Tradition, rationality and social consciousness: the Singh Sabha, Arya Samaj and Ahmadiyah moral languages from colonial Punjab
van der Linden, B.

Citation for published version (APA):
van der Linden, B. (2004). Tradition, rationality and social consciousness: the Singh Sabha, Arya Samaj and Ahmadiyah moral languages from colonial Punjab
CHAPTER TWO

1. Punjab evangelicalism and indigenous voluntary movements

Would like to know what you are actually doing so as to give a more Christian stamp to your government, and leaven your people with Christianity. People in this country are watching your proceedings attentively, looking upon you as a worthy successor of John Lawrence, and in earnest in doing all you can to make known that only name whereby men can be saved. Whilst you have so much power, do, my dear friend, exert it to the utmost for good.

Mr. Tucker of the London Church Missionary Society (CMS) in a letter to Robert Montgomery, dated 22 July 1861.1

For six years, the earlier mentioned Robert Montgomery was Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab (1859-1865) and ever since a large district and its capital town (now in Pakistan) are named ‘Montgomery’ in his memory. Earlier, he spent more than seven years as Collector in Azamgarh (near Benares) under the direct authority of James Thomason. The latter was

Lieutenant-Governor of the North Western Provinces between 1843-1853 and became known as the co-founder of the earlier mentioned 'patronage bureaucracy' in north India. After the annexation of the Punjab in 1849, Thomason released twenty-eight officers to assist in the settlement of the region. More than half came from either Ulster or from Scotland and, like Thomason, all were Protestant evangelicals.\(^2\) Surprisingly, Montgomery was appointed personally by Governor-General Dalhousie (1848-1856) himself. Thomason received the following letter signed by Henry Elliot, Secretary to Dalhousie:

Governor-General’s Camp
Allahabad
12th March 1848

My dear Thomason,

Will you order up Montgomery from Cawnpore immediately? He will be a Commissioner of some sort, probably of the Lahore Division, on Rupees 2,400 a month – the Board of Administration will consist of the two Lawrences and Mansel.

Yrs. sincerely,
H.W. Elliot.

P.S. The G.G. will not declare his policy yet but within a fortnight I fancy you will receive a public letter calling for the selected Civilians. He will not take Temple.\(^3\)

Indeed, one might expect that to be appointed by the Governor-General in this fashion meant that Montgomery, like the men he had to work with, was a senior official, but, on the contrary, at this time his name was certainly unknown in England outside East India House in London. Hence also Elliot’s postscript remains interesting, as Dalhousie definitely made clear he did not want such a senior official as Richard Temple.

\(^2\) Montgomery, *Monty’s grandfather*, 41.
\(^3\) As cited in Ibid., xvii.
Montgomery succeeded John Lawrence as Lieutenant-Governor but, according to John Beames, he was 'a much milder, more refined and civilized man', who gradually mitigated the extreme rigour of Lawrence's system. Even so, throughout the second half of the nineteenth century, a quasi-official Christian evangelical administration ruled the Punjab. Paralleling liberal ideas about 'improvement', Protestant evangelicalism earlier experienced a crucial shift during the nineteenth century towards a social theology that made less of Biblical doctrines of inherent personal sinfulness, guilt and divine punishment and instead more of practical service to others through the 'duty' of hard work as self-denial. Thus following a muscular Christianity, the British came as conquerors and rulers, not as traders to the Punjab. They were cock-sure, knew what they came for, and were determined to make this corner of the Empire conform to the standards of evangelicalism in Great Britain. In fact, as Jeffrey Cox put it:

The geo-political expansion of Britain awakened in missionaries a fascination for strategic advance that generated extraordinarily inefficient missionary strategies. Robert Clark, the pioneer CMS missionary in Punjab from the time of his arrival in Amritsar in 1852, spent much of the rest of the century in attempting to create a frontier “chain” of missions, as if missionaries were military outposts.

Hence thirty years later Robert Clark could report that the Church Missionary Society ran the most extensive network of mission stations in the region, including 113 schools, where,

---

⁴ Beames, Memoirs, 102.
⁵ Cox, Imperial fault lines, 26.
⁶ Robert Clark, A brief account of thirty years of missionary work of the Church Missionary Society in the Panjab and Sindh, 1852-1882, Lahore 1883.
importantly, since 1890 the majority of the teachers were non-Christians. Moreover, many in the Punjab administration had a Protestant evangelical interest and hence missionaries working in the region often received the support of the provincial government. As a result, church and state together in the Punjab probably violated the traditional world more than elsewhere in the subcontinent. Though the activities of the evangelicals can not be taken as the determining agency, they surely worked as a catalyst to the emerging militancy of Punjabi traditions during the last quarter of the nineteenth century.

At the heart of the muscular Christianity reaching the Punjab lay, as Anthony Copley put it, 'a formidable, but intellectually narrow, millenarian, exclusive theology'. Yet, Punjab evangelicalism partly also was a response to the earlier British encounter with South Asian society to which the crux of the problem lay in the conflict of values characteristic of any colonial rule. Initially, agents of the East India Company soothed Indian values in the interest of profitable trade and so it was not until the second half of the eighteenth century, with the rise of a serious Parliamentary interest in Indian affairs, that the conflict came to the fore. Following the strengthening of English territorial power and the general growth in confidence after decades in the subcontinent, reforms were unleashed to bring the Company's administration more into line with English standards. While sympathetic to British Orientalism, Cornwallis’ Permanent Settlement (1793) can be taken as the first step towards Anglicism with its introduction of a Whig concept of private property protected by law in return for revenue liability and its liberal administrative reforms. Soon also the administration became closely connected to the institutions of the major Indian traditions. This involved not only the

---

7 Cox, Imperial fault lines, 196.
8 Copley, Religions in conflict, xiii.
9 As C.A. Bayly suggested 'the Orientalist impulse was deeply implicated with Christian principles, a feature which has been underplayed in studies of Orientalism in both its historical and pejorative sense' in British Orientalism and the Indian “Rational Tradition”, c. 1780-1820 in South Asia Research, 14, 1994, 8.
collection of revenue and taxes but also the management of estates and participation in public ceremonies associated with shrines and temples.

