Moved by modernity

*How development shapes migration in rural Ethiopia*

Schewel, K.D.

Creative Commons License (see https://creativecommons.org/use-remix/cc-licenses):

Other

Citation for published version (APA):

This dissertation examines how the social transformations associated with ‘development’ over the last century impacted the migration and settlement behavior of a traditionally semi-nomadic people in the central lowlands of the Ethiopian Rift Valley. Utilizing original survey data, in-depth interviews, and ethnographic methods, it examines two (im)mobility transitions: 1) from semi-nomadic pastoralism into settled agriculture, and 2) from rural agriculture into more mobile, urban-centric lives. To explain these transitions, the dissertation evaluates the impacts of different dimensions of social change – the political, economic, demographic, cultural and technological – on migration aspirations and behavior over time.

This research finds that, first, the sedentarization of semi-nomadic lifestyles was an integral part of modern nation-state building in Ethiopia. This settlement set the foundation upon which new forms of rural-urban and international migration would later emerge. Second, it finds that rural out-migration among younger generations – whether to neighboring towns or to the Middle East – is driven by rising access to formal education, growing rural-urban connectivity, and the expansion of market forces. It shows why ‘development’ tends to stimulate a widening aspiration-opportunity gap for rural youth; aspirations are increasingly oriented towards urban futures, which cannot be realized in rural areas and thus require migration to achieve. Nevertheless, many still remain in rural areas, lacking the capability to leave. These findings challenge popular ideas that development aid can reduce the ‘root causes’ of migration by showing why development, in its current practice, is the root cause of much contemporary migration.
MOVED BY MODERNITY

HOW DEVELOPMENT SHAPES MIGRATION IN RURAL ETHIOPIA

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
Prof. dr. K. I. J. Maex
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde
commissie, in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel
op dinsdag 15 oktober 2019, te 10:00 uur

door Kerilyn Daniel Schewel

geboren te Savannah, Georgia
PROMOTIECOMMISSIE:

Promoter: Prof. dr. H.G. de Haas
          Universiteit van Amsterdam

Copromoter: Prof. dr. J. Carling
           Peace Research Institute Oslo

Overige leden: Prof. dr. B.M. Burgoon
                Universiteit van Amsterdam

                Prof. dr. W.G.J. Duyvendak
                Universiteit van Amsterdam

                Prof. dr. D.S. Massey
                Princeton University

                Dr. G. Nooteboom
                Universiteit van Amsterdam

                Dr. M.C. de Regt
                Vrij Universiteit Amsterdam

                Prof. dr. R. Skeldon
                University of Sussex

FACULTEIT DER MAATSCHAPPIJ- EN GEDRAGSWETENSCHAPPEN
Acknowledgments

This research would have been impossible without the support of so many. This project began in the fall of 2014 in the Department of International Development at the University of Oxford, where Robin Cohen, Gina Crivello, and Geraldine Adiku provided valuable feedback in crucial early stages. When my doctoral supervisor, Hein de Haas, received ERC funding for a research grant entitled Migration as Development (MADE), he asked me and my husband to consider moving to the Netherlands, where I could join this new project at the University of Amsterdam. I could not be happier with our decision to move; the intellectual companionship of the MADE research team in the years since has been invaluable to me. I thank in particular Sonja Fransen, Katharina Natter, Simona Vezzoli, Lea Funk-Muller, and Siebert Wiestra for years of feedback and friendship.

My intellectual guides throughout this process have been my supervisors, Hein de Haas and Jørgen Carling. Hein always encouraged my theoretical interests and was never satisfied with first or second drafts. He pushed me to rise out of description and build an argument, to always take the analysis one step further, and to write more clearly and directly. Hein’s visit to Ethiopia while I was conducting fieldwork was an invaluable accompaniment at a crucial time. Finally, Hein always gave me the respect of a colleague rather than a student throughout this process, and I look forward to greater collaboration as true colleagues in the years to come.

My second supervisor, Jørgen Carling, was a cherished mentor throughout this long process, and I am grateful for his willingness to supervise from a distance. Jørgen’s careful consideration of the concepts and language we use in migration studies, his thoughtful advice on difficult questions, his detailed attention to key methodological choices, and his emotional support made this project so much better than it would have otherwise been. Writing and working with Jørgen was a highlight of my doctoral training. I am grateful for his generous mentorship and friendship.

