The ghost artist

*Tracing spectral embodiment as a figure of aesthetic resistance, in an unknown woman’s eighteenth century paintings, and works by Hilma af Klint and Louise Bourgeois*

McNab, J.A.

Citation for published version (APA):
Scars

If I were an architect, an architect in love, I would redesign my body. Mail you the blueprints. Redraw. I’d move my blood lines to make rivers in places you would like to swim. I’d use my muscle to shore up hills; I’d use my ribs to pile bridges from here to there (delicate little bridges that would sail above my heart). I’d paint the interior of my skin with birds and light; my breasts would be two small mountains you would sleep between; my feet the boats upon which you flow through time; my eyes the mirror you most deeply crave; my two mouths the music that wakes you to a city you’ve always wanted to call home.

1 These anonymous words were hand written onto the architectural blue print of a building that was never built, and found by Peggy Phelan when she visited an archive dedicated to these well planned out dreams. I found it on page 22 of her book, Mourning Sex, Routledge, London, 1997.
Once upon a time, a young artist painted a watercolour of a naked woman on her knees, facing a naked standing man. The woman's arms hung loosely by her sides and her hands were marked with blood. The kitchen knife on the ground was streaked with red and the man's guts were sliced open from chest to groin. The woman looked, not up, but straight ahead at her work. It was *The Earnest Search for Love*, a painting of a young woman's bewilderment in the face of her cultural conditioning, and the moment when, in a confusion of knife and brush, she transformed a transgressive desire into an image. Disallowed rage was described in its sublimation into an art work — a fantasy of how the given power structure might be otherwise. The woman's stained hands were at rest as she took in the new image forming in the bloody mirror now in front of her.

Claiming the right to look, and to make pictures from what we see is a political act, as those with the most rights define what it is that we all see. *The Earnest Search for Love* was a painting of a woman on her knees, searching for a way to cope with this violent truth of the image. It was a small watercolour, it was mine, and I had made it because I could not understand. I see now that it depicted a desperate claim for the right to make my own picture, but I also know that, at the time, my earnest search was not really ‘thought.’ This was the first trace of knowledge that was difficult for me to think, that strained against my received world view of ‘how things are.’ I had forgotten about it, but it came floating back with the arrival of an old book of watercolours that also portrays intimate domestic scenes and half-formed images. These are not of blood and guts, but this leathery old book-body had surfaced towards me like an unnamed corpse, and *The Earnest Search for Love* had surfaced with it, a body from my inner archive. Together, they were pointing the way to what was not yet a concept.
I see now that the image I drew as forming out of blood and guts had been my recognition that, while an anatomical dissection will not reveal the mysteries of emotional life, a representation of the things we are able to see and touch could be a way to register those experiences that cut invisibly through all our bodies. A series of anonymous watercolours, jumping out at me from an undated manuscript, was bringing this back into renewed focus. I wasn’t sure where the bodies were this time, but the quickening attention that tied this anonymous book to a painting that was now only a memory, heralded what would become The Ghost Artist, a story of invisibly present bodies. In Ghostly Matters, sociologist Avery Gordon (1958–) considers this quickening, and what it can mean when cultural objects seem to hold barely visible content, or when a form seemingly not there to our supposedly well-trained eyes, makes itself known or apparent to us, in its own way, of course. The way the ghost is haunting, and haunting is a very particular way of knowing what has happened or is happening. Being haunted draws us affectively, sometimes against our will and always a bit magically, into the structure of feeling of a reality we come to experience, not as cold knowledge, but as a transformative recognition. 2

Ghostly Matters reveals the way repressed historical narratives can be traced through their exclusion from our histories, in seemingly invisible remains that nevertheless leave some sort of trace. The manuscript is a physically present object in the world, but it has no title, or record of who painted the fifty-two watercolours resting between its covers, where they did it, or when. Something in the artist’s method had drawn me affectively towards it, but I had virtually no ‘cold knowledge’ of the book’s provenance, and the floating worlds painted on each page were a mystery to me. I had the tingling notion that I was looking into a woman’s world however, and I wanted to understand more.

