Mining in the land of Buen Vivir

The politics of large-scale mining, development and territorial transformation in the Ecuadorian Amazon

van Teijlingen, K.M.

Link to publication

Creative Commons License (see https://creativecommons.org/use-remix/cc-licenses):
Other

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
MINING IN THE LAND OF BUEN VIVIR

The Politics of Large-Scale Mining, Development and Territorial Transformation in the Ecuadorian Amazon

KAROLIEN VAN TEIJLINGEN
MINING IN THE LAND OF BUEN VIVIR

The Politics of Large-Scale Mining, Development and Territorial Transformation in the Ecuadorian Amazon

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam

op gezag van de Rector Magnificus Prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex

ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties ingestelde commissie,

in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Agnietenkapel

op dinsdag 17 december 2019, te 10.00 uur door

Karolien Marte van Teijlingen geboren te Utrecht
**Promotiecommissie:**

Promotores:  
- Prof. dr. B.B. Hogenboom  
- Prof. dr. J.M. Baud  
  Universiteit van Amsterdam

Overige leden:  
- Prof. dr. R.A. Boelens  
- Prof. dr. I.S.A. Baud  
- Prof. dr. C.G. Koonings  
- Prof. dr. M. Arsel  
- Dr. E.D. Rasch  
  Universiteit van Amsterdam

  Erasmus Universiteit Rotterdam

  Wageningen University & Research

Faculteit der Maatschappij- en Gedragswetenschappen
Acknowledgements

The past half-a-decade brought me so much more than a nice title and the inch-thick book in front of you. It has been quite a ride, with plenty of lessons learned (and things un-learned), laughter (and some tears), and valuable insights of all kinds. But the best of it all was the company, without whom this experience would have been far less enjoyable. Here are some words of gratitude to those who have joined me.

First, I wish to thank Barbara Hogenboom who has been supportive of my academic career even before it actually started. During my master’s studies, you arranged my first office under the ridge of the Cedla-building at the Keizersgracht. Then, you pushed me to explore new horizons (Belém!) and pursue a PhD. Finally, as supervisor and roommate, you have helped me through the many obstacles of that PhD, from salary negotiations to analytical challenges. Equally essential was the mentoring of Michiel Baud. Although your critical questions and frowns made me shiver at first, I have learned to appreciate them (and answer them convincingly!). Over countless beers (in Amsterdam, El Pangui, or Dalfsen), you have taught me to look at Latin America in an analytic yet engaged and cheerful manner. Despite your busy agendas, you two have been an incredibly nice and patient supervisor’s duo. Thank you for everything!

I am also grateful to all my other colleagues and friends at Cedla, who have made my time between those office walls a great one. Carmen, our endless talks about food, Latin America and life were always thought-provoking and I hold dear memories of those diners with singani at your warm home in Arnhem. Bente, our stretch-sessions and equally endless talks about rabbits, vunzige deuntjes and other random issues were always a joy, as were our nights out dancing to those deuntjes. Julienne, I think we have done a pretty nice job in organizing those dozens of OLA events, and I very much enjoyed sharing numerous drinks, dinners and nights out with you. Lucía, Cristina and Carolina: you made Cedla’s PhD room into a Little Ecuador and thinking of our many Amsterdam adventures puts a smile upon my face. I thank you, as well as Irene, Bibiana, Sara, Sebastián and Pancho, for those delicious and entertaining pambamesas – please keep that spirit alive! Rutgerd, I thank you for your feedback on my work, the political ecology reading groups, and the freezing cold trips to Groningen and the ijsbaan. Many thanks also to Jolanda,
Fabio, Arij, Leontien, Gerson, Kathleen, Pamela, Christien, Annelou, Javier and Graça for making Cedla such a lovely working environment.

I am also indebted to the AISSR and, in particular, to the GPIO department and the GID group. They have not only educated me as a geographer, they have also provided indispensible financial and institutional support to undertake my PhD. I am particularly grateful to Michaela for her encouragements ever since my bachelor studies, and to Mirjam for supporting me during my first semester of teaching. I furthermore thank Isa, Joyeeta, Joeri, Andrés, Maarten, Mieke, Yves, Rivke and Hebe for their feedback and good advice.

