UNIVERSITY OF AMSTERDAM

UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Critical realism and housing studies: An explanation for diverging housing solutions.

Lawson, J.M.

Publication date
2003

Link to publication

Citation for published version (APA):
Lawson, J. M. (2003). *Critical realism and housing studies: An explanation for diverging housing solutions.* [Thesis, fully internal, AME]. AME, Universiteit van Amsterdam.

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, P.O. Box 19185, 1000 GD Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

UvA-DARE is a service provided by the library of the University of Amsterdam (https://dare.uva.nl)

Download date:10 Oct 2026

Appendix 4 Explanatory themes and ontological approaches

Urban development and housing tenure is primarily an outcome of shifts in the mode of production

Key proponent(s)	*Approach*	*Explanatory model proposed*	**Data presented**
Berry (1998)	• Urban development and housing forms are perceived as an outcome of shifts in the organizational base and technological form of industrial development. Berry incorporates concepts from French Regulation theory and Harvey's (1989) work on the structured coherence of urban spatial forms under different conditions of production, reproduction and consumption.	• The Australian solution of home ownership has exhibited a number of phases: stabilization at the turn of the 19th century, intensification until the 1970s and uncertainty in the 1990s. These phases are related to the mode of industrial and technological development, mediated by the role of the state and culturally embedded aspirations and demographic changes. The most recent transition, to a post Keynesian city, has emerged with the deregulation of the financial and industrial relations system and a retreat of the welfare state. This has lead to increasing economic inequality, employment insecurity, privatised forms of social welfare which have polarized access to ownership,	• To illustrate his arguments, Berry provides a selection history of the changing nature of industrial development, also demonstrating the limited availability of housing options over time, and the status differentials reinforcing ownership. The decentralisation of industry and retail developments reinforced urban expansion. Further the gradients of land prices,, structure of the building industry, and the system of credit provision have also influence patterns of production and consumption. He reviews recent trends indicating the demise of home ownership as a broad based housing solution.
Daly (1988)	• Urban development is an uneven unpredictable outcome of irregular capitalist development and resultant social problems. Extends and applies Berry (1983)	• Stresses the importance of early struggles over property ownership of housing and land. Home ownership consumption later became an important tool of Keynesian economic policy. Favourable wages, working conditions and rising property values, materially underpinned and bolstered this pattern of consumption. This pattern of consumption was drastically undermined by changes in the world economy.	• Strategic, long-term analysis of the key relations underpinning patterns of housing consumption and urban development: property rights, financial investment, and wage and conditions.
Berry (1983)	• Marxist informed framework for strategic analysis of Australian urban development, examining the movement of capital and labour over time and space.	• Postulates four stages of expansion and decline in Australian capital accumulation: colonial (1788-1847), commercial (1848-1893), industrial (1894-1939) and corporate (1930-present), each influencing patterns of urbanization, conditioned by constraints posed by international economic integration. Each phase and form has been subject to crises and contradiction tendencies and responded by re-establishing structural solutions in the form new stages of accumulation.	• Examines the spatial consequences of each stage of capitalist development in Australian cities, taking into account the complex role of state relations, international economic conditions and trading relations, industrial developments, flows of investment and labour, differentiation of economic activity, stratification of social classes, division of labour, relations of dependence and dominance of certain industries, technological developments.
Mullins (1981)	• Theory testing research, analysing the influence of different modes of capitalist production (mercantile/ monopoly modes) upon forms of residential life.	• Residential life was, until the 1940s, influenced by the mode of capitalist development. Australian workers under mercantile capitalism were reproduced under relations of urban peasantry (self help), whilst monopoly capitalist cities centred on suburban consumerism.	• Compares mercantile and corporate capitalist cities forms and material services. Examines urban development between 1880 and 1940, with particular emphasis upon the material provision of urban sewerage infrastructure.

Housing provision as a dynamic outcome of social relations in a contingent context