No doubt missionaries were opposed to the way the East India Company took on the role of regulator of Indian traditions. In their eyes the Company not only was tainted by such an association (and hence sometimes called ‘the dry nurse of Vishnu’) but it also made their attempt to convert these heathen communities more difficult. Though initially missionaries did not have much influence within the Company, during the 1830s the all-pervasive influence of both utilitarianism and evangelicalism brought church and state together. Following James Mill’s History of British India (1818), the British increasingly started to judge Indian traditions negatively through European eyes. Reforms followed, often supportive to the evangelical cause. A particular grievance among evangelicals, for example, was the Company’s protection of Hindu temples and hence evangelicals took it as a triumph when in 1840 the East India Company abolished the collection of Hindu pilgrim tax. If only, because the fact that Company’s new policy left temple management in the hands of Hindus rather than British officials, by involved Hindus was taken as a threat to the status and efficacy of these institutions and made them feel betrayed. Other pro-evangelical legislation the Company was to introduce, for example, was the Emancipation Act of 1850, granting rights of inheritance to Christian converts, and the permissive Widow Remarriage Act of 1856. The relationship between church and state nonetheless remained antagonistic. Missionaries generally distrusted the government and went their own way until the end of British rule, though at the same time they looked to the government to support them. As a result, the state often found itself in a complicated situation, especially as the evangelicals denounced anything that stood in the way of the propagation of the Gospel as sin. For indeed, overall missionaries followed a negative policy of reform: ‘an opposition to slavery and paganism as
much as to sexual wrongdoing and drunkenness'.\textsuperscript{10} Their stern moral absolutism was immutable, sacrosanct and certainly not open to negotiation. Moreover, over time, it was ‘infused by secular Victorian values, the very uncertainties of which added an even more compulsive element to the quest for a more ordered, spiritualized society’.\textsuperscript{11} Most relevant to this study, however, remains the fact that this conscience often also became the conscience of South Asia towards matters of morality, as the process coincided with a commitment to social reform among a small group of educated Indians.

Implicit in the East India Company’s role as regulator of Indian traditions was the typical nineteenth century notion of ‘neutrality’ in religious affairs. Particularly after the dissolution of the East India Company in 1858, it was argued that the power and authority of the government should never be used to promote missionary goals. Hence, the British made a distinction between the public and private personalities of officials, restricting the public personality to the observance of ‘neutrality’, while allowing the private personality the right to follow the promptings of personal conscience. Yet much can be argued against this idea of ‘neutrality’ by the state in South Asia. Queen Victoria’s Proclamation of 1858 to the Princes, Chiefs and People of India, for example, shows how Janus-faced the colonial policy towards Indian religions was:

Firmly relying ourselves on the truth of Christianity, and acknowledging with gratitude the solace of religion, we disclaim alike the right and the desire to impose our convictions on any of our subjects. We declare it to be our royal will and pleasure that none be in anywise favoured, none molested or disquieted, by reason of their religious

\textsuperscript{10} Copley, \textit{Religions in conflict}, 11.
\textsuperscript{11} Ibid., 13. Cf. Dewey, \textit{Anglo-Indian attitudes}, Chapter Two (The making of an evangelical).
faith or observances, but that all shall alike enjoy the equal and impartial protection of
the law... And it is our further will that, so far as may be, our subjects, of whatever
race or creed, be freely and impartially admitted to offices in our service, the duties of
which they may be qualified, by their education, ability, and integrity, duly to
discharge.12

So here, on the one hand, the principle of religious ‘neutrality’ and accordingly the
equality of all religions, and on the other, the public pronouncement that Christianity formed
the foundation for British government in South Asia.13 But could it be otherwise? Culturally,
all British (including the so-called secular ones) were Christians -as most Indians perceived
them anyway, whatever the ‘official’ statement. Though they might not be actively devout
themselves, they nonetheless had been brought up in a society that firmly believed the
Christian way to be the only truth. Therefore, the complicating fact for late nineteenth century
Europe (in particular) was the claim that you could have a morality without Christianity (and
be an atheist), while the morality which you must have in the end was Christian. The point is
that, at one time or the other, the policy of religious ‘neutrality’ towards Indian traditions had
to conflict with the programme for promoting the material and moral progress to which the
British were committed in the subcontinent and, hence, with the Christian faith which they
believed to be the foundation for such progress. To be ‘neutral’ demands sympathy and no
doubt this was difficult for a ruler convinced of his own righteousness and ability and often
also ‘morally’ outraged by practices tolerated by Indian traditions. The policy of religious

12 Queen Victoria's Proclamation, 1 November 1858 in C.H. Philips, H.L. Singh and B.N. Pandey (eds.), The
the dissolution of the East India Company, abdication of the Mughal Emperor (who until that time still had a
court in Delhi) and claim of absolute authority over the subcontinent by the Crown instead.
13 In this context also it was possible for the earlier mentioned James Thomason to declare himself officially
‘neutral’ in religion and at the same time translate Church of England Prayer Book into Hindustani for Indian
‘neutrality’ particularly was violated during the process of Anglo-Indian colonial state-formation in the second half of the nineteenth century. By then, not only the British intensified their relationships with indigenous institutions and individuals, but, alternatively, Indians themselves increasingly also sought contact with the state for financial support and legitimacy.

Punjab evangelicalism started when in 1834 American Presbyterians set up the first major mission beyond Delhi in Ludhiana. It became the headquarters for later expansion into the Punjab and a center for education, publishing and proselytism. Naturally there were almost no Christians in the Punjab at the time, but this would soon change. To aid missionary efforts, British officials in 1852 helped the foundation of a Church Missionary Association in Lahore under the leadership of Sir Henry Lawrence.14 The major missionary societies in the region were well-established Protestant evangelical ones: the Church Missionary Society of England, Anglicans from the Church of England, Presbyterians from the Church of Scotland and two north-American Presbyterian denominations. With amazing speed they published tracts, pamphlets and works in Punjabi, Hindi, Urdu, Persian and Kashmiri: indeed, besides grammars, dictionaries and translations of the scriptures, especially also writings attacking indigenous beliefs and practices. An extensive network of mission-schools was established, recognized and supported by the government and fundamental to the spread of Western education and Christian ideas, if not a channel for catechizing. In addition, missionaries opened up well-equipped hospitals and orphanages, and regularly preached at the bazaar (market) and mela (village fair), where they were seen as a public spectacle, ‘involving as

14 The latter was the elder brother of John Lawrence and already active in the Punjab for a long time. He had always opposed annexation, believing that the Punjab should remain a buffer state against the rowdy pathans of the north west frontier. As the permanent British Resident in Lahore after the first Anglo-Sikh war of 1846, he was virtually ruler of the province. During early British rule, Henry was John’s boss in the three men Board of Administration set up by Lord Dalhousie to govern the Punjab. While working together in Lahore, however, the Lawrence-brothers disliked each other so much, that eventually they refused to meet, and communicated only through the third Board member, Robert Montgomery.
they did camels, tents, magic lanterns, and in some instances women preaching in public to
women'.
Perhaps the best illustration of the direct link between government and mission
however remain the Christian ‘model-colonies’ with modern farming facilities. Then again, it
did not take long however before Punjabis reacted negatively to Christian conversions as
well. When during the 1880s thousands of Punjabi men (and some women) began to demand
baptism from missionaries (especially in the central districts around Lahore and Amritsar),
this alarmed indigenous leaders and led to anti-missionary feelings in the province.

