Schippers, A.

Published in:
Bibliotheca Orientalis

Citation for published version (APA):
Es würde ein schiefes Bild abgeben, wenn die immense Fleißbarkeit von S. ungedürftig bliebe. Sie scheut sich nicht, bei der Suche nach unterstützenden Informationen über den Tellerrand der Islamwissenschaft zu schauen. Da macht sich die historische Schulung an der SOAS bemerkbar. Der Aus- sagewert der thesenhaften Schlußfolgerungen muß jedoch an der Beschaffenheit des Materials gemessen werden, dem sie jene abgewinnen. Und das ist unsolide.

Das Arabische als Quellensprache erfährt eine stiefmüti- tigerliche Behandlung. Zitiert wird überwiegend — wenn vorhanden — aus Übersetzungen, wenn nicht, dann — ohne Angabe — ganz offenbar aus der Sekundärliteratur. Das rüttet sich in Form unnötiger Fehler: Die ibaditische 5er Gruppe wird durchweg falsch mit »hamarat« (S. 4 passim) statt: hamalat al-ilm; Salama b. Sa’d heißt nicht »Salāma« (S. 4 Anm. 10); die Anekdoten mit »Umran [sic] b. Hattān al-Shaybānī« (S. 33 Anm. 24) ist der ibaditische Sekundär-termin entnommen, die verkurzte Namensform der Mas- quayy’schen Übersetzung im Appendix der »Chronique« (S. 367-8), ohne auf die Originalstelle bei Sammāṭi (Siyar 77/-4ff.) zu rekurrieren, wo der Name »Ibrāhīm b. Ḥaḍān« lautet; davon wäre ein Querverweis auf den (bäsrischen?) Ibadit und Qatāda-Schüler »Ibrāhīm al-Qaṭān (zu ihm van Ess, 277-8) möglich gewesen; Su‘i b. Mu‘āarrif (S. 53) muß wohl »al-Ma‘rūf« gelesen werden (ibid. 210f.); statt Mu‘āwiyah b. Hudaiga steht Khādiq (S. 72 Anm. 35); Ḥassān b. an-Nu‘mān heißt einmal Ḥassān (S. 90 Anm. 8), einmal Ḥasan b. Ḥusnān (S. 98 Anm. 56), dann wieder Ḥasan b. an-Nu‘mān (S. 113 Anm. 2); lies: tasmiya statt: tāsimiya (S. 144 Anm. 24) und an yakāna statt: an yakānā; gegen Lewicki (Du nouveau sur la liste… 180) und andere liest S. immer »Ya‘qub« (S. 66 passim) statt: A‘firān, Ibrān/Ifrān. Viele Flüchtigkeiten hätten durch einen letzten Korrekturdurchgang bereinigt werden können: Ismā‘il (S. 20 Anm. 20), Khwārizmī (S. 25), shirā (S. 26 Anm. 51), »it is also tells« (S. 60), gūrār (S. 71 Anm. 29), S. 93 ist Anm. 29 den Text gerutscht, Iffriquiy (S. 102 Anm. 91), Qāṣīfīya (S. 155 41.); K. al-‘idāb (S. 169) usw.


Freiburg, Januar 1999 Ulrich REBSTOCK


The first impression one gets when reading the bulk of the articles of this comprehensive book, which is subdivided into groups of articles by discipline, is that most of the articles lose themselves in an accumulation of disparate details and a proliferation of small facts, and one is inclined to think that writing medieval history is the documentation of discrete cases in the broadest sense. But be that as it may, the reader receives an overview of the many disciplines that form a part of any description of Muslim Spain and its legacy to the world. Naturally, in a review as small as this I cannot give a full account of all the articles. Therefore I will give an extended review of certain thought-provoking and sometimes controversial articles, while mentioning others only by title.