While conducting fieldwork in Ethiopia, my thanks goes first and foremost to the Bahá’í community of the Adami Tulu cluster in Ethiopia, who became my family away from home. This community taught me the true meaning of hospitality and friendship. “Where there is love, nothing is too much trouble and there is always time.” Eshetu, Kidanemariam, Solomon, Jamal, Bethel, Lelisso, Khadija, Ibrahim, Marki, so many others… thank you!

I also thank oboletti koo Bashula, Tahirih, Bontu, and Tune for welcoming me into their home, teaching me to cook and do laundry by hand, taking care of me when I was sick, taking care of my re’ee, and more generally, accommodating all the incompetences of a farenji.

I thank my research assistant, Kedir Gemechu, who grew up in Wayisso and helped me carry out my survey there. His deep connections to every family made the survey possible, and it only because of him that every household participated. His humor made even the hottest, most difficult days enjoyable. I also thank Tilah Alemayehu, my translator, whose fluency in Afaan Oromo, Amharic, and English was a rare and precious talent. His easy going nature put people at ease, and it was largely because of him that our interviews were able to go ‘in-depth.’ I thank him for his patience and tireless efforts over these years.

I also thank all the informants who trusted me with their stories. I hope I do justice to them.
This research received institutional support from many places. I thank the Department of Sociology, particularly the political sociology research group, at the University of Amsterdam for their generous financial support at all stages of the project. I thank Jeske de Vries, Gaby Evers, and Danny van der Poel for their extensive administrative assistance. I thank the Geography Department at Addis Ababa University, with which I was affiliated as a visiting researcher. Dr. Asmamaw Legass Bahir, then chair of the department, provided crucial support, writing many formal letters to various governmental and non-governmental agencies on my behalf. I thank the Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research for later funding Dr. Asmamaw’s visit to the University of Amsterdam, which enabled us to collaborate on an article about migration and social transformation in Ethiopia. This paper provided the foundation for chapter two of this thesis. I also thank Princeton University, in particular Douglas Massey, who welcomed me as a visiting student research collaborator in the spring of 2019. The stimulating intellectual environment of the Office of Population Research and Sociology Department was a welcome change of scene while in my final stages of writing. I also thank the International Migration Institute, which shaped my introduction into migration studies as a master’s student at the University of Oxford, published my working papers over the past several years, and with which I hope to continue to collaborate in the years of come. Finally, I thank the European Research Council, which funded the Migration as Development Consolidator Grant project through the European Community's Horizon 2020 Programme (H2020/2015-2020 | Grant Agreement 648496), which made this research possible.

I thank the Institute for Global Prosperity and its collaborators, particularly Haleh Arbab, Geoffrey Cameron, Katayana Melic, and Stephen Murphy. Our thoughtful discussions helped shape my approach to migration studies. I also thank the Bahá’í International Community’s Brussels Office for allowing me to learn about and contribute to policy discourse about migration and development with European institutions. Rachel Bayani, Defne Inhan, Tala Ram, Holly Smith – it has been a true joy to work with you over the last several years.

Finally, I thank my husband, Ben, who supported me at every stage of this process. He has been my rock and my home during so many years of movement, and my editor through countless drafts. Half-way through this research, our son Elliot was born. Elliot turned our world upside down and made all things new. Without the selfless assistance and support of Ben, my mother Karen, Priscilla, Lorna, Cindy, Clare and so many other friends and family, I would never have been able to return to Ethiopia for the last stages of fieldwork, finish writing this dissertation, or learn how to be a mother and an academic. It takes a village – not only to raise a child, but to write a dissertation.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgments .................................................................................................................. 4

List of Tables .......................................................................................................................... 9

List of Figures ........................................................................................................................ 10

Abbreviations / Language Reference .................................................................................... 12

Introduction ............................................................................................................................ 14

  Theoretical Contributions .................................................................................................... 18

  Chapter Outline .................................................................................................................. 22

  The Question of Terminology ............................................................................................. 25