Of more importance than these increasing emotional tensions, however, remains the fact
that the Christian missionaries introduced new forms of organization and action to the
region. Voluntary associations of course were not new to South Asia. For many centuries,
indigenous movements had ‘drawn individuals to them on the basis of belief rather than
birth’. Yet, Christians ‘carried with them the concepts and forms of weekly congregational
meetings held by structured societies with formal membership and sets of written rules’,
which made a fundamental difference. Indeed, ‘it was the presence of mission institutions that
set off the most profound Indian reaction to the mission presence’. In fact, the Punjab was
the first Province to have its own independent indigenous Christian Church Council in 1872.
Furthermore, all this happened in the context of a politico-legal frame within which the new
organizational forms could originate and sustain themselves. Associations registered with the
Anglo-Indian colonial state had the legal right to own property and conduct business. A
complex network of English oriented law came into being, which gave legitimacy and
permanency to an unfamiliar form of social organization based on voluntary membership and
individually assumed contractual obligations. Fundamental to the whole process was the Re-

15 Cox, Imperial fault lines, 53.
16 Ibid., 3. By 1890 there were more Christians than Sikhs in South Asia.
17 Brush, Protestantism in the Punjab, Chapter One.
18 Jones, Socio-religious reform, 215.
gistration of Societies Act of 1860: conservative within the Western tradition this law was revolutionary in the South Asian context. Modern Indian voluntary associations (called sabhas, anjumans and samajes) were established throughout the subcontinent, with officers, constitutions, by-laws and annual reports. In the Punjab, this first happened (as will be explained below) mostly in Lahore, from where the different movements then spread their message to a large number of provincial districts and towns.

Moreover, while the Christian voluntary association provided Indian society with the example of a new form of organization with a legalistic character, Christian missionaries presented new forms of action as well. Apart from educational and social work, missionaries particularly were in search for converts and, continuously, often for local traditional leaders against whom they could prove their one and only truth through polemical debates. Or as Sayyid Ahmad Khan put it in his well-known Urdu treatise on the causes of the 1857 Indian Mutiny, Asbab-e-baghavat-e-Hind (1859):

The missionaries took on new forms of preaching. They printed and circulated controversial religious books, in the shape of questions and answers. Holy men of other faiths were spoken of in these books in a most offensive manner. In Hindustan it was the custom that everyone preached and explained his views in his own religious place or house and if anyone wished he could go there to listen. But the method of the missionaries was exactly the opposite. They used to go to public meeting grounds, places of pilgrimage and fairs, to preach, while no one hindered them solely out of fear of the authorities. In fact, in some districts it became the custom to escort the missionaries with a chaprasi (peon) from the local police station. Besides, the

19 Ibid.
20 Cox, Imperial fault lines, 7.
missionaries were not satisfied to talk only about their New Testament, on the contrary, in violent and abusive language they began to attack the holy men and places of other creeds, insulting the feelings of those who listened to them and so sowing the seeds of unrest in the hearts of the people.21

Indigenous movements nonetheless became used to these practices, copied them and thus seriously compromised with their opponents. It permitted, importantly, the growth of diverse, specialized and autonomous associate groups, wherein action came to be based on pragmatic wisdom and techniques typical of successful entrepreneurship. Undoubtedly, the example given by the Christian missionaries of the functioning (and success) of being organized into a voluntary association remains seminal here. For when subsequently Punjabi voluntary movements increasingly confronted each other, Christian missionaries and the Anglo-Indian colonial state, they surely created a disturbing legacy for Punjabi society.

More difficult to answer but central to this study remains the question how far Christian 'moralism' influenced the 'moral languages' propagated by these movements. What can be said with certainty, however, is that Christian missionaries first of all were institution builders: 'The overwhelming majority of missionaries were not wandering preachers in search of converts but institution-builders presiding over churches, schools, and hospitals'.22

It was not in the open air, but mostly in an institutional setting (still visible today) that Punjabis met Christian missionaries. As such, particularly teachers and administrators were responsible for the broader Christian 'moral' influence in Punjabi society. The fact that, over time, the majority of them were Indian (running schools such as Delhi's St. Stephen's College

21 Ahmad Khan, Asbab-e-baghavat, 42. At the time of writing this work, Sayyid Ahmad Khan already had been employed for twenty years in the judicial administration of the East India Company. Loyal to the British, he
and Lahore's Forman College up to today) only makes clear the long-term effect. Conversely, Chapter Four will reveal how polemics as apologetic answers to the criticism of Christian missionaries led to a 'comparative moral consciousness'. This was crucial, while according to the missionaries Indians generally failed to come up to the standard of Western humanitarianism and liberalism that Christianity had absorbed. In so far as the missions were successful, their attractiveness lay in this moral and humanitarian superiority: theology won few converts. The Christian polemic therefore should be seen as a highly concentrated and specifically moral form of general infiltration of Western culture, which was decidedly influential among Indian elites. The latter alone saw the point of the missionary attack and hence produced 'moral languages', while subalterns on hearing missionaries either paid no attention or just joined the Christian fold. To restate my point, the Christian 'moralism' that influenced Indian reformers was not distinctively 'Christian' as it included the values of liberal humanitarianism dominant in nineteenth century Europe, i.e. the 'civilizing mission' to which alternatively the growing focus on and reorganization of 'education' was decisive.

2. Anglo-vernacular education and print culture

The role of English language education unquestionably has been fundamental to the making of modern South Asia. Everyone knows the importance of English as a link-language in contemporary India as well as Pakistan, despite the fact that Hindi and Urdu are the 'official languages' of these countries. As far as early British policy is concerned, the debate between Orientalists (who wanted to continue instruction through the traditional classical languages:

helped evacuating European residents from the town of Bijnor during the Mutiny and, on behalf of the British, even took charge of the district.
Arabic, Persian and Sanskrit) and Anglicists (who wished to use English) was crucial. More important, however, were the acceptance of Macaulay's Minute on Education of 1835, which recommended the spread of Western learning through English,23 and Charles Wood's Education Dispatch of 1854, which banned Bibles from the schools and decreed that government education should be exclusively secular. Eventually the Orientalists lost to the Anglicists at the level of higher instruction, while at the levels of primary and secondary education, they lost to regional vernaculars -which anyway remained inferior in status to Anglo-vernacular education.24 In reality, however, the role of the colonial government was quite limited. Though there was an attempt to organize a modern system of education, it was principally (and this remains crucial) the result of private initiative. The colonial government, instead, confined its role to that of assisting private -mostly missionary- enterprise, hoping that through educating the indigenous elite, modern knowledge would filter down to the masses.