In the group of articles devoted to HISTORY an “Enve- lope Essay” by Mahmoud Makki deals with “The Political History of al-Andalus (92/711-897/1492)” [p. 30 ff.]. Then follows James Dickie’s article in the subsection The Cities, enti- tled “Granada: A Case Study of Arab Urbanism in Muslim Spain” [p. 88] and Robert Hillenbrand’s “The Ornament of the World”: Medieval Córdoba as a Cultural Centre” [p. 112]. Then it is Sevilla’s turn in Rafael Valencia’s “Islamic Seville: Its Political, Social and Cultural History” [p. 156]. Then follows the history of the minorities, dealt with by Mikael de Epalza (“Mozarabs: An Emblematic Christian Minority in Islamic al-Andalus” ; p. 149), Margarita López
Gómez ("The Mozarabs: Worthy Bearers of Islamic Culture"; p. 171), L.P. Harvey ("The Mu'adejars; p. 176) and Raymond P. Scheindlin ("The Jews in Muslim Spain; p. 188). The later stage of the Moriscos in Christian territory is described by L.P. Harvey ("The Political, Social and Cultural History of the Moriscos"; p. 201). Then two articles about the religious spectrum ("Al-Andalus and North Africa in the Almohad Ideology"; p. 235) by Madeleine Fletcher and ("Moral Enemies, Invisible Neighbours: Northerners in Andalusian Eyes"; p. 259) by Aziz al-Azmeh.

The last article in this group is one by Abbas Hamdani which is entitled "An Islamic Background to the Voyages of Discovery" [p. 273]. Muslim writings referred to the sphericity of the earth, a fact which had been nearly forgotten in the "Dark Ages" and without which the discovery of the astronomical world would have been an impossibility. Columbus found support for his belief that the earth was a sphere in the astronomical treatise al-Mudkhil written by al-Farghani in 247/861. It was translated into Latin in 1135 by John of Seville and Gerard of Cremona, but may have reached Columbus via the Imago Mundi of the French Cardinal, theologian and geographer Pierre d’Ailly (1350-1420), particularly from chapter eight of his book "concerning the Size of the Habitable Earth", or, as was mentioned by Columbus’ son, Ferdinand, via the commentary of Ibn Rushd (Averroes) (d. 595/1198) on Aristotle’s On the Heavens. Another important fact was the existence of Arabic navigational instruments, and sailing charts, the so-called portulans.

The second group, concerned with LANGUAGES AND LITERATURE, contains an article by Pierre Cachia, dealing mainly with literary prose ("Andalusi Belles Lettres"; p. 307). About the impact of Arabic literature he says (p. 314): "In European Christian literatures [...] the influence of Arabic writers is more open to debate. It is noticeable that of the prose works known to have echoes in European writing, few belong to the classical Arabic canon. Thus Fr. Anselmo de Turmeda’s Disputa del Asno (1417), in which an ass argues against the superiority of Man, has roots in one of the Epistles of the Brethren of Purity, a series of scientific and philosophical essays dating from the 4th/10th century. [...] Whether or not distinct literary streams can be traced flowing from Islamic Spain to other parts of Europe, there is no doubt that al-Andalus was one of the main channels by which the entire Arab-Islamic heritage, together with the wealth of Greek thought integrated into it, was passed on to the West".

Salma Jayyusi (Andalusi Poetry: The Golden Period; p. 317) and ("Nature Poetry in al-Andalus and the Rise of Ibn Khafajä", p. 367) discusses in her articles the impact of nature on poetry in al-Andalus, always referring to the Arab poets of the East as predecessors of the Andalusian poets. Subsequently she deals with the poetry of Ibn Hānî, Ibn Shuhayd, Ibn Zaydûn, and others. She also discusses the possible later imitations of Arabic flower poetry by Spanish poets of our own age. She quotes the 20-century poet Rafael Alberti, a poet of the “Generation of 27”, a “profoundly poetical” generation, saying: “The book of Arab-Andalusian poetry of Emilio García Gómez that appeared between 1928 and 1929 was a revelation for me and had a great influence on my work, but above all influenced the work of Federico García Lorca.” She assumes that there is a link between the arabesque which originated in the East and the concentration of miniature descriptions in poetry.

