



## UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

### Justice for both

*Effective judicial protection under Article 47 of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights and the Unfair Contract Terms Directive*

van Duin, J.M.L.

#### Publication date

2020

#### Document Version

Other version

#### License

Other

[Link to publication](#)

#### Citation for published version (APA):

van Duin, J. M. L. (2020). *Justice for both: Effective judicial protection under Article 47 of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights and the Unfair Contract Terms Directive*. [Thesis, fully internal, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

#### General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

#### Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

## CASE LAW INDEX

### Court of Justice of the European Union<sup>1222</sup>

- CJEU 16 December 1976, Case C-33/76 *Rewe-Zentralfinanz en Rewe-Zentral v Landwirtschaftskammer für das Saarland* ECLI:EU:C:1976:188
- CJEU 16 December 1976, Case C-45/76 *Comet v Produktschap v Siergewassen* ECLI:EU:C:1976:191
- CJEU 14 April 1984, Case C-14/83 *Von Colson and Kamann v Land Nordrhein-Westfalen* ECLI:EU:C:1984:153
- CJEU 15 March 1986, Case C-222/84 *Marguerite Johnston v Chief Constable of the Royal Ulster Constabulary* ECLI:EU:C:1986:206
- CJEU 19 June 1990, Case C-213/89 *The Queen v Secretary of State for Transport, ex parte: Factorfame* ECLI:EU:C:1990:257
- CJEU 13 November 1990, Case C-106/89 *Marleasing v La Comercial Internacional de Alimentación* ECLI:EU:C:1990:395
- CJEU 14 December 1995, Joined Cases C-430/93 and C-431/93 *Van Schijndel and Van Veen v Stichting Pensioenfonds voor Fysiotherapeuten* ECLI:EU:C:1995:441
- CJEU 14 December 1995, Case C-312/93 *Peterbroeck, Van Campenhout & Cie v Belgian State* ECLI:EU:C:1995:437
- CJEU 1 June 1999, Case C-126/97 *Eco Swiss China Time v Benetton International* ECLI:EU:C:1999: 269
- CJEU 25 July 2002, Case C-50/00 *Unión de Pequeños Agricultores v Council of the European Union* ECLI:EU:C:2002:462
- CJEU 30 September 2003, Case C-224/01 *Gerhard Köbler v Republik Österreich* ECLI:EU:C:2003:513
- CJEU 27 January 2005, Case C-125/04 *Denuit v Transorient-Mosaïque Voyages et Culture* ECLI:EU:C:2005:69
- CJEU 13 March 2007 (Grand Chamber), Case C-432/05 *Unibet (London) Ltd and Unibet (International) Ltd v Justitiekanslern* ECLI:EU:C:2007:163
- CJEU 4 October 2007, Case C-429/05 *Rampion and Godard Rampion v Franfinance* ECLI:EU:C:2007:575
- CJEU 29 January 2008 (Grand Chamber), Case C-275/06 *Productores de Música de España (Promusicae) v Telefónica de España* ECLI:EU:C:2008:54
- CJEU 3 September 2008 (Grand Chamber), Joined Cases C-402/05 P and C-415/05 P *Kadi and Al Barakaat International Foundation v Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities* ECLI:EU:2008:461
- CJEU 16 July 2009, Case C-385/07 *Der Grüne Punkt – Duales System Deutschland v Commission of the European Communities* ECLI:EU:C:2009:456
- CJEU 2 December 2009 (Grand Chamber), Case C-89/08 *European Commission v Ireland* ECLI:EU:C:2009:742
- CJEU 18 March 2010, Joined Cases C-317/08, C-318/08, C-319/08 and C-320/08 *Rosalba Alassini v Telecom Italia* ECLI:EU:C:2010:146
- CJEU 22 December 2010, Case C-279/09 *DEB v Bundesrepublik Deutschland* ECLI:EU:C:2010:811

---

<sup>1222</sup> Cases concerning the UCTD are listed separately.

CJEU 28 July 2011, Case C-69/10 *Samba Diouf v Ministre du Travail, de l'Emploi et de l'Immigration* ECLI:EU:C:2011:524

CJEU 17 November 2011, Case C-327/10 *Hypoteční banka v Lindner* ECLI:EU:C:2011:745

CJEU 8 December 2011, Case C-386/10 *Chalkor AE Epexergasias Metallon v European Commission* ECLI:EU:C:2011:815

CJEU 24 January 2012 (Grand Chamber), Case C-282/10 *Dominguez v Centre informatique du Centre Ouest Atlantique and Préfet de la région Centre* ECLI:EU:C:2012:33

CJEU 6 November 2012 (Grand Chamber), Case C-199/11 *Europese Gemeenschap v Otis et al.* ECLI:EU:C:2012:684

CJEU 22 November 2012, Case C-277/11 *M.M. v Ministry for Justice, Equality and Law Reform* ECLI:EU:C:2012:744

CJEU 19 December 2012, Case C-325/11 *Alder and Alder v Orłowska and Orłowski* ECLI:EU:C:2012:824

CJEU 26 February 2013 (Grand Chamber), Case C-617/10 *Åklagaren v Åkerberg Fransson* ECLI:EU:C:2013:105

CJEU 26 February 2013 (Grand Chamber), Case C-399/11 *Melloni v Ministerio Fiscal* ECLI:EU:C:2013:107

CJEU 11 April 2013, C-260/11 *The Queen, on the application of David Edwards v Environment Agency* ECLI:EU:C:2013:221

CJEU 4 June 2013 (Grand Chamber), Case C-300/11 *Z.Z. v Secretary of State for the Home Department* ECLI:EU:C:2013:363

CJEU 27 June 2013, Case C-93/12 *T Agrokonsulting-04-Velko Stoyanov v Izpalnitelen direktor na Darzhaven fond 'Zemedelie' – Razplashatelna agentsi* ECLI:EU:C:2013:432

CJEU 26 September 2013, Case C-418/11 *Texdata Software* ECLI:EU:C:2013:588

CJEU 3 October 2013 (Grand Chamber), Case C-583/11 *Inuit Tapiriit Kanatami v European Parliament and Council of the European Union* ECLI:EU:C:2013:625

CJEU 3 October 2013, Case C-32/12 *Duarte Hueros v Autociba and Automóviles Citroën España* ECLI:EU:C:2013:637

CJEU 26 November 2013 (Grand Chamber), Case C-58/12 *Groupe Gascogne v European Commission* ECLI:EU:C:2013:770

CJEU 15 January 2014 (Grand Chamber), Case C-176/12 *Association de médiation sociale v Union locale des syndicats* ECLI:EU:C:2014:2

CJEU 6 March 2014, Case C-206/13 *Siracusa v Regione Sicilia – Soprintendenza Beni Culturali e Ambientali di Palermo* ECLI:EU:C:2014:126

CJEU 11 September 2014, Case C-112/13 *A. v B.* ECLI:EU:C:2014:2195

CJEU 23 October 2014, Case C-437/13 *Unitrading Ltd v Staatssecretaris van Financiën* ECLI:EU:C:2014:2318

