The invalid directive: the legal authority of a union act requiring domestic law making

Vandamme, T.A.J.A.

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
Contents

CHAPTER 1

Introduction

1 Pandora’s Box 3
2 The Pivotal Question 3
3 The Directive 4
3.1 The ‘Dual Nature’ of the Directive 4
3.2 National Discretion 7
3.3 Regulations and Directives 9
3.4 Terminology: Implementation and Transposition 10
4 Defining the Relationship 11
4.1 What Makes the Relationship Interesting? 12
4.1.1 Practical Relevance 12
4.1.2 Theoretical Relevance: The ‘Authority’ of a Directive 14
5 Delimiting the Topic 15
6 The Plan 17

CHAPTER 2

Reviewing an Instrument with a ‘Dual Nature’

1 Introduction 21
1.1 Annulled, Void, Invalid and Non-Existential 21
1.2 Certain Substantive Aspects of Judicial Review of Directives 23
1.2.1 Introduction 23
1.2.2 Marginal Review 25
1.2.3 Consistent Interpretation of Directives 29
1.2.3.1 Limits to Consistent Interpretation? 31
1.2.4 Partial Invalidity 34
1.2.5 Conclusions 35
2 Procedural Aspects of Judicial Review of Directives 36
2.1 Introduction 36
2.2 The Action for Annulment of a Directive 39
2.2.1 The Privileged Applicants in the Co-Decision Era 39
2.2.2 Directives and Private Plaintiffs under Article 230 EC 41
2.2.2.1 Are Directives Excluded a Priori? 41
2.2.2.2 Directives and Direct Concern 46
2.2.2.3 Directives and Individual Concern 51
2.2.2.4 Private Plaintiffs’ Interests in Annulment of a Directive 52
2.2.3 Community Law Effects of an Annulment 53
2.3 The Validity of Directives in Preliminary References 56
2.3.1 Introduction 56
2.3.2 The Complementary Function of the Preliminary Reference 56
2.3.3 Article 234 EC as a Legal Remedy against Invalid Directives 60
2.3.3.1 Benevolence of the National Courts 61
2.3.3.2 Remedies against the Implementing Measure 62
2.3.3.3 European Minimum Requirements 64
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.3.4 How Relevant is the Validity Question to the National Court?</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.5 The Effects of a Declaration of Invalidity</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.6 Conclusions</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Invalid Directives and the Action for Damages</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1 Introduction</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2 Direct Actions for Damages</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.3 The Effect of Damages: Invalidity or 'Invalidity'?</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.4 National Damages against National Measures</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.5 Conclusions</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 The Plea of Illegality</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1 The Position of Individuals</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2 The Position of Member States and Community Institutions</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.3 Inapplicability</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 Non-Existent Directives</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Suspending the Application of Community Law</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 The European Court</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1 The Anticipated Damages</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2 The Scope of Interim Relief Against a Directive</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3 Member State Disobedience During Cases Pending</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 The National Court</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1 Zuckerfabrik During the Implementation Term: The UK Tobacco Cases</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Conclusions</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 EU Political Consequences of Review</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 The Scope of Article 233 EC</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Withdrawal</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 Lawful Directives</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Unlawful Directives</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Conclusions</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHAPTER 3**

**The Per Se Rule**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Introduction</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 The Invalid Directive in the State of the Art</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Legal Writing</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 The Legislator's Opinion</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Interim Conclusion</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Systematic Aspects of European Law</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Article 249 EC as the Basis of a Hypothesis</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 National Discretionary Powers: The Problem of 'Extraction'</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Implementation Through Existing Law</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 EC Law and Conflicting National Law: A European Minimum Sanction</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1 Non-Existence of National Law?</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2 Delimiting 'Non-Applicability'</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.5 The Parallel with Competition Law 131
3.6 The a Fortiori Argument 132
3.7 Interim Conclusion 134
4 Testing the Hypothesis: Case Law 135
4.1 The Fedesa Case and the Two Hormones Directives 135
4.2 The Angelopharm Case: Validity of Pre-Existing Legislation 137
4.3 The Eurotunnel Case: An Invalid Directive in a Horizontal Situation 139
4.4 The Biotechnology Order 141
4.5 Conclusion: No Per Se Consequences 143
5 Invalidity of other Community and Union Acts 143
5.1 Regulations 143
5.1.1 A Per Se Rule for Regulations? 145
5.1.2 The Case Law of the Court 147
5.2 Some Remarks on Union Law 150
5.2.1 Third Pillar Framework Decisions 151
6 Conclusion 154