Abu "

Abu Iṣḥāq Ibrahim b. Khafajä (1058-1138) forms a chapter per se in Andalusí poetry. He is seen as particularly interesting because of his treatment of nature, his particular attitude to the world, his crucial feelings vis-a-vis existential problems, and his handling of the problems of youth and old age, life and death. She describes his birthplace, remarkable for its beauty and fertility, and his exploitation of the long tradition of nature poetry in the East and in al-Andalus, such that it developed into a higher level of sophistication than ever previously demonstrated. She takes note of his style, his choice of vocabulary, syntactical arrangements and rhythmic structures, which vary according to the source of his inspiration, his warm affinity with the inherited bedouin style, with the mention of the place names of Arabia and references to its fauna and flora, and his expression of a deep-seated nostalgia. In some of his poems Ibn Khafajä demonstrates a revolutionary attitude to language, using a vocabulary of great originality, and making a revolutionary change in diction and syntax alike. “Had these changes become a way of writing in al-Andalus, a genuinely Andalusí style would perhaps have been established.”

As an example of his original treatment of style, Jayyusi remarks that the poet “sometimes selects his vocabulary from a long-forgotten repertoire, or chooses rare plurals, or uses words in a novel way that arouses immediate surprise in the reader, sometimes coining them anew and using them with an intended meaning not generally used in Arabic.”

She also says: “A remarkable feature is his persistent capacity to transfer words between different semantic areas, [... He often, for example, borrows from the vocabulary of battle to describe other themes, or from the vocabulary of the human form to describe nature.” “He sometimes audaciously arranges his words to form phrases and sentences in a way unfamiliar in the syntax of the inherited poetry.” Her very useful article on Ibn Khafajä ends with a translation of Ibn Khafajä’s mountain poem by Magda al-Nowaihi and Christoper Middleton. Salma Jayyusi’s remarks are very pertinent and especially those who read Ibn Khafajä regularly will realize how true they are.

In his article (“Zajal and Muwashshahas: Hispano-Arabic Poetry and the Romance Tradition”; p. 398) James Monroe postulates that the zajal was earlier than the muwashshah genre, and that it was possibly of Iberian origin, especially in view of the impact of Iberian musical and poetic forms upon zajal and muwashshah. He also quotes the relevant passages from Ibn Bassam and Maimonides, which he cites as proof that the zajal came into existence earlier than the muwashshah. Monroe also assumes possible Iberian influence on Andalusian Arabic notions of courtly love. All the aspects which he deals with in this article are currently a source of great debate and disagreement in the scholarly world. In support of his views Monroe quotes (p. 412) an opinion that the philosopher and musician Ibn Baja (d. 533/1139) “combined the songs of the Christians with those of the East, thereby inventing a style found only in Andalus, toward which the temperament of its people inclined so that they rejected all others”. According to Monroe, this musical tradition, based largely on muwashshahas and zajals, has survived to the present day in North Africa. “We were able to affirm that the direction of the musical influence was from medieval Romance to Arabic music. Not only is there the sondeau melodic pattern used in North Africa of Romance origin, but the modern Andalusí tradition of Morocco exhibits a typically
European absence of the quarter-tones that characterise Eastern Arab music."

He goes on to describe the process that, in his view, gave rise to the zajal and its daughter, the muwashshah. According to Monroe, in the end, the kharja is the independent nucleus out of which the muwashshah was built.

