UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

[Review of: C. del Valle Rodriguez (2004) Historia de la gramática hebrea en España. Vol. 10: La gramática hebrea de Ibn Danán en la versión árabe y hebrea (al-Darūrī y ha-Kēlal)]

Schippers, A.

DOI

[10.2143/BIOR.64.3.2023955](https://doi.org/10.2143/BIOR.64.3.2023955)

Publication date

2007

Document Version

Final published version

Published in

Bibliotheca Orientalis

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Schippers, A. (2007). [Review of: C. del Valle Rodriguez (2004) Historia de la gramática hebrea en España. Vol. 10: La gramática hebrea de Ibn Danán en la versión árabe y hebrea (al-Darūrī y ha-Kēlal)]. *Bibliotheca Orientalis*, 64(3-4), 447-451.
<https://doi.org/10.2143/BIOR.64.3.2023955>

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

~~une liste complète, qui supervisaient l'administration du temple dont la Bible nous fournit aussi, probablement la liste complète des grands prêtres. L'exemple de Néhémie, n'hésitant pas à s'opposer aux autorités locales, y compris aux prêtres, nous révèle l'étendue du pouvoir du gouverneur tant du point de vue militaire (fortifications, garnison) que du point de vue civil (corvée, taxes...), en collaboration avec les juges nommés directement par le pouvoir central. C'est d'ailleurs dans ce contexte que l'auteur interprète la mission d'Esdras ayant pour but de nommer des juges royaux qui devaient juger non selon un code de lois écrites mais en tenant compte des décrets royaux et satrapiques. Elle en conclut: «the model of Achaemenid rule proposed by Eisdadt is a better description of Persian Yehud than the model of self governance or its variant, the model of imperial authorization of local norms» (p. 233).~~

~~Même si le point de départ d'une étude à partir de modèles a priori peut être dangereux et s'il paraît discutable que la théorie de l'autorisation impériale soit une variante de celle de la «Self Governance», ce livre essaie de tenir compte de la documentation disponible en la replaçant dans son contexte et constitue un intéressant essai sur le fonctionnement de l'Empire Perse. Le Grand Roi semble bien avoir pratiqué une politique pragmatique soutenant ceux qui se ralliaient à lui mais réprimant ceux qui s'y opposaient. L'analyse de la documentation disponible est généralement sérieuse, argumentant dans le détail la position prise dans les sujets discutés comme l'authenticité de la lettre de Darius à Gadatas ou la signification de la trilingue de Xanthos. Cependant cette position paraît parfois plus conjecturale (comme l'hypothèse d'une inscription bilingue pour la construction du temple de Jérusalem) ou même irréaliste lorsqu'elle qualifie Néhémie de *frataraka* (p. 109), ou semble dénier toute importance aux codes de lois antiques alors qu'ils servaient, au moins, à la formation des futurs juges. D'une manière plus générale, il aurait fallu probablement davantage souligner que, à la différence de la Babylonie, de l'Égypte et de l'Asie Mineure, l'analyse de la situation en Judée ne se situait pas au niveau «satrapique» mais au niveau provincial et on reste quelque peu étonné que les parallèles de l'administration provinciale de la Samarie et de l'Idumée n'aient pas été évoqués avec la documentation des papyri de Samarie et celle des ostraca araméens d'Idumée.~~

~~Malgré ces quelques aspects discutables, ce livre clair et bien présenté constitue une thèse généralement bien argumentée qui devrait aider à mieux comprendre le fonctionnement de l'Empire Perse pendant plus de deux siècles.~~

Paris, décembre 2006

A. LEMAIRE

JUDAÏCA EN HEBRAÏCA

VALLE RODRÍGUEZ, C. del — Historia de la Gramática hebrea en España, Volumen X: La gramática hebrea de Ibn Danán en la versión árabe y hebrea (al-Darūrī y ha-Kēlal). (Gramática Hebrea X) Aben Ezra Ediciones, Madrid, 2004. (20 cm, 492), ISBN 84-88324-18-9. € 50,-.