Key proponent(s)	*Approach*	*Explanatory model proposed*	*Data presented*
Bourassa, Greig, Troy (1995)	• Examine the influences affecting the rate of home ownership, beyond the government to wider social and economic changes.	• Home ownership rates have not increased above 70% despite government policies to promote this tenure and under development of alternatives. Significant economic factors such as high interest rates, changes in housing prices and stagnating wages, have made ownership less accessible for first homebuyers. Other factors such as immigration, an aging population, postponed marriages and increased divorce rates have also influenced the rate of home ownership.	• Provide a history of home ownership and alternative tenure developments; examine the role of governments, the type of policies introduced, and the impact on housing affordability. Introduce a number of additional factors influencing affordability, namely: immigration, household formation and unemployment.
Hayward (1992)	• Applies Ball's (1988) analysis of the social relations of housing production, distribution and consumption. Identifies agents involved, the relations between them and their particular historical-institutional form.	• Reveals how the system of housing provision, once dominated by builder/landlords and wealthy home owners, moved towards speculative building and then to a more competitive mass-market system for providing mass home ownership.	• Strategic compilation and analysis of land ownership, building construction, financing agents and sources from the 1880s to late 1980s.
Burke and Hayward (1990)	• Forecast of future housing scenarios based on a defined analytical framework: housing outcomes perceived as path dependent, subject to demographic changes, the policy and economic environment and the capacity of the existing system of housing provision to respond.	• Pattern of future development will take the form of low-density development on the urban fringe, the emergence of urban wastelands (without adequate government response) with under provided infrastructure, employment opportunities and community facilities. Choice for young households: accessibility to urban resources or cheap housing.	• Empirically examines all aspects of the postulated model: incomes, employment, economic growth, industrial restructuring, fiscal and monetary policy; population growth, household change, and residential differentiation; instability in the housing sector, lack of innovation; under provision of infrastructure, constrained capital funding, land speculation, house price differentiation, polarisation of incomes and housing outcomes, rental tenancy, and the policy environment.
Williams (1984)	• Homeownership is not a function of capitalist relations, but a contradictory outcome of struggles over domestic property rights.	• The Australian state has played a continuous role in the operations of the housing market, with home ownership receiving early cross political support during boom, bust and crises. Alternatives to home ownership, such as public housing and private rental have been under developed due to the complex architecture of the state and lack of political constituency.	• Historical analyses, focusing on the housing related discourse of election campaigns and political parties.
Burnley (1980)	• Emphasises interdependence and openness of urban systems and importance of historical factors in urban growth and social structures. Conceptual model analyses shifting modes of production and technological change as the independent variables, linked to demographic change, social stratification and organisation, existing built forms and social pathologies.	• The distinctive pattern of Australian cities is a consequence of Western capitalist growth, accentuating metropolitan primacy, rapid urbanisation and social stratification of housing stock. Governments have been most active in this regard providing infrastructure, promoting immigration and land settlement.	• Examines main factors in 19C urbanisation between 1800 and 1850, 1860 and 1900 as well s demographic patterns until 1914.

Significant relations underpinning the Australian housing solution

Key proponent(s)	*Approach*	*Explanatory model proposed*	*Data presented*
Castles (1997, 1997a)	• Considers the role home ownership plays in providing horizontal, life cycle social security and influencing national systems of welfare and levels of expenditure on pensions.	• Drawing upon international comparisons of welfare systems and tenure, Castles argues the high rates of home ownership are incompatible with high levels of contributory finding for social security. Outright home ownership provides a form of social security that necessitates lower pension payments. However, access to ownership is unevenly and inequitably distributed. Minimal, universal payments are inadequate for households in other tenures, still paying rents in old age.	• Reviews the history of home ownership in Australia, taking into account the relative affluence of workers at the turn of the century and limited interruption to supply during both World Wars. Examines the electoral appeal of home ownership, leading to its promotion by across the political spectrum and current threats to accessibility: high interest, unemployment, and rapidly increasing house prices. Draws upon the Luxembourg Incomes Study, comparing welfare systems, payments and housing tenures.
Frost & Dingle (1995)	• Examine the role of technological development, public and private investment in house construction and infrastructure provision upon the growth of Australian cities.	• The transmission and adoption of innovation in the 19th century influence the growth of cities. This was facilitated by the role of the state in providing infrastructure where investment was considered too risky and unprofitable for the private sector. These investments, in power, transport, irrigation, sewerage and water supply, underpinned private sector growth in the rural, construction and manufacturing sectors.	• Provide a number of examples that illustrate the relationship between technology and urban development.
King (1986)	• Emphasises the importance of analysing switches in finance capital between investments, including forms of property development and the role of state in sheltering this investment and urban planning in maximising monopoly rent by differentiating housing markets.	• During the 1950s and 1960s housing related monetary and fiscal policy ensured extraction of absolute or ground rent from housing investments. The breakdown of mechanism underpinning the housing boom has necessitated the role of urban planning in protecting and differentiating property values, with regressive equity effects.	• Focuses upon the rise in home ownership investment, linked to suburban expansion. Examines the role of public policy in reinforcing differentiated housing markets and the switching of finance capital across different sectors of the built environment.