Lois A. Giffen ("Ilm Ḥazm and the Ṭawq al-Ḥamāma"; p. 420) discusses the Ṭawq al-Ḥamāma by Ibn Ḥazm especially in the light of the many volumes of scholarly publications on the troubadours and courtly love, which try to find the origin of this courtly love in Arabic love poetry. She tries to elude the attitude of sceptics that is embodied in the maxim of the medieval scholastics, *De possibili ad esse nulla illatio* ("One may not infer that something exists from the mere possibility of its existence"), which was quoted by a modern scholar during a discussion where he demanded historical proof that troubadours had seen or heard and understood the actual texts of particular Arabic love poems or songs, and she gives some parallels between the themes of the Ṭawq and the troubadouresque courtly love.

The linguistic side of this group of articles is represented by F. Corriente ("Linguistic Interference Between Arabic and the Romance Languages of the Iberian Peninsula"; p. 443). While stating that Arabic has exerted a degree of influence upon Hispanic Romance languages he also says: "As for the converse phenomenon, i.e., the impact of Romance on the colloquial Arabic used by all segments of the population in al-Andalus regardless of their race, creed or social status, it was already posited by Simonet at the end of the last century, although, for obvious reasons, detailed accounts of relevant phonemic, morphological, syntactic and lexical interferences have not been available until more recent times." Moreover, according to Corriente, scholars in the past had the mistaken assumption that borrowing from Arabic into Romance took place directly from Classical Arabic and did not necessarily come via Andalusi Arabic.

The second linguistic article by Dieter Messner ("Further Listings and Categorisations of Arabic Words in Ibero-Romance Languages"; p. 452) deals with lexical borrowings from the Arabic into Romance.

Arabic influences on European Literatures is dealt with by Roger Boase ("Arab Influences on European Love-Poetry"; p. 457). In his article about Arabic influences on love poetry, Roger Boase declares that the question of "Andalusian influence" on the troubadours is far from answered. After having quoted the old negative views by Ernest Renan ("an abyss separates the form and the spirit of Romance poetry from the form and the spirit of Arabic poetry") and Reimard Dozy ("... A direct influence of Arabic poetry on Provençal poetry, [...] it has not been established and it will not be established") and also Stern's denial of any direct contact between the two poetries, Boase affirms his own opinion that courtly love may be defined as "a comprehensive cultural phenomenon... which arose in an aristocratic Christian environment exposed to Hispanic-Arabic influences". He then gives an overview of what he considers as being the essential features of this conception of courtly love (the beloved's sovereignty, the lover's fidelity and submission, secrecy, etc.). "With the exception of the analogy of feudalism", he says (p. 460), "all the main features which I have just mentioned are founded in the Arab poetic tradition of chaste love, al-hubb al-'udhari..." According to the author the tradition of chaste love was expressed in treatises such as Ibn Hazm's Ṭawq al-Ḥamāma. This tradition was imported into "southern France" by musicians, singing-girls, captives and slaves. The author argues against Peter Drönke's opinion that the parallels between Provençal and Arabic love-poetry are purely coincidental. At the end of his article, the author mentions some material about the evidence of cultural links between Christian Europe and Arab-Islamic civilization, and avenues of transmission within Muslim Spain and Sicily; he also mentions general themes and specific motifs in poetry. He enumerates a variety of slave-girls of Christian origin at Muslim courts and Muslim slave-girls who became lute playing singers and concubines at Christian courts. Then he provides examples from both Provençal poetry and Arabic poetry showing parallel themes such as the lover's attitude of submission, the precept of discretion, the concept of joy and the distinction between desire and ennobling passion. The author argues that his material should have been sufficient to demonstrate that the Provençal troubadours and European poets in general were influenced by Arabic poetry and treatises of love.