Chapter 1. Theorizing Migration in Modernity ........................................................................ 27

  Migration and Development in the Modern Period ............................................................. 29

  ‘Aspirations’ in Migration and Development Research ....................................................... 32

  Theorizing Aspirations ........................................................................................................ 35

  Bringing in Capability .......................................................................................................... 37

  Linking Aspirations, Capabilities, and the Social Transformation Approach ...................... 39

  Conclusion ........................................................................................................................... 42

Chapter 2. Ethiopia’s Migration History .................................................................................... 44

  Modernization in Ethiopia .................................................................................................... 44

  Migration Trends .................................................................................................................. 48

    Sedentarization .................................................................................................................. 48

    Internal Migration ............................................................................................................. 49

    Displacement and Resettlement ....................................................................................... 55

    Emigration ......................................................................................................................... 57

    Immigration ......................................................................................................................... 61

  Conclusion ........................................................................................................................... 63

Chapter 3. Methodological Approach ....................................................................................... 65

  Defining Migration ................................................................................................................ 65

  Research Setting and Case Study Design ............................................................................. 67

  Methods ............................................................................................................................... 71

    The Household Survey ..................................................................................................... 71

    In-Depth Interviews ......................................................................................................... 75

    ‘Hanging Out’ in Wayisso and in Town .............................................................................. 77

    Gathering Historical Data ............................................................................................... 77

  Local Networks and Research Assistants ......................................................................... 78

  Questions of Anonymity in Ethnographic Research ............................................................ 81
Chapter 4. Wayisso’s Migration History .................................................................83

Family trees ...........................................................................................................85
Mapping Destinations ............................................................................................92
Mobility across the Life Course and across Generations ......................................95
International Migration ..........................................................................................98
Conclusion ..............................................................................................................100

Chapter 5. Land ....................................................................................................102

Climate ...................................................................................................................103
Population Growth and Land-Scarcity ...................................................................107
In-migration Dynamics ..........................................................................................119
Conclusion ..............................................................................................................120

Chapter 6. The State .............................................................................................122

Before: The Gada System .......................................................................................123
Becoming part of the ‘Modern’ Ethiopian State | Version 1: Empire .......................125
   Land Tenure and the Balabat ............................................................................126
   Farming ...............................................................................................................128
Becoming part of the ‘Modern’ Ethiopian State | Version 2: Communism .............133
   Land Redistribution and the Peasant Association ............................................134
   Formal Education and Government Work ......................................................137
   Conscription and Government Work ................................................................140
Becoming part of the ‘Modern’ Ethiopian State | Version 3: Developmental State ...142
   Getting Land in Town ......................................................................................146
   Foreign Investment ............................................................................................148
   The Migrant Labor Market ..............................................................................155
   The Diversification and Multiplication of Labor ..............................................157
Conclusion ..............................................................................................................165

Chapter 7. The Market .........................................................................................168

The Expansion of the ‘Market’ in the Adami Tulu Jido Kombolcha Woreda ..........169
From Cattle to Capital: the ‘Modernization’ of Social Practices ............................170
   Conflict-Resolution .........................................................................................171
   Marriage Practices .........................................................................................177
Migration to the Middle East ..................................................................................184
Conclusion ..............................................................................................................193

Chapter 8. Education ............................................................................................197

Educational Attainment and Mobility ....................................................................199
The Spatial Location of Schooling .........................................................................200
Education and Changing Aspirations ....................................................................216
The Aspiration-Opportunity Gap ..........................................................................219
Conclusion ..............................................................................................................222

Chapter 9. The Good Life .....................................................................................225
The Transformation of the ‘Good Life’ .................................................................................. 225
The Good Life was Rural ......................................................................................................... 226
The Good Life is in the City ..................................................................................................... 228
Conflicting Narratives and Generational Divides .................................................................. 232
The Good Life, Constraints and Aspiration Adaptation .......................................................... 235
The Role of Migration in Shifting Social Imaginaries .............................................................. 238
Relative Deprivation ............................................................................................................... 240
Expanding Mental Maps ........................................................................................................ 242
Conclusion ............................................................................................................................... 244

