The invalid directive: the legal authority of a union act requiring domestic law making
Vandamme, T.A.J.A.

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: http://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

UvA-DARE is a service provided by the library of the University of Amsterdam (http://dare.uva.nl)

Download date: 19 Jan 2019
## Contents

### CHAPTER 1

**Introduction**

1. Pandora’s Box .................................. 3  
2. The Pivotal Question ............................ 3  
3. The Directive .................................. 4  
3.1 The ‘Dual Nature’ of the Directive ............ 4  
3.2 National Discretion ............................ 7  
3.3 Regulations and Directives ..................... 9  
3.4 Terminology: Implementation and Transposition 10  
4. Defining the Relationship ....................... 11  
4.1 What Makes the Relationship Interesting? ........ 12  
4.1.1 Practical Relevance ......................... 12  
4.1.2 Theoretical Relevance: The ‘Authority’ of a Directive 14  
5. Delimiting the Topic ............................ 15  
6. The Plan .................................... 17  

### CHAPTER 2

**Reviewing an Instrument with a ‘Dual Nature’**

1. Introduction .................................. 21  
1.1 Annulled, Void, Invalid and Non-Existent .......... 21  
1.2 Certain Substantive Aspects of Judicial Review of Directives 23  
1.2.1 Introduction ................................ 23  
1.2.2 Marginal Review ............................ 25  
1.2.3 Consistent Interpretation of Directives .......... 29  
1.2.3.1 Limits to Consistent Interpretation? ........ 31  
1.2.4 Partial Invalidity ........................... 34  
1.2.5 Conclusions ................................ 35  
2. Procedural Aspects of Judicial Review of Directives .... 36  
2.1 Introduction .................................. 36  
2.2 The Action for Annulment of a Directive .......... 39  
2.2.1 The Privileged Applicants in the Co-Decision Era 39  
2.2.2 Directives and Private Plaintiffs under Article 230 EC 41  
2.2.2.1 Are Directives Excluded a Priori? .......... 41  
2.2.2.2 Directives and Direct Concern ............... 46  
2.2.2.3 Directives and Individual Concern .......... 51  
2.2.2.4 Private Plaintiffs’ Interests in Annulment of a Directive 52  
2.2.3 Community Law Effects of an Annulment .......... 53  
2.3 The Validity of Directives in Preliminary References 56  
2.3.1 Introduction ................................ 56  
2.3.2 The Complementary Function of the Preliminary Reference 56  
2.3.3 Article 234 EC as a Legal Remedy against Invalid Directives 60  
2.3.3.1 Benevolence of the National Courts .......... 61  
2.3.3.2 Remedies against the Implementing Measure .......... 62  
2.3.3.3 European Minimum Requirements ............ 64
THE INVALID DIRECTIVE

2.3.4 How Relevant is the Validity Question to the National Court? 66
2.3.5 The Effects of a Declaration of Invalidity 70
2.3.6 Conclusions 72
2.4 Invalid Directives and the Action for Damages 72
2.4.1 Introduction 72
2.4.2 Direct Actions for Damages 75
2.4.3 The Effect of Damages: Invalidity or 'Invalidity'? 79
2.4.4 National Damages against National Measures 82
2.4.5 Conclusions 83
2.5 The Plea of Illegality 84
2.5.1 The Position of Individuals 84
2.5.2 The Position of Member States and Community Institutions 85
2.5.3 Inapplicability 87
2.6 Non-Existent Directives 88
3 Suspending the Application of Community Law 91
3.1 The European Court 91
3.1.1 The Anticipated Damages 92
3.1.2 The Scope of Interim Relief Against a Directive 93
3.1.3 Member State Disobedience During Cases Pending 95
3.2 The National Court 96
3.2.1 Zuckerfabrik During the Implementation Term: The UK Tobacco Cases 97
3.3 Conclusions 100
4 EU Political Consequences of Review 101
4.1 The Scope of Article 233 EC 101
4.2 Withdrawal 104
4.2.1 Lawful Directives 104
4.2.2 Unlawful Directives 107
5 Conclusions 109

CHAPTER 3

The Per Se Rule

1 Introduction 113
2 The Invalid Directive in the State of the Art 114
2.1 Legal Writing 114
2.2 The Legislator's Opinion 116
2.3 Interim Conclusion 119
3 Systematic Aspects of European Law 119
3.1 Article 249 EC as the Basis of a Hypothesis 120
3.2 National Discretionary Powers: The Problem of 'Extraction' 123
3.3 Implementation Through Existing Law 124
3.4 EC Law and Conflicting National Law: A European 'Minimum Sanction' 125
3.4.1 Non-Existence of National Law? 126
3.4.2 Delimiting 'Non-Applicability' 129
CHAPTER 4

Incidental EU Consequences for the Implementing Measure

1 Introduction
2 Limiting in Time the Effect of Annulment
2.1 Policy Continuity or Legal Certainty?
2.2 Conclusion
3 The Nature of the Invalidity: The Addressees of the Violated Norm
3.1 Introduction
3.2 Protecting or Addressing the Member States?
3.3 Subsidiarity and Proportionality
3.3.1 Subsidiarity
3.3.2 Proportionality: One Principle, Three Norms
3.4 ‘Double Addressing Norms’
3.4.1 The Position of the Internal Market under the European Constitution
3.4.2 The Community Legislator Exempted From Treaty Obligations?
3.4.3 Notification
3.4.4 International Treaties and Customary International Law
3.4.4.1 ‘Concluded by the Community’
3.4.4.2 Invocability and the Nakajima Exception
3.4.4.3 Customary International Law
3.5 General Principles of Community Law
3.5.1 Introduction
3.5.2 Inside or Outside the Scope of Community Law?
THE INVALID DIRECTIVE