



**UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)**

**A new property regime in Kyrgyzstan; an investigation into the links between land reform, food security, and economic development**

Dekker, H.A.L.

[Link to publication](#)

*Citation for published version (APA):*

Dekker, H. A. L. (2001). A new property regime in Kyrgyzstan; an investigation into the links between land reform, food security, and economic development VIATECH

**General rights**

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

**Disclaimer/Complaints regulations**

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <http://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

## SYNOPSIS

### CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION

#### 1.1 RATIONALE

Introduction to land reform projects. Generally two types of land reform projects one aimed at alleviation of food insecurity and the other aimed at economic development. Terms of Reference is often less suitable as guideline for project activities. Presenting a method for rapid assessment of effectiveness of a land reform project.

#### 1.2 LAND TENURE, FOOD SECURITY, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

(Too) easily assumed links between land tenure change and improved food production, two social phenomena but rooting in different domains nevertheless related. Recently (new) attention is given to ecologically sustainable agriculture.

#### 1.3 THE ASSIGNMENT

A short description of the Land and Real Estate Registration Project and its link with the Land and Agrarian Reform project is given. Explaining my assignment in Kyrgyzstan to assist with the establishment of GosRegister.

#### 1.4 CONSTRAINTS IN THE ASSIGNMENT

The one-sided focus on economic development of the project. The encountered problems with the Introduction of western style registration with statistics, languages, and concepts in the Kyrgyz Republic.

#### 1.5 THE MODEL

The method and the model for rapid assessment of effectiveness of a land reform project to be used by project staff. Data gathering and macro-economic indicators for deployment with the model developed in this research.

#### 1.6 STRUCTURE OF THE BOOK

Contents of the document mainly determined by the practical application of the method for rapid assessment. Background information in the chapters 1 – 4 and building of the model in chapter 5. Part two, the chapters 6 – 14, contain an application of the model in Kyrgyzstan. Part three has two chapters. In chapter 15 second thoughts are presented and chapter 16 contains conclusions and statements.

### CHAPTER 2. DEFINITIONS AND TERMINOLOGY

#### 2.1 PROPERTY

##### 2.1.1 Property, Property Regime, and Property Rights

Property, property regimes and property rights described and defined. The who, what, how much, when, and where, of property regimes. Drawing attention to the social function of property.

##### 2.1.2 From communal to Individual Property

The 'evolution' of property rights. Communal lands were the norm but that changed after 1700.

##### 2.1.3 Social Function of Property

The economic aspect of property and the social function of property manifest in layers of social organization. The question comes up if there is any chance to develop a more socially oriented property regime.

##### 2.1.4 Landed Property

The belief that territorial conquest is the basis of wealth and power and the changes that came with capitalism in this respect. Significance of landed property in dominantly agrarian societies.

## 2.2 LAND

### 2.2.1 Land and Real Property

The various distinctions of property in different societies. Significance of the 'ugodia'. Dependence on land as important resource. The similar approach toward state and privately owned land in western societies.

### 2.2.2 Rights to Land

The concept of land. Layer of air and underground with the same property regime. Various holders of rights for the same object. FIG statement on cadastre.

### 2.2.3 Land Tenure

Definition of land tenure. History of holding of land. Anglo-American and Roman law differences in holding.

### 2.2.4 Security of Land Tenure

Security of tenure as a perception. Difference between tenure and possession. Duration of tenure in its economic and legal dimension. Communal tenure.

### 2.2.5 Land Reform

The non-evolutionary change of land tenure by land reform. Definitions and descriptions. Redistribution of land and emphasis on agricultural production.

## 2.3 FOOD

### 2.3.1 Food Security

Food security as a problem in lesser developed countries. Possible solutions for the long term. Definitions as used by the FAO. Food security as utopian concept.

### 2.3.2 Access, Availability, and Utilization of Food

It is not only food production that determines food security. Access and utilization play important roles too. Not a problem of insufficient food but of distribution. Food utilization problems.

