Entertainment & leisure consumption in Istanbul

Aytar, V.

Publication date
2014

Citation for published version (APA):
### Annex I: Periods, Actors and Dynamics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Periods</th>
<th>Byzantine 4th Century - 1453</th>
<th>Classical Ottoman 1453 - 19th Century</th>
<th>Reform Ottoman 19th Century - 1920s</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Producers** | Elite entertainers: High-skilled and/or high educated  
Popular entertainers: Slapstick comicalities  
Organized under groups of entertainers | Continuities: Elite entertainers: High-skilled and/or highly educated  
Popular entertainers: Slapstick comicalities  
Organized under groups of entertainers  
*Change & Transformation: Ethnicity as a clearer and stronger dynamic in organization and clustering of entertainers and their work (also see below, under “Dynamics of Ethnicity”)* | Continuities: Elite entertainers: High-skilled and/or high educated  
Popular entertainers: Slapstick comicalities  
Organized under groups of entertainers  
*Change & Transformation: More flexibility in crossing over among different groups of entertainers (also see below, under “Dynamics of Ethnicity”) Modern forms of entrepreneurship emerging and becoming stronger “Cosmopolitans”* |
| **Consumers** | Palace  
Aristocrats/bureaucrats  
Richer circles  
Middle and lower classes | Palace  
Aristocrats/bureaucrats  
Richer circles  
Middle and lower classes  
‘Ethnic’ groups and Muslims | Palace  
Aristocrats/bureaucrats  
Richer circles  
Middle and lower classes  
‘Ethnic’ groups and Muslims |
| **Regulation** | Traditional paternalism  
Palace: Promotion, support, hosting of events, stratification of groups of entertainers, putting limitations, banning, criminalization  
Church: Support, putting limitations, banning, criminalization | Communitarian traditional paternalism  
Palace: Promotion, support, hosting of events, stratification of groups of entertainers, putting limitations, banning, criminalization  
Islamic clergy: Support, putting limitations, banning, criminalization (official ‘palace’ clergy and ‘volk’ [folk] clergy have sometimes different roles) | Reformist paternalism  
Palace: Promotion, support, hosting of events, stratification of groups of entertainers, putting limitations, banning, criminalization  
Islamic clergy: Support, putting limitations, banning, criminalization  
Foreign Embassies: Promotion, support, hosting of events |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Periods</th>
<th>Byzantine</th>
<th>Classical Ottoman</th>
<th>Reform Ottoman</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4th Century - 1453</td>
<td>1453 - 19th Century</td>
<td>19th Century - 1920s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Actors &amp; Dynamics</td>
<td>Moralizers, Legislators &amp; Aesthetes</td>
<td>Moralizers, Legislators &amp; Aesthetes</td>
<td>Moralizers, Legislators &amp; Promoters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cultural Mediators à la Bourdieu with Moralizing Legislators</td>
<td>Similar to the previous period, moralizer and legislators still exist, as well as cultural specialists.</td>
<td>Similar to the previous period, moralizer and legislators still exist, as well as cultural specialists.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mediators</td>
<td>Religious authorities: armed with legislative powers, they are at once moralizers</td>
<td>Religious authorities: armed with legislative powers, they are at once moralizers</td>
<td>Emergence of modern mediation (newspapers, magazines, annals, guidebooks, and other media)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Intellectuals: Approving, disapproving consumption and entertainment trends</td>
<td>Intellectuals: Approving, disapproving consumption and entertainment trends</td>
<td>Promoters emerge as various cultural and consumption tendencies are colliding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chroniclers: to document, underline or omit</td>
<td>Chroniclers: to document, underline or omit</td>
<td>Cultural specialists and “Cosmopolitans” who promote new, modern tendencies and styles, while competing with other specialists who provide criticisms and offer alternatives to modern ones.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dynamics of Diversity</td>
<td>Regulation-based ‘Othering’: Ethnic stratification and functionalization of diversity</td>
<td>Regulation-based ‘Othering’ &amp; Exoticizing the Familiar</td>
<td>Regulation-based ‘Othering’; Orientalism, Inner-Orientalism &amp; Occidentalism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ethnic stratification and functionalization of diversity Ethnic division of labor through ethnic boundaries</td>
<td>Ethnic stratification and functionalization of diversity Ethnic division of labor through ethnic boundaries</td>
<td>Reform laws (especially new regulations on equality of different millet with Muslims) and changing societal attitudes allow Muslims to become more active in entertainment sector. More flexibility in crossing over among different groups of entertainers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Only ‘ethnic’ groups (non-Muslims and the Roma) are allowed to operate in alcohol sector and in most performative entertainment forms</td>
<td>Only ‘ethnic’ groups (non-Muslims and the Roma) are allowed to operate in alcohol sector and in most performative entertainment forms</td>
<td>Inner-Orientalism emerges as Roma have been administratively and mentally earmarked as ‘the Other’ within the Otherized self.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Muslims in more local/traditional forms</td>
<td>Muslims in more local/traditional forms</td>
<td>Occidentalism as an important dynamic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ethnic Greeks as a privileged and elite group of entertainers.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Producers</strong></td>
<td>Decimation of non-Muslims. Their replacement by Turks or other Turkified group of producers.</td>
<td>Decimation of non-Muslims and their replacement by Turkified group of producers. Informalities providing new chances for entrepreneurs.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Consumers</strong></td>
<td>The state and bureaucrats</td>
<td>The state and bureaucrats</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Newly Turkified bourgeoisie</td>
<td>Newly Turkified bourgeoisie</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Middle and lower classes</td>
<td>Middle and lower classes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rich Provincial Migrants</td>
<td>Rural to Urban Migrants</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Regulation** | *Radical Modernist Paternalism*  
Steering the society towards top-down cultural modernization society, training the masses.  
Forging the Turkish *Volk*  
Promotion, support, hosting of events, putting limitations, banning, criminalization | *Populist, Relaxed Paternalism*  
Less ideological, more practical attitude  
Acknowledging the uncontrollability of informalities.  
Turning informalities into chances by developing clientelistic networks. |
| **Mediators** | *Moralizers, Legislators & Aesthetes*  
Cultural Mediators and Cultural Specialists  
Intellectuals and artists armed with legislative powers  
Monopoly of access to the society when the opposition and alternatives were muted | *Moralizers, Legislators & Aesthetes*  
Cultural Mediators and Cultural Specialists  
Decreasing legislative powers of intellectuals and artists  
No monopoly of access to the society whereby more opposition and alternatives were voiced.  
Fragmentation of the mediators along political and ideological divisions. |
| **Dynamics of Diversity** | The continuing and dramatically speeding decimation of the non-Muslim ethnic minorities  
Othering of the Roma and the rich provincial migrants | Rural to urban migration and out-migration to Germany and other foreign destinations  
Othering of the Roma and new rural to urban migrants |