment: libraries’ institutional organization, purpose and functions from a German copyright perspective.....	254
5.4.1 The characterization of ‘libraries’ under German copyright law: institutional organization	255
5.4.1.1 Physical location versus access beyond fixed location	255
“Bücherei”	255
“Einrichtung”; “Institution”	257
“Öffentlich zugänglich”	260
“Räumen”, “Elektronische Leseplätze”	262
5.4.1.2 Local versus remote collection.....	264
“Bestand”	264
5.4.1.3 Library staff and local users versus interactivity and remote users	266
5.4.1.4 Conclusion.....	268
5.4.2 German copyright law and the purpose of ‘libraries’	269
5.4.2.1 Service in support of users	270
“Kultur – und Bildungsauftrag”	270
5.4.2.2 Public service mission and values	272
“Im Gemeinwohl liegenden Aufgaben”	273
“Keinen Erwerbszweck”	275

Contents

5.4.2.3 Conclusion.....	277
5.4.3 <i>How German copyright law facilitates the ‘library’s’ operationalizing functions</i>	278
Interpretation of exceptions and beneficiaries.....	278
5.4.3.1 Preservation.....	279
From analog to digital preservation	280
From general to specific exception in digital networked environment	284
Conclusion.....	285
5.4.3.2 Access.....	285
a. Consultation.....	285
Making available at terminals on the premises	286
Precedence of contractual agreements concerning making available at terminals	290
Digitization as “Annex-Kompetenz”.....	291
Conclusion.....	293
b. Lending.....	293
Utilization of derogation possibility: traditional interpretation and application to new media	293
German view on e-lending	295
Conclusion.....	297
c. Copying	298
Copying by users: on any medium.....	298
Copying on user request: document delivery by analog or electronic means ..	301
Conclusion.....	306
5.4.3.3 Conclusion.....	307
5.5 Conclusion.....	308
6. The Netherlands	309
6.1 Introduction	309
6.2 Historical rationales behind the library privilege’s development in The Netherlands	310
<i>a. Lending: from exhaustion and via administrative arrangements to a legal basis.</i> 310	
<i>b. Regulating reprography</i>	311
<i>c. Implementing the Rental and Lending Rights Directive and the Copyright Directive</i>	312
6.3 Current relevant provisions in Dutch Copyright Act	314
6.4 Assessment: libraries’ institutional organization, purpose and functions from a Dutch copyright perspective	315
6.4.1 <i>The characterization of ‘libraries’ under Dutch copyright law: institutional organization</i>	315
6.4.1.1 Physical location versus access beyond fixed location	315
“Instellingen”	316
“Voor het publiek toegankelijk”	318
“Besloten netwerk”, “terminals in de gebouwen”	321
6.4.1.2 Local versus remote collection.....	323
“Verzameling”	323
6.4.1.3 Library staff and local users versus interactivity and remote users	325
6.4.1.4 Conclusion.....	327
6.4.2 <i>Dutch copyright law and the purpose of ‘libraries’</i>	328
6.4.2.1 Service in support of users	328
“Toegankelijk maken”, “raadpleegbaar houden”	328

Contents

6.4.2.2 Public service mission and values	330
“Publieke dienstverlening tot taak”, “publieke taak”	331
“Niet het behalen van een direct of indirect economisch of commercieel voordeel nastreven”	334
6.4.2.3 Conclusion	336
6.4.3 <i>How Dutch copyright law facilitates the ‘library’s’ operationalizing functions</i>	337
Interpretation of exceptions and beneficiaries	339
6.4.3.1 Preservation	340
Three preservation purposes as ‘specific acts of reproduction’: technology neutral	341
No making available of preservation copies	343
Further conditions	343
Conclusion	345
6.4.3.2 Access	345
a. Consultation	346
“Tenzij anders overeengekomen”	346
“Besloten netwerk”, “terminals in de gebouwen”	347
Further conditions	350
Conclusion	351
b. Lending	351
Utilization of derogation possibility: traditional interpretation and application to new media	352
Dutch view on e-lending	354
Conclusion	357
c. Copying	357
Traditional forms of private use in the library context	358
Library copying for private use in the digital domain	360
Conclusion	361
6.4.3.3 Conclusion	361
6.5 Conclusion	361
7. Conclusion	364
CHAPTER 4	367
Normative assessment: comparing and criticizing the status quo of the library privilege in copyright law on the traditional-evolving spectrum	367
1. Introduction	367
2. The library privilege in force: from descriptive patterns to criticisms and solutions	369
2.1 Introduction	369
2.2 Libraries’ institutional organization, purpose and functions under copyright law: comparison, criticisms and solutions	371
2.2.1 <i>Institutional organization</i>	371
Comparative state of affairs and criticisms	372
a. Physical location versus access beyond fixed location	372
b. Local versus remote collection	376
c. Library staff and local users versus interactivity and remote users	379
Exploration: proposals for solutions	381
2.2.2 <i>Purpose</i>	385
Comparative state of affairs and criticisms	386