### 2.3.3 Food Security and Land Reform

Land reform to combat food insecurity. Land as the fundamental source for food production. The political dimension of land reform to combat food insecurity. Food storage as an insurance against food insecurity

### 2.3.4 Prosperity Focus and Food Security Focus in Land Reform

The two possible goals of land reform, aim at food insecurity alleviation or focus on economic development.

## 2.4 NON-EVOLUTIONARY CHANGE

### 2.4.1 Institutions

Institutions as the established rules and customary relationships of a social organization. Interference does not mean a quick fix. The social transformation that goes with land reform.

### 2.4.2 Land Registration

The trend to import western style land registration assuming that this will stimulate economic development. Problems for indigenous people with the dual system. Land information systems are not always the only key to secure rights to land.

#### 2.4.3 Land Registration and Land Data

The fixed location of real property. Land surveying to provide the geographical component in a land registration. Elasticity of land under Soviet rule.

## CHAPTER 3. KYRGYZSTAN

### 3.1 THE KYRGYZ REPUBLIC

#### 3.1.1 Geography and Demography

A geographical and demographic description of the Kyrgyz Republic. Some economic considerations.

#### 3.1.2 Importance of Agriculture

The privatization of real property in Kyrgyzstan. Importance of agriculture in this dominantly agricultural country.

#### 3.1.3 Economic Trends

A persistent economic decline. Exchange rate and number of transactions with real property in the capital city. Statistically there is no significant migration to cities from rural areas. Emigration of ethnic Russians.

#### 3.1.4 Food and Agricultural Production

The focus on wheat production in the Kyrgyz Republic. The sown area of wheat increased at the expense of other crops. Possibilities for more competitive crops?

#### 3.1.5 Food Security in Kyrgyzstan

The basic food commodity in the Kyrgyz Republic is bread. Wheat production is closely monitored by the government. The hard to control inflation in the country. At the household level the food security situation has worsened.

#### 3.1.6 Food Security Policy in the Kyrgyz Republic

The National Food Security Policy Seminar in July 1999 in Bishkek gave some of the governments concerns and intentions. Selected policy elements and the conclusions of the seminar.

#### 3.1.7 Rural Living in the Kyrgyz Republic

About 75% of the population of the Kyrgyz Republic is rural (if Bishkek is included this percentage is around 65%). There are a number of problems in rural areas that influence rural living negatively. A description of the situation on the state and collective farms for agricultural employees.

#### 3.1.8 Rural Living after Independence

Hesitation among former agricultural employees to become a private individual farmer. Dependence on the state channels for market access and information for new farmers.

#### 3.1.9 Property in Kyrgyzstan

Privatization of urban and rural property and the differences. The specific situation with the land shares giving use rights to 'Ugodia' land. The Land and Real Estate Registration project.

### 3.2 OWNERSHIP OF RIGHTS TO LAND BEFORE INDEPENDENCE IN KYRGYZIA

#### 3.2.1 Obtaining Use Rights

Before independence all land was state owned. People acquired 'inheritable' use rights. Ways to obtain an exclusive use right to property. The special function of the BTI offices.

#### 3.2.2 'Inheritable' Use Rights

What is an inheritable use right?. Permits issued by the local authorities. Registration of persons; the domestic passport.

#### 3.2.3 Protection and Registration of Property Rights

The various government agencies dealing with distribution, monitoring, control, and use of property. Special attention for agricultural planning and production.

#### 3.2.4 Registration of Use Rights

Description of registration of use rights and the offices managing data on property. The start of the land registration project and creation of GosRegister.

### 3.3 LAND AND AGRARIAN REFORM

#### 3.3.1 The Legal Framework

Description of the laws and regulations on land and agrarian reform. 'Purchase' of property at privatization. The struggle to get privatization going in rural areas. Three phases of land reform.