Conclusion ............................................................................................................................... 247

Explaining Migration from Wayisso ......................................................................................... 248

Implications for Migration and Development Research .......................................................... 251

References ............................................................................................................................... 254

Appendix A. A Map of Ziway, Adami Tulu, and ‘Wayso’ from 1976 ....................................... 267

Appendix B. Survey questions for individuals ......................................................................... 268

Summary ................................................................................................................................... 269

Samenvatting ............................................................................................................................ 274
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. Indicators of Social Transformation in Ethiopia.................................................................45
Table 2. Charting Urban Growth in Ethiopia by Town- and City-size........................................50
Table 3. Road Network Development in Ethiopia............................................................................51
Table 4. Urban Growth by Region in Ethiopia, 1994 and 2007.......................................................52
Table 5. Migration Patterns by Gender: 1999, 2005 and 2013 .......................................................53
Table 6. Emigration Rates by Human Development Ranking and Rural Population, 2015......57
Table 7. Top Ten Destination Countries (and Stock) of Ethiopian Emigrants, 1960-2000....58
Table 8. Migrant (including Refugee) Stock in Ethiopia, 1990-2015 ..........................................63
Table 9. Wayisso Interview Record..................................................................................................76
Table 10. Where Do People Go? (%) ...............................................................................................92
Table 11. Current Residence by Family Group for Ages 20-39..................................................94
Table 12. Number of Movements by Age Group..........................................................................95
Table 13. Number of Movements by Age Group, Men.................................................................96
Table 14. Number of Movements by Age Group, Women..........................................................96
Table 15. Net Enrollment Ratios for the Arssi and Shewa Regions, 1984..................................139
Table 16. The Primary Occupations of Men and Women in/from Wayisso................................161
Table 17. Summary of Migration Types to/from Wayisso by Regime Period..............................166
Table 18. School Enrollments by Level in Ethiopia, 1967-2003...............................................198
Table 19. Educational Attainment by Age and Gender in Wayisso............................................201
Table 20. Number of Places Lived by Educational Attainment, Women................................202
Table 21. Number of Places Lived by Educational Attainment, Men........................................203
Table 22. Education and Mobility by Family Lineage for Ages 20-39.........................................205
Table 23. The Expansion of Public Education in ATJK Woreda.............................................211
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. Wayisso Village and Neighboring Towns, Adami Tulu and Ziway ....................... 18
Figure 2. Integrating the Social Transformation and Aspiration-Capability Frameworks .... 41
Figure 3. Percentage of Population Living in Urban Areas ............................................ 46
Figure 4. Educational Attainment by Migration Trajectory ............................................ 54
Figure 5. International Migration from Ethiopia by Decade and Region of Destination .... 59
Figure 6. Regional Destination of Ethiopian International Migrants, 1990-2015 ............. 60
Figure 7. Map of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia ...................................... 67
Figure 8. The Three Gandas That Bounded the Household Survey .............................. 73
Figure 9. Remnants of the Oromo Protests Outside of Meki Town | 2016 ....................... 81
Figure 10. Example of Semi-Nomadic Pastoral Trajectories in mid-20th Century .......... 84
Figure 11. Migration Status by Family Tree | Model 1 .................................................. 89
Figure 12. Migration Status by Family Tree | Model 2 .................................................. 90
Figure 13. Main Destinations Within the ATJK Woreda .............................................. 93
Figure 14. Main Destinations Outside the ATJK Woreda ............................................. 93
Figure 15. Mobility Pathways of the Second Generation .............................................. 97
Figure 16. Mobility Pathways of the Third and Fourth Generations ............................. 98
Figure 17. Wayisso Community Pond | February 2016 ................................................ 104
Figure 18. Total Rainfall in Millimeters per Year for Adami Tulu, 1958-2015 ................. 106
Figure 19. Aerial View of Wayisso Households in 2008 .............................................. 109
Figure 20. Aerial View of Wayisso Households in 2016 ............................................. 109
Figure 21. Land Holding by Household and Generation | Lineage 1 .............................. 111
Figure 22. Land Holding by Household and Generation | Lineage 1 .............................. 112
Figure 23. Land Holding by Household and Generation | Lineage 2 .............................. 113
Figure 24. Land Holding by Household and Generation | Lineage 3 .............................. 114
Figure 25. Location of Foreign Companies in ATJK Woreda ..................................... 116
Figure 26. A Meeting with Government Officials in Wayisso ...................................... 117
Figure 27. A Father and Son | Seasonal Farm Workers from SNNPR in Wayisso, 2016 ... 120
Figure 28. Aerial Photograph of Wayisso and Surrounding Region from 1967 .............. 130
Figure 29. Aerial Photograph of Wayisso and Surrounding Region from 1972 .............. 131
Figure 30. A Close-up of Wayisso in 1967 ................................................................. 132
Figure 31. A Close-up of Wayisso in 1972 ................................................................. 132
Figure 32. Sector Analysis of Ethiopian Economic Development ............................... 144
Figure 33. Employment by Sector (%) in Ethiopia ..................................................... 145
Figure 34. Building a House on Leased Land in Adami Tulu ...................................... 147
Figure 35. Ziway Town in 1987 .................................................................................... 149
Figure 36. Ziway Town in 1998 .................................................................................... 150
Figure 37. Ziway Town and the Agriflora Sher Greenhouses in 2017 ............................ 150
Figure 38. Day Laborers Constructing Verde Beef's Electric Fence | June 2016 .......... 154
Figure 39. Becoming a Middle Man: a Wayisso Farmer Buys His Neighbors’ Harvest .... 158
Figure 40. A Newly Constructed Road in Ziway | 2016 .............................................. 160
Figure 41. A Child Driving Oxen on His Uncle’s Land ................................................ 164
Figure 42. The First Wedding Ceremony in Adami Tulu ............................................. 181
Figure 43. A Return Migrant’s Store on the Outskirts of Ziway ................................. 190
Figure 44. One Return Migrant's Mana Bunaa, or Roadside Coffee House ................. 190
Figure 45. A Boy Watches the Herd as They Return from Fulee ................................. 201
Figure 46. Place of Current Residence by Educational Attainment, Men .................... 203
Figure 47. Place of Current Residence by Educational Attainment, Women ................. 204
Figure 48. Family Trees | Educational Attainment ...................................................... 208
### Abbreviations / Language Reference

