UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

The invalid directive: the legal authority of a union act requiring domestic law making

Vandamme, T.A.J.A.

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
Contents

CHAPTER 1

**Introduction**
1. Pandora’s Box 3
2. The Pivotal Question 3
3. The Directive 4
3.1 The ‘Dual Nature’ of the Directive 4
3.2 National Discretion 7
3.3 Regulations and Directives 9
3.4 Terminology: Implementation and Transposition 10
4. Defining the Relationship 11
4.1 What Makes the Relationship Interesting? 12
4.1.1 Practical Relevance 12
4.1.2 Theoretical Relevance: The ‘Authority’ of a Directive 14
5. Delimiting the Topic 15
6. The Plan 17

CHAPTER 2

**Reviewing an Instrument with a ‘Dual Nature’**
1. Introduction 21
1.1 Annulled, Void, Invalid and Non-Existence 21
1.2 Certain Substantive Aspects of Judicial Review of Directives 23
1.2.1 Introduction 23
1.2.2 Marginal Review 25
1.2.3 Consistent Interpretation of Directives 29
1.2.3.1 Limits to Consistent Interpretation? 31
1.2.4 Partial Invalidity 34
1.2.5 Conclusions 35
2. Procedural Aspects of Judicial Review of Directives 36
2.1 Introduction 36
2.2 The Action for Annulment of a Directive 39
2.2.1 The Privileged Applicants in the Co-Decision Era 39
2.2.2 Directives and Private Plaintiffs under Article 230 EC 41
2.2.2.1 Are Directives Excluded *a Priori*? 41
2.2.2.2 Directives and Direct Concern 46
2.2.2.3 Directives and Individual Concern 51
2.2.2.4 Private Plaintiffs’ Interests in Annulment of a Directive 52
2.2.3 Community Law Effects of an Annulment 53
2.3 The Validity of Directives in Preliminary References 56
2.3.1 Introduction 56
2.3.2 The Complementary Function of the Preliminary Reference 56
2.3.3 Article 234 EC as a Legal Remedy against Invalid Directives 60
2.3.3.1 Benevolence of the National Courts 61
2.3.3.2 Remedies against the Implementing Measure 62
2.3.3.3 European Minimum Requirements 64
### CONTENTS

| 3.5 | The Parallel with Competition Law | 131 |
| 3.6 | The *a Fortiori* Argument | 132 |
| 3.7 | Interim Conclusion | 134 |
| 4 | Testing the Hypothesis: Case Law | 135 |
| 4.1 | The *Fedesa* Case and the Two Hormones Directives | 135 |
| 4.2 | The *Angelopharm* Case: Validity of Pre-Existing Legislation | 137 |
| 4.3 | The *Eurotunnel* Case: An Invalid Directive in a Horizontal Situation | 139 |
| 4.4 | The *Biotechnology* Order | 141 |
| 4.5 | Conclusion: No *Per Se* Consequences | 143 |
| 5 | Invalidity of other Community and Union Acts | 143 |
| 5.1 | Regulations | 143 |
| 5.1.1 | A *Per Se* Rule for Regulations? | 145 |
| 5.1.2 | The Case Law of the Court | 147 |
| 5.2 | Some Remarks on Union Law | 150 |
| 5.2.1 | Third Pillar Framework Decisions | 151 |
| 6 | Conclusion | 154 |

### CHAPTER 4

**Incidental EU Consequences for the Implementing Measure**

1 | Introduction | 159 |
2 | Limiting in Time the Effect of Annulment | 159 |
2.1 | Policy Continuity or Legal Certainty? | 163 |
2.2 | Conclusion | 165 |
3 | The Nature of the Invalidity: The Addressees of the Violated Norm | 165 |
3.1 | Introduction | 165 |
3.2 | Protecting or Addressing the Member States? | 166 |
3.3 | Subsidiarity and Proportionality | 171 |
3.3.1 | Subsidiarity | 172 |
3.3.2 | Proportionality: One Principle, Three Norms | 175 |
3.4 | 'Double Addressing Norms' | 177 |
3.4.1 | The Position of the Internal Market under the European Constitution | 178 |
3.4.2 | The Community Legislator Exempted From Treaty Obligations? | 181 |
3.4.3 | Notification | 187 |
3.4.4 | International Treaties and Customary International Law | 189 |
3.4.4.1 | 'Concluded by the Community' | 191 |
3.4.4.2 | Invocability and the *Nakajima* Exception | 192 |
3.4.4.3 | Customary International Law | 196 |
3.5 | General Principles of Community Law | 197 |
3.5.1 | Introduction | 197 |
3.5.2 | Inside or Outside the Scope of Community Law? | 199 |
2.2.3 Other Procedural Requirements 270
2.2.4 'Re-Centralization' under EU Pressure? 272
2.2.5 Belgian Courts and Implementation 274
2.2.5.1 The Francorchamps Cases Revisited 275
2.2.5.2 The Annullled Federal Law on Tobacco Advertising 275
2.2.5.3 The Annullled Walloon Decree on Tobacco Advertising 277
2.2.5.4 Review of Executive Legislation 279
2.2.6 Conclusions as to Belgian Law 281
2.3 The French Republic 281
2.3.1 A Vertical Division of Competences 282
2.3.2 Execution and operationalization of 'rules' and 'principles' 285
2.3.3 Implementation by Arrêté 288
2.3.4 Facilitating Implementation: The Ordonnance 289
2.3.5 French Courts and Implementation 292
2.3.5.1 Review of French Statutes: The Conseil Constitutionnel 292
2.3.5.2 Review of Executive Legislation: The Conseil d'État 295
2.3.5.3 Some Remarks on Locus Standi 300
2.3.5.4 Lower Administrative Courts and Ordinary Courts: The Exception of Illegality 301
2.3.6 Conclusions as to French Law 303
2.4 The Kingdom of The Netherlands 304
2.4.1 Implementation in The Netherlands 305
2.4.2 The Dutch 'Henry VIII Clause' 310
2.4.3 Dutch Courts and Implementation 313
2.4.4 Conclusions as to Dutch Law 320
3 Conclusions as to National Law 320

CHAPTER 6

General Conclusion
1 'Authority' and Legal Review 325
1.1 Political Motives, Political Expectations and Legal Expectations 326
2 A Directive's 'Authority' in EC Law 326
2.1 The Directive as Part of the European Legal System 327
3 A Directive's 'Authority' in National Law 328
4 Future Developments: From 'Sovereignty' to 'Autonomy'? 330

Invalidated Directives 332
Tables of Cases 336
Tables of Legislation 350
Bibliography 360
Abbreviations 374
Index 378
Samenvatting 384