CHAPTER 4

Incidental EU Consequences for the Implementing Measure

1 Introduction 159
2 Limiting in Time the Effect of Annulment 159
2.1 Policy Continuity or Legal Certainty? 163
2.2 Conclusion 165
3 The Nature of the Invalidity: The Addressees of the Violated Norm 165
3.1 Introduction 165
3.2 Protecting or Addressing the Member States? 166
3.3 Subsidiarity and Proportionality 171
3.3.1 Subsidiarity 172
3.3.2 Proportionality: One Principle, Three Norms 175
3.4 'Double Addressing Norms' 177
3.4.1 The Position of the Internal Market under the European Constitution 178
3.4.2 The Community Legislator Exempted From Treaty Obligations? 181
3.4.3 Notification 187
3.4.4 International Treaties and Customary International Law 189
3.4.4.1 'Concluded by the Community' 191
3.4.4.2 Invocabilit"y and the Nakajima Exception 192
3.4.4.3 Customary International Law 196
3.5 General Principles of Community Law 197
3.5.1 Introduction 197
3.5.2 Inside or Outside the Scope of Community Law? 199
CHAPTER 5

Invalid Directives and National Implementation

1.1 Introduction
1.2 The ‘Authority’ of Directives as Expressed in National Law
1.3 Pressure to Implement
1.4 Efficiency
1.5 ‘Democratic Leakage’
1.6 National Politics Regain Power
1.7 National Courts Regain Power
1.8 ‘Shifting’ National Democratic Safeguards
1.9 EC Requirements as to National Legislation
1.10 Valid Directives and Invalid Implementation
1.11 Intermezzo
2 The Invalid Directive and the Legal Systems of Four Member States
2.1 The United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland
2.1.1 The European Communities Act 1972
2.1.2 UK Courts and Implementation
2.1.3 Ultra Vires
2.1.4 Indirect Challenge
2.1.5 Invalid Directives and British Preliminary References
2.1.6 Tobacco Advertising Revisited
2.1.7 Devolution Issues
2.1.7.1 Scotland
2.1.7.2 Northern Ireland
2.1.7.3 Wales
2.1.8 Conclusions as to UK Law
2.2 The Kingdom of Belgium
2.2.1 Federal Implementation: Article 108 B. Const.
2.2.2 Federal Implementation: Enabling Acts
2.2.3 Other Procedural Requirements 270
2.2.4 'Re-Centralization' under EU Pressure? 272
2.2.5 Belgian Courts and Implementation 274
2.2.5.1 The Francorchamps Cases Revisited 275
2.2.5.2 The Annulled Federal Law on Tobacco Advertising 275
2.2.5.3 The Annulled Walloon Decree on Tobacco Advertising 277
2.2.5.4 Review of Executive Legislation 279
2.2.6 Conclusions as to Belgian Law 281
2.3 The French Republic 281
2.3.1 A Vertical Division of Competences 282
2.3.2 Execution and operationalization of 'rules' and 'principles' 285
2.3.3 Implementation by Arrêté 288
2.3.4 Facilitating Implementation: The Ordonnance 289
2.3.5 French Courts and Implementation 292
2.3.5.1 Review of French Statutes: The Conseil Constitutionnel 292
2.3.5.2 Review of Executive Legislation: The Conseil d'État 295
2.3.5.3 Some Remarks on Locus Standi 300
2.3.5.4 Lower Administrative Courts and Ordinary Courts: The Exception of Illegality 301
2.3.6 Conclusions as to French Law 303
2.4 The Kingdom of The Netherlands 304
2.4.1 Implementation in The Netherlands 305
2.4.2 The Dutch 'Henry VIII Clause' 310
2.4.3 Dutch Courts and Implementation 313
2.4.4 Conclusions as to Dutch Law 320
3 Conclusions as to National Law 320

CHAPTER 6

General Conclusion
1 'Authority' and Legal Review 325
1.1 Political Motives, Political Expectations and Legal Expectations 326
2 A Directive's 'Authority' in EC Law 326
2.1 The Directive as Part of the European Legal System 327
3 A Directive's 'Authority' in National Law 328
4 Future Developments: From 'Sovereignty' to 'Autonomy'? 330

Invalidated Directives 332
Tables of Cases 336
Tables of Legislation 350
Bibliography 360
Abbreviations 374
Index 378
Samenvatting 384