The missing stone in the Cathedral

Of unfair terms in employment contracts and coexisting rationalities in European contract law

Leone, C.

Citation for published version (APA):
Leone, C. (2020). The missing stone in the Cathedral: Of unfair terms in employment contracts and coexisting rationalities in European contract law.

General rights
It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations
If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.
The missing stone in the Cathedral

of unfair terms in employment contracts and coexisting rationalities in European contract law

sabot
[noun]
clog, a shoe made entirely of wood

In its notorious "arrêt sabots" from 1866, the French Cour de Cassation quashed a decision by the Prud'hommes of Saint Etienne which had reduced a penalty of 10 Francs imposed on a factory worker for having worn their wooden sandals inside the plant. The fine, we know from the Prud'hommes' decision, corresponded to almost half the worker's monthly salary. It was set in the factory's règlement d'atelier, which was hung somewhere within the factory and was binding between the parties on a contractual basis.

The Cassation considered the Prud'hommes, who had decided in equity, to be in breach of article 1134 of the Code civil – in other words, they had failed to properly honour the binding force of contract. This was one of many cases through which, towards the end of the 19th century, contract law rules came to be seen as an instrument of workers' oppression.
The missing stone in the Cathedral

of unfair terms in employment contracts and coexisting rationalities in European contract law

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor aan de
Universiteit van Amsterdam
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex

ten overstaan van een door het College voor
Promoties ingestelde commissie,
in het openbaar te verdedigen
op 12 juni 2020, te 11 uur

door

Candida Leone

geboren te Rome
Promotiecommissie:

Promotor(es):
Prof. dr. A.A.H. van Hoek        Universiteit van Amsterdam
Prof. dr. M.B.M. Loos            Universiteit van Amsterdam

Copromotor(es):
Prof. dr. M. Bartl               Universiteit van Amsterdam

Overige leden:
Dr. K.J. Cseres                  Universiteit van Amsterdam
Dr. N. Maggi-Germain            Université Panthéon-Sorbonne – Paris 1
Prof. dr. C. Mak                 Universiteit van Amsterdam
Prof. dr. H-W. Micklitz          University of Helsinki
Prof. dr. C. U. Schmid           Universität Bremen
Prof. dr. E. Verhulp            Universiteit van Amsterdam

Faculteit der Rechtsgeleerdheid
Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION: CORRECTING THE NARRATIVE ON UNFAIR TERMS CONTROL  1
  1.1. Introduction  1
  1.2. A Prequel: background and terminology  2
  1.3. Private (or contract) law and regulation  12
  1.4. Methodology  19
  1.5. Final remarks  23

PART I THE “POLICY” DISCUSSION IN EUROPEAN CONTRACT LAW AND ITS LIMITATIONS 26

  Introduction  26

CHAPTER 2 DIRECTIVE 93/13, JUSTIFICATION AND AIMS  29
  2.1. Justification and aims of the Unfair Terms Directive  29
  2.2. European private law and the rise of “aims” discussions  48
  2.3. Conclusion: unfair terms control for whom?  51

CHAPTER 3 THE DIRECTIVE “IN ACTION”, A THREE-PRONGED ANALYSIS  53
  3.1. The unfairness test: substantive unfairness and transparency  57
  3.2. Consequences of unfairness  73
  3.3. Ex officio control and the relationship between individual and collective proceedings  82
  3.4. Conclusions  87

PART II THE APPEARANCE OF UNFAIR TERMS CONTROL IN LABOUR LAW AND THE CONTRACTUALISATION OF EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS 90

  Introduction  90

CHAPTER 4 THE ROAD TO UNFAIR TERMS CONTROL  92
  4.1. Similar stories, different paths  92
  4.2. Germany  94
  4.3. France  119
  4.4. Conclusions  137

CHAPTER 5 CONTRACTUALISATION AND EMPLOYMENT RELATIONS 142
  5.1 Introduction  142
  5.2. The contractualisation of employment relationships in historical perspective  142
  5.3. Contractualisation as a tool: contract terms in employment practices  153
  5.4. Contractualisation in practice and judicial responses: analysing certain contentious terms  161
  5.5. Conclusions  195

6. CONCLUSIONS AND OUTLOOK  200

BIBLIOGRAPHY  208

CASE LAW  227

LEGISLATION  232

SUMMARY  237

SAMENVATTING  239

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS  243