#### 3.3.2 First Phase of Land Reform (1991)

The law on peasant farms. Land shares according to labor years and family size. Initially only the under-producing state and collective farms.

#### 3.3.3 Second Phase of Land Reform (1992 –1994)

A response to the 'failure' of the first privatization attempt. A lot of restructuring on paper only during this second phase.

#### 3.3.4 Third Phase; Revitalization Agricultural Restructuring (1994 -> )

Initiative of the president. An assault on the slow progress of real reform. The National Land Fund. Types of farms possible. Obligation to restructure.

#### 3.3.5 Progress of the Reform

Progress on paper impressive in reality much less. Many new smaller farms with part of the old management in place. Differences between the north and the south of the country in agricultural matters.

### 3.4 INTRODUCING OWNERSHIP OF RIGHTS TO ALL LAND

#### 3.4.1 Amendment of the Constitution

The important decision to make all land shares ownership documents. From now on all types of property could be privately owned.

#### 3.4.2 The Land Registration Project

The Law on State Registration of Right to Immovable Property as basis for the land registration project. New GosRegister offices is combination

of BTI and Land Administration offices. The three newly opened offices for land registration.

## **CHAPTER 4. LAND REFORM IN COUNTRIES IN TRANSITION**

### **4.1 FARMING AND POLITICS**

#### **4.1.1 Introduction**

Property was and in some measure remains the sole source of power for socialists. It makes land reform a revolutionary step. It passes power. What is the motive in Kyrgyzstan?

#### **4.1.2 Politics and Agriculture**

There is a continuous attention among politicians for agriculture even when the importance of agriculture in society decreases. In Soviet times the managers of the agricultural enterprises were the real rulers of the country.

#### **4.1.3 Centrally Planned Agricultural Production**

Decades of central planning of agricultural production have left their trace among agricultural employees. Description of a scene in Pazardzhik (BG).

#### **4.1.4 Conditional Privatization**

Often privatization is conditioned. Most used is a moratorium on (agricultural) land sales. The question comes up why so revolutionary change to private ownership. Is there not an evolutionary way to get there?

#### **4.1.5 Land Reform and Land Tenure Security**

Positive and negative systems of land registration. The Soviet land cadastre and its function. Authorities as monitors of state property use and the effect of land tenure security perceived by citizens.

### **4.2 LAND REFORM EXPECTATIONS**

#### **4.2.1 Motives for Land Reform**

One reason for reform is the general expectation that smaller farms produce more efficiently. Get the free-rider out of the system. Fear for peasant uprising as a motive.

#### **4.2.2 Theoretical Considerations**

Several land reform theories and their relevance for Kyrgyzstan. Difficulties for the Kyrgyz Republic after the break up of the USSR.

#### **4.2.3 Revitalization of Land Reform**

A new elan for land reform in the world. Land reform is the (last) hope of many rural inhabitants and lack of political commitment is their greatest enemy.

#### **4.2.4 Expectations of Change toward a Market Economy**

The hope vested in a free market economy in former soviet countries. Land need to be an easy commodity on the market.

### **4.3 LAND REFORM PRACTICE**

#### **4.3.1 Who Gets the Land?**

The various possibilities of land distribution after independence in former soviet states. The capital of most peasants is their land.

#### **4.3.2 Agricultural Labor**

The distribution in Kyrgyzstan and the positive attitude toward agriculture. The hypothesis is that smaller farms are more productive.

#### 4.3.3 Agricultural Production

Growing awareness of poverty in rural areas and its origin. Agricultural development should be the motor of a developing rural economy. But persistent and lingering economic decline hamper state subsidies.

#### 4.3.4 The Three Elements in (Agricultural) Land Reform

The three elements of land reform; distribution of land, establishment of a new property regime, and registration of new rights to land. The problem with the new western style legal system.