CJEU 4 June 2015, Case C-497/13 *Faber v Autobedrijf Hazet Ochten* ECLI:EU:C:2015:357

CJEU 16 September 2015, Case C-519/13 *Alpha Bank Cyprus Ltd v Dau Si Senh and Others* ECLI:EU:C:2015:603

CJEU 6 October 2015 (Grand Chamber), Case C-362/14 *Schrems v Data Protection Commissioner* ECLI:EU:C:2015:650

CJEU 6 October 2015, Case C-61/14 *Orizzonte Salute – Studio Infermieristico Associato v Azienda Pubblica di Servizi alla persona San Valentino – Città di Levico Terme* ECLI:EU:C:2015:655

CJEU 5 April 2016, Case C-689/13 *Pulgienica Facility Esco (PFE) v Airgest* ECLI:EU:C:2016:199

CJEU 16 May 2017 (Grand Chamber), Case C-682/15 *Berlioz Investment Fund SA v Directeur de l'administration des contributions directes* ECLI:EU:C:2017:373

CJEU 14 June 2017, Case C-75/16 *Menini and Rampanelli v Banco Popolare Società Cooperative* ECLI:EU:C:2017:457

CJEU 28 July 2016, Case C-543/14 *Ordre des barreaux francophones et germanophone v Conseil des ministres* ECLI:EU:C:2016:605

CJEU 30 June 2016, Case C-205/15 *Direcția Generală Regională a Finanțelor Publice Brașov (DGRFP) v Toma and Biroul Executorului Judecătoresc Horațiu-Vasile Cruduleci* ECLI:EU:C:2016:499

CJEU 8 November 2016 (Grand Chamber), Case C-243/15 *Lesoochránárske zoskupenie tegen Obvodný úrad Trenčín (Brown Bears II)* ECLI:EU:C:2016:838

CJEU 29 November 2017, Case C-214/16 *King v The Sash Window Workshop Ltd and Richard Dollar* ECLI:EU:C:2017:914

CJEU 13 December 2017, Case C-403/16 *El Hassani v Minister Spraw Zagranicznych* ECLI:EU:C:2017:960

CJEU 20 December 2017, Case C-664/15 *Protect Natur-, Arten- und Landschaftsschutz Umweltorganisation v Bezirkshauptmannschaft Gmünd* ECLI:EU:C:2017:987

CJEU 27 February 2018 (Grand Chamber), Case C-64/16 *Associação Sindical dos Juízes Portugueses v Tribunal de Contas* ECLI:EU:C:2018:11

CJEU 6 March 2018 (Grand Chamber), Case C-284/16 *Slovak Republic v Achmea* ECLI:EU:C:2018:158

CJEU 7 April 2018 (Grand Chamber), Case C-414/16 *Egenberger v Evangelisches Werk Diakonie und Entwicklung* ECLI:EU:C:2018:257

CJEU 7 August 2018, C-300/17 *Hochtief v Budapest Főváros Önkormányzata* ECLI:EU:C:2018:635

CJEU 6 November 2018 (Grand Chamber), Joined Cases C-569/16 and C-570/16 *Stadt Wuppertal v Bauer* ECLI:EU:C:2018:871

CJEU 22 Januari 2019 (Grand Chamber), C-193/17 *Cresco Investigation v Achatzi* ECLI:EU:C:2019:43

CJEU 24 June 2019 (Grand Chamber), C-619/18 *European Commission v Republic of Poland* ECLI:EU:C:2019:531

CJEU 29 July 2019 (Grand Chamber), Case C-476/17 v *Hütter and Schneider-Esleben* ECLI:EU:C:2019:624

CJEU 4 September 2019, Case C-347/18 *Salvoni v Fiermonte* ECLI:EU:C:2019:661

CJEU 19 December 2019, Case C-752/18 *Deutsche Umwelthilfe v Freistaat Bayern* ECLI:EU:C:2018:1114

CJEU 19 December 2019, Joined Cases C-453/18 and C-494/18 *Bondora v VC and XY* ECLI:EU:C:2019:1118

CJEU 24 September 2019, Case C-185/19 *KE v LF* ECLI:EU:C:2019:779

CJEU 7 May 2020, Joined Cases C-267/19 and C-323/19 *Parking v Sawal and Interplastics v Letifico* ECLI:EU:C:2020:351

Cases concerning the UCTD<sup>1223</sup>

CJEU 27 June 2000, Joined Cases C-240/98 to C-244/98 *Océano Grupo Editorial v Murciano Quintero* ECLI:EU:C:2000:346

CJEU 10 May 2001, Case C-144/99 *Commission of the European Communities v Kingdom of the Netherlands* ECLI:EU:C:2001:257

---

<sup>1223</sup> The cases marked with \* refer to Article 47 of the Charter.

CJEU 21 November 2002, Case C-473/00 *Cofidis v Fredout* ECLI:EU:C:2002:705

CJEU 9 September 2004, Case C-70/03 *Commission of the European Communities v Kingdom of Spain* ECLI:EU:C:2004:505

CJEU 26 October 2006, Case C-168/05 *Mostaza Claro v Centro Móvil Milenium* ECLI:EU:C:2006:675

CJEU 4 June 2009, Case C-243/08 *Pannon v Sustikné Gyórfi* ECLI:EU:C:2009:350

CJEU 6 October 2009, Case C-40/08 *Asturcom Telecomunicaciones v Rodríguez Nogueira* ECLI:EU:C:2009:615

CJEU 9 November 2010 (Grand Chamber), Case C-137/08 *VB Pénzügyi Lízing v Ferenc Schneider* ECLI:EU:C:2010:659

CJEU 15 March 2012, Case C-453/10 *Pereničová and Perenič v SOS financ* ECLI:EU:C:2012:144

CJEU 26 April 2012, Case C-472/10 *Nemzeti Fogyasztóvédelmi Hatóság v Invitel Távközlési* ECLI:EU:C:2012:242

CJEU 14 June 2012, Case C-618/10 *Banco Español de Crédito v Calderón Camino* ECLI:EU:C:2012:349

\* CJEU 8 November 2012, Case C-433/11 *SKP v Polhošová* ECLI:EU:C:2012:702

\* CJEU 21 February 2013, Case C-472/11 *Banif Plus Bank v Csaba Csipai* ECLI:EU:C:2013:88

CJEU 14 March 2013, Case C-415/11 *Aziz v Catalunyacaixa* ECLI:EU:C:2013:164

CJEU 30 May 2013, Case C-397/11 *Jörös v Aegon Magyarország Hitel* ECLI:EU:C:2013:340

CJEU 30 May 2013, Case C-488/11 *Asbeek Brusse and de Man Garabito v Jahani* ECLI:EU:C:2013:341

CJEU 14 November 2013, Joined Cases C-537/12 and C-116/13 *Banco Popular Español v Rivas Quichimbo* ECLI:EU:C:2013:759

CJEU 5 December 2013, Case C-413/12 *Asociación de Consumidores Independientes de Castilla y León v Anuntis Segundamano España* ECLI:EU:C:2013:800

