



UvA-DARE (Digital Academic Repository)

The effectiveness of UNHCR's supervision

Assessing the UN refugee agency's supervisory task regarding states' compliance with the 1951 Refugee Convention and the 1967 Protocol

van Roemburg, E.T.W.

Publication date

2021

Document Version

Other version

License

Other

[Link to publication](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

van Roemburg, E. T. W. (2021). *The effectiveness of UNHCR's supervision: Assessing the UN refugee agency's supervisory task regarding states' compliance with the 1951 Refugee Convention and the 1967 Protocol*. [Thesis, fully internal, Universiteit van Amsterdam].

General rights

It is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), other than for strictly personal, individual use, unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

Disclaimer/Complaints regulations

If you believe that digital publication of certain material infringes any of your rights or (privacy) interests, please let the Library know, stating your reasons. In case of a legitimate complaint, the Library will make the material inaccessible and/or remove it from the website. Please Ask the Library: <https://uba.uva.nl/en/contact>, or a letter to: Library of the University of Amsterdam, Secretariat, Singel 425, 1012 WP Amsterdam, The Netherlands. You will be contacted as soon as possible.

THE EFFECTIVENESS OF UNHCR'S SUPERVISION



Assessing the UN refugee agency's supervisory task regarding states' compliance with the 1951 Refugee Convention and the 1967 Protocol

ETW VAN ROEMBURG

© Evelien van Roenburg

This publication is protected by international copyright law.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the author.

Printed in The Netherlands

The effectiveness of UNHCR's supervision

Assessing the UN refugee agency's supervisory task
regarding states' compliance with the 1951 Refugee Convention and
the 1967 Protocol

ACADEMISCH PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor
aan de Universiteit van Amsterdam
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus
prof. dr. ir. K.I.J. Maex
ten overstaan van een door het College voor Promoties
ingestelde commissie, in het openbaar te verdedigen in de Aula
op woensdag 10 februari 2021, te 17.00 uur

door

Evelien Theodora Wilhelmina van Roenburg

geboren te Bussum

Promotor:

Prof. Dr. M.Y.A. Zieck University of Amsterdam

Copromotor(es):

Dr. M. den Heijer University of Amsterdam

Overige leden:

Dr. C.M. Bröllman University of Amsterdam

Dr. J. Crisp University of Oxford

Prof. J.C. Hathaway University of Michigan

Prof. Dr. J.A.M. Klabbers University of Helsinki

Prof. Y. Shany Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Prof. Dr. I. Venzke University of Amsterdam

Faculteit der Rechtsgeleerdheid

for Akau Deng Akau
I hope you are safe

A posse ad esse

Contents

Acknowledgments	xiii
List of abbreviations	xvii
List of diagrams and charts	xix
Chapter 1	1
Introduction	
1.1 Setting the problem	1
1.2 A theory of effective supervision	11
1.3 Circumventing the theoretical challenges	14
1.4 Demarcations	19
1.5 Data gathering	22
1.6 Structure of the study	24
Chapter 2	27
Effective supervision by international organizations	
2.1 Introduction	27
2.2 The goal of supervision	27
2.2.1 Compliance	28
2.2.2 The three phases of supervision	32
2.2.3 The mandate providers	37
2.3 The structural elements of supervision	38
2.3.1 A clear and substantial legal basis	39
2.3.2 Sufficient resources	41
2.3.3 Independence	44
2.3.4 Adequate oversight	47
2.4 The procedural elements of supervision	48
2.4.1 Legitimacy	49
2.4.2 Accountability	52
2.4.3 Operationality	55
2.5 A framework for effective supervision	56
Chapter 3	59
A short history of UNHCR	