### 4.4 CHINA'S LAND REFORM EXPERIENCE

#### 4.4.1 From Food Production to Economic Development

China is using re-adjustable land-use contracts to carry out an agrarian reform. Initially not too successful, later praised as the China miracle.

#### 4.4.2 Family Size Determines Farm Size

Equal allocation of land according to family size. But changes in family will change the size of the land in under the land use contract. Terms of 15 and later 30 years.

#### 4.4.3 Rule of Law versus Rule of Policy

China's struggle with the rule of law and the rule of policy. The latter was dominant and caused difficulties because of its 'flexible' nature. Lack of clear definitions.

#### 4.4.4 The Re-Adjustable Land Rights Policy

The problems with the implementation of the re-adjusting policy. Only large re-adjustments should be prohibited. What will the future bring?

## CHAPTER 5. BUILDING A MODEL

### 5.1 LINKING LAND TENURE AND FOOD SECURITY

#### 5.1.1 The Food Security Paradigm

Building a food security paradigm. The link between land tenure and food security in a simple scheme. Generates already questions.

#### 5.1.2 Extending the Scheme

Introduction of institutional changes as 'land reform' and concepts visualized. Comparison with a scheme of Thiesenhusen

#### 5.1.3 The Food Security Paradigm Visualized

Introduction of the element 'initial change'. The food security paradigm visualized. Change of the scheme from left to right into down from the top.

### 5.2 INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE, INDIVIDUAL BEHAVIOR, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

#### 5.2.1 Family Farming and Economic Development

Introduction of the other paradigm the one of economic development. Institutional changes leading to economic development. The one-way approach of links. A first visualization of the prosperity paradigm.

#### 5.2.2 Land Titling and Economic Development

The Feder model and the Place et al model. Supply and demand factors evaluated. The low impact of the shift from communal to individual rights as described by Slaats.

#### 5.2.3 Comparing Prosperity Paradigms

What contribution is there in the other prosperity paradigm models to my model?

#### 5.2.4 Opportunity Sets and Economic Development

Introduction of opportunity sets in the prosperity model. The model of Allan Schmid. A 'translation' of the model. Poland experience with new spending power of the rural population.

#### 5.2.5 Economic Development and Food Security

Introduction of Tweeten and Brinkman's paradigm. Consequences for 'a translation' in my model.

### 5.3 COMBINING THE PROSPERITY AND FOOD SECURITY PARADIGMS

#### 5.3.1 One Model

Emphasis on the different goals, albeit visualized with almost one model that is actually a combination of the two paradigms.

#### 5.3.2 Implications of the Combined Model

Governmental vigilance is the key word. Growing inequalities can easily develop. In particular when the focus is on economic development, the government should develop measures to redistribute a part of the prosperity that some of the population may acquire as a result of the land reform.

## CHAPTER 6. INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE

### 6.1 IMPLEMENTATION OF A NEW PROPERTY REGIME

#### 6.1.1 Introduction

The contents of chapters 6 – 13 explained. Neither land tenure security nor food security as elements in the model because they are perceptions and not directly measurable.

#### 6.1.2 The Kyrgyz Constitution, the Civil Code, and Land Code

Basis for the institutional change is in new legislation. This new legislation is summarized.

#### 6.1.3 Moratorium on 'Ugodia'

The 'Ugodia' and the moratorium. Some observations about the growing size of house plots and their contribution to food production in the Kyrgyz Republic. The dawn of a land market.

#### 6.1.4 New Regulations

A short review of additional regulation and laws. The confusing situation of the staff of former BTI and Land Administration offices from being inspectors of State property now becoming protectors of private rights to land.

#### 6.1.5 Improving Land Tenure Security

A few remarks from citizens about land tenure security found in the social assessment report. But the conclusion can be that the Kyrgyz government is providing a basis to start building on land tenure security.