In pre-colonial days, most Muslim mosques, Hindu mandirs and Sikh gurdwaras in the Punjab had a school attached. In the course of colonial state formation the British patronized many of these institutions. One of the proposals of Charles Wood's Dispatch was to give grant-in-aid to schools carried on by voluntary effort, provided that they accepted government inspection and guidance of the 'secular' part of their work. Indeed, what the British found lacking in Indian systems of education was 'moral' instruction and hence their policies

---

22 Cox, Imperial fault lines, 7.

23 Thomas Babington Macaulay (1800-1859) came to India as an inexperienced law member of the legislative council of India and was heavily involved in the creation of the body of Anglo-Indian law. Already in 1837 he made a draft of the penal code, which remarkably unscathed survived twenty years of detailed criticism and was officially enacted in 1860. He became more famous, however, as an historian and especially because of two by now legendary statements. First, he declared that a single shelf of a good European library was worth the whole native literature of Indian and Arabia. Second, he believed that a thorough English educational system to be introduced in India would create a class of persons, Indian in blood and colour, but English in taste, in opinion, in morals and in intellect.

24 The term 'Anglo-vernacular education' stresses the language skills that resulted from a public educational program combining knowledge of vernacular languages with English education. It was first imparted at mission and state schools and later at educational institutions set up by indigenous elites.
favoured the patronage of what was deemed to be ‘secular’ learning even in institutions they defined as ‘religious’ (though they allowed the management of the latter to give such religious instruction to their pupils as they thought appropriate). Nonetheless, in the end Christian missionaries took most advantage of government aid, especially in the Punjab where in 1883, thirty years after the Dispatch, thirty of the thirty-one aided Anglo-vernacular secondary schools -including all of the government aided high schools- were Christian missionary institutions.25.

Besides the dominance of mission schools, the introduction of Christian ‘moralism’ was strengthened by the British adherence to Anglo-vernacular education. Wherever the public education system was offered (in mission, state or later indigenous schools), in most places it meant a combination of knowledge of vernacular languages with that of English language and culture. As a result, a tiny but influential bilingual (if not polyglot) privileged elite was educated, for whom language skills were a form of capital. This remains crucial because it offered to the new patron of learning (the so-called 'neutral' Anglo-Indian colonial state) the possibility to invent, as Gauri Viswanathan argued, an entire academic discipline for the teaching of English literature as the formative ‘moral influence’ on a colonized elite, which would have far-reaching consequences for the emergence of new indigenous literary and ‘moral languages’.26 On the whole, a single vision inspired public education in India from its beginning and would continue to do so, as we all know, up to today. At the heart of it was a belief in the unquestioned superiority of Western culture and values: ‘for Indian students, salvation lay only in the abandonment of their decadent traditions and acceptance of the values of the West’.27 The textbooks invited students to identify themselves ‘not with the

25 Brush, Protestant in the Punjab, 251.
26 Viswanathan, Masks of conquest.
27 Walsh, Growing up in British India, 5.
backwardness of the Indian past but with the enlightenment of the British present. Because the British had brought peace and justice to the subcontinent, it was argued, 'they were worthy of imitation, being, with few exceptions, a noble, brave, and self-sacrificing people'. Over time, many Indian schoolboys and (to a much lesser extent) girls accepted the invitation. If only because, besides the prospect of financial prosperity (a working knowledge of English meant twice the salary), the completion of Anglo-vernacular education for them meant the hope of cultural enlightenment. Well-known in this context also are the Indian social reformers, who (since the beginning of the nineteenth century) glorified Western civilization in comparison to their own. In Musafiran-e-Landan (1869), for example, Sayyid Ahmad Khan, after his journey to London, not only universally praised the workings of British society, but decisively compared it with everything to be found in South Asia, as being the difference between a talented and beautiful boy and a wild and dirty animal in rags. However, as the educated gained experience with the realities of British rule (especially the racial inequality within the Raj), gratitude often changed to bitter disappointment.

Importantly, familiarity with Anglo-vernacular education at the same time also meant an increasing dependence on the printed word. The printing press came to the subcontinent as part of a full-blown technology and therefore did not take centuries to develop like in Europe. Obviously it overall led to a 'standardization' of languages as typography arrested linguistic drift (though the way this happened through local linguistic knowledge and scripts certainly remains an interesting subject to be studied). At the end of the eighteenth century, the first dictionaries and grammars not only standardized Indian languages but also made it possible to set them in type. The casting of type fonts was completed soon afterwards and obviously

28 Ibid., 6.
29 Ibid.
30 Ahmad Khan, Musafiran, 183-184. On his return from London, Sayyid Ahmad Khan started his reformist journal, Tahzib ul-Aklaq or Refinement of morals, modeled on the Spectator.
quickened the production of inexpensive printed texts. Translations of scriptures and commentaries into the vernacular languages now became available to a wider -though still limited- literate audience than could respond to works written in Sanskrit, Arabic or Persian. Undoubtedly, ‘print culture’ performed the role of a midwife in the process of intellectual change. The printed word increasingly became the norm, replacing the oral, person to person and often ritual, systems of transmission of knowledge, while people once prohibited by birth from education (like women) now had access to knowledge formerly only studied by a small elite.31

By and large, there emerged a concern for ‘rationality’ as opposed to rote learning or, to put it differently, for the ‘meaning’ instead of the ‘sound’ of a word. Like in the case of Europe during the Reformation, therefore, the importance of ‘print culture’ can not be stressed enough in the making, acceptance and use of authoritative ‘moral languages’. Not only there was a larger availability of printed works in numerous languages but one also became more aware of language itself. Through grammars, dictionaries, etymologies and other reference works (often produced by Christian missionaries) vernaculars became standardized.32 Furthermore, under the influence of English modes of writing, new genres like the earlier mentioned biographies, novels and poems emerged, while one generally became increasingly preoccupied with the ‘rationality’ of the language used (both in writing and speech). Well-known Urdu reformer, Muhammad Husain Azad (1830-1910),33 for example, was fed up with the extensive use of hyperboles or exaggerated statements made for


32 Although the scholarly study of Indian languages for some British had its own intrinsic attractions, the dominant impetus behind these reference works was to provide vernacular translations of the Bible.