3.1	Introduction	59
3.2	A rocky start	60
3.3	Obstacles and opportunities	63
3.4	Supervising in fits and starts	66
3.5	From apolitical to operational	68
3.6	Protection by process	71
Chapter 4		77
The structural elements of UNHCR's supervision		
4.1	Introduction	77
4.2	The mandate providers	77
4.3	A clear and substantial legal mandate	82
4.3.1	UNHCR's Statute	83
4.3.2	UNHCR's supervisory role under Article 35 and 36 of the 1951 Convention	90
4.3.3	General Assembly and ECOSOC resolutions and ExCom conclusions	101
4.3.4	Reflection	103
4.4	Sufficient resources	110
4.4.1	Financial means	111
4.4.2	Information resources	116
4.4.3	Reflection	117
4.5	Independence	117
4.5.1	UNHCR's legal independence	118
4.5.2	UNHCR's financial independence	121
4.5.3	Reflection	127
4.6	Adequate oversight	132
4.6.1	The General Assembly and ECOSOC	132
4.6.2	The Executive Committee	133
4.6.3	Reflection	134
Chapter 5		135
The procedural elements of UNHCR's supervision		
5.1	Introduction	135
5.2	Legitimacy	136
5.2.1	Mandate abidance	136
5.2.2	Expertise	140
5.2.3	Consistency	142
5.2.4	Reflection	148
5.3	Accountability	152
5.3.1	(Political) independence	155
5.3.2	Participation	161

5.3.3	Transparency	168
5.3.4	Reflection	170
5.4	Operationality	172
5.4.1	Access to information	172
5.4.2	Punctuality	174
5.4.3	Capacity	177
5.4.4	Reflection	179
Chapter 6		181
Proposals for alternative structures and procedures		
6.1	Introduction	181
6.2	Filling the gaps	182
6.3	Reinforcement	184
6.2.1	More General Comments	185
6.2.2	More involvement and participation	186
6.2.3	More public reporting	189
6.4	Expansion	191
6.4.1	Special Committee of Experts to the High Commissioner	192
6.4.2	More connectedness between UNHCR and other human rights treaty bodies	196
6.4.3	Special Committee of ExCom	200
6.5	Relocation	203
6.5.1	Individual complaint mechanism	204
6.5.2	A Refugees Rights Committee	207
6.5.3	International Judicial Commission for Refugees	209
Chapter 7		213
Conclusion		
7.1	Introduction	213
7.2	A synthesis of supervision	213
7.3	More or less than the human rights' treaty monitoring bodies	218
7.4	The Achilles heel of supervision	221
7.5	Scaling down, and up	225
7.5.1	Scaling down humanitarian assistance	225
7.5.2	A new focus on protection	228
7.5.3	More public scrutiny of states' compliance	232
7.8	Final remarks	233
Annex I		237
Annex II		238
Summary		241

Samenvatting (in Dutch)	249
Bibliography	257

Acknowledgments

When I worked as a trainee at the Protection Delivery Unit of UNHCR's Branch Office in Nairobi, Kenya, in 2008, I met a young man from Sudan - now South Sudan - who needed the assistance of our Office. He was alone, scared and desperate. I talked with him during our daily consultation hours, for a few days in a row, but I was unable to really alter the situation he was in. As a last resort, I arranged for him to be sent to Dadaab refugee camp, where we both hoped he would be safe. I later inquired about his well-being, but it turned out he had never arrived in Dadaab. This manuscript is dedicated to him.

Although the process of writing a thesis may be lonely, there are a great number of people who have significantly contributed to the realization of this project by supporting me in one way or another.

First, I want to warmly thank the members of the reading committee, James Hathaway, Yuval Shany, Jan Klabbers, Jeff Crisp, Kiki Bröllman and Ingo Venzke, for making the time and effort to read and comment on this thesis.