## 6.2. LAND REFORM IN KYRGYZSTAN

### 6.2.1 Imitating the 'West'

Kyrgyzstan as the pet of international donor organizations. Democracy in Kyrgyzstan as new phenomenon and a little different form western concepts.

### 6.2.2 What Motive?

Basic motive was to replace the approximately 450 state and collective farms by smaller private farms. The distribution of land according to family size.

### 6.2.3 Revitalization of Kyrgyz Land Reform

A short review of the effect of the presidential decree to revitalize the land and agrarian reform in the republic. The Land Code permits some interference by the state.

### 6.2.4 Economic Stagnation

Some illustrations of the persistent stagnation in economic development. A closer look at the number of transfers in the country and in Bishkek city.

### 6.2.5 Land Acquisition

Acquisition is limited by the moratorium. But it happens through new joining in the peasant farms, rentals of land and purchases from the Land Fund. The latter is not impressive however.

## 6.3. THE LAND REGISTRATION PROJECT IN KYRGYZSTAN

### 6.3.1 Land Registration and Land Reform

The link between land and agrarian reform and land registration. The start of the preparation phase of the land registration project in 1999 after the legal basis had been completed.

### 6.3.2 Land Market Development

The terms of reference of the project put as much emphasis on a land market to develop as on protection of individual property rights. The reason of changing the current 'system' is challenged because of the limited transfers of land in the country.

### 6.3.3 Focus on Urban Property?

Reference made to a market economy suggests emphasis on urban real property rather than rural development. This is supported by the text of a project information document of mid 1999.

### 6.3.4 A More Public Friendly System

The reasoning of Omuraliev as the new director of GosRegister is a public friendly system of land registration. But convincing the public will take more than just cosmetic changes.

### 6.3.5 Current Situation on Land Registration

Few incentives for people to register in Kyrgyzstan. Possession has been taken of the land after distribution. New style offices are operational. Special teams for systematic registration started in 2000. The decline in transfers continues for the time being.

### 6.3.6 Perspective of the New Land Registration System

Opening of new offices is currently (far) behind schedule, but GosRegister expects to be able to make an ultimate effort. But what is the real need?

Is the money wisely spent? The heated debates about the field inspections, proving the different concepts of thinking between local experts and expatriates.

## 6.4 ASSESSMENT OF INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE IN KYRGYZSTAN

### 6.4.2 Indicators for Institutional Change

Some indicators for institutional change reviewed. The indicators are about steps taken to result in changes later on in time. A fundamental problem is to separate the effects of land reform from effects of more or less parallel developments that often come with land reform.

### 6.4.2 Assessment of Institutional Change

The results of a survey among farm managers by the WB. There seems to be a lingering ignorance among peasants on the requirements for managing farms.

## CHAPTER 7. OPPORTUNITY SETS

### 7.1 IMPLICATIONS OF OPPORTUNITY SETS

#### 7.1.1 Why opportunity sets?

Opportunity sets because 'security' is a perception and not directly measurable. The hierarchy of needs as presented by Maslow. The lead text in the food security report in Kyrgyzstan.

#### 7.1.2 Informal Markets

If not officially, people will try to succeed along informal ways. The phenomenon of 'table shops' and the habit to request some extra cash for services provided.

#### 7.1.3 Re-emerging Customs

The re-emerging of customs is noticeable in the decreasing role of women in important functions in society and in the way land is commonly registered nowadays. The new registration system must be convincing and complete to conquer the old habit.

#### 7.1.4 Field Observations

The habit of registration because it was necessary in Soviet times to do so. The paternalistic attitude of former farm managers.

### 7.2 USE OF OPPORTUNITY SETS

#### 7.2.1 Interacting Opportunity Sets

The problem to observe and understand a change in opportunity sets in former communist countries for westerners. Statistics show clearly the advantage that peasants took of their opportunity sets.

#### 7.2.2 Changing Opportunity Sets

Indicators for change in opportunity sets are reviewed, with special attention for re-emerging customs at the expense of the female population. Some of the indicators will also contribute to other elements of the model.

