UNIVERSITY OF AMSTERDAM

UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Critical realism and housing studies: An explanation for diverging housing solutions.

Lawson, J.M.

Publication date
2003

Link to publication

Citation for published version (APA):
Lawson, J. M. (2003). *Critical realism and housing studies: An explanation for diverging housing solutions.* [Thesis, fully internal, AME]. AME, Universiteit van Amsterdam.

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, P.O. Box 19185, 1000 GD Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

UvA-DARE is a service provided by the library of the University of Amsterdam (https://dare.uva.nl)

Download date:10 Oct 2026

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS v

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION 1

1.1. WHAT'S SO SPECIAL ABOUT HOUSING? 1
1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT 2
1.2.1 'Truth', plausible explanation and utility 3
1.2.2 Generalisation and abstraction 4
1.3 KEY DEBATES AND SOURCES OF INSPIRATION 5
1.4 STRUCTURE OF THIS BOOK 7
1.4.1 Part 1- Ontology, Methodology and Conceptual Issues 7
1.4.2 Part 2 - Divergent Housing Solutions - The case study evidence 8
1.4.3 Part 3 - Analysis, Insights and Implications 8

PART ONE 9

CHAPTER 2 ONTOLOGY MATTERS 11

2.1 INTRODUCTION 11
2.2 ONTOLOGY AS THE BASIS OF PERCEPTION 12
2.2.1 Ontological Differences 12
2.2.2 The Problems with Positivist and the Potential of Constructivist Approaches 13
2.3 INTRODUCING CRITICAL REALISM AS AN ALTERNATIVE TO POSITIVISM AND INTERPRETIVISM 16
2.3.1 Difference and Change in Housing Systems 18
2.4 METHODOLOGICAL STRATEGIES FOR REALIST RESEARCH 19

CHAPTER 3 METHODOLOGY AND COMPARATIVE RESEARCH 21

3.1 INTRODUCTION 21
3.2 CONCEPTUALISING HOUSING SOLUTIONS 23
3.2.1 The Prospects and Limitations of the Structure of Housing Provision approach 24
3.3 REALIST CONCEPTS - AN INTRODUCTION 25
3.3.1 Necessary and Contingent relations 25
3.3.2 Clusters of Causal Mechanisms 27
3.3.3 Postulating Causal Mechanisms – the Process of Abduction and Retroduction 27
3.4 RISK AND THE ORGANISATION OF TRUST 29
3.4.1 The use of Risk in Housing Studies 29
3.4.2 The Preferred Concept of Risk 35
3.5 THE CONCEPTS APPLIED TO HOUSING SOLUTIONS 36
3.5.1 Social Relations in the Housing Solution 36
3.6. COMPARING HOUSING SOLUTIONS 40
3.6.1 The Level of Comparison 40
3.6.2 The Problem of Time and Space 40
3.6.3 Comparing Two Housing Solutions – The Netherlands and Australia 41

CHAPTER 4 ALTERNATIVE THEORIES FOR THE COMPOSITION AND DYNAMICS OF HOUSING PROVISION 45

4.1 INTRODUCTION 45
4.2 COMPETING HOUSING ONTOLOGIES 45
4.2.1 Summary of Ontological Alternatives for Perceiving Forms of Housing Provision 48
4.2.2 A Critical Review of Ontological Alternatives 50
4.3 WHY DO HOUSING SYSTEMS CHANGE? 52
4.3.1 Competing Notions of Causality in Forms of Housing Provision 53
4.3.2 Summary of Alternatives for Perceiving Causality in Housing Provision 57
4.3.3 A critical review of causal explanatory approaches 59

CHAPTER 5 POSTULATING AN EXPLANATION FOR HOUSING DIVERGENCE 61

5.1 INTRODUCTION 61
5.2 PROPOSED HOUSING ONTOLOGY AND DEFINITION OF CONCEPTS 61
5.2.1 Necessary Relations 62
5.2.2 Property Rights and the Exploitation of land and buildings 63
5.2.3 Savings, Borrowings and the Circulation of Investment in Housing 66
5.2.4 Labour, Welfare and Housing Consumption 72
5.3 EMERGENT PROPERTIES OF NECESSARY RELATIONS 74
5.4 CONTINGENCY IN HOUSING PROVISION 76
5.5 AGENCY AND THE CONCEPT OF RISK 81
5.6 TRUST AND EMBEDDEDNESS 82
5.7 THE ROLE OF THE STATE, STRUCTURAL COHERENCE, PATH DEPENDENCY AND INSTITUTIONAL 'FIX' 83
5.8 DEFINING CRISIS 85
5.9 DEFINING PERIODS FOR ANALYSIS 86
5.10 CONCLUDING STATEMENT 87