To my dear promoter and supervisor Marjoleine Zieck, I am proud to be part of a significant group of students in which you stirred up an interest and passion for the plight of refugees. You made it possible for me to do another LLM at Columbia University in NYC. And there, while drinking cocktails on Amsterdam Avenue the night before your guest lecture in George Fletcher's class, you planted the seed that has now grown into this manuscript. Your advice, your knowledge, your friendship, your scrupulous but fair supervision, all the time you spent sitting with me and going over my ideas, and your enduring faith (and hope) that this project would one day be finished, have been invaluable. About the process of writing a thesis and being indebted to the scholars that preceded me, you once said: "We stand on the shoulders of giants." I am grateful to be allowed to stand on your shoulders.

Maarten den Heijer, there were times that your optimism was the only thing that kept me going. I always felt you were on my side. Thank you for sharp, critical but always constructive and encouraging comments on the many, many draft versions of the various chapters, and for saying that you have actually learned something from this thesis. You have really boosted my confidence. I could not have wished for a better co-promotor. Annemarieke Vermeer-Kuenzli,

although you were my daily supervisor for only a couple of months, I benefitted so much from your help and advice during a time that I was struggling.

My sincere gratitude goes to all the UNHCR officials who were so willing to share their valuable time to answer my questions. Thank you for contributing your views on how the supervisory task is carried out in practice. Your candid and honest portrayal of this task and the struggles you are facing have deepened my understanding immensely. I am particularly grateful to Rene Bruin, Kees Wouters and Alexander Beck; thank you for patiently answering all my questions.

Thank you to all those kind strangers who helped in small but significant ways: from buying me a cup of tea when I was working on this manuscript in a café ('because you are working for a good cause') to those who offered me their quiet office space. The world is filled with kindness - I hope I can reciprocate.

To my former colleagues at the Law School, Nienke, Tim, Anne, Chris, neighbour Leon, Cassandra, Jeremy, Bérénice, Lyn, Christiane, Or, and especially Catharina and Isabelle, thank you so much for our conversations about work, life and the combination thereof. Frederiek, you are an inspiration. Thank you for your encouragements. Cecile, thank you for our nice little talks. To the incredibly helpful, kind and patience staff at the library of the law faculty: thank you. Former colleagues at the department of political science - Floris, Nanke, Jeroen, Polly, Grace, Mirjam - thank you for welcoming me and giving me the opportunity to deepen my knowledge in political science, conflicts and refugees.

Current colleagues at Oxfam, throughout the confederation, thank you for inviting me in your world. This thesis has benefitted so much from everything I learned in the past years. Maintaining a healthy balance between humanitarian work and advocacy is not something only UNHCR struggles with, I now know. Many thanks to all colleagues who work tirelessly on improving the lives of migrants and refugees and changing the policies and practices needed to do it. Thank you to Suying for giving me the opportunity to learn and lead. Florian, master of media, thank you for reminding me now and then that there is more than work. Eva and Cristina, you and the pandas are the reason I switch on Teams every morning. Special thanks to Raphael. You keep me on my toes and make me laugh out loud so very often. My job is manageable only because you are on the other side of the computer. And thank you for introducing me to the confused girl GIF.

To my two musketeers: Anniek, your words of wisdom throughout the years, whether on personal or professional issues, have been a lifeline. Thank you for awakening my inner feminist. Kathalijne, my partner in crime: our weeks in Klimmen and Volendam have been the most productive ones in this entire process. Your support and advice have helped me finish this thesis, and more.

Elisabeth and Sander: thank you for the many play dates and the candid conversations. 50 kilometres is nothing!

Wies and Myrthe, I love our discussions on how we can change the shape of Dutch and international refugee policies.

Martin, thank you for facilitating the eega and thus also for facilitating me. *Nemo mortalium omnibus horis sapit.*

For the gang in the south, thank you Priscilla and Rick, Ninke and especially Kevin, for the sleepovers and the vegetable garden tips (minus the snail-cutting), for listening and laughter, and for being such wonderful aunts and uncles to our sons. Limburg is starting to grow on me: NH indeed loves Maastricht.

To the Core Group Camping: Carolien, Marijke, Marijn, Liselore and Marja. Thank you for all those conversations about politics, work, high heels, power, relationships, taking your chances, and raising kids in the midst of it all. Whether in LA, Amsterdam, Haarlemmermeer, or elsewhere, I feel a strong connection with you.