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ATJK</strong></td>
<td>Adami Tulu Jido Kombolcha. The <em>woreda</em> within which is Wayisso village. The ATJK used to encompass the towns Adami Tulu and Ziway, until Ziway came under direct jurisdiction of the Oromiya state.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>bajaj</strong></td>
<td>A three-wheeled vehicle, imported from India, used as taxis for short-distances.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>balabat</strong></td>
<td>An administrative position under the Imperial regime. The <em>balabat</em> oversaw tax collection, was charged with maintaining peace and order, and administered new forms of land tenure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>balbaala</strong></td>
<td>Literally ‘door’; sub-groups of a <em>gosi</em>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Derg</strong></td>
<td>Officially the Provisional Military Government of Socialist Ethiopia, a military junta led by Mengistu Haile Mariam that ruled Ethiopia from 1974 to 1987. In 1987, Mengistu abolished the Derg and formed the People's Democratic Republic of Ethiopia led by the Workers' Party of Ethiopia, but by 1991, the government fell. I often refer to the period from 1974-1991 as the ‘Derg.’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>EPRDF</strong></td>
<td>The Ethiopian People's Revolutionary Democratic Front, a political coalition that has ruled Ethiopia's federal government since 1994.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>gada</strong></td>
<td>The <em>gada</em> system (<em>sirna gadaa</em>) is the traditional system of governance and social stratification of the Oromo people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>gosi</strong></td>
<td>Roughly translates to ‘tribe,’ a division within a larger ethnic group. The people living in Wayisso constitute different ‘gosi’ of the Arsi Oromo.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>kebele</strong></td>
<td>‘Peasant Association’; the smallest administrative unit in Ethiopia first established by the Derg.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SNNPR</strong></td>
<td>Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples' Region. One of nine ethnically-based regional states in Ethiopia.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>woreda</strong></td>
<td>‘District’; the administrative unit above the <em>kebele</em>.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>