PART TWO 89

CHAPTER 6 EXPLAINING DIVERGENT TENURE PATTERNS AND URBAN FORM– THE AUSTRALIAN CASE OF LOW DENSITY HOME OWNERSHIP 91

6.1 INTRODUCTION 91
6.2 OBSERVABLE OUTCOMES OF THE AUSTRALIAN HOUSING SOLUTION 91
6.3 BEYOND OUTCOMES - EXPLAINING THE CORE OF THE AUSTRALIAN SOLUTION 94
6.3.1 Existing Explanations for the Australian Housing Solution 94
6.4 POSTULATED MODEL OF CAUSAL MECHANISMS 96
6.4.1 Defining phases for analysis 97
6.4.2 Theorising the role of the state in the Australian housing solution 100
6.5 ANALYSIS AND CONTRAST OF DIFFERENT PHASES IN THE AUSTRALIAN HOUSING SOLUTION 102
6.5.1 Emergence and Establishment 1840-1906 103
6.5.2 Establishment and Acceleration 1907-1970 110
6.5.3 An Intermediate Period of Deceleration and Differentiation 1971- 1985 117
6.5.4 Dismantling and Reconfiguration 1986-2000 122
6. 6 ABSTRACTING THE CAUSAL MECHANISMS 130
6.6.1 Abstraction using relevant concepts and ideas 130
6.6.2 Retroductive analysis of the Australian housing solution 132

CHAPTER 7 EXPLAINING DIVERGENT TENURE PATTERNS AND URBAN FORM– THE DUTCH CASE OF COMPACT SOCIAL HOUSING PROVISION 137

7.1 INTRODUCTION 137
7.2 OBSERVABLE OUTCOMES OF THE DUTCH HOUSING SOLUTION 138
7.3 BEYOND OUTCOMES – EXPLAINING THE CORE OF THE DUTCH HOUSING SOLUTION 139
7.3.1 Existing Explanations for the Dutch Housing Solution 140
7.3.2 A Critical Evaluation of Explanatory Progress 149
7.3.3 A Possible Explanation for Progress in Dutch Housing Studies 150
7.4 POSTULATING A MODEL OF CAUSALITY IN DUTCH HOUSING PROVISION 151
7.4.1 Defining Periods for Analysis 151
7.4.2 Theorising the role of the state in the Dutch housing solution 156
7.5 ANALYSIS AND CONTRAST OF DIFFERENT PHASES IN THE DUTCH HOUSING SOLUTION 160
7.5.1 Housing relations under conditions of economic liberalism 1848-1889 161
7.5.2. The First Unsteady Foundations of the Dutch Solution: 1890-1933 166
7.5.3 Recovery and Acceleration of the Dutch Solution 1934-1983 175
7.5.4 Securing 'independent' relations for land development, finance and individualisation 1984-2000. 184
7.6 ABSTRACTING THE CAUSAL MECHANISMS 194
7.6.1 Abstraction using relevant concepts and ideas 194
7.6.2 Retroductive analysis of the Dutch housing solution 196

PART THREE 203

CHAPTER 8 EXPLAINING AND COMPARING HOUSING 'SOLUTIONS' - SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS 205

8.1 INTRODUCTION 205
8.2 CONCEPTUALISING DIFFERENT FORMS OF PROVISION: CORE RELATIONS AND INTERDEPENDENCIES 206
8.3 PATH DEPENDENCY AND CUMULATIVE CAUSATION 207
8.4 CONTINGENCY AND THE NOTION OF RISK 208
8.5 EXPLAINING DIVERGENCE: COMPARING CAUSAL MECHANISMS 209
8.5.1 Why did social housing not emerge as the solution in the late colonial period and why did home ownership not emerge as the solution in the urbanisation of Dutch cities? 210
8.5.2 Why was mortgage finance channelled via state savings banks and households in Australia and central government and associations in the Netherlands? 212
8.5.3 Why did Australian households express their wealth and status via home purchase in the 1950s and 1960s, whilst Dutch households did not? 214
3.4 Why did state support for home purchase decline in Australia and increase in the Netherlands during the 1990s? 216
8.6 FUTURE HOUSING SCENARIOS AND THE DISTRIBUTION OF RISKS ACROSS THE HOUSING SYSTEM 219

REFERENCES 223

APPENDICES

Appendix 1 Ambrose' State Market Citizen relations and the Chain of Provision (1991, 1994) 243
Appendix 1 (a) Ambrose' Chain of Provision (1991, 1994) 245
Appendix 1 (b) Doling's (1997) elaboration of Ambrose' Chain of Provision 246
Appendix 2 State interventions in consumption and production of housing (Lundqvist, 1992) 247
Appendix 3 Structures of Housing Provision (Ball, 1998, 1992, 1983, Ball, Harloe and Martens, 1988) 248
Appendix 4 Explanatory themes and ontological approaches 249
Appendix 5 Illustrative example of private property relations 255
Appendix 6 Illustrative example of New Urban Development 257
Appendix 7 Explanatory themes and ontological approaches 258
Appendix 8 The Brutering Agreement 260
Appendix 9 Guarantee Fund for Social Housing and Central Social Housing Fund 262