The archival records are slight, but in Part One, I consider what is already written, and go on to follow the material and cultural signposts that date the book. A preoccupation with time begins to lift out of each page, underlined by the fifty-two images, perhaps one for each week of a year. This quality entwines with barely visible signs of a woman’s looking, and this merger is perhaps the real quickening, that these might be the paintings of an older woman. Thirty years had passed since my Earnest Search—er had tried to draw what she could not see, and her ghostly psychological return also marked the passage of these years. The manuscript had floated towards me during research into the image confusions that ageing brings, and I had been stuck in the misogynistic world of witch and crone when its nameless worlds brought the realisation that it was not more evidence of this, still current, misogyny I was looking for, but the erasure that it covered. 2 Somehow, this indeterminate ghost was reminding me that although women’s bodies are richly scattered throughout art history, their busy lives are barely registered, and as they age, a faltering number of stereotypes become the scabs that cover an expanding cultural gap site.

In 2013, Lynne Segal (1944–) published an affirmative contemplation of women’s ageing that draws together the ideas of many recent thinkers, 4 however The Ghost Artist focusses on the image, the way some older women artists have worked with ideas of the body in their mid and later years, and returned imagery to the world that both acknowledges the scab, and fills the gap site beneath with new forms of body. In three case studies, I reveal a spectral figure that I argue is the holder for this artistic movement, a figure taken up by women who reject portraiture as an appropriate register of a life in which objectification is a lived bodily reality. The new forms of ‘stand-in’ bodies that I find within the work of the anonymous manuscript artist, Hilma af Klint (1862–1944), and Louise Bourgeois (1911–2010), all circumvent this visible body, and offer fantasised forms of portrayal that allow the experience of life, which is occluded by objectification, to be shared. Together, these case studies suggest a genealogy, a way of working consistent from the late Enlightenment to the twenty-first century.

Many of our contemporary stereotypes of older women have their roots in old witch imagery, but looking through it did not lead me to an art history of commissioned oil paintings. It led to more populist images, the printing press, and the early years of mechanical reproduction. Etchings and woodcuts spread rapidly through seventeenth century Europe as the spread of print technology allowed more and more people to see, own, and share pictures. A popular format of this dispersal was the Emblem book, 5 looking at the ways older women were depicted in these, introduced me to the now outdated but poetic form of an Emblem, an amalgamation of “symbolic pictures, usually accompanied by mottoes and [often] also by a prose commentary.” 6 This approach to words in relation to images, which Emblem historian Mara Wade (1954–) defines as ‘a process of reciprocal reading of texts and images, whereby the back and forth between the words and the pictures creates meaning’ 7 resonated with my experience of painting, where thinking often happens more with congealing liquids than with words. A structure that encouraged a shuttling ‘back and forth’ relationship of intersecting meanings, gaps and overlaps, presented a way to write that might avoid the neutering capacities of the word.