\* CJEU 27 February 2014, Case C-470/12 *Pohotovost' v Vašuta* ECLI:EU:C:2014:101

\* CJEU 3 April 2014, Case C-153/13 *Pohotovost' v Soroka* ECLI:EU:C:2014:1854

CJEU 3 April 2014, Case C-342/13 *Sebestyén v OTP Bank* ECLI:E:C:2014:1857

CJEU 30 April 2014, Case C-280/13 *Barclays Bank v Sánchez García and Chacón Barrera* ECLI:EU:C: 2014:279

CJEU 30 April 2014, Case C-26/13 *Kásler and Káslerné Rábai v OTP Jelzálogbank* ECLI:EU:C:2014:282

\* CJEU 3 July 2014, Case C-92/14 *Tudoran v SC Suport Colect* ECLI:EU:C:2014:2051

\* CJEU 17 July 2014, Case C-169/14 *Sánchez Morcillo and Abril García v BBVA* ECLI:EU:C:2014:2099

\* CJEU 10 September 2014, Case C-34/13 *Kušionová v SMART Capital* ECLI:EU:C:2014:2189

CJEU 18 November 2014, Case C-645/13 *Cajas Rurales Unidas v Méndez Sena* ECLI:EU:C:2014:2398

CJEU 15 January 2015, Case C-537/13 *Šiba v Devènas* ECLI:EU:C:2015:14

CJEU 21 January 2015, Joined Cases C-482/13, C-484/13, C-485/13 and C-487/13 *Unicaja Banco v Hidalgo* ECLI:EU:C:2015:21

CJEU 12 February 2015, Case C-567/13 *Baczó and Vizsnyiczai v Raffeyissen Bank* ECLI:EU:C:2015:88

CJEU 11 June 2005, Case C-602/13 *BBVA v Quintano Ujeta and Sánchez García* ECLI:EU:C:2015:397

\* CJEU 16 July 2015, Case C-539/14 *Sánchez Morcillo and Abril García v BBVA* ECLI:EU:C:2015:508

CJEU 1 October 2015, Case C-32/14 *ERSTE Bank Hungary v Sugár* ECLI:EU:C:2015:637

CJEU 29 October 2015, Case C-8/14 *BBVA v Peñalva López* ECLI:EU:C:2015:731

CJEU 19 November 2015, Case C-74/15 *Tarcău v Banca Comercială Intesa Sanpaolo România* ECLI:EU:C:2015:772

\* CJEU 18 February 2016, Case C-49/14 *Finanmadrid v Albán Zambrano and Others* ECLI:EU:C:2016:98

\* CJEU 23 February 2016, Case C-380/15 *Garzón Ramos v Banco de Caja España de Inversiones* ECLI:EU:C:2016:112

CJEU 14 April 2016, Joined Cases C-381/14 and C-385/14 *Sales Sinués and Drame Ba v Caixabank and Catalunya Caixa (Catalunya Banc)* ECLI:EU:2016:252

CJEU 21 April 2016, Case C-377/14 *Radlinger and Radlingerová v Finway* ECLI:EU:C:2016:283

CJEU 21 June 2016, Case C-122/14 *Aktiv Kapital Portfolio v Egea Torregrosa* ECLI:EU:C:2016:486

\* CJEU 5 July 2016, Case C-7/16 *Banco Popular Español and PL Salvador v Maria Rita Giraldez Villar and Modesto Martínez Baz* ECLI:EU:C:2016:523

CJEU 28 July 2016, Case C-168/15 *Tomášová v Slovenská republika – Ministerstvo spravodlivosti SR and Pohotovosť* ECLI:EU:C:2016:602

CJEU 28 July 2016, Case C-191/15 *Verein für Konsumenteninformation v Amazon EU* ECLI:EU:C:2016:612

CJEU 26 October 2016, Case C-568/14 *Fernández Oliva and Others v Caixabank* ECLI:EU:C2016:828

\* CJEU 21 December 2016 (Grand Chamber), Joined Cases C-154/14, C-307/15 and C-308/15 *Gutiérrez Naranjo v Cajasur Banco, Palacios Martínez v BBVA, Banco Popular Español v Irlés López and Torres Andreu* ECLI:EU:C:2016:980

\* CJEU 21 December 2016, Case C-119/15 *Biuro podróży 'Partner' v Prezes Urzędu Ochrony Konkurencji i Konsumentów* ECLI:EU:C:2016:987

CJEU 26 January 2017, Case C-421/14 *Banco Primus v Gutiérrez García* ECLI:EU:C:2017:60

\* CJEU 16 February 2017, Case C-503/15 *Margarit Panicello v Hernández Martínez* ECLI:EU:C:2017:126

CJEU 30 November 2017, *IJDF Italy v Fernando Dionisio* ECLI:EU:C:2017:924\*

CJEU 7 December 2017, Case C-598/15 *Banco Santander v Sánchez López* ECLI:EU:C:2017:945

CJEU 17 May 2018, C-147/16 *Karel de Grote – Hogeschool Katholieke Hogeschool Antwerpen v Kuijpers* ECLI:EU:C:2018:320

\* CJEU 31 May 2018, Case C-483/16 *Sziber v ERSTE Bank Hungary* ECLI: EU:C:2018:367

CJEU 7 August 2018, Joined Cases C-96/16 and C-94/17 *Banco Santander v Mahamadou Demba and Mercedes Godoy Bonet and Rafael Ramón Escobedo Cortés v Banco de Sabadell* ECLI:EU:C:2018:643

\* CJEU 13 September 2018, Case C-176/17 *Profi Credit Polska v Wawrzosek* ECLI:EU:C:2018:711

CJEU 20 September 2018, Case C-448/17 *EOS KSI Slovensko v Danko and Danková* ECLI:EU:C:2018:745

CJEU 20 September 2018, Case C-51/17 *OTP Bank and OTP Faktoring Követeléskezelő v Ilyés and Kiss* ECLI:EU:C:2018:750

\* CJEU 25 October 2018, Case C-426/17 *Barba Giménez v Carrión Lozano* ECLI:EU:C:2018:858

\* CJEU 28 November 2018, Case C-632/17 *PKO Bank Polski v Michalski* ECLI:EU:C:2018:963

\* CJEU 14 March 2019, Case C-118/17 *Dunai v ERSTE Bank Hungary* ECLI:EU:C:2019:207

CJEU 26 March 2019 (Grand Chamber), Case C-70/17 *Abanca v Salamanca Santos* ECLI:EU:C:2019:250

\* CJEU 3 April 2019, Case C-266/18 *Aqua Med v Skóra* ECLI:EU:C:2019:282

CJEU 26 June 2019, Case C-407/18 *Kuhar v Addiko Bank* ECLI:EU:C:2019:537

CJEU 3 July 2019, Case C-92/16 *Bankia v Rengifo Jiménez and Felix Caixa* ECLI:EU:C:2019:560