### 7.3 RESULTS OF CHANGE IN OPPORTUNITY SETS

#### 7.3.1 Inventory of Change in Opportunity Sets

There still is much to improve around the information and support for peasants starting their new farms as can be noted from the (oral) plans of the Ministry of Agriculture. Restructuring of agriculture is not yet complete.

#### 7.3.2 Assessment of Changing Opportunity Sets

Statistical data on changing farm types in the republic show the impact of the change on the rural population. Interesting also to note the increase of the area of 'Ugodia' land.

### **CHAPTER 8. ACCESS TO LAND**

#### **8.1 ISSUES CONCERNING ACCESS TO LAND**

##### 8.1.1 Stewardship for Resources

Some considerations about the psychological effect of change in land tenure commonly referred to as land reform. It is a chance to improve the life of the rural population.

##### 8.1.2 Land Titling

Internationally growing doubt about the effect of titling of land as a means to support economic development. Remarks from the World Bank and some researchers.

##### 8.1.3 Registration of Land

It is difficult to find indicators for change in access to land in the registration offices. There is still little knowledge about registration benefits among the population.

#### **8.2 ASSESSMENT OF CHANGE IN ACCESS TO LAND**

##### 8.2.1 Indicators for Change in Access to Land

The distinction between urban and rural areas as far as the two paradigms are concerned. Also the perception of the changed access to land plays a role.

##### 8.2.2 Seizing the Opportunity

For rural residents the changes in access to land were real and can be observed during field visits. There are yet limited statistical data available on this matter in the Kyrgyz Republic.

##### 8.2.3 Land Market

Not yet an evolution of a land market in Kyrgyzstan. It is evidently not a virtue to pay rent in time for rented land out of the land fund in the country.

### **CHAPTER 9. RESOURCE USE**

#### **9.1 LAND AS ECONOMIC PRODUCTION FACTOR**

##### 9.1.1 Economic Motives

The theory is that a free market economy will stimulate efficient use of resources. Markets are important for economic development, but many farmers are disappointed in the government because of lack of support for them.

##### 9.1.2 Little Support for Farmers

Observations in Kyrgyzstan reveal that there is a host of difficulties facing new farmers in Kyrgyzstan.

#### **9.2 ASSESSMENT OF CHANGE IN RESOURCE USE**

### 9.2.1 Indicators

Observation of a more conscious use of land and of changing agricultural methods of production. In urban areas it is more the exploitation of real property by renting and changing it.

### 9.2.2 Statistics about Change in Resource Use

There is a wide range of possibilities to observe changes in resource use. Education demand, efficiency in use of real property, credit use and others can be used. For arable land the changes in production are captured in statistic data.

## **CHAPTER 10. AGRICULTURAL PRODUCTION**

### **10.1 DISMANTMENT OF LARGE SCALE FARMS**

#### 10.1.1 More Potential Private Farms than Land; A Compromise

What type of distribution process serves best continuing agricultural production? Statistical data about the changes in farm types and farm labor.

#### 10.1.2 Increased Agricultural Employment

Statistical data show an increase of labor per acre on smaller farms. This corresponds with findings of other researchers. Economics of scale play a role in the deployment of machinery.

### **10.2 RESOURCE CONSERVATION**

#### 10.2.1 Increased Awareness

There is always the fear that intensification on smaller farms will affect vulnerable marginal lands. But on the other hand it can be questioned whether small farmers will pursue short-term gains at the expense of long term goals when their tenure is secure.

#### 10.2.2 Governmental Action

Government action takes the form of guiding and control in the protection of sustained use of natural resources. In Kyrgyzstan the special attention for the 'Ugodia' shows positive intentions of the government.

### **10.3 ASSESSMENT OF CHANGE IN (AGRICULTURAL) PRODUCTION**

#### 10.3.1 Indicators

Crop changes are an important indicator for changes in agricultural production. The government in Kyrgyzstan still has not fully withdrawn from influencing crop choices.