33 Muhammad Husain Azad worked for the Punjab Education department where he produced school textbooks in Urdu. Over time he was exposed to Victorian ideas of what poetry should be, which decisively influenced his criticism of Urdu poetry.
effect, not intended to be taken literally. Instead, properly in the Aligarh tradition, he
propagated a preference for ‘natural’ writings embodying an aesthetic of realism, whether in
its depiction of history or the external world. Or as he put it in *Ab-e Hayat* or *Water of life*
(1880):

> The common principle of English writing is whatever thing or inner thought you write
about, you should present it in such a way that you arouse the same state —of
happiness, or grief, or anger, or pity, or fear, or fervour— in the heart as is aroused by
experiencing or witnessing the thing itself.\(^34\)

In 1911, nearly 600 books were published in Urdu, over 450 in Punjabi and about eighty
both in English and Hindi. These not only included traditional forms of prose and poetry but
also new literary genres like the novel. The political and socio-cultural concerns of Punjabis,
however, especially came to be reflected in their journalistic activity. A total of two-hundred
and nine newspapers (though few were of real importance and many little more than adverti-
sing sheets) owned by Punjabis were published in 1903: 31 in English, 1 in English and Urdu,
164 in Urdu, 6 in Hindi and 7 in Punjabi. The leading papers more or less were mouthpieces
of various groups criticizing each other and the colonial government in their editorial co-
lumns. The *Tribune* and the *Observer* (both published in English from Lahore) respectively
were the leading Hindu and Muslim papers. On the whole, more than half of printed
publications were published from Lahore (with Amritsar following after a wide margin).\(^35\)
The point however is that newspapers framed opinion, impassioned it. The weight of the
press was not argument but assertion; not the making of opinion but its strengthening.

\(^34\) As cited in Pritchett, *Nets of awareness*, 143.
\(^35\) Imperial Gazetteer of India, Provincial series: Punjab, vol. 1, Calcutta 1908, 144.
Undeniably new modes of ‘communication’ influenced the issues and strategies of those involved in South Asian traditions. Indian elites increasingly became involved with both Anglo-vernacular education and print culture. As during the European Reformation, modern printing techniques led to a process of ‘scripturalism’. Complex set of teachings were summarized and put into print, furnishing a basic statement of belief for a particular community. Furthermore, as print shaped the popular dissemination of religious teachings and an entire style of religious education, it also fostered sectarianism. Printed works made room for internal debate, whipped up differences and generally advanced the extent to which tradition became part of debates in the new ‘public sphere’. The importance of an oral debate was often found less in the event itself than in the formulaic presentation of the event in publications. Moreover, ‘printed texts made possible ever more detailed standards for correct knowledge and behavior: the medium permitted the message’. Consequently, as in Europe, print culture disseminated elite norms through a widespread circulation of what might be called high cultural texts and textual norms, particularly through the aspirations of upwardly mobile groups as part of the processes later described as Sanskritization and Ashrafization, among Hindus and Muslims respectively.

All the same, it should be stressed that ‘print culture’ did not influence Indian traditions so much as it did Western Christianity since the Reformation. A word of warning therefore about the stressing of uniformity and authority of the printed word in the dissemination of well-defined bodies of moral doctrines. For indeed up to today much of Indian traditions continued to be transmitted orally and hence the way new ideas were spread, was far less defined or coherent. Personal discussion of ideas enabled Indians to make their own choices

36 Barbara D. Metcalf, Imagining community: polemic debates in colonial India in Jones (ed.), Religious controversy, 234
37 Ibid., Perfecting women, 26.
of the ideas they heard, to impose their own understanding on them, rendering the content of the message more diffuse and complex. Partly, of course, this could be compensated for by the skill of the reformer speaking, who might use rhetorical devices of repetition and recapitulation, and who sought to attract his audience back to hear further speech, in which poorly understood points might be clarified or reinforced. Whether this was sufficient to create any uniformity of belief remains to be questioned. What is certain, however, is that it created fervour and impatience for change.

Otherwise, by the 1880s, there were only around 55,000 Indians (on a total population of 195 million) who wrote and spoke English with relative skill and had at least a passing familiarity with the cultural assumptions and values of the West. In relation to this, two contemporary Indian authors did not only describe how knowledge of English became a status marker but, more interestingly, also how in reality few Indians had a genuine proficiency in the English language, despite their confidence in it. In Dilli darbar darpan (1877), Bhartendu Harishchandra comically describes how he witnessed at the Delhi darbar (where Queen Victoria was declared Empress of India, Kaisar-i-Hind) the Nawab of Luharu unhesitatingly rattling away in English doing a lot of damage to grammar and idiom. Similarly, Nazir Ahmad (1836-1912) voiced his criticism of Sayyid Ahmad Khan’s Westernized way of life and belief in natural philosophy (necharal filasafti) in a satirical novel called Ibn-ul-vaqt or Thê time server (1889). In it, for example, he describes how his main character, who thinks he has become quite an Englishman already, understands English in a most peculiar way and, after desperate efforts to learn it, still could not converse in it without much difficulty at the

38 The 1891 Punjab Census counted only 19,274 out of an approximate population of twenty-three million that could speak and write English.
39 Harishchandra, Dilli darbar, 102.
end of his life. Examples like these refer to a fundamental underlying process that took place during the last two centuries: how because of the linguistic knowledge of a small but influential group of Indians, the English language as well as, more significantly, South Asian languages changed linguistically in some crucial ways during the colonial interaction.

Today, the English spoken in South Asia obviously has traveled its own idiosyncratic journey since the guardians of its purity left (anyone who has been there must have picked up some peculiar colloquial examples). Interestingly, as the British up to just fifty years ago had their Anglo-Indian language of which *Hobson-Jobson* (1886) remains the legendary memorial, many English words, in turn, have taken on new 'Hinglish' meanings. ‘Indian English’ indeed went through a similar development as American English, creating its own grammatical rules, syntax and vocabulary. Moreover, in course it produced a unique body of literature, from which for example a writer like Salman Rushdie frequently draws words and phrases. Yet, my point is that one should imagine how difficult it was during the early colonial interaction, to come to terms with a language created in a distant world. Driven by curiosity and the need to understand, Arya Samajists Pandit Gurudatta and Lala Ruchi Ram Sahni, for example, while both students in Lahore, wrestled with the foreign concepts in John Stuart Mill’s *Utilitarianism* (1861):

We read and re-read Mill’s small book line by line, or paragraph by paragraph, discussing, arguing, differing or agreeing in the end, as we went along. Now and again, we could not ‘do’ more than a sentence or two in the course of one hour, for either we could not agree as to what the author’s real meaning was or, for some other

---

40 Ahmad, *Ibn ul-vaqat*, 8. Among many other things, Nazir Ahmad translated the Indian penal code into Urdu and wrote the first ‘novels’ (which are in fact more reforming tales, written to illustrate a social or moral theme) in that same language.
reason, the whole time was taken up with the discussion about all the implications of
the passage or how far we could ourselves accept his lead.42

Learning a new language means learning to analyze one's experience of reality in a
completely different manner. Moreover, learning to read is different from learning by reading.
While the role of works in English (and of course the English language itself) became
increasingly important in South Asia, it has to be stressed that there were many different
(often imaginative) and conflicting readings of them. In the next Chapters, when discussing
the making of the Arya Samaj, Singh Sabha and Ahmadiyah ‘moral languages’, I will give
some examples of how each interpretation of English works was dependent on who was
reading them, in what state, with what knowledge and with what purpose. Yet, first I want to
finish my general description of the emergence of a Punjabi public sphere by turning to the
cultural and administrative center of the region, the city of Lahore, where there emerged a
subculture of elitist Punjabi public men.