CJEU 31 July 2019, Case C-486/16 *Bankia v Sánchez Martínez and Sánchez Triviño* ECLI:EU:C:2019:572  
CJEU 19 September 2019, Case C-34/18 *Lovasné Tóth v ERSTE Bank Hungary* ECLI:EU:C:2019:764  
CJEU 3 October 2019, Case C-260/18 *Dziubak v Raiffeisen Bank International* ECLI:EU:C:2019:819  
CJEU 7 November 2019, Joined Cases C-419/18 and C-483/18 *Profi Credit Polska v Włostowska* ECLI:EU:C:2019:930  
CJEU 7 November 2019, Case C-349/18 *Nationale Maatschappij der Belgische Spoorwegen v Kanyeba* ECLI:EU:C:2019:936  
CJEU 11 March 2020, Case C-511/17 *Lintner v UniCredit Bank Hungary* ECLI:EU:C:2020:188  
\* CJEU 4 June 2020, Case C-495/19 *Kancelaria Medius v RN* ECLI:EU:C:2020:431

### Opinions of Advocates General

Opinion of AG Ruiz-Jaracob Colomer of 5 March 2009, Case C-14/08 *Roda Golf & Beach Resort*, ECLI:EU:C:2009:134  
Opinion of AG Cruz Villalón of 28 July 2011, Case C-69/10 *Brahim Samba Diouf v Ministre du Travail, de l'Emploi et de l'Immigration* ECLI:EU:C:011:524  
Opinion of AG Bot of 2 October 2012, Case C-399/11 *Criminal proceeding against Stefano Melloni* ECLI:EU:C:2012:600  
Opinion of AG Kokott of 28 February 2013, Case C-32/12 *Duarte Hueros v Autociba and Automóviles Citroën España SA* ECLI:EU:C:2013:637  
Opinion of AG Bot of 14 March 2013, Case C-93/12 *ET Agroconsulting-04-Velko Stoyanov v Izpalnitelen direktor na Darzhaven fond 'Zemedelie' – Razplashatatelna agentsia* ECLI:EU:C:2013:432  
Opinion of AG Jaäskinen of 13 March 2014, Case C-562/12 *Liivimaa Lihaveis v Eesti-Läti programmi 2007-2013 Seirekomitee* ECLI:EU:C:2014:155  
Opinion of AG Jaäskinen of 7 May 2015, Case C-61/14 *Orizzonte Salute - Studio Infermieristico Associato v Azienda Pubblica di Servizi alla persona San Valentino – Città di Levico Terme and Others* ECLI:EU:C:2015:655  
Opinion of AG Wathelet of 10 January 2017, Case C-682/15 *Berlioz Investment Fund v Directeur de l'administration des contributions directes* ECLI:EU:C:2017:2  
Opinion of AG Kokott of 30 March 2017, Case C-73/16 *Puškár v Finančné riaditeľstvo Slovenskej republiky and Kriminálny úrad finančnej správy* ECLI:EU:C:2017:253  
Opinion of AG Bobek of 7 September 2017, Case C-403/16 *El Hassani v Minister Spraw Zagranicznych*, ECLI:EU:C:2017:960  
Opinion of AG Sharpston of 12 October 2017, Case C-664/15 *Protect Natur-, Arten- und Landschaftsschutz Umweltorganisation v Bezirkshauptmannschaft Gmünd* ECLI:EU:C:2017:760  
Opinion of AG Bobek of 16 October 2017 *Case C-470/16 North East Pylon Pressure Campaign Limited Maura Sheehy v An Bord Pleanála Minister for Communications, Climate Action and Environment* ECLI:EU:C:2017:781  
Opinion of AG Kokott of 29 November 2018, Case C-411/17 *Inter-Environnement Walloni ASBL v Conseil des ministres* ECLI:EU:C:2018:972  
Opinion of AG Bobek of 30 April 2019, Case C-556/17 *Torubarov v Bevándorlási és Menekültügyi Hivatal* ECLI:EU:C:2019:339

### Cases concerning the UCTD

- \* Opinion of AG Trstenjak of 14 May 2009, Case C-40/08 *Asturcom Telecomunicaciones v Rodríguez Nogueira* ECLI:EU:C:2009:305
- Opinion of AG Trstenjak of 6 July 2010, Case C-137/08 *VB Pénzügyi Lízing v Ferenc Schneider* ECLI:EU:C:2010:401
- Opinion of AG Trstenjak of 14 February 2012, Case C-618/10 *Banco Español de Crédito v Calderón Camino* ECLI:EU:C:2012:74
- Opinion of AG Trstenjak of 26 April 2012, Case C-472/10 *Nemzeti Fogyasztóvédelmi Hatóság v Invitel Távközlési* ECLI:EU:C:2011:806
- Opinion of AG Kokott of 8 November 2012, Case C-415/11 *Aziz v Catalunya Caixa*
- Opinion of AG Wahl of 21 November 2013, Case C-482/12 *Macinský and Macinská v Getfin and Financreal* ECLI:EU:C:2013:765
- \* View of AG Wahl of 3 July 2014, Case C-169/14 *Sánchez Morcillo and Abril García v BBVA* ECLI:EU:C:2014:2110
- Opinion of AG Cruz Villalón of 25 June 2015, Case C-32/14 *ERSTE Bank Hungary v Sugár* ECLI:EU:C:2015:424
- \* Opinion of AG Kokott of 15 September 2016, Case C-503/15 *Ramón Margarit Panicello v Hernández Martínez* ECLI:EU:C:016:696
- Opinion of AG Szpunar of 13 May 2015, Case C-8/14 *BBVA v Peñalva López* ECLI:EU:C:2015:321
- \* Opinion of AG Szpunar of 11 November 2015, Case C-49/14 *Finanmadrid v Albán Zambrano* ECLI:EU:C:2015:746
- \* Opinion of AG Saugmandsgaard Øe of 2 June 2016, Case C-119/15 *Biuro podróży 'Partner' v Prezes Urzędu Ochrony Konkurencji i Konsumentów* ECLI:EU:C:2016:387
- Opinion of AG Mengozzi of 13 July 2016, Joined Cases C-154/14, C-307/15 and C-308/15 *Gutiérrez Naranjo v Cajasur Banco, Palacios Martínez v BBVA, Banco Popular Español v Irlés López and Torres Andreu* ECLI:EU:C:2016:552
- Opinion of AG Wahl of 29 June 2017, Case C-598/15 *Banco Santander v Sánchez López* ECLI:EU:C:2017:505
- Opinion of AG Sharpston of 30 November 2017, Case C-147/16 *Karel de Grote – Hogeschool Katholieke Hogeschool Antwerpen v Kuijpers* ECLI:EU:C:2017:928
- Opinion of AG Kokott of 26 April 2018, Case C-176/17 *Profi Credit Polska v Wawrzosek*, ECLI:EU:C:2018:293
- \* Opinion of AG Tanchev of 3 May 2018, Case C-51/17 *OTP Bank and OTP Faktoring Követeléskezelő v Ilyés and Kiss* ECLI:EU:C:2018:303
- Opinion of AG Szpunar of 13 September 2018, Case C-70/17 *Abanca v Salamanca Santos* ECLI:EU:C:2018:724
- \* Opinion AG Hogan of 19 September 2019, Case C-34/18 *Lovaszé Tóth v ERSTE Bank Hungary* ECLI:EU:C:2019:245
- Opinion of AG Kokott of 14 November 2019, Case C-616/18 *Cofidis v YU, ZT* ECLI:EU:C:2019:975