#### 10.3.2 Improvement of Rural Infrastructure

The poor infrastructure in Kyrgyzstan will hamper the full advantage of benefits from privatization of agriculture. Major constraint is the lack of funds at government level.

#### 10.3.3 Statistical Data

Statistical data on crop changes are presented in this paragraph. It is interesting to note the extension of agricultural (Ugodia?) land in the country since independence.

#### 10.3.4 Effects on Rural Living

Still not much of an effect on rural living by the land and agrarian reform except for the way in managing farms. There is an urgent need for more resources.

## **CHAPTER 11. ASSESSMENT OF CHANGE IN INCOME**

### **11.1 OBSERVATIONS AND INDICATORS**

#### **11.1.1 Observations**

Statistical data on income and minimum consumption budget show a persistent decline in possibilities to make a living for Kyrgyz citizens. These are the official data, there is an informal circuit that is hard to evaluate though.

#### **11.1.2 Indicators**

Because of the understandable reluctance to provide personal data on income, personal observations are the most important in this field.

## **CHAPTER 12. ASSESSMENT OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT**

### **12.1 THE PROSPERITY BRANCH OF THE MODEL**

#### **12.1.1 Indicators and Statistics**

Agricultural production is an important indicator also for economic development. For the prosperity paradigm at the macro level the GDP is used.

#### **12.1.2 Poverty Alleviation**

Reports on poverty alleviation show that although there are positive signs of the land and agrarian reform in this respect, there still is a long way to go.

#### **12.1.3 Economic Perspective**

Slowly the situation is improving. Inflation is more manageable and labor on farms seems to be increasingly in demand. Specific attention for agricultural production could support the development.

## **CHAPTER 13. CHANGE IN CONSUMPTION AND NUTRITIONAL STATUS**

### **13.1 SUSTAINABLE AGRICULTURAL PRODUCTION**

#### **13.1.1 New Approach toward Agricultural Production**

The threat of over-exploitation has been mentioned before. It is a remaining point of concern. Food production should intensively rely on application of new agricultural technology.

#### **13.1.2 Environmental Issues**

Attention for environmental issues is given in the National Food Security Policy Report. It remains to be seen how much of it is just rhetoric.

### **13.2 ASSESSMENT OF CONSUMPTION AND NUTRITIONAL STATUS**

#### **13.2.1 Measuring Consumption and Nutritional Status**

Ideally it is measuring of calorie intake, but that is under the given circumstances impossible to accomplish. Macro-economic indications are difficult to obtain as a result of the vast barter economy in food.

#### **13.2.2 Change in Demand for Specific Food**

Statistical data provides insight in changes in the food consumption and production pattern of the population.

#### 13.2.3 Growth Rate of the Population

Some statistical data on the development of the population in the country are given in this paragraph.

### 13.3 FOOD POLICY IN KYRGYZSTAN

#### 13.3.1 Food Policy Strategy

The not too positive Food Security Policy Report on July 1999. Wheat production is up and shows an almost sufficient level to be food secure. For meat the situation is much more difficult to influence.

#### 13.3.2 Assessment of the Food Security Situation

There is increased immigration from neighboring countries putting pressure on food production. The area of agricultural land increased since independence but not significantly.

#### 13.3.3 Access, Availability, and Utilization

There is a one-sided approach to food production with a tendency to neglect the two other elements in food security access and utilization. Special attention should be given to the urban population in respect of access and utilization.

## CHAPTER 14. THE LAND AND REAL ESTATE REGISTRATION PROJECT

### 14.1 NEW LAND REGISTRATION

#### 14.1.1 Contradictory Data and Poor Mapping

The preparatory phase of the project that started eight years after the privatization begun. Second hand data on land now available require careful check. The integrity of land related data.

