
Schleifer, P.

Published in:
Global Environmental Politics

DOI:
10.1162/GLEP_r_00407

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

UvA-DARE is a service provided by the library of the University of Amsterdam (http://dare.uva.nl)
seen, for example, in the reports on mitigation from the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC).

Its shortcomings aside, this book offers a comprehensive and compelling account of the politics of carbon trading, calculation, and accounting. It should be widely read, not least by environmental economists and decision-makers in government. The only fear is that those who would benefit the most from reflecting on its insights and policy implications would prefer to continue developing their models and policies without taking into account the worrying politics of carbon measurement and commodification.


Reviewed by Philip Schleifer
University of Amsterdam

The Oil Palm Complex offers a fascinating and detailed analysis of the oil palm boom in Indonesia and Malaysia, one of the largest agricultural expansions in recent history. Since 1975 the amount of land under oil palm in the two countries has grown from about 500,000 hectares to over 14 million hectares. The book traces the drivers and socio-economic outcomes of this process, as part of a multiyear research project. The central questions asked by Cramb and McCarthy, using a political-economy approach, are: Who benefits and who loses from the oil palm boom? And can oil palm development provide a basis for inclusive and sustainable rural development?

The authors find the answer to these questions in analyzing what they refer to as the “complexation” of the industry, which “skews the allocation of resources and distribution of benefits in favor of a powerful cross-country coalition of political, bureaucratic, and agribusiness interests” (p. 443). The conclusion they draw is that the oil palm boom has not contributed to inclusive and sustainable development in the two countries. On the contrary, this boom has been driven by an intraregional state-industrial complex that puts corporate profits before people and the environment. At the same time, however, the authors contend that oil palm is not an “evil crop.” Its cultivation supports the livelihoods of a growing number of smallholders, and Cramb and McCarthy argue that giving these people access to technology, resources, and inputs is important to make this a developmental success story.

In much detail, the contributors to this volume—including scholars, government officials, and activists—trace the politics and evolution of the oil palm complex. Following the introductory chapter and a conceptual chapter, the first part of the book examines the different modes of oil palm production in Indonesia and Malaysia. The chapters describe a “capitalist convergence” toward large, privately owned oil palm estates. A central argument is that the estate
mode is not per se more productive or efficient than smallholder farming. However, it delivers the highest returns on corporate investments. The chapters show how national and local governments played a leading role in driving this process by freeing up native land to attract big agribusiness corporations.

The second part of the book examines the various conflicts surrounding the industry. An important insight is that local farmers typically do not oppose capitalist oil palm expansion as such. Instead, most conflicts are distributional in nature, involving struggles over land use and profits between corporations, local communities, and migrant workers.

The final part of the book offers a detailed analysis of the political economy of labor that underpins the oil palm complex. It describes the strategy of agribusinesses and state actors to create a situation of labor oversupply through actively and passively supporting transmigration. This has the dual effect of undermining the power of local communities and creating a highly dependent and cheap labor force for the oil palm estates.

The Oil Palm Complex offers a rich analysis of these regional and local processes and how they interact in producing political settlements and socioeconomic outcomes. This is the key strength of the book, but also one of its limitations. Adopting a regional lens means that important global developments remain somewhat under the radar. Some of these issues are addressed in a chapter on the Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil, a transnational private regulatory initiative. However, key trends such as the booming demand for palm oil from China and India and the emerging hybrid regulatory regime in the European Union, another major importer of palm oil, are only mentioned at the margins. These developments in the global political economy of palm oil have important implications for producer countries—for example, as external drivers of social and environmental conditions in the industry. Addressing these issues more fully would have made the analysis more complete.

A second limitation of the book is that it largely neglects the environmental dimension of the oil palm boom. While the authors recognize the importance of the issue, a more thorough analysis is missing. The rapid expansion of oil palm plantations in Southeast Asia has gone hand in hand with the large-scale transformation and destruction of the natural environment. Processes like tropical deforestation and the draining of peatlands are closely intertwined with other factors analyzed in this volume. Environmentally degraded landscapes undermine the traditional livelihood strategies of local communities and become the source of conflicts, with important regional and global repercussions, as witnessed during the 2015 Southeast Asian haze. The environment is a key factor in the political economy of palm oil—shaping the interests and interactions of agribusiness corporations, domestic and foreign governments, native communities, and international and local NGOs. Unfortunately, this aspect of the oil palm complex and its politics remains mostly unaddressed.

These shortcomings do not diminish the value of this empirically rich and well-written volume. Cramb, McCarthy, and their contributors provide a

*The Green State in Africa* is a finely wrought study of the social, political, economic, and environmental effects of the green-state discourse and practice on the constitution of African states and societies. In Death’s words: “The green state in Africa is the effect of an assemblage of environmental rationalities, discourses, and technologies of government through which territories, populations, economies, and international relations have been brought within the scope of sedimented power relations” (pp. 15–16). This is a marvelous book, a must-read for anyone interested in global environmental governance, African political economy, state theory, and the intersections of the three. It is densely theoretical yet elegant in delivery and eminently readable. It is broad in scope but fine in detail. Its text is complemented by a series of photographs, each of which perfectly captures the mood of the particular chapters in which it appears. Trenchant epigrams set the tone for ensuing chapter-specific arguments. It has an extensive bibliography and, importantly, a detailed index, which seems to be something of a lost art these days.

The study is anchored by the interweaving of six key themes. First, the state is not a thing, but rather, following Foucault, a social form that “should be studied as an assemblage of practices, technologies and discourses” (p. 56). Second, the “green state” is not a particular “stage” of development, but rather a “changing assemblage of practices, technologies and discourses” (p. 63). Third, environmental politics constitutes the state in Africa in quite a different way than in the rest of the world. Fourth, there is a great deal of agency amid persistent structure, and this agency plays out unevenly across African states and societies. Fifth, there are winners and losers in African environmental politics, so change on behalf of those (people and the natural environment) that are most vulnerable is part of a (social/political/economic/ecological) struggle, not a deliberate outcome of techniques of management. Sixth, there is a great deal to be learned about the state in general, and the “green state” in particular, from African places and cases.

At the heart of the study is a normative agenda: in exploding a number of myths—among them, the unproblematic homogeneity of global environmental governance, green states, the African state, African unity, and the causes of African underdevelopment—Death aims to reveal the winners and losers in African environmental politics, highlighting the limited but very real ways in which the most vulnerable are able to exercise agency (by challenging,