In her article, Maria Rosa Menocal ("Al-Andalus and 1492: The Ways of Remembering"; p. 483) calls for a new approach in the study of Muslim Spain in relation to other Iberian disciplines. Disciplines such as Romance, Hebrew and Arabic literature should not be studied in different departments of a university. She also suggests that the medieval world, which consisted of so many cultures and languages, was adapted to later more uniform nationalist tendencies in philology. I quote: "It is a cliché with considerable truth that the whole idea of the Renaissance, beginning with its very name, acquires meaning first of all through contra-distinction to a medieval past. [...] What the [...] muwashshahāt and the [...] prolific tradition of philosophical and scientific translation... also reveal, is a medieval past that is not dark, [...] What our histories have wanted is the post-1492 European ideal: a coherent narration [...] Indeed, what is thrown overboard in the neat narration of a pure past (...) was once said to be darkness, ignorance, superstition and chanting: [...]".

The article by Luce López Baralt ("The Legacy of Islam in Spanish Literature"; p. 505) gives some insight into the influence of Spain's Oriental on Spanish literature. The author says that in dealing with this subject in this article she is dealing only with the tip of the iceberg: exploring the full scope of the legacy of Islam in Spanish literature must of necessity be the task of future generations.


PHILOSOPHY is dealt with by Miguel Cruz Hernández ("Islamic Thought in the Iberian Peninsula"; Envelope Essay, p. 777), Jamal al-Din al-'Alawi ("The Philosophy of Ibn Rushd"; p. 804) and J.C. Bürgel ("Ibn Tufayl and his Hayy Ibn Yaqzan: A Turning Point in Arabic Philosophical Writing"; p. 830).

In the group of articles on RELIGIOUS STUDIES we find Dominique Urvoy's article on "The 'Ulama' of al-Andalus" [p. 849], Manuela Maria's on "Muslim Religious Practices in al-Andalus (2nd/8th-4th/10th Centuries)" [p. 878], Maria Isabel Fierro's on "Heresy in al-Andalus" [p. 895], and Claude Addas's "Andalusi Mysticism and the Rise of Ibn 'Arabi" [p. 909].

The section entitled SCIENCE, TECHNOLOGY AND AGRICULTURE consists of the following articles: "Natural and Technical Sciences in al-Andalus" by J. Vernet [p. 937]; "The Exact Sciences in al-Andalus" by Julio Samsó [p. 952]; "Hydraulic Technology in al-Andalus" by Thomas F. Glick [p. 974]; "Agriculture in Muslim Spain" by Expiracion Garcia Sanchez [p. 987]; "The Use of Plants for Dyeing and Clothing" by Lucie Bolens [p. 1000]; "The Hispano-Arab Garden: Notes towards a Typology" by James Dickie [p. 1016]; and "The Translating Activity in Medieval Spain" by Charles Burnett [p. 1036].

The book as a whole concludes with a closure article by the hand of Margarita Lopez Gomez ("Islamic Civilisation in al-Andalus: A Final Assessment"; p. 1059); Biographies of the Contributors [p. 1063]; an Index [p. 1074]; and Maps by Jezus Zanon [p. 1099].

It should by now be clear that I could not discuss all the articles. However, the bulk of the articles give a good and balanced survey of the present state of research. In this connection I would like to mention the above mentioned article by Raymond Scheindlin on the Jews in Muslim Spain, which also deals with the presence of Judeo-Arabic culture in medieval Christian Spain and the article on translation by Charles Burnett. The book will be useful for the coming decennia, although since the scarcity of data, Rachel Arié is able to extract valuable material from the legal works, historical descriptions and sources and the biographies of some of the poetesses.

Maliki jurisprudence, which dominated al-Andalus, placed women and men on an equal level in the fields of ethics and religion; women were, however, inferior to men in the political and legal domains. This inferiority was confirmed by the Koran, the penal code, matrimonial law and the complex hereditary law. There is a discussion of the marriage ceremony, as well as visits by women to the public bathhouses and to the cemeteries, the great religious feasts and the vintage feasts. As far as the professions are concerned, women worked as milk merchants, embroiderers, weavers, and in the less favoured classed as servants, singers and prostitutes called khardjiyydt [i.e. involved in the tax called kharaj] in brothels called kharaj-houses or girls' houses.