Outside Roeterseiland, there are many other scholars who have created an inspiring academic environment for this dissertation to come about. First and foremost, I thank Consuelo, Esben and Luís for being such a wonderful team. Much of the ideas in this dissertation were born out of our conversations, joined fieldwork experiences and the process of editing our book “La Amazonía Minada: Minería a Gran Escala y Conflictos En El Sur Del Ecuador”. It has been great sharing a profound love and concern for the Cordillera del Cóndor, and I am sure this will make us join again in the future. Thea Riofrancos and Paulina Garzón, our (muddy) trips into the field have been great fun, and our discussions thought-provoking. I also thank Ximena Warnaars for our collaboration, which has been incredibly smooth and chévere given the fact we have actually never met in person. I am furthermore grateful to Pablo Andrade, Pablo Ospina, Manuel Bayón, Murat Arsel, Lorenzo Pelligrini, Constanza Parra, Nienke Busscher, Michiel Köhne, Robert Fischer, Eduardo Silva, Sarah Radcliffe and Tania Murray Li for reading and commenting on my work. I also would like to thank Cian Dayrit for allowing me to use a piece of the beautiful Frontiers of Struggle series on the cover of this dissertation.

I am also truly grateful to every single person in the Cordillera del Cóndor who opened her or his doors for me, and entrusted to me her or his stories. Inhabitants of El Pangui, Tundayme, Yanúa, Churuwia, Etsa, Mirador. Valle del Quimi, San Marcos, Sta. Cruz, San Andrés, San Francisco de Pakintza, Santiago Paati, San Carlos Numpaim, Certero, Los Encuentros, El Guisme, Zamora, Bomboiza and Gualaquiza – your generosity, kindness and openness have been absolutely essential for the coming into being of this dissertation. Similarly, I thank the representatives of the GAD Parroquial de Tundayme, CASCOMI, the GAD Municipal El Pangui, the Prefectura de Zamora Chinchipe, Zamaskijat, FESHZCH, FEPNASH and the Comité
de Defensa de la Naturaleza, la Vida y la Salud del Pangui for their collaboration in this research. Finally, I want to express my deepest gratitude to Anny, Angela and their families, for their friendship and for providing me with a home in the Cordillera del Cóndor.

Luckily, my web of support reached far beyond academia. My dear friends and roommates, Mariska, Katrien, Harmen, Nite, Annemarie, Elisa, Floortje, Tessie, Merel, Margo, Eva and Just: you have helped me to disconnect from my reading and writing, and reconnect with the other spheres of life. Singing, cooking, eating, dancing, gossiping, swimming, doing yoga, hiking, going on holidays and above all being together with you has been crucial for my well-being throughout this whole period.

I am also deeply grateful for the encouragement and support of my dear family. Martje, your indignation and relentless struggle against environmental degradation and injustice in Drenthe have formed me, and inspired me to dig into these dilemmas ever since I was in high school. Hans, you were absolutely right when you casually suggested me to study geography: this dissertation shows my passion for this discipline. Nienke, our shared lame sense of humour, our imitations of the Drentse dialect, as well as your more serious medical and big-sistah-advices have helped me through. But above all, it has been the foundations of self-confidence and unconditional love you three gave me ever since I was little that has helped me thrive in this and basically all of my undertakings. I would also like to thank my family at the other side of the ocean – Liliana, Edwin, Esteban and Edwin Ricardo – for being such generous, welcoming and loving persons.

Lastly, I owe an incredible lot to Juan. We have gone through this wild ride together, and we made it to the end. You have helped me to understand Ecuador, Foucault and myself a lot better than I ever did before. You are the single-greatest gift this PhD brought me, and I am sure that this period would have been much less pleasant without you by my side. I clearly remember how it all started, sitting on the couch in my sunlit room in de Gijsbrecht van Aemstelstraat of Amsterdam and reading each other poems of Benedetti: “si te quiero es porque sos / mi amor mi cómplice y todo / y en la calle codo a codo / somos mucho más que dos”. Back then, neither of us must have imagined that, five years later, we would end up living the poem. But we definitely are, codo a codo.
# Table of content

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENT</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF ACRONYMS</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION: A GASH IN THE FOREST .................. 19