### **European Court of Human Rights**

- ECtHR 26 October 2000, Appl. No. 30210/96 *Kudla v Poland*
- ECtHR 8 April 2014, Appl. No. 17120/09 *Dhahbi v Italy*
- ECtHR 20 December 2018, Appl. No. 22853/15 *Merkantil Car Zrt. v Hungary*



## **Spain: Tribunal Constitucional**

*Tribunal Constitucional*, judgment no. 41/1981 of 18 December 1981, ECLI:ES:TC:1981:41  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, judgment no. 185/1987 of 18 November 1987, ECLI:ES:TC:1987:185  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, judgment no. 174/1995 of 23 November 1995, ECLI:ES:TC:1995:174  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, judgment no. 352/2006 of 14 December 2006, ECLI:ES:TC:2006:352  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, order no. 113/2011 of 19 July 2011, ECLI:ES:TC:2011:113A  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, judgment no. 145/2012 of 2 July 2012, ECLI:ES:TC:2012:145  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, order no. 70/2014 of 10 March 2014, ECLI:ES:TC:2014:70A  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, order no. 71/2014 of 10 March 2014, ECLI:ES:TC:2014:71A  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, order no. 111/2014 of 8 April 2014, ECLI:ES:TC:2014:111A  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, order no. 112/2014 of 8 April 2014, ECLI:ES:TC:2014:112A  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, order no. 113/2014 of 8 April 2014, ECLI:ES:TC:2014:113A  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, order no. 206/2014 of 22 July 2014, ECLI:ES:TC:2014:206A  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, judgment no. 241/2015 of 30 November 2015, ECLI:ES:TC:2015:241  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, judgment no. 58/2016 of 17 March 2016, ECLI:ES:TC:2016:58  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, judgment no. 148/2016 of 19 September 2016, ECLI:ES:TC:2016:148  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, judgment no. 75/2017 of 19 June 2017, ECLI:ES:TC:2017:75  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, judgment no. 1/2018 of 11 January 2018, ECLI:ES:TC:2018:1  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, judgment no. 31/2019 of 28 February 2019, ECLI:ES:TC:2019:31  
*Tribunal Constitucional*, judgment no. 34/2019 of 14 March 2019, ECLI:ES:TC:2019:34

## **Spain: Tribunal Supremo**

*Tribunal Supremo (Sala de lo Civil)*, judgment no. 681/2006 of 16 February 2006, ECLI:ES:TS:2006:681  
*Tribunal Supremo (Sala de lo Civil)*, judgment no. 1916/2013 of 9 May 2013, ECLI:ES:TS:2013:1916  
*Tribunal Supremo (Sala de lo Civil)*, judgment no. 4617/2014 of 24 November 2014, ECLI:ES:TS:2014:4617  
*Tribunal Supremo (Sala de lo Civil)*, judgment no. 1280/2015 of 25 March 2015, ECLI:ES:TS:2015:1280  
*Tribunal Supremo (Sala de lo Civil)*, judgment no. 477/2017 of 24 February 2017, ECLI:ES:TS:2017:477  
*Tribunal Supremo (Sala de lo Civil)*, order no. 2684/2017 of 4 April 2017, ECLI:ES:TS:2017:2684A  
*Tribunal Supremo (Sala de lo Civil)*, judgment no. 3028/2017 of 20 July 2017, ECLI:ES:TS:2017:3028  
*Tribunal Supremo (Sala de lo Civil)*, judgment no. 3373/2017 of 27 September 2017, ECLI:ES:TS:2017:3373  
*Tribunal Supremo (Sala de lo Civil)*, judgment no. 463/2019 of 11 September 2019, ECLI:ES:TS:2019:2761

## **Spain: courts of appeal**

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona*, order no. 222/2012 of 29 October 2012, ECLI:ES:APB:2012:7113A  
*Audiencia Provincial de Lleida (Sección 2ª)*, order no. 55/2013 of 25 March 2013, JUR\2014\294266

*Audiencia Provincial de Tarragona (Sección 1ª)*, order no. 64/2013 of 10 June 2013, JUR\2014\294027

*Audiencia Provincial de Vizcaya (Sección 5ª)*, judgment no. 250/2013 of 30 September 2013, JUR\2014\144762

*Audiencia Provincial de Santa Cruz de Tenerife (Sección 1ª)*, order no. 171/2013 of 17 December 2013, JUR\2015\9254

*Audiencia Provincial de Valencia (Sección 11ª)*, judgment no. 586/2013 of 30 December 2013, AC\2014\415

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 11ª)*, order no. 48/2014 of 20 March 2014, JUR\2014\296437

*Audiencia Provincial de Castellón (Sección 3ª)*, order of 2 April 2014, JUR\2014\179524

*Audiencia Provincial de Las Palmas (Sección 5ª)*, order no. 189/2014 of 22 July 2014, JUR\2015\9437

*Audiencia Provincial de Pontevedra (Sección 1ª)*, order no. 148/2014 of 28 July 2014, JUR\2014\225714

*Audiencia Provincial de Castellón (Sección 3ª)*, order no. 171/2014 of 29 July 2014, JUR\2015\10598, ECLI:ES:APCS:2014:55A

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 17ª)*, order no. 259/2014 of 3 September 2014, JUR\2014\295502

*Audiencia Provincial de Valencia (Sección 9ª)*, order no. 455/2014 of 8 September 2014, JUR\2015\51807

*Audiencia Provincial de Castellón (Sección 3ª)*, order no. 175/2014 of 10 September 2014, JUR\2015\52954

*Audiencia Provincial de Valencia (Sección 9ª)*, order no. 460/2014 of 11 September 2014, JUR\2015\51381

*Audiencia Provincial de Las Palmas (Sección 5ª)*, order no. 207/2014 of 12 September 2014, JUR\2015\55184

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 4ª)*, order no. 196/2014 of 18 September 2014, JUR\2014\297187

*Audiencia Provincial de Granada (Sección 3ª)*, order no. 162/2014 of 22 September 2014, JUR\2015\2137

*Audiencia Provincial de Álava (Sección 1ª)*, order no. 94/2014 of 24 September 2014, JUR\2014\255268

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 1ª)*, order no. 253/2014 of 26 September 2014, JUR\2015\10332

*Audiencia Provincial de Tarragona (Sección 3ª)*, order of 30 September 2014, JUR\2015\43480

*Audiencia Provincial de Las Palmas (Sección 5ª)*, order no. 243/2014 of 2 October 2014, JUR\2015\56330

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 13ª)*, order no. 210/2014 of 6 October 2014, JUR\2014\295342

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 13ª)*, order no. 221/2014 of 16 October 2014, JUR\2014\294909

*Audiencia Provincial de Castellón (Sección 3ª)*, order of 21 November 2014, JUR\2015\5684

