The invalid directive: the legal authority of a union act requiring domestic law making
Vandamme, T.A.J.A.

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: http://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
Contents

CHAPTER 1  Introduction
1  Pandora's Box  3
2  The Pivotal Question  3
3  The Directive  4
3.1  The 'Dual Nature' of the Directive  4
3.2  National Discretion  7
3.3  Regulations and Directives  9
3.4  Terminology: Implementation and Transposition  10
4  Defining the Relationship  11
4.1  What Makes the Relationship Interesting?  12
4.1.1  Practical Relevance  12
4.1.2  Theoretical Relevance: The 'Authority' of a Directive  14
5  Delimiting the Topic  15
6  The Plan  17

CHAPTER 2  Reviewing an Instrument with a 'Dual Nature'
1  Introduction  21
1.1  Annulled, Void, Invalid and Non-Existential  21
1.2  Certain Substantive Aspects of Judicial Review of Directives  23
1.2.1  Introduction  23
1.2.2  Marginal Review  25
1.2.3  Consistent Interpretation of Directives  29
1.2.3.1  Limits to Consistent Interpretation?  31
1.2.4  Partial Invalidity  34
1.2.5  Conclusions  35
2  Procedural Aspects of Judicial Review of Directives  36
2.1  Introduction  36
2.2  The Action for Annulment of a Directive  39
2.2.1  The Privileged Applicants in the Co-Decision Era  39
2.2.2  Directives and Private Plaintiffs under Article 230 EC  41
2.2.2.1  Are Directives Excluded a Priori?  41
2.2.2.2  Directives and Direct Concern  46
2.2.2.3  Directives and Individual Concern  51
2.2.2.4  Private Plaintiffs' Interests in Annulment of a Directive  52
2.2.3  Community Law Effects of an Annulment  53
2.3  The Validity of Directives in Preliminary References  56
2.3.1  Introduction  56
2.3.2  The Complementary Function of the Preliminary Reference  56
2.3.3  Article 234 EC as a Legal Remedy against Invalid Directives  60
2.3.3.1  Benevolence of the National Courts  61
2.3.3.2  Remedies against the Implementing Measure  62
2.3.3.3  European Minimum Requirements  64
CONTENTS

3.5 The Parallel with Competition Law 131
3.6 The a Fortiori Argument 132
3.7 Interim Conclusion 134

4 Testing the Hypothesis: Case Law 135
4.1 The Fedesa Case and the Two Hormones Directives 135
4.2 The Angelopharm Case: Validity of Pre-Existing Legislation 137
4.3 The Eurotunnel Case: An Invalid Directive in a Horizontal Situation 139
4.4 The Biotechnology Order 141
4.5 Conclusion: No Per Se Consequences 143

5 Invalidity of other Community and Union Acts 143
5.1 Regulations 143
5.1.1 A Per Se Rule for Regulations? 145
5.1.2 The Case Law of the Court 147
5.2 Some Remarks on Union Law 150
5.2.1 Third Pillar Framework Decisions 151
6 Conclusion 154

CHAPTER 4

Incidental EU Consequences for the Implementing Measure

1 Introduction 159
2 Limiting in Time the Effect of Annulment 159
2.1 Policy Continuity or Legal Certainty? 163
2.2 Conclusion 165
3 The Nature of the Invalidity: The Addressees of the Violated Norm 166
3.1 Introduction 165
3.2 Protecting or Addressing the Member States? 166
3.3 Subsidiarity and Proportionality 171
3.3.1 Subsidiarity 172
3.3.2 Proportionality: One Principle, Three Norms 175
3.4 'Double Addressing Norms' 177
3.4.1 The Position of the Internal Market under the European Constitution 178
3.4.2 The Community Legislator Exempted From Treaty Obligations? 181
3.4.3 Notification 187
3.4.4 International Treaties and Customary International Law 189
3.4.4.1 'Concluded by the Community' 191
3.4.4.2 Invocability and the Nakajima Exception 192
3.4.4.3 Customary International Law 196
3.5 General Principles of Community Law 197
3.5.1 Introduction 197
3.5.2 Inside or Outside the Scope of Community Law? 199
CHAPTER 5

Invalid Directives and National Implementation

1.1 Introduction 223
1.2 The 'Authority' of Directives as Expressed in National Law 224
1.3 Pressure to Implement 225
1.4 Efficiency 227
1.5 'Democratic Leakage' 228
1.6 National Politics Regain Power 231
1.7 National Courts Regain Power 232
1.8 'Shifting' National Democratic Safeguards 233
1.9 EC Requirements as to National Legislation 234
1.10 Valid Directives and Invalid Implementation 237
1.11 Intermezzo 238
2 The Invalid Directive and the Legal Systems of Four Member States 239
2.1 The United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland 239
2.1.1 The European Communities Act 1972 243
2.1.2 UK Courts and Implementation 247
2.1.3 Ultra Vires 250
2.1.4 Indirect Challenge 251
2.1.5 Invalid Directives and British Preliminary References 252
2.1.6 Tobacco Advertising Revisited 253
2.1.7 Devolution Issues 255
2.1.7.1 Scotland 256
2.1.7.2 Northern Ireland 260
2.1.7.3 Wales 261
2.1.8 Conclusions as to UK Law 262
2.2 The Kingdom of Belgium 262
2.2.1 Federal Implementation: Article 108 B.Const. 265
2.2.2 Federal Implementation: Enabling Acts 267

xii
2.2.3 Other Procedural Requirements
2.2.4 'Re-Centralization' under EU Pressure?
2.2.5 Belgian Courts and Implementation
2.2.5.1 The Francorchamps Cases Revisited
2.2.5.2 The Annulled Federal Law on Tobacco Advertising
2.2.5.3 The Annulled Walloon Decree on Tobacco Advertising
2.2.5.4 Review of Executive Legislation
2.2.6 Conclusions as to Belgian Law
2.3 The French Republic
2.3.1 A Vertical Division of Competences
2.3.2 Execution and operationalization of 'rules' and 'principles'
2.3.3 Implementation by Arrêté
2.3.4 Facilitating Implementation: The Ordonnance
2.3.5 French Courts and Implementation
2.3.5.1 Review of French Statutes: The Conseil Constitutionnel
2.3.5.2 Review of Executive Legislation: The Conseil d'État
2.3.5.3 Some Remarks on Locus Standi
2.3.5.4 Lower Administrative Courts and Ordinary Courts: The Exception of Illegality
2.3.6 Conclusions as to French Law
2.4 The Kingdom of The Netherlands
2.4.1 Implementation in The Netherlands
2.4.2 The Dutch 'Henry VIII Clause'
2.4.3 Dutch Courts and Implementation
2.4.4 Conclusions as to Dutch Law
3 Conclusions as to National Law

CHAPTER 6 General Conclusion
1 'Authority' and Legal Review
1.1 Political Motives, Political Expectations and Legal Expectations
2 A Directive's 'Authority' in EC Law
2.1 The Directive as Part of the European Legal System
3 A Directive's 'Authority' in National Law
4 Future Developments: From 'Sovereignty' to 'Autonomy'? 

Invalidated Directives
Tables of Cases
Tables of Legislation
Bibliography
Abbreviations
Index
Samenvatting