1.1 FOCUS AND AIMS                         22

1.2 CONCEPTUALIZING TERRITORIAL TRANSFORMATIONS 24

1.3 POWER DYNAMICS AT THE MINING FRONTIER: A REVIEW 29

1.4 TOWARDS A MICRO-POLITICAL ECOLOGY OF THE SUBSOIL 35

1.5 RESEARCH LOCATION AND METHODOLOGY 42

1.6 ON POSITIONALITY 48

1.7 A ROADMAP OF THE DISSERTATION 51

## CHAPTER 2. A “CHANGE OF ERA”? THE CITIZENS’ REVOLUTION, BUEN VIVIR AND MINING IN ECUADOR ........................................ 53

2.1 THE CITIZENS’ REVOLUTION: FROM A NEOLIBERAL PAST TO A POST-EXTRACTIVE FUTURE? 55

2.2 TOWARDS A PAÍS MINERO 66

2.3 “WE ARE OPEN FOR BUSINESS”: ECUADOR AS LATIN AMERICA’S NEXT MINING FRONTIER 77

2.4 THE ROLE OF CHINA IN ECUADOR’S MINING AMBITIONS 83

2.4 CONCLUDING REMARKS: AN AMBIGUOUS CHANGE 87

## CHAPTER 3. SEDIMENTED NOTIONS OF THE PAST: SITUATING TERRITORY, IDENTITY AND DEVELOPMENT IN EL PANGUI ........................................ 91

3.1 EL PANGUI AS PERENNIAL FRONTIER 93

3.2 TERRITORIAL TRANSFORMATIONS AND THE STRUGGLES FOR LAND 99

3.3 DIFFERENCE, ETHNIC IDENTITIES AND POWER RELATIONS 107

3.4 PATRIA, “PROGRESS” AND CITIZENSHIP IN THE PERIPHERY 117

3.5 CONCLUDING REMARKS: CUTTING THROUGH THE LAYERS 123
CHAPTER 4. FROM MOUNTAIN TO MINE: POWER, KNOWLEDGE AND MAPS IN THE MAKING OF THE MIRADOR PROJECT ................................................................. 127

4.1 Power, knowledge and maps 129
4.2 The making of Mirador: the chronicles of a Trojan Horse 131
4.3 The science of “responsible mining” 141
4.4 The politics of truth: mobilizing science and containing criticism 147
4.5 Corporate Cartography 154
4.6 Materializing the mine: enclosures and expropriations 161
4.7 Concluding remarks: political interests and the expert subjectivity 168

CHAPTER 5. ‘MINERÍA PARA EL BUEN VIVIR’: FORGING A LOCAL MINING-DEVELOPMENT NEXUS AND NEW SUBJECTIVITIES........................................... 171

5.1 Development’s productive power and subject formation 173
5.2 From ECSA’s “Fair Deal” to the State’s Buen Vivir 175
5.3 Mining for good living: governmental discourses under the Citizens’ Revolution 180
5.4 The mining-development nexus reaches El Pangui 185
5.5 Ecuador Estratégico: grids and concrete in the “New Amazon” 195
5.6 Concluding remarks: mining, development and the making of the ideal citizen? 205

CHAPTER 6. TERRITORIAL CONFLICTS, RESISTANCE AND STRUGGLES FOR ALTERNATIVES............................................................................ 211

6.1 Territorial conflicts and identity politics: some theoretical orientations 213
6.2 Shuar leaders and their struggle for territory 216
6.3 Colonist identity politics and counter-territorialization: the case of CASCOMI 231
6.4 Multi-layered power dynamics in territorial conflicts 250
6.5 Concluding remarks: resistance movements and worlds otherwise? 257
List of figures

Figure 1.1: The view from María’s house. Image by author, August 2015.................................19

Figure 1.2: Map of the Research area. Elaboration by Karolien van Teijlingen......................43

Figure 2.1 Table of Metal Mining Concessions issued in Ecuador in period 2001 – 2016......68

Figure 2.2: Price index for metals and copper........................................................................69

Figure 2.3: Screenshot taken from presentations by the Minister of Mining at PDAC 2018..80

Figure 2.4: Table with the five strategic mining projects in Ecuador.................................81