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 15ª)*, judgment no. 407/2014 of 15 December 2014, JUR\2015\86196

*Audiencia Provincial de Girona (Sección 2ª)*, order no. 274/2014 of 18 December 2014, JUR\2015\81699

*Audiencia Provincial de Girona (Sección 2ª)*, order no. 14/2015 of 14 January 2015,  
JUR\2015\116526

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 16ª)*, order no. 35/2015 of 5 February 2015,  
JUR\2015\115541

*Audiencia Provincial de Madrid (Sección 14ª)*, order no. 33/2015 of 18 February 2015,  
JUR\2015\100490

*Audiencia Provincial de Valencia (Sección 9ª)*, order no. 123/2015 of 25 February 2015,  
JUR\2015\124382

*Audiencia Provincial de Lleida (Sección 2ª)*, order no. 36/2015 of 26 February 2015,  
JUR\2015\158435

*Audiencia Provincial de Lleida (Sección 2ª)*, order no. 46/2015 of 9 March 2015,  
JUR\2015\121304

*Audiencia Provincial de Girona (Sección 2ª)*, order no. 116/2015 of 10 March 2015,  
JUR\2015\153253

*Audiencia Provincial de Las Palmas (Sección 5ª)*, order no. 96/2015 of 30 March 2015,  
JUR\2015\120970

*Audiencia Provincial de Girona (Sección 2ª)*, order no. 185/2015 of 6 May 2015,  
JUR\2015\166350

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 16ª)*, order no. 168/2015 of 19 May 2015,  
JUR\2015\160073

*Audiencia Provincial de Alicante (Sección 8ª)*, order no. /2015 of 15 June 2015,  
JUR\2015\190491

*Audiencia Provincial de Madrid (Sección 10ª)*, order no. 223/2015 of 9 July 2015,  
JUR\2015\186525

*Audiencia Provincial de Castellón (Sección 3ª)*, order no. 187/2015 of 3 September 2015,  
JUR\2015\271900, ECLI:ES:APCS:2015:91A

*Audiencia Provincial de Castellón (Sección 3ª)*, order no. 185/2015 of 3 September 2015,  
JUR\2015\271187

*Audiencia Provincial de Valencia (Sección 6ª)*, order no. 188/2015 of 8 September 2015,  
JUR\2016\130308

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 16ª)*, order no. 283/2015 of 18 September 2015,  
JUR\2015\261047

*Audiencia Provincial de Castellón (Sección 3ª)*, order no. 216/2015 of 30 September 2015,  
JUR\2015\271027

*Audiencia Provincial de Málaga (Sección 5ª)*, order no. 311/2015 of 12 November 2015,  
JUR\2016\84863

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 17ª)*, order no. 372/2015 of 26 November 2015,  
JUR\2016\101861

*Audiencia Provincial de Granada (Sección 3ª)*, order no. 208/2015 of 11 December 2015,  
JUR\2016\114214

*Audiencia Provincial de Madrid (Sección 10ª)*, order no. 425/2015 of 14 December 2015,  
JUR\2016\15218

*Audiencia Provincial de Málaga (Sección 5ª)*, order no. 335/2015 of 15 December 2015,  
JUR\2016\83571

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 16ª)*, order no. 385/2015 of 17 December 2015,  
JUR\2016\47092

*Audiencia Provincial de Sevilla (Sección 6ª)*, order no. 311/2015 of 17 December 2015,  
JUR\2016\58585

*Audiencia Provincial de Las Palmas (Sección 5ª)*, order no. 6/2016 of 11 January 2016, JUR\2016\65926

*Audiencia Provincial de Valencia (Sección 6ª)*, judgment no. 53/2016 of 2 February 2016, JUR\2016\145999

*Audiencia Provincial de Girona (Sección 2ª)*, order no. 52/2016 of 9 February 2016, JUR\2016\192307

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 1ª)*, judgment no. 104/2016 of 11 March 2016, JUR\2016\120913

*Audiencia Provincial de Málaga (Sección 6ª)*, order no. 182/2016 of 16 March 2016, AC\2016\1219

*Audiencia Provincial de Madrid (Sección 10ª)*, order no. 101/2016 of 17 March 2016, JUR\2016\89139

*Audiencia Provincial de Almería (Sección 1ª)*, order no. 206/2016 of 9 May 2016, JUR\2017\86409

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 15ª)*, judgment no. 136/2016 of 9 June 2016, JUR\2016\180303

*Audiencia Provincial de Málaga (Sección 5ª)*, order no. 207/2016 of 15 June 2016, JUR\2016\240828

*Audiencia Provincial de Granada (Sección 3ª)*, order no. 135/2016 of 30 June 2016, JUR\2016\222262

*Audiencia Provincial de Lleida (Sección 2ª)*, order no. 158/2016 of 27 October 2016, JUR\2017\51706

*Audiencia Provincial de Alicante (Sección 8ª)*, judgment no. 295/2016 of 28 October 2016, JUR\2016\265901

*Audiencia Provincial de Málaga (Sección 5ª)*, order no. 356/2016 of 31 October 2016, JUR\2017\93140

*Audiencia Provincial de Guipúzcoa (Sección 3ª)*, judgment no. 292/2016 of 1 December 2016, JUR\2017\64956

*Audiencia Provincial de Pontevedra (Sección 1ª)*, judgment no. 568/2016 of 12 December 2016, JUR\2017\8971

*Audiencia Provincial de Madrid (Sección 10ª)*, order no. 452/2016 of 22 December 2016, JUR\2017\25699

*Audiencia Provincial de Madrid (Sección 10ª)*, order no. 8/2017 of 16 January 2017, JUR\2017\61994

*Audiencia Provincial de Almería (Sección 1ª)*, order no. 52/2017 of 23 January 2017, JUR\2017\112584

*Audiencia Provincial de Granada (Sección 3ª)*, order no. 10/2017 of 31 January 2017, JUR\2017\91912

*Audiencia Provincial de Toledo (Sección 2ª)*, order no. 151/2017 of 2 February 2017, JUR\2017\142012

*Audiencia Provincial de Valencia (Sección 11ª)*, order no. 67/2017 of 23 February 2017, JUR\2017\130297

*Audiencia Provincial de Álava (Sección 1ª)*, judgment no. 110/2017 of 6 March 2017, JUR\2017\135437

*Audiencia Provincial de Toledo (Sección 2ª)*, order no. 185/2017 of 7 March 2017, JUR\2017\146402

*Audiencia Provincial de Almería (Sección 1ª)*, order no. 118/2017 of 9 March 2017, JUR\2017\157110

*Audiencia Provincial de Almería (Sección 1ª)*, order no. 154/2017 of 30 March 2017,  
JUR\2018\200420, ECLI:ES:APAL:2017:679A

*Audiencia Provincial de León (Sección 1ª)*, judgment no. 192/2017 of 19 May 2017,  
JUR\2017\171244, ECLI:ES:APLE:2017:536

*Audiencia Provincial de Valencia (Sección 6ª)*, order no. 255/2017 of 27 June 2017,  
JUR\2018\25068, ECLI:ES:APV:2017:3327A

