Entertainment & leisure consumption in Istanbul

Aytar, V.

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
## Annex I: Periods, Actors and Dynamics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Periods</th>
<th>Byzantine 4th Century - 1453</th>
<th>Classical Ottoman 1453 - 19th Century</th>
<th>Reform Ottoman 19th Century - 1920s</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Actors &amp; Dynamics</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Producers

- **Elites**: High-skilled and/or highly educated
- **Popular entertainers**: Slapstick comicalities
- **Organized under groups of entertainers**

### Consumers

- **Palace**
- **Aristocrats/bureaucrats**
- **Richer circles**
- **Middle and lower classes**
- **‘Ethnic’ groups and Muslims**

### Regulation

- **Traditional paternalism**
  - Palace: Promotion, support, hosting of events, stratification of groups of entertainers, putting limitations, banning, criminalization
  - Church: Support, putting limitations, banning, criminalization

- **Communitarian traditional paternalism**
  - Palace: Promotion, support, hosting of events, stratification of groups of entertainers, putting limitations, banning, criminalization
  - Islamic clergy: Support, putting limitations, banning, criminalization (official ‘palace’ clergy and ‘volk’ [folk] clergy have sometimes different roles)

- **Reformist paternalism**
  - Palace: Promotion, support, hosting of events, stratification of groups of entertainers, putting limitations, banning, criminalization
  - Islamic clergy: Support, putting limitations, banning, criminalization
  - Foreign Embassies: Promotion, support, hosting of events

### Continuities

- **Elite entertainers**: High-skilled and/or highly educated
- **Popular entertainers**: Slapstick comicalities
- **Organized under groups of entertainers**

### Change & Transformation

- **Ethnicity** as a clearer and stronger dynamic in organization and clustering of entertainers and their work (also see below, under “Dynamics of Ethnicity”)
- More flexibility in crossing over among different groups of entertainers (also see below, under “Dynamics of Ethnicity”)
- Modern forms of entrepreneurship emerging and becoming stronger
- “Cosmopolitans”
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Periods</th>
<th>Byzantine 4th Century - 1453</th>
<th>Classical Ottoman 1453 - 19th Century</th>
<th>Reform Ottoman 19th Century - 1920s</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mediators</strong></td>
<td><em>Moralizers, Legislators &amp; Aesthetes</em>&lt;br&gt;<strong>Cultural Mediators à la Bourdieu with Moralizing Legislators</strong> (religious authorities and personalities) and Cultural Specialists à la Featherstone (Intellectuals, artists, chroniclers)&lt;br&gt;Religious authorities: armed with legislative powers, they are at once <em>moralizers</em>&lt;br&gt;Intellectuals: Approving, disapproving consumption and entertainment trends&lt;br&gt;Chroniclers: to document, underline or omit</td>
<td><em>Moralizers, Legislators &amp; Aesthetes</em>&lt;br&gt;Similar to the previous, period, moralizer and legislators still exist, as well as cultural specialists.&lt;br&gt;Religious authorities: armed with legislative powers, they are at once <em>moralizers</em>&lt;br&gt;Intellectuals: Approving, disapproving consumption and entertainment trends&lt;br&gt;Chroniclers: to document, underline or omit</td>
<td><em>Moralizers, Legislators &amp; Promoters</em>&lt;br&gt;Similar to the previous, period, moralizer and legislators still exist, as well as cultural specialists.&lt;br&gt;Emergence of modern mediation (newspapers, magazines, annals, guidebooks, and other media)&lt;br&gt;Promoters emerge as various cultural and consumption tendencies are colliding&lt;br&gt;Cultural specialists and “Cosmopolitans” who promote new, modern tendencies and styles, while competing with other specialists who provide criticisms and offer alternatives to modern ones.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dynamics of Diversity</strong></td>
<td><em>Regulation-based ‘Othering’:</em> Ethnic stratification and functionalization of diversity&lt;br&gt;Ethnic division of labor through ethnic boundaries&lt;br&gt;Ethnic Greeks as a privileged and elite group of entertainers&lt;br&gt;Roma either as administratively clustered, ethnicized, and skilled exotics, or as slapstick entertainers.</td>
<td><em>Regulation-based ‘Othering’ &amp; Exocitizing the Familiar</em>&lt;br&gt;Ethnic stratification and functionalization of diversity&lt;br&gt;Ethnic division of labor through ethnic boundaries&lt;br&gt;Only ‘ethnic’ groups (non-Muslims and the Roma) are allowed to operate in alcohol sector and in most performative entertainment forms&lt;br&gt;Muslims in more local/traditional forms</td>
<td><em>Regulation-based ‘Othering’; Orientalism, Inner-Orientalism &amp; Occidentalism</em>&lt;br&gt;Reform laws (especially new regulations on equality of different <em>millet</em> with Muslims) and changing societal attitudes allow Muslims to become more active in entertainment sector. More flexibility in crossing over among different groups of entertainers.&lt;br&gt;Inner-Orientalism emerges as Roma have been administratively and mentally earmarked as ‘the Other’ within the Otherized self.&lt;br&gt;Occidentalism as an important dynamic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Producers</strong></td>
<td>Decimation of non-Muslims. Their replacement by Turks or other Turkified group of producers.</td>
<td>Decimation of non-Muslims and their replacement by Turkified group of producers. Informalities providing new chances for entrepreneurs.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Consumers</strong></td>
<td>The state and bureaucrats Newly Turkified bourgeoisie Middle and lower classes Rich Provincial Migrants</td>
<td>The state and bureaucrats Newly Turkified bourgeoisie Middle and lower classes Rural to Urban Migrants</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Regulation</strong></td>
<td><strong>Radical Modernist Paternalism</strong> Steering the society towards top-down cultural modernization society, training the masses. Forging the Turkish Volk Promotion, support, hosting of events, putting limitations, banning, criminalization</td>
<td><strong>Populist, Relaxed Paternalism</strong> Less ideological, more practical attitude Acknowledging the uncontrollability of informalities. Turning informalities into chances by developing clientelistic networks.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mediators</strong></td>
<td><strong>Moralizers, Legislators &amp; Aesthetes</strong> Cultural Mediators and Cultural Specialists Intellectuals and artists armed with legislative powers Monopoly of access to the society when the opposition and alternatives were muted</td>
<td><strong>Moralizers, Legislators &amp; Aesthetes</strong> Cultural Mediators and Cultural Specialists Decreasing legislative powers of intellectuals and artists No monopoly of access to the society whereby more opposition and alternatives were voiced. Fragmentation of the mediators along political and ideological divisions.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dynamics of Diversity</strong></td>
<td>The continuing and dramatically speeding decimation of the non-Muslim ethnic minorities Othering of the Roma and the rich provincial migrants</td>
<td>Rural to urban migration and out-migration to Germany and other foreign destinations Othering of the Roma and new rural to urban migrants</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>