The essay Two Ends of the Emblem, 8 by art historian James Elkins (1955–) focuses on the point where these gaps widen.
Emblem book imagery was often simply drawn and easy to reproduce, and lent itself to being played around with. Two Ends of the Emblem explores this, and how initially related emblem parts were sometimes reworked until what may originally have been a concise locus of meanings becomes something quite opaque. The loss of image readability was perhaps at the core of my middle-aged-artist questions, as personal visual codes falling away, losing their context and the meanings they once had, were becoming my life. My social definition as a woman was changing, and I had been tracking this in pareidolic paintings of melting ice cream figurines and barely balanced household debris. It was, therefore, with curiosity that I turned the page to see what the deliquescing Emblem book would be. The answer was the untitled manuscript, full of watercolours, and known only by its archival designation: MS Ferguson 115. Elkins writes of this enigmatic and anonymous object as “one of the most amazing manuscripts the author has ever seen,” and reveals that its key is to notice that each painting uses the framing device of a cut cross-section of a tree trunk or branch. Within the age rings and bark of these painted log-ends, the artist conjures up imagined worlds. The brush strokes that define each of the circular log-ends entangle themselves with these interior scenes as they spiral inwards towards a transforming heart wood. Unsure if it even is an Emblem book, Elkins explores suggestions of alchemical and mystical symbolism. Within the archival gaps, imagined worlds, and uncracked codes of this possible Emblem book, I recognized paintings that had been created with a technique similar to the one I brought to ice cream. It is a way of generating surprises, and it was also the bloody mirror of The Earnest Search for Love. It relies on meditative staring, and as I began to return this, with slow looking at these deforming and reforming patterns of wood, the record of a life rose out of the surreal combinations of alchemical, botanical, and religious symbolism. As time ran through my own body like it was an open mesh, the manuscript paper, and its imagery, slowly found places and times. Echoes of different semiotic systems and historically traceable fashion details pointed towards central European wars, and historic battles for minds and spirits. As this is a book of paintings, the only textual clues are in the short Latin dedication on the first page. Its wording suggests an alchemical treatise, and the symbolic Ouroboros, the snake of eternity, swims throughout, tying these magical worlds to a pre-Enlightenment world view, while other references point to early Romantic pre-occupations. My 'supposedly well-trained eyes' would go on to locate this pivotal moment in history more precisely, but the trace of the woman I thought to be the maker of this world would remain tantalizingly on the edge of vision. She did remain however, and The Ghost Artist is the story of her trace as it unfolds out of her paintings, and then goes on to unfold, as a method, in the work.
of other women artists living one, and two hundred years after this book was made. I was looking at a way of working, a way of seeing the world.

The emblem method that I had been exploring when I came to the manuscript, has also remained, and it has become the structuring device of this book. The Ghost Artist takes on the three viewpoints that emblems offer—the image, a short motto, and a longer text—and disrupts this triad construction across these pages as a whole. This embeds an analytic text within a collection of images that work alongside its stated points, and shadows these with another form of writing, not the motto, but a broken fictional narrative. With the gaps and overlaps between these three forms, I hope that other sorts of gaps, those of history and invisible interiority, might somehow breach into visibility.

Images appear as both objects of study, and painted outcomes of it. These outcomes, my paintings, performatively mark the abstract body of these written thoughts, and act as resting places throughout the text.

Emblematic mottoes have been replaced by a story, the tale of a middle-aged woman whose life is written into the margins. Jess’s tale of desire juggles the problem that “If what I want is only produced in relation to what is wanted from me, then the artist’s desire turns the making of a misnomer. I am, in my desire, negotiating what has been wanted of me.” Her involuntary engagement with this feeding, gutting loop of life, and her tense awareness of time passing, tell their daily lives are rarely told stories in an historical narrative that This absence is the missing art historical body of women’s lives. Of the three case studies, the anonymous manuscript takes up by far the most space, as the book’s place in history, where and when it was painted, had to be researched and defined before an analysis, as part of an emblematic structure balanced by idea of spectral embodiment could be explored. Presenting this analysis, as part of an emblematic structure balanced by fiction and images, is an experiment in artistic history writing. It attempts a crystalline structure that might catch the light of both analysis and imagination, as they each, from their differing angles, seek to define the shape of an absence.

This absence is the missing art historical body of women’s lives. Women’s forms are scattered throughout art history, but their daily lives are rarely told stories in an historical narrative that stops at their skins. I had an idea that the manuscript was trying to tell such a story, if only I could find the right angle from which to see it. Could the spectral gap that the artist’s anonymity defines, be an example of the wider cultural gap site that is the image record of women’s preoccupations and ways of seeing the world? As the established codes of art history work with economy—names, dates, places, payments—either relating to the artist, the commissioner, or the subject portrayed, the lack of all of these had denied the manuscript a meaningful place in the art historical record. So, while its leathery cultural body is physically preserved, its nameless skin leaves its dynamic inner life virtually unknown. Such an object is an apt stand-in for the many nameless women of art history, and The Ghost Artist establishes how this presence of an absent subject might be performed, and goes on to ask whether this can be framed as an example of a revenant return of ghosted female subjectivity that is traceable, as a formal approach, in the work of others.