One of the first works dealing with Sa'adya ibn Dannān with which I came into contact was Yaakov Mashiah's PhD dissertation (1972, Columbia University), *The Terminology*

of Hebrew Prosody and Rhetoric with special reference to Arabic origins, pp. 238-253. In both the Arabic and the Hebrew tradition, metres and prosody are regarded as 'grammar'. Medieval Hebrew poetry and grammars of biblical Hebrew go together, because once you have learned the language, you have to practise it in the highest form of speech, namely poetry. Especially since the seventies Angel Sáenz Badillos and Carlos del Valle Rodríguez, have published widely on grammarians of the Hebrew language, and many of their books and articles are devoted to grammarians of Hebrew or poets writing in Hebrew in Spain. Carlos del Valle's *El Divan Poético de Dunash ibn Labraṭ* (Madrid, 1988) contains a section on poetry and metre in general, including a chapter on the poetics of ibn Dannān (1473), pp. 361-380. Del Valle has now provided us with an edition of the whole text of Sa'adyah ibn Dannān's work on grammar and metrics as part of a larger project aimed at vulgarizing the publications of the Spanish-Hebrew grammarians. The present volume is the tenth to result from del Valle's great project on the history of Hebrew grammar in Spain, namely 'Historia de la Gramática Hebrea en España'. The first volume, which appeared in 2002, deals with Menaḥem ibn Sarūq (910-970) and his disciples.

In the tenth volume, del Valle edits and analyses the Hebrew grammar of Sa'adyah ibn Dannān ca. (1420-1505), both the Arabic version and the version in Hebrew. The Arabic version is called *Al-Darūrī*, the Hebrew version *Ha-Kēlal ha-hekraḥi*. Both titles can be freely translated as 'The necessary knowledge of the grammar of the Hebrew language'.

Chapter 1 is a general introduction related to the Jews during the Nasrid reign of Grenade. Chapter 2 deals with the life and work of Sa'adyah ibn Dannān; his linguistic oeuvre and grammatical doctrine is dealt with in Chapters 3 and 4.

Chapter 1 starts with a detailed picture of the rise of the Almohad dynasty (1148-1232) which was a catastrophe for the Jewish communities. For instance, Abraham ibn Da'ūd (1110-1180) had to leave Cordoba to escape persecution; he wrote his *Sefer ha-Qabbala* ('Book of the Rabbinic Tradition') in Toledo in 1169 and mentioned the Almohad disaster. Other chronicles — such as that of Abraham Zacuto (d. 1516) — speak about the intrusion of the Almohad leader ibn Tumart into the Arab world in 1142.

Del Valle also quotes other Jewish historians, such as Solomon ibn Verga (15th century), David Ganz (1511-1613), Yosef ha-Kohen (1496-1577), Abraham ibn Ezra (d. 1167) and Isaac Israeli (14th century). After the death of Abraham ibn Da'ūd, many disasters overcame al-Andalus, and literacy among the Jews disappeared completely. In the first decades of the 13th century, there were no longer any synagogues in al-Andalus. Samuel Cohen (1148) wrote from Fustāt (Old Cairo, Egypt) that the Jews living under the yoke of the Almohads could not profess their Jewishness openly. However, many adhered to the Jewish faith while pretending to be Muslim, a possibility noticed by Maimonides in his treatise *Qiddush ha-Shem* ('Sanctification of the Name').

Judaeo-Arabic culture continued in exile, in both Christian Spain and in Provence. The knowledge of Arabic among the Jews of Christian Spain was still conspicuous. Signs of the better treatment of Jews under Muslim rule are noticeable following the rise of the Nasrid dynasty, starting with Muḥammad I ibn al-Aḥmar (1232-1273). Their former legal position as *dhimmi*s was apparently restored. Del Valle gives some examples of the *convivencia* (coexistence) in al-Andalus of

that period, while in Castile Jewish families were forced to convert to Christianity. Many of them emigrated to Granada. In one of his responsa in 1480, Sa'adya ibn Dannān confirms that many Jews in the Christian territories were forced to convert to Christianity.

Del Valle provides some details about daily life in Granada, namely about the distinctive marks Jews wore upon their clothing, about their economic activities and their trade with Genoa, and about the revival of Jewish learning after three hundred years of silence. For example, Rabbi Juda ben Solomon ibn Kalas left Castile, settled in Granada in 1477 and made a supercommentary on Rashi entitled *Meshiah illemim* ('Making the Mute Speak'). At that time there were no Jewish academies in Granada. Yosef ben Moshe Alascar and Abraham bar Yaqob Gabishon were other learned men of the period. There were also many professionals of medicine. The *convivencia* was fragile in the 1470s, which was a time of pogroms reminiscent of the riots in Granada in 1066. The rights of the Jews under the Christians were laid down in capitulations.