*Audiencia Provincial de Almería (Sección 1ª)*, order no. 426/2017 of 25 September 2017,  
JUR\2018\200338, ECLI:ES:APAL:2017:727A

*Audiencia Provincial de León (Sección 1ª)*, judgment no. 346/2017 of 13 October 2017,  
JUR\2018\277847, ECLI:ES:APLE:2017:998

*Audiencia Provincial de Las Palmas (Sección 5ª)*, order no. 276/2017 of 17 October 2017,  
JUR\2018\123083, ECLI:ES:APGC:2017:504A

*Audiencia Provincial de Almería (Sección 1ª)*, order no. 471/2017 of 24 October 2017,  
JUR\2018\201909, ECLI:ES:APAL:2017:1035<sup>a</sup>

*Audiencia Provincial de Toledo (Sección 2ª)*, order no. 663/2017 of 1 December 2017,  
JUR\2018\64957, ECLI:ES:APTO:2017:377A

*Audiencia Provincial de Almería (Sección 1ª)*, order no. 591/2017 of 19 December 2017,  
JUR\2018\200435, ECLI:ES:APAL:2017:781A

*Audiencia Provincial de León (Sección 1ª)*, judgment no. 446/2017 of 19 December 2017,  
JUR\2018\38156, ECLI:ES:APLE:2017:1270

*Audiencia Provincial de Alicante (Sección 8ª)*, order no. 24/2018 of 12 March 2018,  
JUR\2018\162684, ECLI:ES:APA:2018:174A

*Audiencia Provincial de Almería (Sección 1ª)*, order no. 232/2018 of 23 May 2018,  
JUR\2018\201290, ECLI:ES:APAL:2018:127A

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 19ª)*, order no. 194/2018 of 5 July 2018,  
JUR\2018\210473, ECLI:ES:APB:2018:4118A

*Audiencia Provincial de León (Sección 1ª)*, judgment no. 308/2018 of 23 July 2018,  
JUR\2018\282480, ECLI:ES:APLE:2018:891

*Audiencia Provincial de León (Sección 1ª)*, judgment no. 344/2017 of 23 July 2018,  
JUR\2018\302054, ECLI:ES:APLE:2018:982

*Audiencia Provincial de Toledo (Sección 2ª)*, order no. 297/2018 of 12 December 2018,  
JUR\2019\72784

*Audiencia Provincial de Toledo (Sección 2ª)*, order no. 31/2019 of 28 January 2019,  
JUR\2019\128090, ECLI:ES:APTO:2019:68A

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 11ª)*, order no. 38/2019 of 6 February 2019,  
JUR\2019\49570, ECLI:ES:APB:2019:275A

*Audiencia Provincial de Barcelona (Sección 11ª)*, order no. 39/2019 of 6 February 2019,  
JUR\2019\49202, ECLI:ES:APB:2019:279A

*Audiencia Provincial de Guipúzcoa (Sección 2ª)*, order no. 229/2019 of 20 March 2019,  
JUR\2019\172545, ECLI:ES:APSS:2019:355A

*Audiencia Provincial de Girona (Sección 2ª)*, order no. 65/2019 of 11 April 2019,  
JUR\2019\127067, ECLI:ES:APGI:2019:167A

### **Spain: courts in first instance**

*Juzgado de Primera Instancia No. 4 de Bilbao*, order of 26 October 2009 in case no. 1147/2007,  
JUR\2011\403897, ECLI:ES:JPI:2009:9A

*Juzgado de lo Mercantil No. 3 de Barcelona*, judgment of 2 May 2013 in case no. 13/2011,  
ECLI:ES:JMB:2013:21

*Juzgado de Primera Instancia No. 5 de Cartagena*, order of 23 January 2014 in case no. 352/2013 (not published)

*Juzgado de lo Mercantil nº 11 de Madrid*, judgment no. 53/2016 of 7 April 2016, ECLI:ES:JMM:2016:53

*Juzgado de Primera Instancia de Madrid*, judgment no. 379/2016 of 13 October 2016, JUR\2016\237072

*Juzgado de Primera Instancia No. 5 de Cartagena*, order of 11 April 2016 in case no. 352/2013 (not published)

### **Netherlands: Hoge Raad**

*Hoge Raad* 11 December 1987, ECLI:NL:HR:1987:AC2270

*Hoge Raad* 27 November 2009, ECLI:NL:HR:2009:BH2162

*Hoge Raad* 21 September 2012, ECLI:NL:HR:2012:BW6135

*Hoge Raad* 13 September 2013, ECLI:NL:HR:2013:691

*Hoge Raad* 26 September 2014, ECLI:NL:HR:2014:2837

*Hoge Raad* 10 July 2015, ECLI:NL:HR:2015:1866

*Hoge Raad* 9 October 2015, ECLI:NL:HR:2015:3018

*Hoge Raad* 12 February 2016, ECLI:NL:HR:2016:236

*Hoge Raad* 26 February 2016, ECLI:NL:HR:2016:340

*Hoge Raad* 29 April 2016, ECLI:NL:HR:2016:769

*Hoge Raad* 21 April 2017, ECLI:NL:HR:2017:773

*Hoge Raad* 1 June 2018, ECLI:NL:HR:2018:818

*Hoge Raad* 28 September 2018, ECLI:NL:HR:2018:1800

*Hoge Raad* 8 February 2019, ECLI:NL:HR:2019:207

*Hoge Raad* 8 November 2019, ECLI:NL:HR:2019:1731

### **Netherlands: Opinions of Advocates General**

Opinion AG Spier of 11 May 2012, ECLI:NL:PHR:2012:BW6135

Opinion of AG Wissink of 21 December 2012, ECLI:NL:PHR:2012:BY7854

Opinion of AG Wissink of 10 April 2015, ECLI:NL:PHR:2015:455

Opinion of AG Wissink of 30 October 2015, ECLI:NL:PHR:2015:2703

Opinion of AG Wesseling-van Gent of 4 December 2015, ECLI:NL:PHR:2015:2663

Opinion of AG Wissink of 22 January 2016, ECLI:NL:PHR:2016:3

Opinion of AG Wissink of 23 September 2016, ECLI:NL:PHR:2016:938

Opinion of AG Drijber of 23 February 2018, ECLI:NL:PHR:2018:154

Opinion of AG Hartlief of 6 July 2018, ECLI:NL:PHR:2018:788

Opinion of AG Wissink of 5 April 2019, ECLI:NL:PHR:2019:346

Opinion of AG Valk of 12 July 2019, ECLI:NL:PHR:2019:769

Opinion of deputy PG Langemeijer and AG Wissink of 13 September 2019, ECLI:NL:PHR:2019:887