Figure 2.5: Poster promoting China-Ecuador relations in Tundayme.................................84

Figure 2.6: FDI in Mining in Ecuador per country of origin.................................................85

Figure 2.8: Critical cartoons on strengthening relations between Ecuador and China........86

Figure 3.1: An impression of the Shuar territoriality in the area of the Mirador project, around 1940......................................................................................................................102

Figure 3.2 Colonization, formation of villages and the Shuar reserve of Churuwia area of the Mirador project around 1980. .........................................................................................................................105

Figure 3.3: Miss Elections in El Pangui, with the 'hispana' queen in the middle.................115

Figure 3.4: The perceived loss of Ecuadorian territory from 1740 to 1942. .........................118

Figure 4.1 Table summarizing different mine designs and EIAs of the Mirador project ....134

Figure 4.2.a-d: Mirador’s mine designs through time...........................................................135

Figure 4.3. Assessment of environmental and social impacts for the processing phase......143

Figure 4.4 Cartoon published by ECSA on water use in the “modern” mining industry.....149

Figure 4.5: The reviewed design of the Mirador project......................................................154

Figure 4.6: The areas of impact identified for the processing phase....................................155
Figure 4.7: The protected forest Cordillera del Condor. ................................................................. 157

Figure 4.8: Government territorial boundaries.................................................................................. 158

Figure 4.9: Development of landownership by ECSA, 2000-2015..................................................... 163

Figure 4.10: Private security and access rules at the (public) entrance bridge to the Parish of Tundayme .................................................................................................................................................. 164

Figure 4.11: Territorial transformation and deforestation due to the Mirador project................. 167

Figure 5.1: An ECSA leaflet, collected during fieldwork in Tundayme in 2012. ............................ 176

Fig. 5.2. Billboard of EEEP stating “Mining brings Buen Vivir to your community” and “Resources construct happiness”. ...................................................................................................................... 187

Figure 5.3 Government leaflet promoting “responsible mining” so “we can all improve”... 189

Figure 5.4. True or False game of EEEP’s Edu-Communication Programme............................. 192

Figure 5.5: Map of areas selected for intervention by EEEP. ........................................................... 196

Figure 5.6: Standardized design of a Millennium School. Source: webpage Ministry of Education. .................................................................................................................................................. 198

Figure 5.7: Plans for the Millennium Community of Tundayme. Source: picture by author. 201

Figure 5.8. The design of the urban park of the Millennium Community of Tundayme........... 201

Figure 6.1 Meeting of Shuar from El Pangui organized by Asamblea de los Pueblos del Sur in June 2012. Source: photo taken by author .......................................................................................................................... 225

Figure 6.2: Commemoration of the death of Shuar leaders, December 2016............................ 230

Figure 6.4: A member of ASCOMI with the patron saint San Marcos (in the box) and some other artefacts from the chapel which she saved when it was demolished........................................ 237

Figure 6.5: Sign placed by CASCOMI to demarcate its collective territory................................ 244

Figure 6.6: sign at the entrance of “El Nuevo San Marcos” ............................................................ 245

Figure 6.7 Pictures of the evictions and protest in September 2015.............................................. 248

Figure 6.8: Territorial pluralism around the Mirador project............................................................. 251
Figure 7.1 – reconstruction of Oscar’s community.                                      269