Then on 2 January 1492, the Christian kings entered Granada. Although they too were welcomed by the Jews, in the same year the latter were expelled from the whole of Castile by the Inquisition. After this section, there are several appendices containing fragments of historical sources translated into Spanish (pp. 59-76).

Chapter 2 is devoted to the life and work of Sa'adya ibn Dannān (ca. 1440-1493), the son of Maymūn, whose family had been in Granada since ca. 1300. After the 1492 expulsion, the family settled in the Maghreb; Sa'adya died of pestilence in Oran in 1493. His intellect was multifaceted: he dealt with grammar, lexicography and philosophic speculation. He was the director of a Jewish seminar, Rabbi of Granada, a Halachist (student of Jewish law) and a surgeon. Del Valle lists 13 publications by Sa'adyah, who also copied a lot of works, such as Maimonides's *Guide*, the *Book of Elements* by Yosef ben Yehoshuah ha-Lorqi, and many others. He also wrote wine and love poems for boys and girls. We find a selection of his poetry in the parts of his grammar that are devoted to metrics. About possible pederast or homosexual passages in his poetry, del Valle says (p. 87): 'Apparently there are at least reasons to think that the criticisms of ibn Dannān's love poems were due to the exaltation of his love for the epebe.' On the other hand, del Valle noticed that there are poems in which the male word for 'beloved' [*ahubi*] refers to a woman.¹⁾

This part of the chapter, which is about the life of Sa'adya ibn Dannān, is concluded with a quotation from a Granadian poet, Isaac Mar'eli (p. 89): 'In Granada a light was spread/ which subdued a whole generation/ till some Christians expelled him from his town [...]'.

In the second part of Chapter 2, del Valle discusses the linguistic work by Sa'adya ibn Dannān. The grammar of Hebrew that Sa'adya composed was meant as an introduction to his biblical Hebrew dictionary *Kitāb al-uṣūl* or *Sefer ha-shorashim* ('Book of Roots'). Sa'adyah ibn Dannān believes that this work lays the basis for students to learn 'to speak the Hebrew language'. First he made a grammar in Arabic (*Al-Ḍarūri fī-l-lughat al-'ibrāniyya*), which he

finished in August 1468. Five years later (1473), he made the Hebrew version — *Ha-Kelal ha-ekrahit be-diqduq ha-lashon ha-'ibrit* — at the special request of his Romance- or Spanish-speaking students. The Hebrew version is a literal translation of the Arabic with a certain re-elaboration. The Arabic and Hebrew versions together with the *Kitāb al-uṣūl* mentioned above can be found in a unique manuscript, which was ready to be copied in 1480 (Bodleian 612; Neubauer 1492). Ibn Dannān defines his work as a compendium and excuses himself for the short chapter on the letters HWY, because it would demand a larger comment. He purposely does not deal in more detail with the verbal paradigm because it has been discussed extensively by David Qimḥi (1120-1195).

The greatest difference between the Arabic and the Hebrew version are the poems that serve as examples of the metres. In the Hebrew version, they are wisdom and religious poems, while in the Arabic version they are love poems, and passionate and mundane poems. Only one poem appears in both versions. The Hebrew version has some lacuna at the beginning. The unique manuscript contains 237 fol. and could be an autograph. It is all in Hebrew characters. Del Valle is the first to publish the manuscript in Arabic characters. According to him, nowadays a text edition of Judaeo-Arabic should be in Arabic characters. The part on metrics was previously edited by A. Neubauer in *Meleket ha-shūr; Hebräische Verskunst* (Frankfurt 1885), as well as by del Valle (1988), Sáenz Badillos (1987) and Mosheh Cohen (2000).

Speaking about the dictionary of biblical Hebrew (*Kitāb al-Uṣūl*, mentioned above), del Valle counts 2138 roots in the 22 sections of the Hebrew letters. He gives a frequency list of quoted authors (mainly grammarians) such as Yona ibn Janāḥ (77 x), Sa'adya Gaon (24 x), David Qimḥi (18 x), Abraham ibn Ezra (10 x) and Ḥayyūj and Maimonides (each 8 x) and others (p. 96). Regarding the 'Middle Arabic' of the Judaeo-Arabic text, del Valle rightly affirms that the term is not meant as the chronological intermediary between ancient and modern, but is the result of a contamination between Classical Arabic and Arabic dialect or colloquial, differentiating from Classical Arabic in some cases spread over the whole linguistic spectrum: phonology, lexicon, morphology and syntax.

