The invalid directive: the legal authority of a union act requiring domestic law making

Vandamme, T.A.J.A.

Citation for published version (APA):
CONTENTS

Contents

CHAPTER 1

Introduction
1 Pandora’s Box 3
2 The Pivotal Question 3
3 The Directive 4
3.1 The ‘Dual Nature’ of the Directive 4
3.2 National Discretion 7
3.3 Regulations and Directives 9
3.4 Terminology: Implementation and Transposition 10
4 Defining the Relationship 11
4.1 What Makes the Relationship Interesting? 12
4.1.1 Practical Relevance 12
4.1.2 Theoretical Relevance: The ‘Authority’ of a Directive 14
5 Delimiting the Topic 15
6 The Plan 17

CHAPTER 2

Reviewing an Instrument with a ‘Dual Nature’
1 Introduction 21
1.1 Annulled, Void, Invalid and Non-Existential 21
1.2 Certain Substantive Aspects of Judicial Review of Directives 23
1.2.1 Introduction 23
1.2.2 Marginal Review 25
1.2.3 Consistent Interpretation of Directives 29
1.2.3.1 Limits to Consistent Interpretation? 31
1.2.4 Partial Invalidity 34
1.2.5 Conclusions 35
2 Procedural Aspects of Judicial Review of Directives 36
2.1 Introduction 36
2.2 The Action for Annulment of a Directive 39
2.2.1 The Privileged Applicants in the Co-Decision Era 39
2.2.2 Directives and Private Plaintiffs under Article 230 EC 41
2.2.2.1 Are Directives Excluded a Priori? 41
2.2.2.2 Directives and Direct Concern 46
2.2.2.3 Directives and Individual Concern 51
2.2.2.4 Private Plaintiffs’ Interests in Annulment of a Directive 52
2.2.3 Community Law Effects of an Annulment 53
2.3 The Validity of Directives in Preliminary References 56
2.3.1 Introduction 56
2.3.2 The Complementary Function of the Preliminary Reference 56
2.3.3 Article 234 EC as a Legal Remedy against Invalid Directives 60
2.3.3.1 Benevolence of the National Courts 61
2.3.3.2 Remedies against the Implementing Measure 62
2.3.3.3 European Minimum Requirements 64
THE INVALID DIRECTIVE

2.3.4 How Relevant is the Validity Question to the National Court? 66
2.3.5 The Effects of a Declaration of Invalidity 70
2.3.6 Conclusions 72
2.4 Invalid Directives and the Action for Damages 72
2.4.1 Introduction 72
2.4.2 Direct Actions for Damages 75
2.4.3 The Effect of Damages: Invalidity or ‘Invalidity’? 79
2.4.4 National Damages against National Measures 82
2.4.5 Conclusions 83
2.5 The Plea of Illegality 84
2.5.1 The Position of Individuals 84
2.5.2 The Position of Member States and Community Institutions 85
2.5.3 Inapplicability 87
2.6 Non-Existent Directives 88
3 Suspending the Application of Community Law 91
3.1 The European Court 91
3.1.1 The Anticipated Damages 92
3.1.2 The Scope of Interim Relief Against a Directive 93
3.1.3 Member State Disobedience During Cases Pending 95
3.2 The National Court 96
3.2.1 Zuckerfabrik During the Implementation Term: The UK Tobacco Cases 97
3.3 Conclusions 100
4 EU Political Consequences of Review 101
4.1 The Scope of Article 233 EC 101
4.2 Withdrawal 104
4.2.1 Lawful Directives 104
4.2.2 Unlawful Directives 107
5 Conclusions 109