Arguments about the role of the state in housing promotion

Key proponent(s)	Approach	Explanatory model proposed	Data presented
Dalton (1999)	• Historical, state centred analysis of the housing policy process. The state is considered to be a complex institutional structure of agencies, selectively contingent on the social and economic relations of the forms of capitalism with which it is located.	• Examines four policy regimes: regional state regime mid 1800 to 1930; the central state regime of the 1930s to the 1970s, the regional state regime as the central state withdraws from the mid 1980 to the 1990s and finally, the complete abrogation of the state regime since 1994, as the state withdraws form housing policy at both the regional and central levels.	• Analyses the history of the state's involvement in home ownership through detailed policy and administrative historical research, drawing upon a range of documentary sources and interview material revealing the formal and informal processes and influences upon of decision and non-decision making concerning housing policy.
Kemeny, (1983) See also Hayward (1992) and Troy, (1990).	• Emphasises the ideological and political underpinning of home ownership. Critical analysis of the role of the state in promotion of certain tenure forms.	• Ideological and actual dominance of home ownership in Australia is a consequence of targeted state support and promotion. This has led to highly privatised urban structures, a home-centred life style and underdevelopment of more collective forms of welfare and housing tenure.	• Home ownership rates would have declined 'naturally' without government support. Home ownership has stifled more collective forms of social welfare.

Key proponent(s)	Approach	Explanatory model proposed	Data presented
Yates (1997)	• Examines shifting role of the state towards different tenures and social groups, and the distribution of risk from society to individual households.	• Highlights the introduction of rental assistance, considered to be a u-turn in government policy, which comes at the expense of support for public housing. Argues that risks of unemployment, higher interest rates, stagnant price inflation are concentrated amongst those at the margin of home purchase.	• Summarises housing policies, categorised as explicit and implicit support for home ownership and those concerning public and private rental tenures. Examines the equality of treatment of across tenure forms over three different periods: pre 1978, post 1978 and post 1986.
Troy (1990)	• Thematic historical account of housing policy process in one State, New South Wales.	• Housing policy development is irregular and a product of political pragmatism. Property ownership reinforced notions of citizenship a route to working class emancipation. State Banks promoted access via the credit foncier loan instrument.	• Reviews development of NSW housing policy between 1901 and 1941. Provides a detailed administrative history of housing initiatives and failures.
Stretton (1978)	• Broad access to home ownership is threatened by external economic conditions. Normative analysis of implications for low to middle income households, critique of current policy and feasibility of alternatives.	• The success of housing policy is dependent upon dynamic economic and financial conditions. State policy is constrained by electoral politics, institutional capacity and image, and divided supported amongst political parties in different States.	• Focuses upon the accessibility of home ownership under changing economic conditions and policies.
Sandercock (1975)	• Structured, normative critique of urban planning and development in Australia. Conceives the city as a mechanism for distributing resources, yet broader theory is not articulated.	• Explanations can be found in the formal and informal power of agents in the urban development process to influence property relations. Throughout most of Australia's European history this has rested with landowners and more recently urban planners. Dominant, pro-growth ideologies have at times, unified industry with state interests.	• Presents illustrative examples of the policy making process, providing evidence of formal and informal decision making processes.
Jones (1972)	• Descriptive, normative critique of the role of government assistance for housing lower income households.	• Explanation emphasises electoral and fiscal rationale for political actions. Governments chose policy options with limited risk to their power base and financial resources.	• Presents evidences of the dominant ideas and ideologies of different political parties through parliamentary speech notes and government reports. Provides a scattering of descriptive information on the outcomes of government policy.
Stretton (1970)	• Descriptive, normative critique set in historical context of uneven city development. No clear ontology of housing provision or urban development, application or testing of theory.	• Provides a number of fragmented explanations for role of the state in facilitating urban development, such as extreme emphasis by the middle classes on private life, private homes and gardens, and inviolable property rights; secure social segregation and a restrained public culture; limited expectations of public life; lack of will and skills in state and local administration; and, comprehensive distrust of government, political power of public sector workers.	• Chronology of events in city development and administration of planning policy.

Description reveals the process

Key proponent	Approach	Explanatory model proposed	Data presented
Pugh (1976)	• Housing provision is complex and occurs in an open, contingent laden environment. Does not articulate key or contingent relations influencing housing provision.	• Housing policy is a response to vexatious housing conditions and problems affecting the community.	• Chronology of housing events, providing examples of reactive policy making.
Bunker (1988)	• Descriptive study of urban development patterns, which covers demographic trends, population mobility and policies promoting certain forms of urban development.	• Urban sprawl is an aggregate of short outward moves, from the dominant central city, regulated by plans producing monotonous, jobless cities, dependent on private transport.	• Bunker describes various demographic trends, movements, and related policies.
Neutze (1981)	• Descriptive, empirical study of urban development in Australia.	• Contends that urban development is a consequence of market, administrative and political influences, of which the state plays and integral role. Emphasises the importance of transport technology and state infrastructure provision in urban development.	• Extensive use of quantitative data, again various demographic trends, movements, and related policies