



## UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

### The invalid directive : the legal authority of a union act requiring domestic law making

Vandamme, T.A.J.A.

**Publication date**  
2005

[Link to publication](#)

#### **Citation for published version (APA):**

Vandamme, T. A. J. A. (2005). *The invalid directive : the legal authority of a union act requiring domestic law making*. [Thesis, fully internal, Universiteit van Amsterdam]. Europa Law Publishing.

#### **General rights**

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

#### **Disclaimer/Complaints regulations**

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

## Contents

CHAPTER 1	<b>Introduction</b>	
1	Pandora's Box	3
2	The Pivotal Question	3
3	The Directive	4
3.1	The 'Dual Nature' of the Directive	4
3.2	National Discretion	7
3.3	Regulations and Directives	9
3.4	Terminology: Implementation and Transposition	10
4	Defining the Relationship	11
4.1	What Makes the Relationship Interesting?	12
4.1.1	Practical Relevance	12
4.1.2	Theoretical Relevance: The 'Authority' of a Directive	14
5	Delimiting the Topic	15
6	The Plan	17
CHAPTER 2	<b>Reviewing an Instrument with a 'Dual Nature'</b>	
1	Introduction	21
1.1	Annulled, Void, Invalid and Non-Existent	21
1.2	Certain Substantive Aspects of Judicial Review of Directives	23
1.2.1	Introduction	23
1.2.2	Marginal Review	25
1.2.3	Consistent Interpretation of Directives	29
1.2.3.1	Limits to Consistent Interpretation?	31
1.2.4	Partial Invalidity	34
1.2.5	Conclusions	35
2	Procedural Aspects of Judicial Review of Directives	36
2.1	Introduction	36
2.2	The Action for Annulment of a Directive	39
2.2.1	The Privileged Applicants in the Co-Decision Era	39
2.2.2	Directives and Private Plaintiffs under Article 230 EC	41
2.2.2.1	Are Directives Excluded <i>a Priori</i> ?	41
2.2.2.2	Directives and Direct Concern	46
2.2.2.3	Directives and Individual Concern	51
2.2.2.4	Private Plaintiffs' Interests in Annulment of a Directive	52
2.2.3	Community Law Effects of an Annulment	53
2.3	The Validity of Directives in Preliminary References	56
2.3.1	Introduction	56
2.3.2	The Complementary Function of the Preliminary Reference	56
2.3.3	Article 234 EC as a Legal Remedy against Invalid Directives	60
2.3.3.1	Benevolence of the National Courts	61
2.3.3.2	Remedies against the Implementing Measure	62
2.3.3.3	European Minimum Requirements	64

2.3.4	How Relevant is the Validity Question to the National Court?	66
2.3.5	The Effects of a Declaration of Invalidity	70
2.3.6	Conclusions	72
2.4	Invalid Directives and the Action for Damages	72
2.4.1	Introduction	72
2.4.2	Direct Actions for Damages	75
2.4.3	The Effect of Damages: Invalidity or 'Invalidity'?	79
2.4.4	National Damages against National Measures	82
2.4.5	Conclusions	83
2.5	The Plea of Illegality	84
2.5.1	The Position of Individuals	84
2.5.2	The Position of Member States and Community Institutions	85
2.5.3	Inapplicability	87
2.6	Non-Existent Directives	88
3	Suspending the Application of Community Law	91
3.1	The European Court	91
3.1.1	The Anticipated Damages	92
3.1.2	The Scope of Interim Relief Against a Directive	93
3.1.3	Member State Disobedience During Cases Pending	95
3.2	The National Court	96
3.2.1	Zuckerfabrik During the Implementation Term: The UK Tobacco Cases	97
3.3	Conclusions	100
4	EU Political Consequences of Review	101
4.1	The Scope of Article 233 EC	101
4.2	Withdrawal	104
4.2.1	Lawful Directives	104
4.2.2	Unlawful Directives	107
5	Conclusions	109
CHAPTER 3	<b>The Per Se Rule</b>	
1	Introduction	113
2	The Invalid Directive in the State of the Art	114
2.1	Legal Writing	114
2.2	The Legislator's Opinion	116
2.3	Interim Conclusion	119
3	Systematic Aspects of European Law	119
3.1	Article 249 EC as the Basis of a Hypothesis	120
3.2	National Discretionary Powers: The Problem of 'Extraction'	123
3.3	Implementation Through Existing Law	124
3.4	EC Law and Conflicting National Law: A European 'Minimum Sanction'	125
3.4.1	Non-Existence of National Law?	126
3.4.2	Delimiting 'Non-Applicability'	129