As far as the sources of Al-Ḍarūri are concerned, he must have been acquainted with *Sefer Yešira* ('Book of Creation'), which is attributed to the patriarch Abraham. He seems to have known Masoretes and Qaraites. He quotes a lot of medieval grammarians and Hebrew poets.

Chapter 4 deals with the grammatical doctrine of Sa'adyah ibn Dannān about language in general and Hebrew language in particular. A language system can be *dākhil* (internal/conceptual) or *khārij* (external/physical). Language, despite having its origin in God, is compatible with the conventional origin of language. God distinguished mankind from animals by Reason: in the same way he distinguished Hebrew from the other languages. Hebrew is the gate of the Torah. Hebrew is the perfect convention.

Grammar is based on predominant linguistic features without taking into account irregularities. There are three fundamental vowels in Hebrew, as there are in every other language. For the consonants he distinguishes five groups of articulations, namely gutturals [ʔ, h, ḥ, ʕ], palatals [gykq], linguals [dtlnt], dentals [z, sh, ṣ, r, s] and labials [bwmp], in

¹⁾ In fact already in the famous pre-Islamic Arabic first hemistich of the *Mu'allaqa* by Imru'ul-Qays (d. 550): *qifā nabki min dhikrā ḥabībīn wa-manzilī* the female beloved was indicated with a 'male' word (*ḥabīb*). A.S.

conformity with the classification of the *Sefer Yešira* (7th century).

There are three fundamental vowels according to the three basic movements of the universe (from the centre, to the centre and around the centre). The subdivision he makes is taken from Yosef Qimḥi (c. 1105 — c. 1170). Ibn Dannān distinguishes within the three groups of vowels the categories of rough, fine and finer.

Most words (nouns and verbs) have three consonants, but there are also words with four, five, six or seven letters or consonants. Of 22 letters (consonants), 11 are always radicals, while 11 can also be servants because they can also have the function as indicators of morphologic, syntactical and other categories. Sa'adya uses mnemotechnic phrases; for instance, the sentence '*ani ha-koteb la-shem*' contains all servile letters. There are three kinds of words: nouns, verbs and particles. He has a questionnaire which every reader has to go through in order to analyse words grammatically.

He discusses verbs with the usual categories of sound, defective, geminate, contracted and soft, referring to the combinations of radicals. The traditional eight conjugations (or stems) are reduced by ibn Danan to four. This category of particles contains not only one letter prepositions but also elements of verbs and nouns, such as the verbal suffixes *-ta*, *-ti* and *-tem* for the perfect tense and prepositions combined with personal suffixes.

Ibn Dannān discusses how particles are described with mnemotechnic devices such as the word '*etan*' [*ytn*] comprising the consonants for the formation of prefixes of the future tense, '*yah tam*' [*yhtm*] for verbal stems, etc.

At the end of the grammatical work, Hebrew prosody (based upon Arabic) is dealt with. His predecessor Yehudah ha-Levi (1085-1141) published the first metrical treatise. Sa'adyah ibn Dannān recognizes 16 metres with only 12 main metres. He is the first to use Hebrew terminology as a translation of the Arab terms.

All the subjects discussed by del Valle derive from the texts that appear in the subsequent pages of his volume: the edition of the Hebrew text *Ha-Kelal ha-hekraḥi be-diqduq ha-lashon ha-'ibrit*, and the Arabic text *Al-Ḍarūri fī 'l-l-lugha-l-'ibrāniyyah*. The edition is bilingual, which allows us to read del Valle's interpretation of the Hebrew and Arabic texts. Both works are followed by a Hebrew and an Arabic grammatical lexicon, respectively.

This edition and publication is a valuable work. In his introductory chapters, del Valle sheds light upon the Hebrew Andalusian grammatical tradition. In this, he uses the existing studies (both historical and linguistic) effectively, and builds on the most pertinent ones. The volume contains many interesting data and remarks, and a comprehensive bibliography. Moreover, despite the book's specialist nature it is accessible to Arabists, Hebraists, Semitists and general linguists, as well as to those who are interested in Hebrew and Arabic poetry and metrics. In addition to being of interest to linguists, it is interesting to historians, especially those who focus on the relationship between Muslims, Jews and Christians, and the different situations of the Jews under Christian and under Muslim rule.