In The Apparitional Lesbian, historian Terry Castle (1953–) also looks for an invisible woman, and records how, as someone unresponsive to the economy of male desire, the lesbian was widely considered not to exist before around 1900. Castle’s analysis reveals that she was nevertheless actively written into literary history, and there to be seen in early film; a figure that was present but somehow unrecognisable, a mere apparition in the eyes of a readership culturally conditioned not to recognise her form. By studying the many nameless women of art history, and the powerful social economy of the image however, and I argue that it is in re-thinking how a skin might be represented, that the stand-in figures within these artist’s works portray this vulnerable embodiment.

The paintings of the manuscript begin as studies of wooden surfaces. Searching for images within the dents and stains of ageing logs, the artist treated these like black mirrors, seeing ‘into’ them, conjuring form out of the marks, cracks, and rotted holes of everyday firewood. Letting her imagination work slowly into such familiar materials was a different order of study to the recording of confirmable visual data. This artist saw herself in her imaginative projections, and recorded a wooden ‘skin’ that was both there, and not really there. Merging imaginative seeing-in with observation, she was creating another sort of body portrayal. Seeing herself in another form, that of a piece of wood, was a way to separate self-portrayal from body mimesis.

Walking through the department store on the way to winter coats, she saw a pudgy middle-aged woman gumming up the aisle towards her. She was that risqué mix of thin down and short fused, and Jess body seemed to avoid contact. In her hyper the woman stepped with. Exactly with. The vision in the mirror rebounded like a kick in the head, and she felt repulsion spill and tumble through her. She hadn’t recognised herself at all.

There must be a moment in every woman’s life when she meets Mrs Hyde, and feels how the weave of being and appearing can separate as easily as a too small silk blouse. What becomes seen in this parting cannot be you, but she’s with you to the end now. This is the hard-boiled uncanny, and you swallow a stone.

There would be no new coat today. Hopes as yet un-named streamed from pockets and sleeves as Jess scowled. She had only nipped into the shop for a break (as trivially and would need to be fine again by her next appointment. She was not fine now. She walked to the further bus stop, and to the next. She bought a more expensive bottle of wine to take to dinner later, and distracted herself with thoughts of the meeting. The archivist was important. She needed access and it was far from automatic. Otherwise she had only the ghosts that slipped through the paintings themselves. She reviewed her questions and statements as she sat blindly on the top deck in December rain. She was still reeling from the realization that in these last exhausting years spent seeing from Mrs Hyde, she had become sealed into Mrs Hyde instead—another object of fiction, and now mute with shock. She was brought back to herself by the ever-present sparkles of her damaged nerve endings, and as she sorted out her story, the anaesthetic of work began to mingle like milk with the acid of her encounter. Between these two, the feeling of being taken, the lay her life. She wasn’t ready.
This is an idea I go on to explore with contemporary ideas of psychological embodiment. These were not part of the Enlightenment world-view the manuscript grew out of, but, while all artworks are residues of the cultures that made them, they also perform in relation to what we as contemporary viewers are able to see. This is what Castle laid bare, and it is a position art historian Mieke Bal (1946–), in *Quoting Caravaggio*, calls the constantly ‘re-visioning’ viewpoint of the present, where we all eternally live. We are also produced by a constantly morphing present, and art works in effect morph with us, shape-shifting in the ways they can be seen. *The Ghost Artist* has been written from Bal’s eternal present, with Castle’s magnifying glass in hand, and an old emblem book for a pattern.

An apparitional figure rises out of this, one that rejects portraiture as an adequate form of portrayal. Women’s representation as images created for the pleasure of others has been their historic submersion beneath an objectifying cultural gaze, a social reality that much of art history has both reflected and reiterates. This powerful cultural force slides over the gaps left by women’s unrecorded lives; the ghosted subjectivities that lie silently beneath it. In Part Two I employ a Lacanian understanding of this force to think about the manuscript as a more fantastic form of portrayal, and I connect the liberating potential of such imagining to more contemporary artworks that at first, I only sensed inhabited these unmarked graves. *The Ghost Artist* is the path this haunting recognition took in becoming the ‘cold knowledge’ needed to define these relations.