### **Netherlands: courts of appeal**

*Gerechtshof Amsterdam* 1 March 2011, ECLI:NL:GHAMS:2011:BR1722

*Gerechtshof Leeuwarden* 5 July 2011, ECLI:NL:GHLEE:2011:BR2500

*Gerechtshof Amsterdam* 17 April 2012, ECLI:NL:GHAMS:2012:BX3835

*Gerechtshof Amsterdam* 11 July 2013, ECLI:NL:GHAMS:2013:1966

*Gerechtshof Arnhem-Leeuwarden* 10 September 2013, ECLI:NL:GHARL:2013:6635  
*Gerechtshof Amsterdam* 13 September 2013, ECLI:NL:GHAMS:2013:CA1825  
*Gerechtshof 's-Hertogenbosch* 24 September 2013, ECLI:NL:GHSHE:2013:4346  
*Gerechtshof 's-Hertogenbosch* 15 November 2013, ECLI:NL:GHSHE:2013:5206  
*Gerechtshof Arnhem-Leeuwarden* 10 December 2013, ECLI:NL:GHARL:2013:9446  
*Gerechtshof Amsterdam* 24 December 2013, ECLI:NL:GHAMS:2013:4791  
*Gerechtshof Amsterdam* 21 January 2014, ECLI:NL:GHAMS:2014:950  
*Gerechtshof Amsterdam* 25 February 2014, ECLI:NL:GHAMS:2014:1580  
*Gerechtshof Arnhem-Leeuwarden* 3 July 2014, ECLI:NL:GHARL:2014:5450  
*Gerechtshof Amsterdam* 29 July 2014, ECLI:NL:GHAMS:2014:5414  
*Gerechtshof Den Haag* 25 November 2014, ECLI:NL:GHDHA:2014:3833  
*Gerechtshof Arnhem-Leeuwarden* 18 August 2015, ECLI:NL:GHARL:2015:6097  
*Gerechtshof 's-Hertogenbosch* 15 December 2015, ECLI:NL:GHSHE:2015:5258  
*Gerechtshof Arnhem-Leeuwarden* 23 August 2016, ECLI:NL:GHARL:2016:6736  
*Gerechtshof Den Haag* 25 October 2016, ECLI:NL:GHDHA:2016:2984  
*Gerechtshof Arnhem-Leeuwarden* 11 July 2017, ECLI:NL:GHARL:2017:5961  
*Gerechtshof Arnhem-Leeuwarden* 1 August 2017, ECLI:NL:GHARL:2017:6578  
*Gerechtshof Den Haag* 19 September 2017, ECLI:NL:GHDHA:2017:2894 (SEBA)  
*Gerechtshof 's-Hertogenbosch* 18 January 2018, ECLI:NL:GHSHE:2018:166  
*Gerechtshof 's-Hertogenbosch* 1 February 2018, ECLI:NL:GHSHE:2018:363  
*Gerechtshof Arnhem-Leeuwarden* 28 August 2018, ECLI:NL:GHARL:2018:7753  
*Gerechtshof Arnhem-Leeuwarden* 4 September 2018, ECLI:NL:GHARL:2018:7970  
*Gerechtshof Arnhem-Leeuwarden* 5 February 2019, ECLI:NL:GHARL:2019:1060  
*Gerechtshof Amsterdam* 5 March 2019, ECLI:NL:GHAMS:2019:657  
*Gerechtshof Den Haag* 12 March 2019, ECLI:NL:GHDHA:2019:453  
*Gerechtshof Amsterdam* 2 April 2019, ECLI:NL:GHAMS:2019:1109  
*Gerechtshof Den Haag* 2 April 2019, ECLI:NL:GHDHA:2019:630

#### **Netherlands: courts in first instance**

*Rechtbank Amsterdam* 17 December 2008, ECLI:NL:RBAMS:2008:BH1368  
*Rechtbank Leeuwarden* 15 July 2009, ECLI:NL:RBLEE:2009:BJ2957  
*Rechtbank Rotterdam* 18 May 2011, ECLI:NL:RBROT:2011:BQ5670  
*Rechtbank Leeuwarden* 3 August 2011, ECLI:NL:RBLEE:2011:BR4256  
*Rechtbank Almelo* 7 October 2011, ECLI:NL:RBALM:2011:BT7088  
*Rechtbank Zutphen* 4 January 2012, ECLI:NL:RBZUT:2012:BV6245  
*Rechtbank Zutphen* 12 January 2012, ECLI:NL:RBZUT:2012:BV1679  
*Rechtbank Oost-Brabant* 31 January 2013, ECLI:NL:RBOBR:2013:BZ0842  
*Rechtbank Gelderland* 10 April 2013, ECLI:NL:RBGEL:2013:CA0523  
*Rechtbank Amsterdam* 13 May 2013, ECLI:NL:RBAMS:2013:CA0869  
*Rechtbank Midden-Nederland* 26 June 2013, ECLI:NL:RBMNE:2013:3393  
*Rechtbank Amsterdam* 18 December 2013, ECLI:NL:RBAMS:2013:9891  
*Rechtbank Amsterdam* 23 July 2014, ECLI:NL:RBAMS:2014:5421  
*Rechtbank Den Haag* 28 October 2015, ECLI:NL:RBDHA:2015:12213  
*Rechtbank Limburg* 18 January 2016, ECLI:NL:RBLIM:2016:390  
*Rechtbank Rotterdam* 11 May 2016, ECLI:NL:RBROT:2016:6438  
*Rechtbank Gelderland* 20 July 2016, ECLI:NL:RBGEL:2016:4868  
*Rechtbank Den Haag* 23 November 2016, ECLI:NL:RBDHA:2016:14190  
*Rechtbank Amsterdam* 14 April 2017, ECLI:NL:RBAMS:2017:2427

*Rechtbank Limburg* 26 July 2017, ECLI:NL:RBLIM:2017:7453  
*Rechtbank Amsterdam* 16 October 2017, ECLI:NL:RBAMS:2017:7577  
*Rechtbank Amsterdam* 30 January 2018, ECLI:NL:RBAMS:2018:419  
*Rechtbank Den Haag* 6 June 2018, ECLI:NL:RBDHA: 2018:6463  
*Rechtbank Oost-Brabant* 28 June 2018, ECLI:NL:RBOBR:2018:3169  
*Rechtbank Amsterdam* 9 November 2018, ECLI:NL:RBAMS:2018:7770  
*Rechtbank Amsterdam* 25 January 2019, ECLI:NL:RBAMS:2019:1339  
*Rechtbank Amsterdam* 27 February 2019, ECLI:NL:RBAMS:2019:1338  
*Rechtbank Gelderland* 20 March 2019, ECLI:NL:RBGEL:2019:1175  
*Rechtbank Noord-Holland* 17 April 2019, ECLI:NL:RBNHO:2019:3323  
*Rechtbank Den Haag* 28 June 2019, ECLI:NL:RBDHA:2019:6302  
*Rechtbank Den Haag* 2 July 2019, ECLI:NL:RBDHA:2019:7920  
*Rechtbank Oost-Brabant* 11 July 2019, ECLI:NL:RBOBR:2019:4890  
*Rechtbank Amsterdam* 29 November 2019, ECLI:NL:RBAMS:2019:8803  
*Rechtbank Amsterdam* 9 March 2020, ECLI:NL:RBAMS:2020:1477  
*Rechtbank Amsterdam* 27 March 2020, ECLI:NL:RBAMS:2020:2002