3. A subculture of public men: the Brahma Samaj and Anjuman-i-Punjab in Lahore

British rule encouraged urbanization in the Punjab, especially in those places that became
administrative centers for the Anglo-Indian colonial state. Much of it came in the new parts of
the towns and cities, i.e. in the Civil and Military Lines outside of the old mostly Mughal city
walls. Actually, the region counted only three cities, which controlled most of the long

41 Yule, H. and A.C. Burnell, Hobson-Jobson, a glossary of colloquial Anglo-Indian words and phrases... -
edited by William Crooke-, London 1903. See further on both ‘Hobson-Jobson’ and ‘Hinglish’: Salman Rushdie,
distance trade and some manufacturing: Lahore, Amritsar and Delhi. Smaller towns like Rawalpindi, Multan, Ambala, Jullunder, Patiala and Sialkot mostly served as centres of specialized manufacturing. Lahore was the centre for various engineering, educational, police and railroad administrative units; since 1867 an episcopal See of the Church of England; and the headquarters of an army division. Accordingly, the city attracted a constant stream of visitors from other parts of India and Europe, many of whom spent their time there lecturing and debating cultural, economic and political themes. After his visit to Lahore in 1867, twenty-three year old liberal and radical imperialist Charles Dilke (1843-1911), whose brilliant political career ended prematurely because of a typical Victorian adultery scandal, wrote the following interesting statement in his immensely popular *Greater Britain* (1868): ‘Lahore has been a British city for nineteen years. Bombay for two centuries and more; yet Lahore is far more English than Bombay’. Though this might seem a strange thought at first, Lahore was a city with large Civil and Military Lines where one clearly could see ‘the complexities, the internal stratification and the attitudinal differences that characterized British society at home’. Naturally the city was much smaller than Calcutta or Bombay -though its population had grown after annexation with sixty percent between 1855-1881 to 149.369 and subsequently reached 474.181 in 1901. Yet, because of its time of annexation, Lahore was an Imperial provincial capital, architecturally displaying the pomp and splendour of the Raj (as still can be witnessed today in particular all along the Mall road -though now, of course, renamed Muhammad Ali Jinnah road- from the Civil Secretariat to the Lahore cantonment

43 Charles W. Dilke, *Greater Britain: a record of travels in English speaking countries during 1866 and 1867*, vol. II, London 1868, 288. In this book, Dilke offered the British a vision of themselves as a benevolent master race. Interestingly, John Stuart Mill not only complained to Dilke about ‘the insolence of the English in India’ but also chided Dilke for referring to the Bengalis as ‘mere savages’, while according to him some of them were ‘the most cultivated of all Hindus’ in Letter to Dilke, 8 February 1869 in J.M. Robson (ed.), *The collected works of John Stuart Mill*, vol. 17, 1561-62.
44 Kerr, *Urbanization and colonial rule*, 220.
across the upper Bari doab canal) and the center of cultural and intellectual life in northwest India.45

In this urban setting, a crucial interaction took place between British from different social and professional backgrounds and an equally various indigenous elite. A whole 'subculture' came into existence dominated by a new Lahori elite, who had followed Anglo-vernacular education, immersed themselves in print culture and, generally, found employment in one or the other government institution. Or as Prakash Tandon put it:

Lahore was the first town to start schools and Colleges, and although educational facilities spread all over the Punjab, higher education in arts, science, medicine, law, engineering, teaching and veterinary science was concentrated in Lahore. Each generation, my grand-uncle, father, uncle and we ourselves, studied at Lahore. When you settled in a profession or service, most of your colleagues were old friends from Lahore; you married into some family whose sons and daughters had been to Lahore. Gradually people also began to retire to Lahore. Thus Lahore came to acquire a very special position in our society. There was an overall class of Punjabi professionals who had been educated in Lahore, and this was not a caste of birth and inheritance, for in many Colleges, especially those started by charitable trusts, there was a large number of students from humble homes in towns and villages.46

Members of this Lahore elite belonged to the upcoming Indian 'public men', who together formed a power bloc the like of which had never existed in pre-colonial society.

45 An illustration of the growing predominance of Lahore for example remains the fact that in 1877 the Punjab government closed Delhi College and so deprived the city of higher education.
46 Tandon, Punjabi century, 192.
While the Anglo-Indian colonial state more and more penetrated Punjabi society and, alternatively, gained much knowledge of the region and its inhabitants, its workings obviously also became more bureaucratic, more reliant on the 'archive'. In terms of intellectual change, this undoubtedly was crucial to the making of the elitist Lahori subculture mentioned above, particularly as the creation and maintenance of the 'archive' gradually was helped by private indigenous initiatives along government lines. On the whole, therefore, the 'archival depth' of Lahori society (and thus of the Punjab at large) was reinforced with the building of public and private libraries, as well as all sorts of (mostly government) institutions housing an ever-increasing amount of documents and statistics. An impetus to the creation of this 'collective memory' unmistakably was the remarkable growth of the legal profession. Following colonial numbers and terminology, around the turn of century, the Punjab was 'the most litigious province' of British India, relatively to the population: 'in 1901 the number of suits instituted was 11.4 per 1,000 of the population, the next highest figure being 9.6 in Bombay'. Whatever the intensity of litigation in the Punjab, however, the point is that legal cases led to a more widespread desire for written standard and documentation validated in Anglo-Indian courts.

Similarly, in this Lahori version of the emerging world of Indian public men, scientific knowledge and standard time (as celebrated by the clock tower in cities and towns throughout the subcontinent) were internalized in ways that were qualitatively new. While, generally, the different modes of knowledge and of spreading information speeded up the awareness of 'time', some among the Punjabi public men (indeed very few women) began to keep personal diaries as a record of their division of time and a measure of the routines of their lives. Later

these notes would develop into autobiographies, introducing a new literary genre. In an interesting study, Judith Walsh studied over a hundred of these autobiographies written in English, groping after 'the psychological consequences of growing up in British India for those who had to combine the heritage of their traditional world with the pressing realities of foreign power and Western education'. While documents and statistics can give us facts of change, these autobiographies -despite their obvious limitations- tell us much about what it all meant 'from the inside' for those involved: how one began to make archives of one's own life and how, at least in the reconstructed sphere of self-identity, Macaulay was beginning to win the day.