Inscription in the art historical record is further explored in an analysis of a curatorial experiment by Scottish artist Fiona Jardine (1976–). The 2011 exhibition Troglydites also sought to tease apart the seemingly secure relationship between body description and subject description that portraiture historically represents. Jardine was given access to the collections of Paisley Museum, and from these, she selected a group of commissioned portrait paintings that she presented alongside a group of ceramic pots. In a set of visual relationships carefully choreographed around a written text and the museum’s title plates, the power of naming was re-distributed, and Jardine was able to reveal portraiture as primarily an emblematic, rather than a naturalistic, vessel of identity. I consider how the artist’s ‘re-visioning’ destabilized the dominance of traditional portraiture as an adequate portrayal of a subject, and moved the viewer towards an understanding of the imaginative, fantastising potential of other sorts of cultural mirrors. Setting this in relation to the destabilised self-portrayals of painter Maria Lassnig (1919–2014) and photographer Cindy Sherman (1954–), the specific function the manuscript artist asked of her blackly mirroring logs comes into renewed focus.

The essential cultural role of such a displaced image of subjectivity is one visual theorist Peggy Phelan (1948–) points to in *Mourning Sex*, when she writes that

> Endless looking for an interior beneath the surface of the bodies and images with which we are forever ensnared is the catastrophe of living (in)skin. Skinned alive, our bodies are sentenced to find a form that might hold our love, a form that might hold our deaths.

Phelan is interested in those who struggle to find their identities performatively returned to them within culture, and in how the temporality of performance, its constant renewal, might offer a form capable of touching on this. My proposal is that the manuscript both acknowledges and responds to this need for ‘endless looking for an interior beneath the surface’ in its serial re-imaging of what a meaningful reflection might look like, when the mirror that was this artist’s cultural world, returned only her absence back to her. Mourning the passage of time, of life, is deeply inscribed in the choice of the log as a stand-in for such an absent body, marked as it is by the annual age rings and destined for the flames. Seeing the outline of an invisible Self within such images, is to both see, and suggest that the artist saw, a ghost. However, as María Pilar Blanco (d.o.b. unknown) and Esther Peeren (1976–), in Conceptualizing Spectralities, make clear, while a ghost may have insight to offer, especially into those matters that are commonly considered not to matter [... the ghost also questions the formation of knowledge itself and specifically invokes what is placed outside it, excluded from perception and, consequently, from both the archive as the depository of the sanctioned, acknowledged past and politics as the (re)imagined present and future.

The manuscript spends its days in a university archive, but as a ‘tangible ambiguity’ with virtually no contextualising identity. The speculative figure I conjure from its pages is also far from what the ‘sanctioned, acknowledged past’ has so far considered to be there. This figure is, additionally, one that has been ‘commonly considered not to matter,’ that of an older woman. The artist’s sketchy grasp of human anatomy reveals she was probably untrained, a lack of access suggested by every brush stroke made as she tries, nevertheless, to picture her world. Her outline within the shadows of her stand-in, wooden, multiple body reveals a form of self-portrayal inscribed with awareness of its cultural invisibility, but which takes the re-presentation of this absent presence, within aesthetic space, as precisely the figure capable of holding the ‘form of her love.’ By painting the surface of a log in terms of what is both there and not there, these paintings become a sort of log-book, or record of a life, and with this, I propose that the artist found a way to paint herself into a broader cultural record that thoughtlessly erased.
this as a possibility. To look at the mirror on the wall, and paint what she saw there, would not have achieved this result, as the visible surface of her skin was also the location of her objectification, or loss of subjectivity. Asking an actual domestic object to stand in for this presented a vehicle of return with which she could insistently record her lived experience, while also acknowledging its obliteration within the given cultural forms of record-keeping in her time. Seeing life within the bounding surfaces of interchangeable, inert, and unfeeling bits of wood is to return a vision of a silent domestic object, through which subjectivity nevertheless relentlessly presses.