Figure 7.2: Members of the Comité Pro-Universidad para El Pangui next to the Minister of
Mining and other authorities during the inauguration of the Mirador project.           285
# List of acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2005EIA</td>
<td>The environmental impact assessment the company submitted in 2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006EIA</td>
<td>The environmental impact assessment the company submitted in 2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010EIA</td>
<td>The environmental impact assessment the company submitted in 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015EIA</td>
<td>The environmental impact assessment the company submitted in 2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alianza PAIS</td>
<td><em>Alianza Patria Altiva i Soberana</em>, political movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARCOM</td>
<td><em>Agencia Nacional de Regulación y Control Minero</em>, the National Regulation and Control of Mining Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASCOMI</td>
<td><em>Organización de Acción Social Cóndor Mirador</em>, Organization of Social Acción Cóndor Mirador</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CASCOMI</td>
<td><em>Comunidad Amazónica de Acción Social Condor Mirador</em>, Amazonian Community of Social Action Cóndor Mirador</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDES</td>
<td><em>Centro de Derechos Economicos y Sociales</em>, Quito-based NGO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDENMA</td>
<td><em>Coordinadora Ecuatoriana de organizaciones para la Defensa de la Naturaleza y el Medio Ambiente</em>, Quito-based network of NGOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDHU</td>
<td><em>Comission Eucomenica de Derechos Humanos</em>, Quito-based NGO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEPAL</td>
<td><em>Comisión Económica para América Latina y el Caribe</em>, United Nations Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CODELCO</td>
<td><em>Corporación Nacional del Cobre de Chile</em>, Chile’s National Copper Mining Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CODENPE</td>
<td><em>Consejo de Desarrollo de las Nacionalidades y Pueblos del Ecuador</em>, government body responsible for the registration of indigenous organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIAP</td>
<td><em>Colectivo de Investigación y Acción Psicosocial</em>, Quito-based research collective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPC</td>
<td>Communist Party of China</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRCC</td>
<td>China Railway Construction Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CREA</td>
<td><em>Centro de Reconversión Económica del Azuay, Cañar y Morona Santiago</em>, Centre for the Economic Reconversion of the Azuay, Cañar and Morona Santiago Provinces</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSR</td>
<td>Corporate Social Responsibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONAIE</td>
<td><em>Confederación de Nacionales Indígenas del Ecuador</em>, Confederation of Indigenous Nationalities of Ecuador</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONFENAIE</td>
<td><em>Confederación de Nacionalidades Indígenas de la Amazonía Ecuatoriana</em>, Confederation of Indigenous Nationalities of the Ecuadorian Amazon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECORAE</td>
<td><em>Instituto para el Ecodesarrollo Regional Amazónico</em>, Institute for the Eco-development of the Amazon region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECSA</td>
<td>Ecuacorrientes S.A., mining company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECUARUNARI</td>
<td><em>Confederación de Pueblos de la Nacionalidad Kichwa del Ecuador</em>, Confederation of the People of the Kichwa Nationality of Ecuador</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EEEP</td>
<td><em>Ecuador Estratégico Empresa Publica</em>, public enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EIA</td>
<td>Environmental Impact Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENAMI</td>
<td><em>Empresa Nacional de Minería</em>, Ecuador's National Mining Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDI</td>
<td>Foreign Direct Investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FEPNASH</td>
<td><em>Federación Provincial de la Nacionalidad Shuar</em>, Provincial Federation of the Shuar Nation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FESHZCH</td>
<td><em>Federación Shuar de Zamora Chinchipe</em>, the Shuar Federation of the Zamora Chinchipe Province</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FICSH</td>
<td><em>Federación Interprovincial de Centros Shuar</em>, Interprovincial Federation of Shuar Centres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIDH</td>
<td><em>Federación Internacional de Derechos Humanos</em>, transnational NGO based in Quito</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
IERAC  
*Instituto Ecuatoriano de Reforma Agraria y Colonización,* Ecuadorian Institute for Agrarian Reform and Colonization

ILO  
International Labour Organization

IMF  
International Monetary Fund

INREDH  
*Fundación Regional de Asesoría en Derechos Humanos,* Quito-based NGO

MAAP  
Monitoring of the Andean Amazon Project

MAE  
*Ministerio del Ambiente del Ecuador,* Ecuadorian Ministry of the Environment

Mt  
Million Tonnes

NGO  
Non-Governmental Organization

PDAC  
Prospectors and Development Association of Canada

PDOT  
*Plan de Desarrollo y Ordenamiento Territorial,* Territorial Planning and Development Plan

PRODEMINCA  
Mining Development and Environmental Control Technical Assistance Project of the World Bank

SADCO  
South American Development Company

SASAC  
Assets Supervision and Administration Commission of the (Chinese) State Council

SENAGUA  
*Secretaría Nacional del Agua,* National Water Secretary

SENPLADES  
*Secretaría Nacional de Planificación y Desarrollo,* National Planning and Development Secretary

TEK  
Traditional Ecological Knowledge

WWII  
Second World War