To my dearest and long-time friends: Martijn and Laurie, thank you for so many years of laughter, support and game nights, and for not finding Bussum too far away to come for a visit. Daan, we need to revive our lunch dates. Thank you for reading and commenting on my work in those early days, and for being so steady. Eva and Jasper, your cauliflower, boiled potatoes and cheese sauce with meatballs, and the accompanying conversations, have often been a lifesaver.

My family, Maaïke and Gerard and the girls, Joop and Marjan, Floris and Anja, Guy, Seth, Raoul, and Miranda, thank you for being with me on this journey and for not asking when I would finish. Mevrouw Boer, thank you for welcoming me in your family, for having us over all those weekends and for making me feel at home.

To my parents, Rob en Dory van Roenburg. Lieve pap en mam, jullie hebben mij geleerd om af te maken wat je start. Het feit dat dit proefschrift nu klaar is, is daar het resultaat van - alhoewel ik weet dat jullie het een beetje lang vonden duren (dat is absoluut waar). ‘Dankjewel’ zegt niet voldoende hoe dankbaar ik ben voor jullie eindeloze steun aan mij, ongeacht de soms rare beslissingen die ik nam. Jullie zijn er gewoon altijd, vol liefde, en dat is zo waardevol. Ik streef ernaar het soort ouder te zijn die jullie altijd voor mij zijn geweest. Dankjewel dat jullie Martijn in jullie hart hebben gesloten, en dat jullie de beste opa en oma zijn die onze zonen kunnen wensen.

To my love, Martijn Boer. Liefste, your love changed my life, back then, and it still does. I always feel your strong and warm presence besides me, even when we are on two different continents. You stimulate me to become better than I thought was possible. I know I drove you insane with yet another revision of my introduction, but you stayed interested, supportive and exceptionally facilitating

in this entire process. Writing a PhD is a self-centred exercise; I am so relieved that it is now done. Thank you for our beautiful boys, James and Lewis, who give me so much joy. Growing old(er) with you is a delight.

List of abbreviations

ACHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
AfP	Agenda for Protection
CEAS	Common European Asylum System
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CPT	Council of Europe's Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
DIP	Department of International Protection
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council
ExCom	Executive Committee
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
GA	General Assembly
GCM	Global Compact for Safe, Orderly and Regular Migration
GCR	Global Compact on Refugees
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
HRC	Human Rights Committee
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICVA	International Council for Voluntary Agencies
IDP	Internally Displaced Person
IJCM	International Judicial Commission for Refugees
ILC	International Law Commission
ILO	International Labour Organization
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IOM	International Organization for Migration
IRO	International Refugee Organization
MSF	Médécins sans Frontières (Doctors without Borders)
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NRC	Norwegian Refugee Council
OAU	Organization of African Unity

OCHCR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
PDES	Policy Development and Evaluation Service
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNSG	United Nations Secretary-General
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Collection
UNRWA	United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East
US	United States of America
SC	Security Council
SCAF	Sub-Committee on Administrative and Financial Matters
SCIP	Sub-Committee of the Whole on International Protection
ToC	Theory of Change
UPR	Universal Periodic Review
WFP	World Food Program
WHO	World Health Organization
WTO	World Trade Organization

List of diagrams and charts

- Diagram 1 Theory of Change
- Diagram 2 Theory of Change, complete framework
- Diagram 3 Theory of Change, complete framework (repeated)

- Chart 1 Number of court interventions by UNHCR (1986-2019)
- Chart 2 Annual Budget of UNHCR and Funds available (1994-2019)
- Chart 3 Population of Concern to UNHCR (1950-2019)
- Chart 4 Contributions to UNHCR in 2019 as percentage of total contributions
- Chart 5 Earmarking trend as percentage of total contributions to UNHCR (2001-2019)