Such knowing, metaphorical, possession is also traceable in *The Paintings for the Temple*, by Swedish artist Hilma af Klint. This cycle of paintings was created in the early years of the twentieth century, but was virtually unknown until the early 2000’s. Like the manuscript, Af Klint’s work has been held within an archive, but barely exhibited by an art world that has only recently become interested. For fifty years they existed as art cycle ghosts, in an ironic material re-enactment of the invisible spirits that the artist wrote of as haunting her own interiority. From the age of 44, Af Klint strove to find a visual form for these inner experiences, and previous commentaries on the artist’s work have mostly focussed on approaches to *The Paintings for the Temple* suggested by the ways the artist herself wrote about this process. By looking at the work itself however, and connecting it with previously un-researched aspects of the artist’s life, I have found connections to the Af Klint family’s map making history, and to the Swedish Life Reform movement, to which many of the artist’s friends dedicated their lives. Aligning the material skins of the paintings, as objects, with maps of the sea, I find a metaphor for the body of the culturally invisible, creative woman, tattooed and returned to visibility by the artist’s own words. Each visual realisation of the ghostly spirits embedded in the artist’s friendship with Swedish Life Reform activist Otilia Adelborg (1885 – 1936), I find compelling evidence that these paintings are a political visualization of the beliefs and interests of the Reform movement. The patterns embedded there repeat embroidery patterns from Adelborg’s collection of folk textiles, built up as part of a wider cultural impetus to preserve Swedish traditions. They are the patterns anonymously designed by countless peasant women seeking to decorate their lives in remote farming communities. Brought into the part-bodies of a cycle of paintings conceived as a single entity, like the fifty-two paintings of the anonymous manuscript, *The Paintings for the Temple* unite these personal and political image histories within a cyclical body that is infused with a permeating force of light as a sexually freeing concept within Nordic Romanticism.

The conceptual figure of return that these light-filled paintings define, and which connects them to the manuscript, comes back in a different form within the visually permeable skins of the late Cell cycle by French American artist Louise Bourgeois. Bourgeois entered psychoanalysis when she was forty, and her later work is deeply informed by her understanding of this approach to ourselves in the world. Her first brush with Freudian ideas had been in the Paris of her youth however, when she had mingled with the Surrealists. She never joined this artistic movement, but her later work revisits Surrealist approaches to the submerged forces of the unconscious. The men of Surrealism had been motivated by the revolutionary potential of transcending desire, but Bourgeois redirected their approach to make sense of their method in relation to her female experience. I will argue that the taboo she consistently touches on is not that of transgressive desire, but socially disallowed female rage. In my final chapter, A Room of One’s Own, I explore how the transparent conceptual figure I trace in the shadows of the manuscript, and in the light filled bodies of the Temple cycle, can be traced in the Cells in this angry form. These are sculptural bodies that we literally see ‘through.’ With the invasive power of vision, we cut into dirty cages filled with an alchemy of mutilated body parts, often placed within a litter of used up domesticity. Catching sight of ourselves mirrored into this world, through skins of glass and wire walls, we become affectively entwined in the artist’s screaming structures.

I have approached *The Paintings for the Temple* and the manuscript with the same psychoanalytic ideas that are commonly used to explore Bourgeois’ work, and looking back in this way may only be possible from a present that includes the Cells. However, all these bodies-of-work resonate with a similar, insistently internal life that these ideas merely give words to. Each visual realization of the artist’s metaphor is most directly metaphorical carrier of this life has been found within the skin of a domestic object. These stand-ins, for the visible skins of the women who made them, are given aesthetic vitality through the meditative re-presentation of the sight and touch of the world at their hand’s reach, the world experienced every day from inside those skins. In finding a conceptual metaphor for the visible object materiality, these aesthetic bodies offer artistic resting places for the endless search ‘sentenced to find a form that might hold our love, a form that might hold our deaths.’ To see these bodies-of-work, which are built up in serial form, we are obliged to dance in time, looking back, forward, sometimes around, building meaning from bits and pieces as our oscillations, through pages, round and through a sculpture and a room, require both memory and imagination to patch readings together out of parts. From its continual present, the dance takes us back to a speculative reading of an old book as an
anonymous record of an ageing woman, negotiating picture-making in an attempt to make sense of her inner world. The dance finds her tracing her life within an aesthetic field that possibly offered her no other mirror, and that is only being recognised and valued now, centuries later.