Still, more intriguing in relation to the Singh Sabha, Arya Samaj and Ahmadiyah movements, remain the activities of those public men who were specifically religiously involved. As such, there emerged so-called 'lay leaders' within the different traditions, who often had urban professions in the field of law, journalism and teaching, while the more successful among them were able to support themselves simply by either their managing, writing or preaching activities. They came to be seen as experts, even though they did not receive traditional teaching or initiation like the mahants, ulama and Brahmans (heirs of the traditional mainly orally transmitted modes of learning). These lay leaders were crucial, as they were not just engaged in aping the West but also in exploring and constructing avenues to come to terms with the altered historical situation. Though they would replace traditional leadership, characteristically, they identified with communities rather than with the Western-educated class as a whole. Of course, such patterns of participation more or less reflected existing identities but now membership of one of the newly emerged voluntary associations strengthened that identification. Even so, during the 1860s and 1870s, some of the associations established in the Punjab were joint societies (between Hindus, Muslims and Sikhs),

49 Walsh, *Growing up in British India*, ix.
while on the whole Muslims (unlike in Calcutta, Bombay and Madras, the majority in the region) were more involved than Hindus and Sikhs in associations during this initial period. Rapid social change, however, made that all this would soon belong to the past, as Sikhs and Hindus became more and more active in public life and the perspectives of the different communities on both themselves and one another shifted.

Looking back, the Brahma Samaj (dominated by Bengalis) and the Anjuman-i-Punjab (being a mutual effort of Punjabi elites and the British) were the two most important movements during those early decades of colonial rule. They were at the heart of the process of coming to terms with the changing cultural environment and, as such, provided the platforms where influential Punjabis could hone their skills at oratory, public campaigns, government lobbying and so on. Bengalis followed in the footsteps of the British into the Punjab. Most of them settled in the towns, where they, often as members of the Brahma Samaj, came to dominate the social and intellectual world. Or as one contemporary Sikh (thus no Hindu or Bengali), Bhagat Lakshman Singh (1863-1944), put it:

To belong to the Brahma Samaj or to rank amongst its sympathizers was to belong to the intellectual aristocracy of Lahore. The Brahma Samaj mandir was, thus, the only place where one could hope to meet Indians of advanced views on religion and social reform.

50 Edward D. Churchill, Muslim societies of the Punjab, 1860-1890 in Punjab Past and Present, 8, 1974, 72.
52 Singh, Autobiography, 40-41. Bhagat Lakshman Singh was closely associated with almost all the modern Sikh associations during his life and hence his autobiography contains interesting comments on voluntary movements then active within the different communities in the Punjab.
The 'society for the transcendent deity' (Brahmo Samaj) was established in Calcutta by Ram Mohan Roy (1772-1833), who clearly was a precocious young man, for already at a young age he wrote a Persian tract which criticized idolatry and polytheism and echoed the rational deistic thought imbibed during his earlier Islamic study in Patna. Afterwards, Roy became acquainted with the Serampore missionaries: he learned English, helped them with the translation of the New Testament in Bengali and set himself to study Christianity (especially its Unitarian variety) seriously. In fact, in 1821 Roy started a mission for the propagation and defense of Hindu Unitarianism, which nonetheless had little success and soon was dissolved. Though influenced by Christian Unitarianism, at the same time he felt that Hindu ‘scriptures’ contained all fundamental truths. What remains crucial, however, is that on the basis of his own individual ‘rational’ judgement, Roy chose to substitute some of these works (while relying heavily on the Vedas and the Upanishads) for priests as the sources of proper knowledge. Subsequently, translations of them in printed vernaculars as well as English circulated widely in Bengal and eventually beyond. Ram Mohan Roy established the Brahmo Samaj in 1828 but soon after that left for England, where he died three years later. The movement remains one of the first signs that Indians (in this case Hindus) ‘rationally’ reassessed their heritage as part of their interaction with the West. Its members were theists and opposed idol worship, emphasizing spiritual devotion to God rather than elaborate external ritual, while at the same time they appreciated Western science and especially Christianity. Over time, however, the Brahmos, first under the leadership of Debendranath Tagore (1817-1905), separated from the mainstream of Hindu society and practice, developing into a distinct community of faith governed by its own marriage laws and famous for its activities in the field of social reform.
The Lahore Brahmoo Samaj was founded in 1863 and was an offshoot of the earlier movement. Besides the missionaries and the government, they were the first to own a printing press for the propagation of their ideas. Despite being Bengali speakers, Brahmoo Samajists were willing to make use of Urdu and Punjabi but preferred Hindi in the Devanagari script. Nonetheless, while being outsiders and mostly in government service, Brahmos faced similar problems as the missionaries in attracting Punjabis to their program. Though Bengalis provided a lifestyle and Brahmos the specific institutions for adaptation, Bengalis remained aloof from Punjabis and especially the Brahmoo Samaj generated much criticism from local Hindus. Founded before Christianity was an integral part of the British government and before there were any clear cut ideas about the Empire, most Punjabis rejected the Brahmoo Samaj because of its tolerance towards other faiths and particularly its use of Christian moral overtones. Such mixing of faiths especially gave little support to Hindus surrounded by proselytizing traditions and fearful of Christian conversion. Instead, Punjabi Hindus as well as Sikhs were much more attracted to the Arya Samaj.

Quite different from the Brahmoo Samaj was the Anjuman-i-Punjab which existed principally in Lahore between 1865 and 1888 as an important voluntary association of both Europeans and indigenous elites. Lieutenant-Governor, Donald McLeod,\(^{53}\) did the original call for membership but Dr. Leitner undoubtedly was the pivotal character behind the movement. Leitner was an Hungarian who had lived in Turkey, received a Phd. from the University of Freiburg in Germany and lectured in Arabic, Turkish and modern Greek at King's College, University of London.\(^{54}\) In 1864 he came to Lahore and became Principal of the Government College. With McLeod's backing, the association soon consisted of over three hundred

\(^{53}\) Donald McLeod was Robert Montgomery's son-in-law and succeeded the latter as Lieutenant-Governor. 'Beware of Donald McLeod's religious fanaticism', John Lawrence once wrote to Robert Montgomery. As cited in Montgomery, Monty's grandfather, 119.
members, mostly drawn from the Punjab's major towns and cities. A Parliamentary report on
the Punjab University movement states that the Anjuman officially was founded 'for the
diffusion of useful knowledge, the discussion of subjects possessing literary and scientific
interest and for the free expression of native opinion on questions of social and political
reform'. Accordingly, one of its first important projects was the establishment of a Free
Public Library during a time when printed books still were scarce.

