



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

Copyright, Limitations and the Three-step test. An Analysis of the Three-Step Test in International and EC Copyright Law

Senftleben, M.R.F.

Publication date
2004

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Senftleben, M. R. F. (2004). *Copyright, Limitations and the Three-step test. An Analysis of the Three-Step Test in International and EC Copyright Law*. [Thesis, fully internal, Universiteit van Amsterdam]. Kluwer Law International.

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

CONTENTS

FOREWORD	vii
CONTENTS	ix
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xiii
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER 2: THE THREE-STEP TEST WITHIN THE COPYRIGHT SYSTEM	5
2.1 Rationales of Copyright Protection	6
2.1.1 The Historical Interplay of Natural Law and Utilitarian Notions	7
2.1.2 The Labourer's Claim and the Entitlement of the Public	10
2.1.3 The Cultural Rationale as the Essential Foundation of Copyright	17
2.2 Justifications for Copyright Limitations	22
2.2.1 Freedom of Expression and Information	24
2.2.2 The Dissemination of Information	30
2.2.3 The Right to Privacy	32
2.2.4 The Enhancement of Democracy	33
2.3 Copyright's Delicate Balance	34
CHAPTER 3: THE CONTEXTUAL BACKGROUND TO THE THREE-STEP TEST	43
3.1 The Berne Convention	43
3.1.1 The 'Minor Reservations Doctrine' as a Precursor	45
3.1.2 The Introduction of the Test at the 1967 Stockholm Conference	47
3.1.3 National Limitations at the Time of the Stockholm Conference	52
3.1.3.1 The Federal Republic of Germany	53
3.1.3.2 The Netherlands	58
3.1.3.3 France	63
3.1.3.4 The United Kingdom	67
3.1.3.5 India	75
3.1.4 The Dualism Inherent in the Three-Step Test	81
3.2 The TRIPs Agreement	83
3.2.1 The Double Insertion of the Three-Step Test	84
3.2.2 Article 13 TRIPs as a Berne-Plus Element	87
3.3 The WIPO 'Internet' Treaties	91
3.3.1 Previous Discussions Based on the Three-Step Test	92
3.3.2 The Debate at the 1996 WIPO Conference	96

CONTENTS

CHAPTER 4:	THE INTERPRETATION OF THE THREE CRITERIA	99
4.1	Principles of Interpretation	99
4.1.1	The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	99
4.1.2	The Material Available for Interpretation	104
4.1.2.1	The Wording of the Three-Step Test	105
4.1.2.2	The Context Surrounding the Three-Step Test	105
4.1.2.3	The Role of WTO Panel Reports	107
4.1.2.4	The Interconnection of Supplementary Sources	110
4.1.2.5	The US Fair Use Doctrine	112
4.1.2.6	The Language Situation	113
4.1.3	The Circle of Relevant Limitations	115
4.2	Two Different Functions	118
4.2.1	Controlling Limitations Directly	118
4.2.2	Serving as an Additional Safeguard	121
4.3	The System of the Three Criteria	125
4.3.1	The Basic Rule	126
4.3.2	The Two Conditions	127
4.3.3	Overview of the Regulatory Framework	131
4.4	Certain Special Cases	133
4.4.1	Certainty	133
4.4.2	Speciality	137
4.4.2.1	Assessing Quantitative and Qualitative Considerations	138
4.4.2.2	Rejecting the Quantitative Concept of the WTO Panel	140
4.4.2.3	Bringing Qualitative Considerations into Focus	144
4.4.2.4	Defining a Special Case	152
4.4.2.5	Clarifying the Interplay with the Third Criterion	152
4.4.3	The Impact on Internationally Recognised Limitations	153
4.4.4	The Impact on Remaining National Limitations	157
4.4.4.1	Personal and Internal Use	158
4.4.4.2	Fair Use	162
4.5	Conflict with a Normal Exploitation	168
4.5.1	The Historical Approach of Bornkamm	169
4.5.2	The Empirical Approach of Ricketson	171
4.5.3	The Development of a Normative Concept	177
4.5.3.1	The Guideline Given at the Stockholm Conference	177
4.5.3.2	Adapting the Guideline to the Digital Environment	180
4.5.3.3	Bringing the Economic Core of Copyright into Focus	184
4.5.3.4	Determining the Correct Reference Point	189
4.5.3.5	Defining a Conflict with a Normal Exploitation	193
4.5.4	The Impact on Internationally Recognised Limitations	194
4.5.4.1	Criticism and Parody	194
4.5.4.2	Utilisation for Teaching	197

CONTENTS

4.5.4.3	The 'Minor Reservations Doctrine'	198
4.5.4.4	Compulsory Broadcasting Licences	201
4.5.5	The Impact on Remaining National Limitations	202
4.5.5.1	Strictly Personal Use	203
4.5.5.2	Libraries	206
4.6	Unreasonable Prejudice to Legitimate Interests	210
4.6.1	The Reference to Interests Instead of Rights	213
4.6.2	Economic Interests	216
4.6.3	Non-Economic Interests	219
4.6.3.1	Article 9(2) BC and Article 10 WCT	221
4.6.3.2	Article 13 TRIPs	223
4.6.4	The Proportionality Test	226
4.6.4.1	Identifying Legitimate Interests	227
4.6.4.2	Avoiding an Unreasonable Prejudice	235
4.6.5	The Impact on Internationally Recognised Limitations	241
4.6.6	The System of the Three Criteria Revisited	243
CHAPTER 5: THE THREE-STEP TEST IN THE EUROPEAN COPYRIGHT DIRECTIVE		245
5.1	The Contextual Background	246
5.1.1	The Drafting History of Article 5(5) CD	246
5.1.2	The Framework Set Out for Limitations	250
5.1.3	The Objectives Underlying the Directive	253
5.2	The Function of Article 5(5) CD	255
5.3	The Impact on the List of Permissible Limitations	257
5.3.1	Certain Special Cases	257
5.3.1.1	Speciality	258
5.3.1.2	No Need for Further Specification	264
5.3.2	Conflict with a Normal Exploitation	268
5.3.3	Unreasonable Prejudice to Legitimate Interests	273
5.3.4	Overview of International Obligations	277
5.4	The Addressees of Article 5(5) CD	278
CHAPTER 6: SUMMARY		283
CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSION		295
7.1	Aligning Copyright Law with the Users among Authors	296
7.2	Restructuring International Copyright Law	304

CONTENTS

BIBLIOGRAPHY	313
INDEX	337
SAMENVATTING	341
ZUSAMMENFASSUNG	355
ABOUT THE AUTHOR	369