Contents

a. Service in support of users	386
b. Public service mission and values	389
Exploration: proposals for solutions	393
2.2.3 <i>Functions</i>	395
2.2.3.1 Preservation	396
Comparative state of affairs and criticisms	397
Exploration: proposals for solutions	404
2.2.3.2 Access.....	407
a. Consultation.....	407
Comparative state of affairs and criticisms	408
Exploration: proposals for solutions	413
b. Lending.....	416
Comparative state of affairs and criticisms	416
Exploration: proposals for solutions	420
c. Copying	426
Comparative state of affairs and criticisms	426
Exploration: proposals for solutions	432
3. Conclusion: towards a future library privilege in copyright law	435
Institutional organization.....	435
Purpose	436
Functions	437
CHAPTER 5	439
Summary, conclusions and recommendations: the principles for a library privilege in copyright law in the digital networked environment	439
1. Introduction: foundations and substance of a future library privilege.....	439
2. Implications of the library’s historically developed societal role, its fundamental rights connotations and continued relevance.....	442
2.1 What we can learn from the library’s historical development	442
2.2 The continued relevance of the library’s main characteristics: institutional organization, purpose, functions	443
<i>Institutional organization</i>	444
<i>Purpose</i>	445
<i>Functions</i>	446
2.3 Conclusion.....	449
A. <i>Foundational principles</i>	449
B. <i>Substantive principles</i>	450
3. Implications of the historical and current position of ‘libraries’ under copyright law for their future regulation	451
3.1 What we can learn from copyright law’s historical rationales in theory and practice	452
<i>Historical rationales in theory</i>	452
<i>Historical rationales in practice</i>	454
3.2 Space under copyright law for the library’s evolving main characteristics	457
<i>Institutional organization</i>	457
<i>Purpose</i>	461
<i>Functions</i>	462
3.3 Conclusion.....	468
A. <i>Foundational principles</i>	468
B. <i>Substantive principles</i>	470

4. Outlook: ‘libratory’ copyright law	474
SUMMARY.....	477
Problem definition: copyright law and libraries in the digital networked environment	477
The historically developed role of libraries and its continued relevance in (the information) society.....	478
Assessment framework: institutional organization, purpose and functions on the scale of traditional-evolving	480
The significance of copyright law for libraries	481
Country analyses: historical rationales for the library privilege and copyright’s current ‘view’ on library characteristics	481
Comparison: status quo of the library privilege on the traditional-evolving spectrum.....	483
Conclusions and recommendations for the principles for the library privilege in the digital networked environment.....	484
NEDERLANDSE SAMENVATTING.....	489
Aanleiding: auteursrecht en bibliotheken in de digitale genetwerkte omgeving	489
De historisch gegroeide rol van bibliotheken en voortdurende relevantie in de (informatie)maatschappij	490
Toetsingskader: institutionele organisatie, doel en functies op de schaal van traditioneel-zich ontwikkelend	493
De betekenis van het auteursrecht voor bibliotheken.....	493
Landenstudies: historische redenen voor bibliotheekprivilege en huidige ‘visie’ auteursrecht op bibliotheekkenmerken.....	494
Vergelijking: status quo van bibliotheekprivilege op traditioneel-zich ontwikkelend spectrum	496
Conclusies en aanbevelingen voor de principes voor een auteursrechtelijk bibliotheekprivilege in de digitale genetwerkte omgeving	497
BIBLIOGRAPHY	501
Literature and reports	501
Library statutes and statements.....	532
Legislative instruments and policy documents	535
The US.....	535
The EU and Council of Europe	536
Germany	538
The Netherlands	540
Case law.....	542
The US.....	542
The EU	544
Germany	544
The Netherlands	545
Websites.....	546
ANNEX I - Selection of national copyright provisions	547
The US	547
The EU.....	551
Germany.....	554
The Netherlands	559

Contents

ANNEX II - Charts of the library's position under the copyright laws of the US, the EU, Germany and The Netherlands.....	563
US CHART	563
US COPYRIGHT ACT IN FORCE.....	563
LEGISLATIVE HISTORY	565
OTHER POLICY DOCUMENTS	567
EXEMPLARY CASES	568
EU CHART.....	570
MAIN DIRECTIVES IN FORCE.....	570
LEGISLATIVE HISTORY	571
OTHER POLICY DOCUMENTS, DIRECTIVES AND RECENT PROPOSALS	573
EXEMPLARY CASES	578
GERMAN CHART	580
GERMAN COPYRIGHT ACT IN FORCE AND AMENDMENT AS OF 1 MARCH 2018.....	580
LEGISLATIVE HISTORY	583
OTHER POLICY DOCUMENTS	586
EXEMPLARY CASES	586
DUTCH CHART	590
DUTCH COPYRIGHT ACT IN FORCE	590
LEGISLATIVE HISTORY	592
OTHER POLICY DOCUMENTS	594
EXEMPLARY CASES	596
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	599