CHAPTER 3 The Per Se Rule
1 Introduction 113
2 The Invalid Directive in the State of the Art 114
2.1 Legal Writing 114
2.2 The Legislator’s Opinion 116
2.3 Interim Conclusion 119
3 Systematic Aspects of European Law 119
3.1 Article 249 EC as the Basis of a Hypothesis 120
3.2 National Discretionary Powers: The Problem of ‘Extraction’ 123
3.3 Implementation Through Existing Law 124
3.4 EC Law and Conflicting National Law: A European ‘Minimum Sanction’ 125
3.4.1 Non-Existence of National Law? 126
3.4.2 Delimiting ‘Non-Applicability’ 129
3.5 The Parallel with Competition Law 131
3.6 The *a Fortiori* Argument 132
3.7 Interim Conclusion 134
4 Testing the Hypothesis: Case Law
4.1 The *Fedesa* Case and the Two Hormones Directives 135
4.2 The *Angelopharm* Case: Validity of Pre-Existing Legislation 137
4.3 The *Eurotunnel* Case: An Invalid Directive in a Horizontal Situation 139
4.4 The *Biotechnology* Order 141
4.5 Conclusion: No *Per Se* Consequences 143
5 Invalidity of other Community and Union Acts 143
5.1 Regulations 143
5.1.1 A *Per Se* Rule for Regulations? 145
5.1.2 The Case Law of the Court 147
5.2 Some Remarks on Union Law 150
5.2.1 Third Pillar Framework Decisions 151
6 Conclusion 154

CHAPTER 4

**Incidental EU Consequences for the Implementing Measure**

1 Introduction 159
2 Limiting in Time the Effect of Annulment 159
2.1 Policy Continuity or Legal Certainty? 163
2.2 Conclusion 165
3 The Nature of the Invalidity: The Addressees of the Violated Norm 165
3.1 Introduction 165
3.2 Protecting or Addressing the Member States? 166
3.3 Subsidiarity and Proportionality 171
3.3.1 Subsidiarity 172
3.3.2 Proportionality: One Principle, Three Norms 175
3.4 'Double Addressing Norms' 177
3.4.1 The Position of the Internal Market under the European Constitution 178
3.4.2 The Community Legislator Exempted From Treaty Obligations? 181
3.4.3 Notification 187
3.4.4 International Treaties and Customary International Law 189
3.4.4.1 'Concluded by the Community' 191
3.4.4.2 Invocability and the *Nakajima* Exception 192
3.4.4.3 Customary International Law 196
3.5 General Principles of Community Law 197
3.5.1 Introduction 197
3.5.2 Inside or Outside the Scope of Community Law? 199
2.2.3 Other Procedural Requirements
2.2.4 'Re-Centralization' under EU Pressure?
2.2.5 Belgian Courts and Implementation
2.2.5.1 The Francorchamps Cases Revisited
2.2.5.2 The Annulled Federal Law on Tobacco Advertising
2.2.5.3 The Annulled Walloon Decree on Tobacco Advertising
2.2.5.4 Review of Executive Legislation
2.2.6 Conclusions as to Belgian Law
2.3 The French Republic
2.3.1 A Vertical Division of Competences
2.3.2 Execution and operationalization of 'rules' and 'principles'
2.3.3 Implementation by Arrêté
2.3.4 Facilitating Implementation: The Ordonnance
2.3.5 French Courts and Implementation
2.3.5.1 Review of French Statutes: The Conseil Constitutionnel
2.3.5.2 Review of Executive Legislation: The Conseil d'État
2.3.5.3 Some Remarks on Locus Standi
2.3.5.4 Lower Administrative Courts and Ordinary Courts: The Exception of Illegality
2.3.6 Conclusions as to French Law
2.4 The Kingdom of The Netherlands
2.4.1 Implementation in The Netherlands
2.4.2 The Dutch 'Henry VIII Clause'
2.4.3 Dutch Courts and Implementation
2.4.4 Conclusions as to Dutch Law
3 Conclusions as to National Law

General Conclusion
1 'Authority' and Legal Review
1.1 Political Motives, Political Expectations and Legal Expectations
2 A Directive's 'Authority' in EC Law
2.1 The Directive as Part of the European Legal System
3 A Directive's 'Authority' in National Law
4 Future Developments: From 'Sovereignty' to 'Autonomy'?