#### 14.1.2 Renewal of Mapping

A short description of the poor cadastral mapping situation and the expectation of renewal by funds out of registration.

### 14.2 IMPLEMENTATION OF NEW REGISTRATION

#### 14.2.1 New Offices

The schedule of opening of new offices in annex D and the reality of today's Kyrgyzstan. The problem with fees for notaries.

#### 14.2.2 Stagnating Development

Some data on transfers in the newly opened offices. The continuing field inspections. The isolated position of the land and real estate registration project.

## CHAPTER 15. IMPLICATIONS OF NON-EVOLUTIONARY TENURE CHANGE

### 15.1 A WIDER APPROACH

#### 15.1.1 Emphasis on Equity

The 'production goes before distribution' thought scolded by Myrdal. More emphasis on equity is necessary. Three concerns about the decline in land reform by Ghonemy. The governmental action to safeguard (some of the) social functions of property.

#### 15.1.2 Not Only Economic Emphasis

There is a food problem in the world that demands special attention. Avoid creating a growing gap between 'haves' and 'have-nots'.

#### 15.1.3 Careful implementation of Reform

A pledge for careful implementation of land reform. Timely and taking into account the local circumstances. Too often expectations fail to deliver.

### 15.2 THE STANDARD MODEL

#### 15.2.1 Overall Picture

Presentation of a scheme of the standard model and its background.

#### 15.2.2 Details of the Standard Model

The various elements in the model elaborated.

#### 15.2.3 Implication of the Standard Model

Research showing the usefulness of application of the standard model. Kyrgyzstan still has to work on it.

### 15.3 INTEGRITY OF LAND RELATED DATA

#### 15.3.1 Compatibility of Land Related Data

Easily exchangeable data on land are a condition for good governing of a country because of the enormous contribution of land data to information for various functions of the government.

#### 15.3.2 A Possible Solution

The simple scheme of the apartment building for organizing land data. Multi-functional data to be managed by a centrally respected agency.

### 15.4 NEGLECTED DYNAMICS

#### 15.4.1 Visualization of Dynamics

There are a lot of dynamics in the link between land tenure change and food security improvement. Some of them are presented in this paragraph.

#### 15.4.2 Interdependency of the Two Paradigms

The model and the method show that there is no real possibility to separate the two paradigms. Working on land tenure change will imply both paradigms even when not intended!

#### 15.4.3 A Different Property Regime?

A pledge for new legislation containing a new concept of property regime that pays more attention to the social function and in that way closely continues a practice not uncommon in former communist countries.

## CHAPTER 16. CONCLUSIONS AND STATEMENTS

### 16.1 CONCLUSIONS

#### 16.1.1 Gathering Data

The problem to find and to use as much as possible clear and 'clean' data. Confusing definition changes.

#### 16.1.2 The Method for Rapid Assessment

Effects easily overlooked might be noted with the rapid assessment method developed in this research. It provides the project staff with more insight.

#### 16.1.3 Effects Take Time

There is no quick effect noticeable of land reform.

**16.1.4 Is There a Better Way?**

The more socially oriented way of life in Soviet times is neglected in the projects aiming at quick privatization to stimulate economic progress. There should be another way.

**16.2 STATEMENTS**

**16.2.1 Paragraph Specific Statements**

**16.2.2 Subject Specific Statements**

**16.2.3 General Statements**

**REFERENCES (Bibliography)**

**GLOSSARY OF TERMS**

**ANNEXES**

**ANNEX A (MAP OF KYRGYZSTAN)**

**B TRANSACTIONS WITH REAL PROPERTY IN BISHKEK CITY**

**C TWO PROSPERITY PARADIGMS COMPARED**

**D PROJECT SCHEDULE OF OPENING OF NEW LAND REGISTRATION OFFICES**

**E ARTICLE IN THE "TIMES OF CENTRAL ASIA", NOVEMBER 23, 2000**

**INDEX**