Yet from 1865 up to 1882 the central issue of the Anjuman remained one of higher
education: the so-called 'Oriental movement' for the creation of an Oriental University in
Lahore (the Prince of Wales, who then was the President of the London Sanskrit Text society,
became the patron of the association). Overall the movement wanted to reinvigorate
indigenous learning and spread Western knowledge through the vernaculars. Nonetheless,
while it sought patronage and support for its Orientalist ideas, the government of India did not
intend to establish an Oriental University in Lahore and instead founded Panjab University in
1882 (with indeed Dr. Leitner as its Registrar). The University was recognized by Calcutta
University as an English language medium institution but offered Asian language degrees as
well. In fact, being the fourth University in South Asia (after Bombay, Calcutta and Madras
Universities, which were all three founded in 1857), Panjab University was somewhat ahead
of its time. Until 1904, the former three Universities solely examined aspiring degree candi-
dates. They offered no courses and, instead, let students fulfill the required classes at any
number of University affiliated colleges, before presenting themselves for examinations.
Panjab University, on the contrary, was a teaching University, though things further mostly
were the same: Europeans obviously ruled it at the top, while according to Bhagat Lakshman

Singh, Indians working below them solely were *jo hukm huzurs* (those who did whatever the Europeans wanted), serving as pawns in the game.\(^{56}\)

Most probably the establishment of an Oriental University in Lahore was too much for a government committed to spread ‘useful’ learning through education in India. For Dr. Leitner’s initiatives undoubtedly were against this policy as he made clear himself in his somewhat sarcastic illustration of education in government schools presented before the Punjab Education Commission in 1884:

> After leaving the middle school, a boy... knows arithmetic, Urdu and Persian, if not a little English, all of which may be said to be “useful” to him, whilst he has acquired some information regarding history, geography, and elementary science, which, also, cannot be affirmed to be “useless”. He has also learnt the elements of mensuration, which is a “practical” acquirement for him, especially if he wishes to become a sub-overseer, overseer or engineer. He has also, if he has studied English, read Cunningham’s Sanitary Primer, and if he has practiced the lessons contained in it, that knowledge too is “practical”.\(^{57}\)

By the time a student completes high school, Leitner continues, he has acquired more information but otherwise has become ‘less suited for a “useful” and “practical” career, than

---

\(^{56}\) Generally Lakshman Singh was not too happy with the new mode of higher learning, writing forty years after completing his education in Lahore: ‘even at this long distance of time I can not find words to give adequate expression to the absolute cussedness and fatuity which had led to the conception and adoption of one uniform scheme of studies for youngsters of different tastes and intellectual developments... I can say that I have not benefited in the least from my study of the aforesaid subjects, with the exception of English and history, which I could have as well learnt privately with self effort’ in *Autobiography*, 71-72.

\(^{57}\) Anonymous, *Report by the Punjab provincial committee with evidence taken before the committee and memorials addressed to the education commission*, Calcutta 1884, 369-370.
when he passed the middle school. His distaste to all physical exertion, except to that of the pen, has grown, and he is more unwilling than before to return to his father's shop.\textsuperscript{58}

More important, the Punjab government came to appreciate the Anjuman-i-Punjab as a dependable loyal representative of public opinion and a deposit of 'native' knowledge. While to some extent the movement was a reaction against the loathing of everything coming from the East as put into words by Macaulay, the Anjuman clearly belonged to its times and was warmly welcomed by the British in their quest for knowledge of India to rule 'for the better'. Most issues brought before the Anjuman by the government reflected some current need for confirming the 'native' viewpoint on cases such as: the prevention of female infanticide; an inquiry from the Punjab Census office how best to determine the age of Hindu and Muslim youths; the availability of Persian literary works for government publication; the marriage of minor girls or widow remarriage.\textsuperscript{59} Undoubtedly, the earlier mentioned, Muhammad Husain Azad, played a crucial role during these discussions. He was a very active member of the Anjuman-i-Punjab and in 1869 Dr. Leitner appointed him assistant Professor of Arabic at the Government College. He presented twenty-two papers before the Anjuman meetings discussing a great variety of subjects (eventually the Anjuman published a total of 142 papers). Yet one of his lectures turned out to be the most memorable and controversial meeting in the Anjuman's history. On May 9, 1874, Azad straightforwardly called for the reform of Urdu poetry based on English models, aiming at 'moral' instruction and presenting a 'natural' picture of feelings and thoughts. Supported by the Director of Public Instruction, Colonel W.R.M Holroyd, he proposed to start a Victorian style new \textit{mushairah} series (a \textit{mushairah} is a gathering at which poets read their verses, which are usually, by pre-arrangement,  

\textsuperscript{58} Ibid.  
formally identical ones, before an audience of connoisseurs and patrons). However, instead of setting the traditional formal pattern line to which all the poetry should conform, the Anjuman invited poets to compose on such themes as 'Hope', 'Patriotism', 'Justice' and indeed 'Civilization'. Undoubtedly, these meetings symbolize Lahore’s uniqueness in terms of the colonial interaction and, importantly, as significant center for the development of modern Urdu (and Punjabi, but this will be further treated in Chapter Four).60

All in all, the Brahma Samaj and the Anjuman-i-Punjab can be seen as experimental voluntary movements organized mostly by early Lahori public men. The Brahma Samaj was dominated by Bengalis and the Anjuman-i-Punjab by traditional Punjabi elites working together with British officials (though over time some Anjuman members -especially through Dr. Leitner's newspaper: the Indian Public Opinion- became somewhat -indeed not downright- critical towards the government and began voicing their own felt needs). Nonetheless, the two associations soon were to be replaced by other voluntary movements more suited to the fast changing Punjabi context. In hindsight, the most important role of the Brahma Samaj and Anjuman-i-Punjab therefore was giving other Punjabis the opportunity to perceive new forms of organization and debating which, alternately, inspired them to start off movements by themselves, catering more to the needs of the different communities.61 Obviously the Arya Samaj, Singh Sabhas and Ahmadiyahs were among them and the next Part will finally turn to them.

60 Pritchett, Nets of awareness, 32-34.
61 A more straightforward political movement was the Lahore Indian Association, which had moved to the Punjab from Bengal in 1877 and was dominated by Hindus. It criticized the British through the (Brahmo Samaj dominated) Tribune newspaper but initially did not find much response among the educated Punjabis. However, when in 1883 the government tried to authorize the Ilbert Bill, many Punjabis assembled to support the Indian Association. The Bill would permit Indian magistrates jurisdiction over Europeans and thus met much opposition from Europeans, who demonstrated and formed defence associations. In turn, the Indian Association accused the intolerance of Europeans.