CONTENTS

3.5	The Parallel with Competition Law	131
3.6	The <i>a Fortiori</i> Argument	132
3.7	Interim Conclusion	134
4	Testing the Hypothesis: Case Law	135
4.1	The <i>Fedesa</i> Case and the Two Hormones Directives	135
4.2	The <i>Angelopharm</i> Case: Validity of Pre-Existing Legislation	137
4.3	The <i>Eurotunnel</i> Case: An Invalid Directive in a Horizontal Situation	139
4.4	The <i>Biotechnology</i> Order	141
4.5	Conclusion: No <i>Per Se</i> Consequences	143
5	Invalidity of other Community and Union Acts	143
5.1	Regulations	143
5.1.1	A <i>Per Se</i> Rule for Regulations?	145
5.1.2	The Case Law of the Court	147
5.2	Some Remarks on Union Law	150
5.2.1	Third Pillar Framework Decisions	151
6	Conclusion	154
CHAPTER 4	<b>Incidental EU Consequences for the Implementing Measure</b>	
1	Introduction	159
2	Limiting in Time the Effect of Annulment	159
2.1	Policy Continuity or Legal Certainty?	163
2.2	Conclusion	165
3	The Nature of the Invalidity: The Addressees of the Violated Norm	165
3.1	Introduction	165
3.2	Protecting or Addressing the Member States?	166
3.3	Subsidiarity and Proportionality	171
3.3.1	Subsidiarity	172
3.3.2	Proportionality: One Principle, Three Norms	175
3.4	'Double Addressing Norms'	177
3.4.1	The Position of the Internal Market under the European Constitution	178
3.4.2	The Community Legislator Exempted From Treaty Obligations?	181
3.4.3	Notification	187
3.4.4	International Treaties and Customary International Law	189
3.4.4.1	'Concluded by the Community'	191
3.4.4.2	Invocability and the <i>Nakajima</i> Exception	192
3.4.4.3	Customary International Law	196
3.5	General Principles of Community Law	197
3.5.1	Introduction	197
3.5.2	Inside or Outside the Scope of Community Law?	199

3.5.2.1	Measures Implementing Community Acts	201
3.5.2.2	A Wider Community Context?	203
3.5.3	Some Remarks on Human Rights	205
4	Exclusivity of Community Competences	206
4.1	Exclusivity <i>a Priori</i> and the British Fisheries Cases	208
4.2	Exclusivity by 'Occupation of the Field'	210
4.3	Is the Field Still Occupied?	212
4.4	Conclusion	212
5	The Principle of Sincere Co-Operation	213
5.1	The Scope of Article 10 EC	213
5.2	Limits to an Open-Ended Article ?	214
5.3	The Concrete Duties of the Member States	216
5.4	Conclusion: No Duty to Maintain	219
6	Conclusions	219
CHAPTER 5	<b>Invalid Directives and National Implementation</b>	
1.1	Introduction	223
1.2	The 'Authority' of Directives as Expressed in National Law	224
1.3	Pressure to Implement	225
1.4	Efficiency	227
1.5	'Democratic Leakage'	228
1.6	National Politics Regain Power	231
1.7	National Courts Regain Power	232
1.8	'Shifting' National Democratic Safeguards	233
1.9	EC Requirements as to National Legislation	234
1.10	Valid Directives and Invalid Implementation	237
1.11	Intermezzo	238
2	The Invalid Directive and the Legal Systems of Four Member States	239
2.1	The United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	239
2.1.1	The European Communities Act 1972	243
2.1.2	UK Courts and Implementation	247
2.1.3	<i>Ultra Vires</i>	250
2.1.4	Indirect Challenge	251
2.1.5	Invalid Directives and British Preliminary References	252
2.1.6	Tobacco Advertising Revisited	253
2.1.7	Devolution Issues	255
2.1.7.1	Scotland	256
2.1.7.2	Northern Ireland	260
2.1.7.3	Wales	261
2.1.8	Conclusions as to UK Law	262
2.2	The Kingdom of Belgium	262
2.2.1	Federal Implementation: Article 108 B.Const.	265
2.2.2	Federal Implementation: Enabling Acts	267

CONTENTS

2.2.3	Other Procedural Requirements	270
2.2.4	'Re-Centralization' under EU Pressure?	272
2.2.5	Belgian Courts and Implementation	274
2.2.5.1	The Francorchamps Cases Revisited	275
2.2.5.2	The Annulled Federal Law on Tobacco Advertising	275
2.2.5.3	The Annulled Walloon Decree on Tobacco Advertising	277
2.2.5.4	Review of Executive Legislation	279
2.2.6	Conclusions as to Belgian Law	281
2.3	The French Republic	281
2.3.1	A Vertical Division of Competences	282
2.3.2	Execution and operationalization of 'rules' and 'principles'	285
2.3.3	Implementation by <i>Arrêté</i>	288
2.3.4	Facilitating Implementation: The <i>Ordonnance</i>	289
2.3.5	French Courts and Implementation	292
2.3.5.1	Review of French Statutes: The <i>Conseil Constitutionnel</i>	292
2.3.5.2	Review of Executive Legislation: The <i>Conseil d'État</i>	295
2.3.5.3	Some Remarks on <i>Locus Standi</i>	300
2.3.5.4	Lower Administrative Courts and Ordinary Courts: The Exception of Illegality	301
2.3.6	Conclusions as to French Law	303
2.4	The Kingdom of The Netherlands	304
2.4.1	Implementation in The Netherlands	305
2.4.2	The Dutch 'Henry VIII Clause'	310
2.4.3	Dutch Courts and Implementation	313
2.4.4	Conclusions as to Dutch Law	320
3	Conclusions as to National Law	320
CHAPTER 6	<b>General Conclusion</b>	
1	'Authority' and Legal Review	325
1.1	Political Motives, Political Expectations and Legal Expectations	326
2	A Directive's 'Authority' in EC Law	326
2.1	The Directive as Part of the European Legal System	327
3	A Directive's 'Authority' in National Law	328
4	Future Developments: From 'Sovereignty' to 'Autonomy'?	330
	<b>Invalidated Directives</b>	332
	<b>Tables of Cases</b>	336
	<b>Tables of Legislation</b>	350
	<b>Bibliography</b>	360
	<b>Abbreviations</b>	374
	<b>Index</b>	378
	<b>Samenvatting</b>	384

**THE INVALID DIRECTIVE**